From: nat fields
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: !!! PLEASE MAINTAIN the FL panther"s endangered status, as it currently exists, PLEASE !!!
Date: Thursday, August 24, 2017 9:47:01 AM

Mr. Shindle
I am hoping that you are already aware that without any changes to the current protected status of the Florida Panther preservation, their habitats are suffering an annual loss of between a 1% and 2%.
I have become aware that you are, in part, responsible for re-evaluating the panther's protected status here in South Florida. I understand that there is a lot of financial pressures on both you and the Service to revoke the panther's protected status, not because the panther population is once again healthy, but so that new construction projects can begin.
Against a lot of pressure, the US Government once took some very big preservation steps to protect its lands and animals- and as you likely know, one by one many of those protections have been removed in the name of "progress", always financial in nature.
Progress is short lived, but like in war, grounds lost can never be protected again or can, at GREAT expense.
Please do not allow further losses of habitats & loss of life for trophy hunting until the panther populations have fully recuperated and can sustain these losses; which is estimated will take about 14 more years.
I understand that before you are many projects, one being the COLOSALLY HUGE Collier County construction project which alone will destroy HUGE panther habitat at ground zero. I know it is a battle to do what is right in light of the HUGE pressures you and the Service must face. I am hoping that the personal reasons you took this job include forcing others to maintain environmental responsibilities. If not, then I imagine my pleading falls on deaf ears and I apologize for wasting your time.
Please help the US Fish and Wildlife Service to maintain the recovery goals they once set and are mandated to maintain despite daily pressures to ignore.
Please work hard to maintain the Florida Panther's endangered status and current recovery plans. This animal is a symbol of Florida, as is demonstrated by the many schools, organizations and businesses that use it as their mascot.
Respectfully Submitted,
Nat Fields

Mr. nat fields
555 5th Ave NE
saint petersburg, FL 33701
US
[redacted]

From: 3868710212@messaging.sprintpcs.com
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: 1/3
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 6:16:23 PM

Not sure why people have to write to you and attempt to get you to leave to Florida panther alone. They are dying off, you (the gove

From: 3868710212@messaging.sprintpcs.com
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: 2/3
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 6:16:57 PM

---

rnment) has allowed their habitat to be almost nonexistent, and what they have left more want to take. This cat needs our protection

From: 3868710212@messaging.sprintpcs.com
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: 3/3
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 6:16:11 PM

, tell the developers, ranchers and other encroachers no. Leave the cats on any endangered or protected list there is.

From:	David Shindle
To:	David Shindle
Subject:	5 Year Review text comment
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 11:01:43 AM
Attachments:	Untitled attachment 10589.txt IMG_0964.PNG

From:	David Shindle
To:	David Shindle
Subject:	5 Year Review text message comments
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 4:31:51 PM
Attachments:	Untitled attachment 09994.txt IMG_0965.PNG IMG_0966.PNG Untitled attachment 09997.txt

---

From: Andrew Bedotto
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: 82 FR 29916 - Five Year Status Review of the Florida Panther
Date: Thursday, August 24, 2017 3:21:17 PM

Dear Dr. Shindle:

I am writing in regards to the current review of the Florida Panther listing status. The Florida Panther should remain listed as a Federally protected Endangered Species. There is no indication that the status should change. Of the five criteria in The Endangered Species Act used to determine the status of endangered, three are clearly met when only one is required: 1. The present or threatened destruction, modification, or curtailment of its habitat or range; 2. Overutilization for commercial, recreational, scientific, or educational purposes; 3. Other natural or manmade factors affecting its continued existence.

The Florida Panther population is too low in numbers to be viable without strong, continued protections. We have not come close to target numbers for any change in listing status. Almost all panthers reside in a small region in southwest Florida. This range is significantly smaller (perhaps 5-10% of the original distribution). Panthers require large range and a mix of contiguous natural habitat. By delisting the Florida Panther, we open additional lands to development without further review. South Florida is under continued development pressure and currently SW Florida is in a phase of rampant development leading to impacts to not only the Florida Panther but many other Threatened and Endangered plants an animals. SW Florida has multiple large Development of Regional Impact submissions currently under review. Several have already been approved, a concrete indication that natural areas will be subject to further development and protected areas will be impacted. Continuity in habitat is critically important to the Florida Panther.The Florida Panther protections provide a means to review development permits and to protect the species for future generations. Moreover, the idea that panthers are abundant, because they are seen in urban areas has very little to do with population, but much more to do with the development of the natural home range and limited habitat. This is a very false assumption that some may try to perpetuate. It is not supported by data!

I do feel there are many challenges and do not discount the difficulty of managing habitat for the Florida Panther. Clearly, the large range/spatial extent needs mean we need to work together to come up with solutions. Many of our largest natural area land holders should be engaged and supported. If areas that are currently used for grazing are converted to development, we will further compartmentalize already limited habitat. I recognize that panthers may at sometimes take cattle as food. These numbers are fairly limited and we should work to provide limited compensation for losses (to ranches) rather than lose lands and/or delist the panther. We spend tens of millions of dollars on T&E protections when a beef cow sells for approximately $150- $1500 on the market (depending on size, sex, and quality). It seems that this is minimal compensation relative to the potential to lose 10s of thousands of acres to development or to lose the support of landholders of large natural areas. At a minimum, we should recognize the challenge of balancing Florida's commercial interests with it's ecological responsibility and work toward a common solution.

As a Floridian, I feel it would be negligent to change the listing status of the Florida Panther. We know from extensive public surveys that the Florida Panther is a symbol of natural Florida and highly regarded by the public. It would be unfair to future generations to allow this beautiful animal to be further threatened due to a change in its listing status.
As ongoing land pressures continue, whether it be development, water storage, or loss in continuity of natural areas (road building etc), we continue to put pressure on the Florida Panther. I appreciate the opportunity to voice my opinion and hope that the Federal government and the USFWS will maintain the Endangered Species status for the Florida Panther.

Respectfully yours,

Andrew Bedotto
334 NE 26th Terr.
Miami FL. 33137

From: Thelma C
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: About the Florida Panthers
Date: Sunday, August 27, 2017 7:39:14 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle

I would like just a moment of your time to talk about the Florida Panthers. I have read that there are federal regulators considering to change their status to 'threatened', which I believe would not contribute and instead damage all the effort that has been taken to protect these creatures. If panthers were to be taken out of the picture, the damage of having to lose a primary predator in the ecosystem and food web of Florida would be large. It would affect many things, such as the populations of many other animals that need predators in order to contain that balance.

This leads to another issue that would worsen if Florida Panthers are taken out of the picture: Burmese Pythons. These pythons are making life worse for all the other animals that are native to Florida. The panther and the python share the same prey, meaning that if they were taken out of the picture, that would mean less competition for the python and more pythons reproducing by the day.

I understand that much effort has been taken, from making sure that certain lands or properties are solely for panthers, to spending up to millions of dollars to make sure they are kept safe. If they were downgraded to 'threatened', it would mean less money and restrictions being used to protect that animal. However, animals like panthers do not reproduce just as easily as other animals. They need their territory, food, and mates. If there is less effort in taking care of panthers, the numbers could just as easily lower to the twenties, just as it did in the 1900's, until the animal becomes extinct. This would mean that all that time, effort, and money would have been for naught.

I believe that it is wonderful that the numbers have jumped to 230; that isn't the easiest job in the world. However, I do not think that number is one people should taken comfort in just yet. If there were 100,000 or more so, I would understand lowering the status. But, there are animals in numbers of thousands or more that are still classified as endangered.

This cause is not just one that is important to me, but to hundreds of others. I would like for future generations to be able to know about the Florida Panther, see it living and thriving, and not know it only as an animal that used to live in Florida. I want others to enjoy that experience. for people to care about the animals that live in our state, and our world. I don't want to see this majestic animal to disappear off the face of the earth because we as people did not do our job to help it.

I understand I've taken enough of your time, so I would like to add this in quickly from an article I've read. There are certain precautions and questions to consider before delisting an animal. One of them is a current threat or issue having to do with their territory, which is currently happening because their land is being taken and used for different purposes. Another would be natural factors affecting it's existence, such as the pythons.

Thank you for taking the time to hear me out, and I hope that this has made you possibly reconsider.

Sincerely, Thelma Collado.

From: Nathalie Galan
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Addressing Florida Panthers
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 8:18:45 PM

Dear David Shindle,

My name is Nathalie Galan, I am a south Floridian who believes that you not only have a responsibility but have a duty to classify the Florida Panther as an endangered species. Florida Panthers have only recently been brought back from the brink of extinction by programs like yours taking such extensive care of them and government restrictions protecting them. While I do know you're most likely facing some kind of outside pressure to reclassify the panther as merely a threatened species, that simply is not true. As mentioned before the only reason the panther has not fallen into extinction, and while you may be thinking "well if the numbers dip again, we can always reclassify it again" it is simply too much of a risk. By the time the time comes to reclassify it yet again, their land could have already been developed or invasive predators could have outclassed them for prey. This is simply too much of a risk, especially considering how delicate Florida's ecosystem is at this current moment in time.

Thank you for your time,
Nathalie Galan

From:	Miranda Darling
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Animal protections
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 11:26:34 AM

I'm writing in concern for the Florida panther. We should be protecting this species even more as its natural habitat continues to fall in the hands of developers. Please do not remove current protections on this or any other threatened native Florida species. I have a 6 week old baby and would like her to experience the majesty of Florida's natural world someday.

Respectfully,
Miranda Darling
Sarasota, Florida

Sent from my iPhone

From:	beth connor
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Another panther hit/killed last week
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 6:12:07 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

I am vehemently opposed to the de-listing of the Florida Panther. No new habitat is ever going to appear. What is available to them now is severly fragmented and car strikes are too common. The excitement in the West Central Florida region was palpable when a female was discovered north of the Caloosahatchee. There is widespread and deep support to keep the panther on the endangered specie list. This cat deserves the highest protection under the law and I believe it is the duty of the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Services to insure this incredible mammal makes it to the next century.

Sincerely,
Beth Connor
St. Petersburg

From:	Jason Rodriguez
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Appreciation Email
Date:	Sunday, August 27, 2017 11:09:19 PM

Dear, David

I would like to thank you for saving the Florida panthers and fighting for them. My class and I have watched videos and have heard your name multiple times and our teacher wanted us to send you an email to thank you for your public services on saving animals.

From:	Nelson Morales
To:	David_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Article
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 9:51:27 AM

The Florida panthers have little over 200 remaining in the wild and even with such a low number count, they are in the process of potentially moving to threatened allowing for farmers and land owners to expand onto their territory, in the process removing their territory. The animals are extremely territorial and removing a small amount of territory can be detrimental since they will fight amongst themselves for land and will have to travel through urban areas to breed. In 2014, the number of Florida Panther roadkill exceeded the number of panthers born that year, urbanization is a direct cause for the near extinction of the Florida panther and would like to ask the FWC to please keep the Florida Panthers endangered until the population bounces back.

From:	Nelson Morales
To:	David_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Article
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 9:52:24 AM

The Florida panthers have little over 200 remaining in the wild and even with such a low number count, they are in the process of potentially moving to threatened allowing for farmers and land owners to expand onto their territory, in the process removing their territory. The animals are extremely territorial and removing a small amount of territory can be detrimental since they will fight amongst themselves for land and will have to travel through urban areas to breed. In 2014, the number of Florida Panther roadkill exceeded the number of panthers born that year, urbanization is a direct cause for the near extinction of the Florida panther and would like to ask the FWC to please keep the Florida Panthers endangered until the population bounces back.

From:	SYDNEY
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov; Chair, Ecology Party of Florida
Subject:	Attachment 1: COMMENTS: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 9:59:22 PM
Attachments:	Attachment 1 Bacchus 404 18GSA mining paper2006.pdf

---

Following is Attachment 1 for the comments below:
Attachment 1 Bacchus 404 18GSA mining paper2006.pdf

------ Forwarded Message
From: sydney <appliedenvirserve@gmail.com>
Date: Tue, 29 Aug 2017 21:53:27 -0400
To: <david_shindle@fws.gov>, "Chair, Ecology Party of Florida" <chair@ecologyparty.org>
Subject: COMMENTS: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species

Dear Dr. Shindle,

Please see the following comments as justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species.

Attached is the letter version of these comments as the following pdf file: USFWS panther ltr 082917.pdf

I will be forwarding the 7 attachments separately because of the large file size of some of those attachments.

Thank you for the opportunity to provide comments.

Sincerely,
Sydney Bacchus, Ph. D.
Hydroecologist

August 29, 2017

David Shindle, Florida Panther Coordinator
U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service
david_shindle@fws.gov

Re: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species

Dear Dr. Shindle,

I am providing the formal comments below on behalf of the Ecology Party of Florida (EPF) and myself, for the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service¹s (USFWS) status review for continued listing of the Florida panthers (Puma concolor coryi) as an endangered species. My comments are based, in part, on the approximately 40 peer-reviewed papers, journal articles, book chapters and books, addressing various aspects of the irreversible adverse environmental impacts of groundwater alterations on habitats in Florida and the southeastern coastal plain that I have authored or co-authored.

CUMULATIVE IMPACTS NOT CONSIDERED

Habitat for Florida panthers and a primary prey of these panthers (i.e., white-tailed deer) has been evaluated by Davis (1943); Young and Goldman (1946); Harlow and Jones (1965); Hemker, Lindzey, and Ackerman (1984); Belden and Maehr (1986); Maehr (1987); Maehr, Land, Roof, and McCown (1989); Beier, Choate, and Barrett (1995); Kautz, Kawula, Hoctor, Comiskey, Jansen, Jennings, Kasbohm, Mazzotti, McBride, Richardson, and Root (2006); Benson, Lotz and Jansen (2008); Land, Shindle, Kawula, Benson, Lotz, and Onorato (2008); Onorato, Criffield, Lotz, Cunningham, McBride, Leone, Bass, and Helgren (2011); Frakes, Belden, Wood, and James (2015); van de Kerk, Onorato, Criffield, Bolker, Augustine, McKinley, and Oli (2015); and others. None of those studies considered the adverse cumulative impacts (effects) related to groundwater alterations that degrade and destroy of essential panther habitat in the primary and secondary panther habitat zones, including habitat for panther dens and habitat for an abundance of high quality prey items that are essential for the nutritional demands of successfully rearing panther kittens in the wild.

As examples, Kautz et al. (2006) and Frakes et al. (2015) recommended no loss of quality and quantity of the remaining panther habitat in southwest Florida, but those publications did not address the highly fractured aquifer system underlying the areas designated as primary and secondary panther habitat zones or how groundwater alterations via those fractures degrade and destroy essential habitat within those zones. In fact, neither those publications, nor the others referenced above addressed the adverse cumulative impacts (effects) of groundwater alterations (e.g., from groundwater withdrawals for municipal, agricultural and industrial/power plant use and from non-mechanical dewatering of the aquifer system from all types of mining) that occur far from the surface footprints via fractures.

Those cumulative impacts also occur within areas considered as ³protected² by those authors, such as Big Cypress National Preserve and Fakahatchee Strand State Preserve, from groundwater withdrawals for municipal, agricultural and industrial/power plant use, from non-mechanical dewatering of the aquifer system from all types of mining, and from oil exploration, even beyond the boundaries of those areas that are presumed to be ³protected.² Those cumulative impacts are in addition to the cumulative impacts from panther deaths due to existing and proposed roads and proposed development projects (e.g., the proposed Rural Lands West subdivision in eastern Collier County, adjacent to the Florida Panther National Wildlife Refuge), which would include traffic in addition to increasing groundwater alterations that will degrade and destroy essential panther habitat. I am including the seven attached publications (submitted individually) as examples of the fractures and cumulative impacts referenced above that result from groundwater impacts to habitats, including habitats essential to the survival of Florida panthers. I urge the USFWS to consider all of those cumulative impacts now and after continuing the endangered status of the Florida panther to ensure the survival and recovery of the Florida panther.

Sincerely,
Sydney T. Bacchus, Ph. D.
Hydroecologist

cc: Ecology Party of Florida (chair@ecologyparty.org)

Attachments

1. Bacchus, S.T. (2006) Nonmechanical dewatering of the regional Floridan aquifer system. Perspectives on Karst Geomorphology, Hydrology, and Geochemistry, 404, 219-234
2. Bacchus, S.T. (2007) More inconvenient truths: Wildfires and wetlands, SWANCC and Rapanos. National Wetlands Newsletter, 29, 15-21
3. Lines, J.P., Bernardes, S., He, J., Zhang, S., Bacchus, S.T., Madden, M., & Jordan, T. (2012) Preferential groundwater flow pathways and hydroperiod alterations indicated by georectified lineaments and sinkholes at proposed karst nuclear power plant and mine sites. Journal of Sustainable Development, 5, p78
4. Bacchus, S.T., Bernardes, S., Jordan, T., & Madden, M. (2014) Benthic macroalgal blooms as indicators of nutrient loading from aquifer-injected sewage effluent in environmentally sensitive near-shore waters associated with the South Florida Keys. Journal of Geography and Geology, 6
5. Bacchus, S.T., Bernardes, S., Xu, W., & Madden, M. (2015a) Fractures as preferential flowpaths for aquifer storage and recovery (ASR) injections and withdrawals: implications for environmentally sensitive near-shore waters, wetlands of the Greater Everglades Basin and the regional karst aquifer system. Journal of Geography and Geology, 7, 117-155
6. Bacchus, S. T., Bernardes, S., Xu, W., & Madden, M. (2015b). What Georgia Can Learn from Aquifer Storage and Recovery (ASR) in Florida. Proceedings of the 2015 Georgia Water Resources Conference, held April 28-29, 2015, at The University of Georgia, Athens, GA. (eds R.J. McDowell, C.A. Pruitt, R.A. Bahn)
7. Xu, W., S. Bernardes, S. T., Bacchus and M. Madden. (2016) Mapped Fractures and Sinkholes in the Coastal Plain of Florida and Georgia to Infer Environmental Impacts from Aquifer Storage and Recovery (ASR) and Supply Wells in the Regional Karst Floridan Aquifer System. Journal of Geography and Geology 8(2):76-110

------ End of Forwarded Message

From:	SYDNEY
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov; Chair, Ecology Party of Florida
Subject:	Attachment 2/Attachment 1: COMMENTS: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 10:01:39 PM
Attachments:	Attachment 2 Bacchus ELI wildfires107.pdf

Following is Attachment 2 for the comments below:
Attachment 2 Bacchus ELI wildfires107.pdf

------ Forwarded Message
From: sydney <appliedenvirserve@gmail.com>
Date: Tue, 29 Aug 2017 21:56:39 -0400
To: "david_shindle@fws.gov" <david_shindle@fws.gov>, "Chair, Ecology Party of Florida" <chair@ecologyparty.org>
Subject: Attachment 1: COMMENTS: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species

Following is Attachment 1 for the comments below:
Attachment 1 Bacchus 404 18GSA mining paper2006.pdf

------ Forwarded Message
From: sydney <appliedenvirserve@gmail.com>
Date: Tue, 29 Aug 2017 21:53:27 -0400
To: <david_shindle@fws.gov>, "Chair, Ecology Party of Florida" <chair@ecologyparty.org>
Subject: COMMENTS: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species

Dear Dr. Shindle,

Please see the following comments as justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species.

Attached is the letter version of these comments as the following pdf file:
USFWS panther ltr 082917.pdf

I will be forwarding the 7 attachments separately because of the large file size of some of those attachments.

Thank you for the opportunity to provide comments.

Sincerely,
Sydney Bacchus, Ph. D.
Hydroecologist

August 29, 2017

David Shindle, Florida Panther Coordinator
U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service
david_shindle@fws.gov

Re: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species

Dear Dr. Shindle,

I am providing the formal comments below on behalf of the Ecology Party of Florida (EPF) and myself, for the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service[1]s (USFWS) status review for continued listing of the Florida panthers (Puma concolor coryi) as an endangered species. My comments are based, in part, on the approximately 40 peer-reviewed papers, journal articles, book chapters and books, addressing various aspects of the irreversible adverse environmental impacts of groundwater alterations on habitats in Florida and the southeastern coastal plain that I have authored or co-authored.

CUMULATIVE IMPACTS NOT CONSIDERED

Habitat for Florida panthers and a primary prey of these panthers (i.e., white-tailed deer) has been evaluated by Davis (1943); Young and Goldman (1946); Harlow and Jones (1965); Hemker, Lindzey, and Ackerman (1984); Belden and Maehr (1986); Maehr (1987); Maehr, Land, Roof, and McCown (1989); Beier, Choate, and Barrett (1995); Kautz, Kawula, Hoctor, Comiskey, Jansen, Jennings, Kasbohm, Mazzotti, McBride, Richardson, and Root (2006); Benson, Lotz and Jansen (2008); Land, Shindle, Kawula, Benson, Lotz, and Onorato (2008); Onorato, Criffield, Lotz, Cunningham, McBride, Leone, Bass, and Helgren (2011); Frakes, Belden, Wood, and James (2015); van de Kerk, Onorato, Criffield, Bolker, Augustine, McKinley, and Oli (2015); and others. None of those studies considered the adverse cumulative impacts (effects) related to groundwater alterations that degrade and destroy of essential panther habitat in the primary and secondary panther habitat zones, including habitat for panther dens and habitat for an abundance of high quality prey items that are essential for the nutritional demands of successfully rearing panther kittens in the wild.

As examples, Kautz et al. (2006) and Frakes et al. (2015) recommended no loss of quality and quantity of the remaining panther habitat in southwest Florida, but those publications did not address the highly fractured aquifer system underlying the areas designated as primary and secondary panther habitat zones or how groundwater alterations via those fractures degrade and destroy essential habitat within those zones. In fact, neither those publications, nor the others referenced above addressed the adverse cumulative impacts (effects) of groundwater alterations (e.g., from groundwater withdrawals for municipal, agricultural and industrial/power plant use and from non-mechanical dewatering of the aquifer system from all types of mining) that occur far from the surface footprints via fractures.

Those cumulative impacts also occur within areas considered as [3]protected[2] by those authors, such as Big Cypress National Preserve and Fakahatchee Strand State Preserve, from groundwater withdrawals for municipal, agricultural and industrial/power plant use, from non-mechanical dewatering of the aquifer system from all types of mining, and from oil exploration, even beyond the boundaries of those areas that are presumed to be [3]protected.[2] Those cumulative impacts are in addition to the cumulative impacts from panther deaths due to existing and proposed roads and proposed development projects (e.g., the proposed Rural Lands West subdivision in eastern Collier County, adjacent to the Florida Panther National Wildlife Refuge), which would include traffic in addition to increasing groundwater alterations that will degrade and destroy essential panther habitat. I am including the seven attached publications (submitted individually) as examples of the fractures and cumulative impacts referenced above that result from groundwater impacts to habitats, including habitats essential to

the survival of Florida panthers. I urge the USFWS to consider all of those cumulative impacts now and after continuing the endangered status of the Florida panther to ensure the survival and recovery of the Florida panther.

Sincerely,
Sydney T. Bacchus, Ph. D.
Hydroecologist

cc: Ecology Party of Florida (chair@ecologyparty.org)

Attachments

1. Bacchus, S.T. (2006) Nonmechanical dewatering of the regional Floridan aquifer system. Perspectives on Karst Geomorphology, Hydrology, and Geochemistry, 404, 219-234
2. Bacchus, S.T. (2007) More inconvenient truths: Wildfires and wetlands, SWANCC and Rapanos. National Wetlands Newsletter, 29, 15-21
3. Lines, J.P., Bernardes, S., He, J., Zhang, S., Bacchus, S.T., Madden, M., & Jordan, T. (2012) Preferential groundwater flow pathways and hydroperiod alterations indicated by georectified lineaments and sinkholes at proposed karst nuclear power plant and mine sites. Journal of Sustainable Development, 5, p78
4. Bacchus, S.T., Bernardes, S., Jordan, T., & Madden, M. (2014) Benthic macroalgal blooms as indicators of nutrient loading from aquifer-injected sewage effluent in environmentally sensitive near-shore waters associated with the South Florida Keys. Journal of Geography and Geology, 6
5. Bacchus, S.T., Bernardes, S., Xu, W., & Madden, M. (2015a) Fractures as preferential flowpaths for aquifer storage and recovery (ASR) injections and withdrawals: implications for environmentally sensitive near-shore waters, wetlands of the Greater Everglades Basin and the regional karst aquifer system. Journal of Geography and Geology, 7, 117-155
6. Bacchus, S. T., Bernardes, S., Xu, W., & Madden, M. (2015b). What Georgia Can Learn from Aquifer Storage and Recovery (ASR) in Florida. Proceedings of the 2015 Georgia Water Resources Conference, held April 28-29, 2015, at The University of Georgia, Athens, GA. (eds R.J. McDowell, C.A. Pruitt, R.A. Bahn)
7. Xu, W., S. Bernardes, S. T., Bacchus and M. Madden. (2016) Mapped Fractures and Sinkholes in the Coastal Plain of Florida and Georgia to Infer Environmental Impacts from Aquifer Storage and Recovery (ASR) and Supply Wells in the Regional Karst Floridan Aquifer System. Journal of Geography and Geology 8(2):76-110

------ End of Forwarded Message

------ End of Forwarded Message

From:	SYDNEY
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov; Chair, Ecology Party of Florida
Subject:	Attachment 3/Attachment 2/Attachment 1: COMMENTS: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 10:05:42 PM
Attachments:	Attachment 3 JSD Lines et al paper re preferential flow paths113012.pdf

---

Following is Attachment 3 for the comments below:
Attachment 3 JSD Lines et al paper re preferential flow paths113012.pdf

------ Forwarded Message
From: sydney <appliedenvirserve@gmail.com>
Date: Tue, 29 Aug 2017 21:59:21 -0400
To: "david_shindle@fws.gov" <david_shindle@fws.gov>, "Chair, Ecology Party of Florida" <chair@ecologyparty.org>
Subject: Attachment 2/Attachment 1: COMMENTS: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species

Following is Attachment 2 for the comments below:
Attachment 2 Bacchus ELI wildfires107.pdf

------ Forwarded Message
From: sydney <appliedenvirserve@gmail.com>
Date: Tue, 29 Aug 2017 21:56:39 -0400
To: "david_shindle@fws.gov" <david_shindle@fws.gov>, "Chair, Ecology Party of Florida" <chair@ecologyparty.org>
Subject: Attachment 1: COMMENTS: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species

Following is Attachment 1 for the comments below:
Attachment 1 Bacchus 404 18GSA mining paper2006.pdf

------ Forwarded Message
From: sydney <appliedenvirserve@gmail.com>
Date: Tue, 29 Aug 2017 21:53:27 -0400
To: <david_shindle@fws.gov>, "Chair, Ecology Party of Florida" <chair@ecologyparty.org>
Subject: COMMENTS: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species

Dear Dr. Shindle,

Please see the following comments as justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species.

Attached is the letter version of these comments as the following pdf file:
USFWS panther ltr 082917.pdf

I will be forwarding the 7 attachments separately because of the large file size of some of those attachments.

Thank you for the opportunity to provide comments.

Sincerely,
Sydney Bacchus, Ph. D.

Hydroecologist

_____
August 29, 2017

David Shindle, Florida Panther Coordinator
U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service
david_shindle@fws.gov

Re: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species

Dear Dr. Shindle,

I am providing the formal comments below on behalf of the Ecology Party of Florida (EPF) and myself, for the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service¹s (USFWS) status review for continued listing of the Florida panthers (Puma concolor coryi) as an endangered species. My comments are based, in part, on the approximately 40 peer-reviewed papers, journal articles, book chapters and books, addressing various aspects of the irreversible adverse environmental impacts of groundwater alterations on habitats in Florida and the southeastern coastal plain that I have authored or co-authored.

CUMULATIVE IMPACTS NOT CONSIDERED
Habitat for Florida panthers and a primary prey of these panthers (i.e., white-tailed deer) has been evaluated by Davis (1943); Young and Goldman (1946); Harlow and Jones (1965); Hemker, Lindzey, and Ackerman (1984); Belden and Maehr (1986); Maehr (1987); Maehr, Land, Roof, and McCown (1989); Beier, Choate, and Barrett (1995); Kautz, Kawula, Hoctor, Comiskey, Jansen, Jennings, Kasbohm, Mazzotti, McBride, Richardson, and Root (2006); Benson, Lotz and Jansen (2008); Land, Shindle, Kawula, Benson, Lotz, and Onorato (2008); Onorato, Criffield, Lotz, Cunningham, McBride, Leone, Bass, and Helgren (2011); Frakes, Belden, Wood, and James (2015); van de Kerk, Onorato, Criffield, Bolker, Augustine, McKinley, and Oli (2015); and others. None of those studies considered the adverse cumulative impacts (effects) related to groundwater alterations that degrade and destroy of essential panther habitat in the primary and secondary panther habitat zones, including habitat for panther dens and habitat for an abundance of high quality prey items that are essential for the nutritional demands of successfully rearing panther kittens in the wild.

As examples, Kautz et al. (2006) and Frakes et al. (2015) recommended no loss of quality and quantity of the remaining panther habitat in southwest Florida, but those publications did not address the highly fractured aquifer system underlying the areas designated as primary and secondary panther habitat zones or how groundwater alterations via those fractures degrade and destroy essential habitat within those zones. In fact, neither those publications, nor the others referenced above addressed the adverse cumulative impacts (effects) of groundwater alterations (e.g., from groundwater withdrawals for municipal, agricultural and industrial/power plant use and from non-mechanical dewatering of the aquifer system from all types of mining) that occur far from the surface footprints via fractures.

Those cumulative impacts also occur within areas considered as ³protected² by those authors, such as Big Cypress National Preserve and Fakahatchee Strand State Preserve, from groundwater withdrawals for municipal, agricultural and industrial/power plant use, from non-mechanical dewatering

of the aquifer system from all types of mining, and from oil exploration, even beyond the boundaries of those areas that are presumed to be [3]protected.[2] Those cumulative impacts are in addition to the cumulative impacts from panther deaths due to existing and proposed roads and proposed development projects (e.g., the proposed Rural Lands West subdivision in eastern Collier County, adjacent to the Florida Panther National Wildlife Refuge), which would include traffic in addition to increasing groundwater alterations that will degrade and destroy essential panther habitat. I am including the seven attached publications (submitted individually) as examples of the fractures and cumulative impacts referenced above that result from groundwater impacts to habitats, including habitats essential to the survival of Florida panthers. I urge the USFWS to consider all of those cumulative impacts now and after continuing the endangered status of the Florida panther to ensure the survival and recovery of the Florida panther.

Sincerely,
Sydney T. Bacchus, Ph. D.
Hydroecologist

cc: Ecology Party of Florida (chair@ecologyparty.org)

Attachments

1. Bacchus, S.T. (2006) Nonmechanical dewatering of the regional Floridan aquifer system. Perspectives on Karst Geomorphology, Hydrology, and Geochemistry, 404, 219-234
2. Bacchus, S.T. (2007) More inconvenient truths: Wildfires and wetlands, SWANCC and Rapanos. National Wetlands Newsletter, 29, 15-21
3. Lines, J.P., Bernardes, S., He, J., Zhang, S., Bacchus, S.T., Madden, M., & Jordan, T. (2012) Preferential groundwater flow pathways and hydroperiod alterations indicated by georectified lineaments and sinkholes at proposed karst nuclear power plant and mine sites. Journal of Sustainable Development, 5, p78
4. Bacchus, S.T., Bernardes, S., Jordan, T., & Madden, M. (2014) Benthic macroalgal blooms as indicators of nutrient loading from aquifer-injected sewage effluent in environmentally sensitive near-shore waters associated with the South Florida Keys. Journal of Geography and Geology, 6
5. Bacchus, S.T., Bernardes, S., Xu, W., & Madden, M. (2015a) Fractures as preferential flowpaths for aquifer storage and recovery (ASR) injections and withdrawals: implications for environmentally sensitive near-shore waters, wetlands of the Greater Everglades Basin and the regional karst aquifer system. Journal of Geography and Geology, 7, 117-155
6. Bacchus, S. T., Bernardes, S., Xu, W., & Madden, M. (2015b). What Georgia Can Learn from Aquifer Storage and Recovery (ASR) in Florida. Proceedings of the 2015 Georgia Water Resources Conference, held April 28-29, 2015, at The University of Georgia, Athens, GA. (eds R.J. McDowell, C.A. Pruitt, R.A. Bahn)
7. Xu, W., S. Bernardes, S. T., Bacchus and M. Madden. (2016) Mapped Fractures and Sinkholes in the Coastal Plain of Florida and Georgia to Infer Environmental Impacts from Aquifer Storage and Recovery (ASR) and Supply Wells in the Regional Karst Floridan Aquifer System. Journal of Geography and Geology 8(2):76-110

------ End of Forwarded Message

------ End of Forwarded Message

------ End of Forwarded Message

From:	SYDNEY
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov; Chair, Ecology Party of Florida
Subject:	Attachment 4/Attachment 3/Attachment 2/Attachment 1: COMMENTS: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 10:09:54 PM
Attachments:	Attachment 4 JGG Bacchus et al fracture SGD paper1214.pdf

---

Following is Attachment 4 for the comments below:
Attachment 4 JGG Bacchus et al fracture SGD paper1214.pdf

------ Forwarded Message
From: sydney <appliedenvirserve@gmail.com>
Date: Tue, 29 Aug 2017 22:02:49 -0400
To: "david_shindle@fws.gov" <david_shindle@fws.gov>, "Chair, Ecology Party of Florida" <chair@ecologyparty.org>
Subject: Attachment 3/Attachment 2/Attachment 1: COMMENTS: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species

Following is Attachment 3 for the comments below:
Attachment 3 JSD Lines et al paper re preferential flow paths113012.pdf

------ Forwarded Message
From: sydney <appliedenvirserve@gmail.com>
Date: Tue, 29 Aug 2017 21:59:21 -0400
To: "david_shindle@fws.gov" <david_shindle@fws.gov>, "Chair, Ecology Party of Florida" <chair@ecologyparty.org>
Subject: Attachment 2/Attachment 1: COMMENTS: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species

Following is Attachment 2 for the comments below:
Attachment 2 Bacchus ELI wildfires107.pdf

------ Forwarded Message
From: sydney <appliedenvirserve@gmail.com>
Date: Tue, 29 Aug 2017 21:56:39 -0400
To: "david_shindle@fws.gov" <david_shindle@fws.gov>, "Chair, Ecology Party of Florida" <chair@ecologyparty.org>
Subject: Attachment 1: COMMENTS: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species

Following is Attachment 1 for the comments below:
Attachment 1 Bacchus 404 18GSA mining paper2006.pdf

------ Forwarded Message
From: sydney <appliedenvirserve@gmail.com>
Date: Tue, 29 Aug 2017 21:53:27 -0400
To: <david_shindle@fws.gov>, "Chair, Ecology Party of Florida" <chair@ecologyparty.org>
Subject: COMMENTS: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species

Dear Dr. Shindle,

Please see the following comments as justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species.

Attached is the letter version of these comments as the following pdf file:
USFWS panther ltr 082917.pdf

I will be forwarding the 7 attachments separately because of the large file size of some of those attachments.

Thank you for the opportunity to provide comments.

Sincerely,
Sydney Bacchus, Ph. D.
Hydroecologist

August 29, 2017

David Shindle, Florida Panther Coordinator
U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service
david_shindle@fws.gov

Re: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species

Dear Dr. Shindle,

I am providing the formal comments below on behalf of the Ecology Party of Florida (EPF) and myself, for the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service¹s (USFWS) status review for continued listing of the Florida panthers (Puma concolor coryi) as an endangered species. My comments are based, in part, on the approximately 40 peer-reviewed papers, journal articles, book chapters and books, addressing various aspects of the irreversible adverse environmental impacts of groundwater alterations on habitats in Florida and the southeastern coastal plain that I have authored or co-authored.

CUMULATIVE IMPACTS NOT CONSIDERED
Habitat for Florida panthers and a primary prey of these panthers (i.e., white-tailed deer) has been evaluated by Davis (1943); Young and Goldman (1946); Harlow and Jones (1965); Hemker, Lindzey, and Ackerman (1984); Belden and Maehr (1986); Maehr (1987); Maehr, Land, Roof, and McCown (1989); Beier, Choate, and Barrett (1995); Kautz, Kawula, Hoctor, Comiskey, Jansen, Jennings, Kasbohm, Mazzotti, McBride, Richardson, and Root (2006); Benson, Lotz and Jansen (2008); Land, Shindle, Kawula, Benson, Lotz, and Onorato (2008); Onorato, Criffield, Lotz, Cunningham, McBride, Leone, Bass, and Helgren (2011); Frakes, Belden, Wood, and James (2015); van de Kerk, Onorato, Criffield, Bolker, Augustine, McKinley, and Oli (2015); and others. None of those studies considered the adverse cumulative impacts (effects) related to groundwater alterations that degrade and destroy of essential panther habitat in the primary and secondary panther habitat zones, including habitat for panther dens and habitat for an abundance of high quality prey items that are essential for the nutritional demands of successfully rearing panther kittens in the wild.

As examples, Kautz et al. (2006) and Frakes et al. (2015) recommended no loss of quality and quantity of the remaining panther habitat in southwest Florida, but those publications did not address the highly fractured aquifer system underlying the areas designated as primary and secondary panther habitat zones or how groundwater alterations via those fractures degrade and

destroy essential habitat within those zones. In fact, neither those publications, nor the others referenced above addressed the adverse cumulative impacts (effects) of groundwater alterations (e.g., from groundwater withdrawals for municipal, agricultural and industrial/power plant use and from non-mechanical dewatering of the aquifer system from all types of mining) that occur far from the surface footprints via fractures.

Those cumulative impacts also occur within areas considered as ³protected² by those authors, such as Big Cypress National Preserve and Fakahatchee Strand State Preserve, from groundwater withdrawals for municipal, agricultural and industrial/power plant use, from non-mechanical dewatering of the aquifer system from all types of mining, and from oil exploration, even beyond the boundaries of those areas that are presumed to be ³protected.² Those cumulative impacts are in addition to the cumulative impacts from panther deaths due to existing and proposed roads and proposed development projects (e.g., the proposed Rural Lands West subdivision in eastern Collier County, adjacent to the Florida Panther National Wildlife Refuge), which would include traffic in addition to increasing groundwater alterations that will degrade and destroy essential panther habitat. I am including the seven attached publications (submitted individually) as examples of the fractures and cumulative impacts referenced above that result from groundwater impacts to habitats, including habitats essential to the survival of Florida panthers. I urge the USFWS to consider all of those cumulative impacts now and after continuing the endangered status of the Florida panther to ensure the survival and recovery of the Florida panther.

Sincerely,
Sydney T. Bacchus, Ph. D.
Hydroecologist

cc: Ecology Party of Florida (chair@ecologyparty.org)

Attachments

1. Bacchus, S.T. (2006) Nonmechanical dewatering of the regional Floridan aquifer system. Perspectives on Karst Geomorphology, Hydrology, and Geochemistry, 404, 219-234
2. Bacchus, S.T. (2007) More inconvenient truths: Wildfires and wetlands, SWANCC and Rapanos. National Wetlands Newsletter, 29, 15-21
3. Lines, J.P., Bernardes, S., He, J., Zhang, S., Bacchus, S.T., Madden, M., & Jordan, T. (2012) Preferential groundwater flow pathways and hydroperiod alterations indicated by georectified lineaments and sinkholes at proposed karst nuclear power plant and mine sites. Journal of Sustainable Development, 5, p78
4. Bacchus, S.T., Bernardes, S., Jordan, T., & Madden, M. (2014) Benthic macroalgal blooms as indicators of nutrient loading from aquifer-injected sewage effluent in environmentally sensitive near-shore waters associated with the South Florida Keys. Journal of Geography and Geology, 6
5. Bacchus, S.T., Bernardes, S., Xu, W., & Madden, M. (2015a) Fractures as preferential flowpaths for aquifer storage and recovery (ASR) injections and withdrawals: implications for environmentally sensitive near-shore waters, wetlands of the Greater Everglades Basin and the regional karst aquifer system. Journal of Geography and Geology, 7, 117-155
6. Bacchus, S. T., Bernardes, S., Xu, W., & Madden, M. (2015b). What Georgia Can Learn from Aquifer Storage and Recovery (ASR) in Florida. Proceedings of the 2015 Georgia Water Resources Conference, held April 28-29, 2015, at The University of Georgia, Athens, GA. (eds R.J. McDowell,

C.A. Pruitt, R.A. Bahn)
7. Xu, W., S. Bernardes, S. T., Bacchus and M. Madden. (2016) Mapped Fractures and Sinkholes in the Coastal Plain of Florida and Georgia to Infer Environmental Impacts from Aquifer Storage and Recovery (ASR) and Supply Wells in the Regional Karst Floridan Aquifer System. Journal of Geography and Geology 8(2):76-110

------ End of Forwarded Message

------ End of Forwarded Message

------ End of Forwarded Message

------ End of Forwarded Message

From:	SYDNEY
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov; Chair, Ecology Party of Florida
Subject:	Attachment 5/Attachment 4/Attachment 3/Attachment 2/Attachment 1: COMMENTS: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 10:14:37 PM
Attachments:	Attachment 5 Bacchus et al. JGG ASR 49058-168858-3-PB 060115.pdf

---

Following is Attachment 5 for the comments below:
Attachment 5 Bacchus et al. JGG ASR 49058-168858-3-PB 060115.pdf

------ Forwarded Message
From: sydney <appliedenvirserve@gmail.com>
Date: Tue, 29 Aug 2017 22:06:15 -0400
To: "david_shindle@fws.gov" <david_shindle@fws.gov>, "Chair, Ecology Party of Florida" <chair@ecologyparty.org>
Subject: Attachment 4/Attachment 3/Attachment 2/Attachment 1: COMMENTS: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species

Following is Attachment 4 for the comments below:
Attachment 4 JGG Bacchus et al fracture SGD paper1214.pdf

------ Forwarded Message
From: sydney <appliedenvirserve@gmail.com>
Date: Tue, 29 Aug 2017 22:02:49 -0400
To: "david_shindle@fws.gov" <david_shindle@fws.gov>, "Chair, Ecology Party of Florida" <chair@ecologyparty.org>
Subject: Attachment 3/Attachment 2/Attachment 1: COMMENTS: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species

Following is Attachment 3 for the comments below:
Attachment 3 JSD Lines et al paper re preferential flow paths113012.pdf

------ Forwarded Message
From: sydney <appliedenvirserve@gmail.com>
Date: Tue, 29 Aug 2017 21:59:21 -0400
To: "david_shindle@fws.gov" <david_shindle@fws.gov>, "Chair, Ecology Party of Florida" <chair@ecologyparty.org>
Subject: Attachment 2/Attachment 1: COMMENTS: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species

Following is Attachment 2 for the comments below:
Attachment 2 Bacchus ELI wildfires107.pdf

------ Forwarded Message
From: sydney <appliedenvirserve@gmail.com>
Date: Tue, 29 Aug 2017 21:56:39 -0400
To: "david_shindle@fws.gov" <david_shindle@fws.gov>, "Chair, Ecology Party of Florida" <chair@ecologyparty.org>
Subject: Attachment 1: COMMENTS: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species

Following is Attachment 1 for the comments below:
Attachment 1 Bacchus 404 18GSA mining paper2006.pdf

------ Forwarded Message
From: sydney <appliedenvirserve@gmail.com>
Date: Tue, 29 Aug 2017 21:53:27 -0400
To: <david_shindle@fws.gov>, "Chair, Ecology Party of Florida" <chair@ecologyparty.org>
Subject: COMMENTS: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species

Dear Dr. Shindle,

Please see the following comments as justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species.

Attached is the letter version of these comments as the following pdf file: USFWS panther ltr 082917.pdf

I will be forwarding the 7 attachments separately because of the large file size of some of those attachments.

Thank you for the opportunity to provide comments.

Sincerely,
Sydney Bacchus, Ph. D.
Hydroecologist

August 29, 2017

David Shindle, Florida Panther Coordinator
U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service
david_shindle@fws.gov

Re: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species

Dear Dr. Shindle,

I am providing the formal comments below on behalf of the Ecology Party of Florida (EPF) and myself, for the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service¹s (USFWS) status review for continued listing of the Florida panthers (Puma concolor coryi) as an endangered species. My comments are based, in part, on the approximately 40 peer-reviewed papers, journal articles, book chapters and books, addressing various aspects of the irreversible adverse environmental impacts of groundwater alterations on habitats in Florida and the southeastern coastal plain that I have authored or co-authored.

CUMULATIVE IMPACTS NOT CONSIDERED
Habitat for Florida panthers and a primary prey of these panthers (i.e., white-tailed deer) has been evaluated by Davis (1943); Young and Goldman (1946); Harlow and Jones (1965); Hemker, Lindzey, and Ackerman (1984); Belden and Maehr (1986); Maehr (1987); Maehr, Land, Roof, and McCown (1989); Beier, Choate, and Barrett (1995); Kautz, Kawula, Hoctor, Comiskey, Jansen, Jennings, Kasbohm, Mazzotti, McBride, Richardson, and Root (2006); Benson, Lotz and Jansen (2008); Land, Shindle, Kawula, Benson, Lotz, and Onorato (2008); Onorato, Criffield, Lotz, Cunningham, McBride, Leone, Bass, and Helgren (2011); Frakes, Belden, Wood, and James (2015); van de Kerk, Onorato, Criffield, Bolker, Augustine, McKinley, and Oli (2015); and others.

None of those studies considered the adverse cumulative impacts (effects) related to groundwater alterations that degrade and destroy of essential panther habitat in the primary and secondary panther habitat zones, including habitat for panther dens and habitat for an abundance of high quality prey items that are essential for the nutritional demands of successfully rearing panther kittens in the wild.

As examples, Kautz et al. (2006) and Frakes et al. (2015) recommended no loss of quality and quantity of the remaining panther habitat in southwest Florida, but those publications did not address the highly fractured aquifer system underlying the areas designated as primary and secondary panther habitat zones or how groundwater alterations via those fractures degrade and destroy essential habitat within those zones. In fact, neither those publications, nor the others referenced above addressed the adverse cumulative impacts (effects) of groundwater alterations (e.g., from groundwater withdrawals for municipal, agricultural and industrial/power plant use and from non-mechanical dewatering of the aquifer system from all types of mining) that occur far from the surface footprints via fractures.

Those cumulative impacts also occur within areas considered as ³protected² by those authors, such as Big Cypress National Preserve and Fakahatchee Strand State Preserve, from groundwater withdrawals for municipal, agricultural and industrial/power plant use, from non-mechanical dewatering of the aquifer system from all types of mining, and from oil exploration, even beyond the boundaries of those areas that are presumed to be ³protected.² Those cumulative impacts are in addition to the cumulative impacts from panther deaths due to existing and proposed roads and proposed development projects (e.g., the proposed Rural Lands West subdivision in eastern Collier County, adjacent to the Florida Panther National Wildlife Refuge), which would include traffic in addition to increasing groundwater alterations that will degrade and destroy essential panther habitat. I am including the seven attached publications (submitted individually) as examples of the fractures and cumulative impacts referenced above that result from groundwater impacts to habitats, including habitats essential to the survival of Florida panthers. I urge the USFWS to consider all of those cumulative impacts now and after continuing the endangered status of the Florida panther to ensure the survival and recovery of the Florida panther.

Sincerely,
Sydney T. Bacchus, Ph. D.
Hydroecologist

cc: Ecology Party of Florida (chair@ecologyparty.org)

Attachments

1. Bacchus, S.T. (2006) Nonmechanical dewatering of the regional Floridan aquifer system. Perspectives on Karst Geomorphology, Hydrology, and Geochemistry, 404, 219-234
2. Bacchus, S.T. (2007) More inconvenient truths: Wildfires and wetlands, SWANCC and Rapanos. National Wetlands Newsletter, 29, 15-21
3. Lines, J.P., Bernardes, S., He, J., Zhang, S., Bacchus, S.T., Madden, M., & Jordan, T. (2012) Preferential groundwater flow pathways and hydroperiod alterations indicated by georectified lineaments and sinkholes at proposed karst nuclear power plant and mine sites. Journal of Sustainable Development, 5, p78
4. Bacchus, S.T., Bernardes, S., Jordan, T., & Madden, M. (2014) Benthic macroalgal blooms as indicators of nutrient loading from

aquifer-injected sewage effluent in environmentally sensitive near-shore waters associated with the South Florida Keys. Journal of Geography and Geology, 6
5. Bacchus, S.T., Bernardes, S., Xu, W., & Madden, M. (2015a) Fractures as preferential flowpaths for aquifer storage and recovery (ASR) injections and withdrawals: implications for environmentally sensitive near-shore waters, wetlands of the Greater Everglades Basin and the regional karst aquifer system. Journal of Geography and Geology, 7, 117-155
6. Bacchus, S. T., Bernardes, S., Xu, W., & Madden, M. (2015b). What Georgia Can Learn from Aquifer Storage and Recovery (ASR) in Florida. Proceedings of the 2015 Georgia Water Resources Conference, held April 28-29, 2015, at The University of Georgia, Athens, GA. (eds R.J. McDowell, C.A. Pruitt, R.A. Bahn)
7. Xu, W., S. Bernardes, S. T., Bacchus and M. Madden. (2016) Mapped Fractures and Sinkholes in the Coastal Plain of Florida and Georgia to Infer Environmental Impacts from Aquifer Storage and Recovery (ASR) and Supply Wells in the Regional Karst Floridan Aquifer System. Journal of Geography and Geology 8(2):76-110

------ End of Forwarded Message

------ End of Forwarded Message

------ End of Forwarded Message

------ End of Forwarded Message

------ End of Forwarded Message

From:	SYDNEY
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov; Chair, Ecology Party of Florida
Subject:	Attachment 6/Attachment 5/Attachment 4/Attachment 3/Attachment 2/Attachment 1: COMMENTS: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 10:16:22 PM
Attachments:	Attachment 6 GWR4.5.3bacchus et al FL GA ASR15.pdf

---

Following is Attachment 5 for the comments below:
Attachment 6 GWR4.5.3bacchus et al FL GA ASR15.pdf

------ Forwarded Message
From: sydney <appliedenvirserve@gmail.com>
Date: Tue, 29 Aug 2017 22:10:29 -0400
To: "david_shindle@fws.gov" <david_shindle@fws.gov>, "Chair, Ecology Party of Florida" <chair@ecologyparty.org>
Subject: Attachment 5/Attachment 4/Attachment 3/Attachment 2/Attachment 1: COMMENTS: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species

Following is Attachment 5 for the comments below:
Attachment 5 Bacchus et al. JGG ASR 49058-168858-3-PB 060115.pdf

------ Forwarded Message
From: sydney <appliedenvirserve@gmail.com>
Date: Tue, 29 Aug 2017 22:06:15 -0400
To: "david_shindle@fws.gov" <david_shindle@fws.gov>, "Chair, Ecology Party of Florida" <chair@ecologyparty.org>
Subject: Attachment 4/Attachment 3/Attachment 2/Attachment 1: COMMENTS: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species

Following is Attachment 4 for the comments below:
Attachment 4 JGG Bacchus et al fracture SGD paper1214.pdf

------ Forwarded Message
From: sydney <appliedenvirserve@gmail.com>
Date: Tue, 29 Aug 2017 22:02:49 -0400
To: "david_shindle@fws.gov" <david_shindle@fws.gov>, "Chair, Ecology Party of Florida" <chair@ecologyparty.org>
Subject: Attachment 3/Attachment 2/Attachment 1: COMMENTS: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species

Following is Attachment 3 for the comments below:
Attachment 3 JSD Lines et al paper re preferential flow paths113012.pdf

------ Forwarded Message
From: sydney <appliedenvirserve@gmail.com>
Date: Tue, 29 Aug 2017 21:59:21 -0400
To: "david_shindle@fws.gov" <david_shindle@fws.gov>, "Chair, Ecology Party of Florida" <chair@ecologyparty.org>
Subject: Attachment 2/Attachment 1: COMMENTS: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species

Following is Attachment 2 for the comments below:
Attachment 2 Bacchus ELI wildfires107.pdf

------ Forwarded Message
From: sydney <appliedenvirserve@gmail.com>
Date: Tue, 29 Aug 2017 21:56:39 -0400
To: "david_shindle@fws.gov" <david_shindle@fws.gov>, "Chair, Ecology Party of Florida" <chair@ecologyparty.org>
Subject: Attachment 1: COMMENTS: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species

Following is Attachment 1 for the comments below:
Attachment 1 Bacchus 404 18GSA mining paper2006.pdf

------ Forwarded Message
From: sydney <appliedenvirserve@gmail.com>
Date: Tue, 29 Aug 2017 21:53:27 -0400
To: <david_shindle@fws.gov>, "Chair, Ecology Party of Florida" <chair@ecologyparty.org>
Subject: COMMENTS: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species

Dear Dr. Shindle,

Please see the following comments as justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species.

Attached is the letter version of these comments as the following pdf file:
USFWS panther ltr 082917.pdf

I will be forwarding the 7 attachments separately because of the large file size of some of those attachments.

Thank you for the opportunity to provide comments.

Sincerely,
Sydney Bacchus, Ph. D.
Hydroecologist

August 29, 2017

David Shindle, Florida Panther Coordinator
U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service
david_shindle@fws.gov

Re: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species

Dear Dr. Shindle,

I am providing the formal comments below on behalf of the Ecology Party of Florida (EPF) and myself, for the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service¹s (USFWS) status review for continued listing of the Florida panthers (Puma concolor coryi) as an endangered species. My comments are based, in part, on the approximately 40 peer-reviewed papers, journal articles, book chapters and books, addressing various aspects of the irreversible adverse environmental impacts of groundwater alterations on habitats in Florida and the southeastern coastal plain that I have authored or co-authored.

CUMULATIVE IMPACTS NOT CONSIDERED

Habitat for Florida panthers and a primary prey of these panthers (i.e., white-tailed deer) has been evaluated by Davis (1943); Young and Goldman (1946); Harlow and Jones (1965); Hemker, Lindzey, and Ackerman (1984); Belden and Maehr (1986); Maehr (1987); Maehr, Land, Roof, and McCown (1989); Beier, Choate, and Barrett (1995); Kautz, Kawula, Hoctor, Comiskey, Jansen, Jennings, Kasbohm, Mazzotti, McBride, Richardson, and Root (2006); Benson, Lotz and Jansen (2008); Land, Shindle, Kawula, Benson, Lotz, and Onorato (2008); Onorato, Criffield, Lotz, Cunningham, McBride, Leone, Bass, and Helgren (2011); Frakes, Belden, Wood, and James (2015); van de Kerk, Onorato, Criffield, Bolker, Augustine, McKinley, and Oli (2015); and others. None of those studies considered the adverse cumulative impacts (effects) related to groundwater alterations that degrade and destroy of essential panther habitat in the primary and secondary panther habitat zones, including habitat for panther dens and habitat for an abundance of high quality prey items that are essential for the nutritional demands of successfully rearing panther kittens in the wild.

As examples, Kautz et al. (2006) and Frakes et al. (2015) recommended no loss of quality and quantity of the remaining panther habitat in southwest Florida, but those publications did not address the highly fractured aquifer system underlying the areas designated as primary and secondary panther habitat zones or how groundwater alterations via those fractures degrade and destroy essential habitat within those zones. In fact, neither those publications, nor the others referenced above addressed the adverse cumulative impacts (effects) of groundwater alterations (e.g., from groundwater withdrawals for municipal, agricultural and industrial/power plant use and from non-mechanical dewatering of the aquifer system from all types of mining) that occur far from the surface footprints via fractures.

Those cumulative impacts also occur within areas considered as ³protected² by those authors, such as Big Cypress National Preserve and Fakahatchee Strand State Preserve, from groundwater withdrawals for municipal, agricultural and industrial/power plant use, from non-mechanical dewatering of the aquifer system from all types of mining, and from oil exploration, even beyond the boundaries of those areas that are presumed to be ³protected.² Those cumulative impacts are in addition to the cumulative impacts from panther deaths due to existing and proposed roads and proposed development projects (e.g., the proposed Rural Lands West subdivision in eastern Collier County, adjacent to the Florida Panther National Wildlife Refuge), which would include traffic in addition to increasing groundwater alterations that will degrade and destroy essential panther habitat. I am including the seven attached publications (submitted individually) as examples of the fractures and cumulative impacts referenced above that result from groundwater impacts to habitats, including habitats essential to the survival of Florida panthers. I urge the USFWS to consider all of those cumulative impacts now and after continuing the endangered status of the Florida panther to ensure the survival and recovery of the Florida panther.

Sincerely,
Sydney T. Bacchus, Ph. D.
Hydroecologist

cc: Ecology Party of Florida (chair@ecologyparty.org)

Attachments

1. Bacchus, S.T. (2006) Nonmechanical dewatering of the regional Floridan aquifer system. Perspectives on Karst Geomorphology, Hydrology, and Geochemistry, 404, 219-234
2. Bacchus, S.T. (2007) More inconvenient truths: Wildfires and wetlands, SWANCC and Rapanos. National Wetlands Newsletter, 29, 15-21
3. Lines, J.P., Bernardes, S., He, J., Zhang, S., Bacchus, S.T., Madden, M., & Jordan, T. (2012) Preferential groundwater flow pathways and hydroperiod alterations indicated by georectified lineaments and sinkholes at proposed karst nuclear power plant and mine sites. Journal of Sustainable Development, 5, p78
4. Bacchus, S.T., Bernardes, S., Jordan, T., & Madden, M. (2014) Benthic macroalgal blooms as indicators of nutrient loading from aquifer-injected sewage effluent in environmentally sensitive near-shore waters associated with the South Florida Keys. Journal of Geography and Geology, 6
5. Bacchus, S.T., Bernardes, S., Xu, W., & Madden, M. (2015a) Fractures as preferential flowpaths for aquifer storage and recovery (ASR) injections and withdrawals: implications for environmentally sensitive near-shore waters, wetlands of the Greater Everglades Basin and the regional karst aquifer system. Journal of Geography and Geology, 7, 117-155
6. Bacchus, S. T., Bernardes, S., Xu, W., & Madden, M. (2015b). What Georgia Can Learn from Aquifer Storage and Recovery (ASR) in Florida. Proceedings of the 2015 Georgia Water Resources Conference, held April 28-29, 2015, at The University of Georgia, Athens, GA. (eds R.J. McDowell, C.A. Pruitt, R.A. Bahn)
7. Xu, W., S. Bernardes, S. T., Bacchus and M. Madden. (2016) Mapped Fractures and Sinkholes in the Coastal Plain of Florida and Georgia to Infer Environmental Impacts from Aquifer Storage and Recovery (ASR) and Supply Wells in the Regional Karst Floridan Aquifer System. Journal of Geography and Geology 8(2):76-110

------ End of Forwarded Message

------ End of Forwarded Message

------ End of Forwarded Message

------ End of Forwarded Message

------ End of Forwarded Message

------ End of Forwarded Message

From: djimmison@gmail.com
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Big Cats of Florida
Date: Saturday, August 12, 2017 7:08:16 AM

Good Morning! My name is Diana Jimmison. I reside in Middleburg, Florida in the country and have resided here all of my life. I and the people of the State of Florida. I beg of you an urge you to keep the protection of out Big Cats here in Florida especially out Florida Panthers and Bobcats. Please please keep our animals protected.
Thank you!
Diana Jimmison
[redacted]
2842 Windemere Ct
Middleburg, FL 32068

Sent from my iPhone

From:	Cassandra Provost
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Cassandra Provost Hialeah Gardens High School
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 11:20:54 PM

Hi David Shindle,

My names Cassandra Provost and I am from Hialeah Gardens Senior High School. I think panthers should be listed as endangered. They should be protected. If they are listed as threatening then the less people would want them around. Having Florida Panthers keeps the number of animals it hunts like deers in check. They are already endangered as it is we should do all we can to keep them around, and maybe in the future have more. The Florida Panther is such a rare beautiful animal that should be around for years to come.

Sincerely,

Cassandra Provost

From: Shannon Muir Stevenson
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Cats
Date: Monday, August 14, 2017 8:14:14 AM

Please don't harm these beautiful cats... stop killing things
Sent from my iPhone

From:	Victoria Olson
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Change of Florida Panther Protection
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 11:28:39 PM
Importance:	High

There's just an estimated 230 Florida panthers still in existence, federal regulators are reconsidering their status as an endangered species, WHY?

U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service is studying whether a slight uptick in panther population since 2014 is enough to change them from "endangered" to "threatened."

Changing panthers' endangered status could do away with some of their federal protections. It's a move supported by developers and ranchers who bristle at limits imposed on using panthers' ever-shrinking territory.

Supporters of changing the endangered species status argue that panthers — driven away by sprawling development, pollution and over hunting — could survive without the same level of protection that has kept them from drifting into extinction. If that's the case, then surely there must be more than just 230 panthers prowling around out there somewhere. Perhaps they are hiding in the subdivisions and shopping centers now spread over their bulldozed territory. Maybe we just can't see them as we speed over the roads and highways crisscrossing the hunting grounds panthers once roamed.

The U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service says that reconsidering the panther's endangered status is a standard practice that will result in a recommendation, not an immediate change to panther protections. If a change from "endangered" to "threatened" is recommended, that would kick off more than a year of considerations for federal officials to decide what the new panther protection rules should be.

The Florida panther's road to recovery has been slow and remains too risky to dial back protections.

After the number of Florida panthers dipped into the 20s in the 1970s, prohibitions on killing panthers along with protecting remaining habitat and even bringing in panthers from Texas to help boost breeding have helped them rebound.

Federal and state officials in February announced that the panther population had grown to as many 230, up from about 180 in 2014. That's welcome news, but not a reason to start changing the rules that helped panthers survive.

Development and other man-made pressures continue to squeeze out room for the panther. **That makes it more important than ever to bolster, not diminish, protections for Florida's remaining panthers.**

Victoria Olson
victoriao@bellsouth.net
Broward Cultural Council
"Compassion is not religious business, it is human business, it is not luxury, it is essential

for our own peace and mental stability, it is essential for human survival."
— Dalai Lama XIV

From:	Sara Byrd
To:	David_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Comment about the "Florida" panther.
Date:	Wednesday, August 16, 2017 3:57:21 PM

Hello David,

.My name is Sara Byrd, and would like to voice my opinions about the exsitance of the "Florida" panther.

I can indeed talk about this topic all day, and to be quite honest it is nothing good.
What exactly does the Florida Panther do for the ecosystem that, people or other less invasive species don't already? Absolutely nothing. All that cat does is KILL, anything they please. How is that okay?

If FWC would like a healthy panther population, like anything else it must be managed, not let get completely out of control like it is being allowed to do so now.

To,be quite frank, all I hear is excuses on why this useless cat does this or does that. You guys do not have an accurate assessment of the active "FLORIDA" panther population, they are steaming out of control. Do you really think if there was only 200 in the state of florida that 40 or so would still be getting killed yearly on the road ways?

Killing off ones livelyhood is NOT okay.
This cat needs to he properly controlled.

From:	amber crooks
To:	David Shindle (david_shindle@fws.gov)
Cc:	nicole johnson; "Jason Totoiu"; Haley Stewart (hstewart@humanesociety.org); "Jacki Lopez"; ALISON KELLY (AKELLY@NRDC.ORG); Christina Scaringe (christinascaringe@ad-international.org); Jennifer Leon; "cmclaughlin@npca.org" (cmclaughlin@npca.org)
Subject:	Comment letter regarding the 5 Year Status Review of the Florida panther
Date:	Friday, August 25, 2017 5:28:06 PM
Attachments:	5 Year Status_Florida Panther_08.25.17_Group letter.pdf

Dear Mr. Shindle,

On behalf of the Conservancy of Southwest Florida, Everglades Law Center, Humane Society of the United States, Center for Biological Diversity, Natural Resources Defense Council, Animal Defenders International, National Parks Conservation Association, and Big Cat Rescue, please see the attached letter regarding the USFWS 5-Year Status Review of the Florida panther.

Please feel free to contact any of the organizations if you have questions or would like to discuss our letter further. A CD containing referenced documents will also be provided to you under separate cover.

Thank you for considering our comments.

Sincerely,

Amber Crooks

Amber Crooks, Senior Environmental Policy Specialist
Conservancy of Southwest Florida
1495 Smith Preserve Way
Naples, FL 34102
[redacted] ext. 286
amberc@conservancy.org
www.conservancy.org

Protecting Southwest Florida's unique natural environment and quality of life…now and forever.

Please consider the environment before printing this e-mail

From: Kathryn Dorn
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Comment on Florida Panther conservation status
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 7:59:42 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

I'm writing this in absolute support of maintaining the Florida panther's current status as a protected endangered subspecies. Our panthers once were and, I hope, will someday be again an important part of Florida's ecosystems, and the fact that separate cougar populations exist in the western U.S. doesn't directly affect our state's panther population and should not affect their conservation status. We can't revive this subspecies later if we allow them to be killed off now. Please maintain the Florida panther's current conservation status and help our state keep its panthers!

Sincerely,
Kathryn Dorn

From:	Karen Hoffmann
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Comment on Florida panther endangered status
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 4:36:46 PM

To whom it may concern:

I'm writing to urge that USFWS **maintain full endangered species status for the Florida panther** – and consider the cumulative impacts to the panther from the many development projects currently underway or under review in its habitat. I ask that USFWS also consider what those projects are doing to the likelihood that the Florida panther will ever recover.

The panther's small core habitat in southwest Florida, less than five percent of its original range across most of the southeast United States, continues to shrink and become more fragmented by the day. Up to a dozen new development projects in that core habitat – including oil exploration across hundreds of thousands of acres, road expansions, new power plant construction, and new subdivisions – are poised to destroy or degrade massive amounts of some of the best upland habitats this species has left. And while the panther population may have recovered from near-extinction in the mid-nineties when only 20 to 30 panthers remained, the current estimate of 120 to 230 panthers is still a tiny number. With continued habitat loss and roadkill continuing to take their toll, that population has almost certainly reached a peak. A record 42 panthers died in 2015 with 30 killed as a result of vehicle collision. That record was equaled in 2016, but with 32 cases of roadkill. With more growth, wider roads, and more cars on those roads, this grim situation is not expected to improve.

The Florida panther remains an isolated sub-species of the North American cougar. It has had little to no contact with puma populations in the western United States for approximately 100 years – after habitat loss, highway construction, and indiscriminate hunting wiped out those connections. The "eastern cougar" was declared extinct in its last 5-year review conducted in 2011 – making the Florida panther the very last sub-species and breeding population of cougars east of the Mississippi River. The Florida panther was chosen by Florida's schoolchildren in 1982 as our state animal and is also considered an important "keystone species" (of vital importance to the ecosystem where it is found) and "umbrella species" (protection of panther habitat protects numerous other plants and animals – many also rare and endangered - which share its range). It is the name of South Florida's hockey team and numerous school sports teams around the state.

Recent scientific surveys of the Florida panther landscape (Kautz, et al, 2006, and Frakes, et al, 2015) have recommended no loss in either the quality or quantity of the Florida panther's remaining habitat in southwest Florida - if the species is to have any chance of survival into the future. So far, that advice is not being heeded by any of the responsible government agencies.

Please exercise your power as a regulatory agency of the United States government and fulfill your duties under the Endangered Species Act by protecting the Florida panther's vital but rapidly shrinking habitat from loss, degradation, and fragmentation.

Thank you for your urgent attention to this matter.

Best,
Karen

--
Karen Hoffmann, Esq.
Attorney
ALDEA - The People's Justice Center
[redacted] (office)

[redacted] (cell)
karen@berksprobono.org

From: Jocelyn Ziemian
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Comment on Florida panther listing status
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 11:59:28 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

I write in support of maintaining endangered listing status for the Florida panther under the Endangered Species Act. Three major factors argue for continuing this status:

1. Habitat: Florida panthers are an iconic species, the habitat of which is increasingly threatened by extensive human development, ranching activities, and alterations from climate change, especially sea level rise. Florida panthers are still at great risk of extinction due to habitat loss and degradation. The species will not be able to recover unless its last remaining habitat is protected and ensured connectivity to new habitats in Florida and beyond so panthers can establish new home ranges.

2. Small population size: The best available science regarding panther recovery establishes that reclassification from endangered to threatened should only be considered if the species has two viable populations of at least 240 adults and subadults for at least twelve years, in addition to other criterion related to habitat connectivity. For delisting, three populations of 240 panthers are needed. The latest population estimate of 120 to 230 adult and subadult panthers, if accurate, is not enough to constitute even one viable population.

3. Genetics: There is not enough evidence at this time to determine that the panther is not a subspecies of Puma concolor. Additional research is needed for a comprehensive evaluation of the Florida panther's genetic status. Therefore, panthers should not be downlisted or delisted based on currently existing, but insufficient, genetics research.

Thank you for this opportunity to comment.

Sincerely,
Jocelyn Ziemian
Washington, DC

From:	MARY
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Comment on review of status of Florida Panther
Date:	Thursday, August 24, 2017 1:03:38 PM

Mr. Shindle:
I am opposed to any change in the protected status of our Florida Panthers and want them to remain on Endangered Status. While Panther populations have improved in South Florida their habitat has decreased. Nothing is being done to decrease land development and other projects so the threats to their habitat will only increase.

I also believe more should be done to provide a safe corridor for our Panthers from South Florida to areas north of the Caloosahachee River, including highway over and underpasses.

Thank you for your time.

Mary Hoffman
1811 Sabal Palm Drive
Davie, Florida 33324

From:	Kurt Schwarz
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Comments from the Maryland Ornithological Society Regard Proposed Reclassification for the Florida Panther
Date:	Sunday, August 27, 2017 7:29:48 PM
Attachments:	MOS Florida Panther August 2017.docx

Dear Mr. Shindle:

Please find attached the detailed comments of the Maryland Ornithological Society regarding the proposed reclassification of the status of the Florida panther. In summary, we oppose it as bad for the panther and nesting bird habitat. Please enter these comments into the permanent record.

Kurt Schwarz
Conservation Chair
Maryland Ornithological Society.
krschwa1@verizon.net

From:	Randy Kautz
To:	David Shindle
Subject:	Comments on Florida Panther 5-Year Status Review
Date:	Thursday, August 17, 2017 3:25:20 PM
Attachments:	Randy Kautz - Comments - Panther 5-Year Status Review.pdf

---

David,

Attached are my comments on the Florida panther 5-year status review. In summary, I recommend that the Florida panther remain listed as endangered under the U.S. Endangered Species Act of 1973, as amended. The attached document provides the basis for my recommendation. Please let me know if you have any questions or concerns regarding this document.

Randy Kautz
2625 Neuchatel Drive
Tallahassee, FL 32303
Email: randykautz@comcast.net
Cell: (850) [redacted]

From:	E Zambello
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Comments on the Florida Panther
Date:	Friday, August 11, 2017 12:17:21 PM

Good morning,

I am writing to say I do not support the de-listing of the Florida panther. It is abundantly clear that there are not enough individuals in this population to remove the threat of extinction in the near-future, and de-listing would remove critical protections for this species on the edge. Additionally, the Florida population is expecting to grow, meaning protections are more important than ever.

Please do not downgrade the status of the Florida panther or de-list the species altogether.

Thank you so much for your time and for the work you all do at FWS! Even though I don't hunt I just bought my Duck Stump :)

Sincerely,
Erika
Santa Rosa Beach, FL

--
Erika A. Zambello

Duke Nicholas School of the Environment, 2015
M.E.M. Ecosystem Science and Conservation
Cornell University, 2012
B.A. Government, B.A. Anthropology
zambellophotography.com

From:	heidi
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Comments on the Florida Panther
Date:	Thursday, August 24, 2017 3:21:18 PM

Hello Mr. Schindle,

I am contacting you today in regards to the status reconsideration of the Florida Panther as an endangered species. Consider there are only approximately 230 Florida panthers in existence today, we absolutely must keep them on the endangered species list. These animals needs all the protection we can offer. We must not bow to developers and whomever else wishes to remove them from the list. It is our job as humans, as scientists, and as animal lovers to protect these animals and encourage population growth however we can. If you wish to reconsider protections for the Florida panther, perhaps we could increase protections.

Thank you,

Heidi Miller
Florida resident, scientist, and animal lover.

From: Jeremy Bleech
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Comments
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 9:13:19 AM

I would like to let you know that I highly support keeping the Florida Panther on the Endangered species list. I believe that taking it off the list would set years of work of restoration back and end up bringing the Florida panther, once again, to the brink of extinction.

I understand that hunters would rather have a larger deer population to hunt, and would prefer that they do not have to compete with local predators for hunting deer, but that is the reality of the situation, one which Florida has always been, and should be. Removing them off the list for that reason is not a worth argument in my opinion.

I do not think that the Florida Panther even meets the criteria to be taken off the Endangered species list. There may be some mixed blood, but the Florida Panther is isolated, and is a part of our national history and should be presevered.

Jeremy Bleech

From: jcomiskey@comcast.net
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Comments: Endangered and Threatened Wildlife and Plants; 5-Year Status Reviews of 23 Southeastern Species
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 11:42:17 PM

Attn: David Schindle
Florida Panther Coordinator
South Florida Ecological Services Field Office
U.S. Fish & Wildlife Service

Below are my comments on the Federal Register Notice by the Fish and Wildlife Service on 06/30/2017 (https://www.federalregister.gov/documents/2017/06/30/2017-13758/endangered-and-threatened-wildlife-and-plants-5-year-status-reviews-of-23-southeastern-species): Endangered and Threatened Wildlife and Plants; 5-Year Status Reviews of 23 Southeastern Species

A. Species biology, including but not limited to population trends, distribution, abundance, demographics, and genetics

I urge USFWS not to rely on unsound estimates of panther population size or carrying capacity. These are not "best available scientific data" as they are not scientific.

There are currently no statistically sound estimates of 1) Florida panther population size relative to recovery goals or 2) carrying capacity of panther range. Agency statements and press accounts repeat estimates based on unwarranted extrapolations from the most densely populated areas of panther habitat, supported by increasing rates of roadway mortality that are just as likely to reflect increased hazards and demographic shifts. Beginning early in panther monitoring, the important concept of carrying capacity has been conflated with yearly population estimates. Recovery spokesmen have often made press statements representing the annual count for any given year as the maximum number of panthers the environment could support.

Recent press accounts, some quoting agency spokesmen, have referenced 120-160 panthers, up to 160, 160, at least 160, then the same upward progression has been repeated for "estimates" of 180 and 230, sometimes stipulating adults and subadults, sometimes adults, sometimes breeding adults, often accompanied by statements that the currently referenced number is all the environment can support. Most disturbing: "Official estimates put the Florida Panther population at 230" (Jim Ash, WGCU News August 10, 2017, http://news.wgcu.org/post/animal-rights-groups-growl-panther-regulators). There are reliable methods for estimating carrying capacity and population size, but these have not yet been applied to the Florida panther population.

The documented lower end of the estimate on myfwc.com is often ignored ("There are approximately 120-230 adult panthers in the population."), but the annual McBride count represented by the lower estimate - which has remained stable over the past decade - is likely close to the total population, as panther ranges on private land often

overlap public lands.

The danger lies in how the above "guestimates" are used.

Using them in press accounts and public statements can mislead the public about critical aspects of panther recovery.

Using them in species status reports and recovery plans can lead to mischaracterizing the degree of endangerment/recovery and misdirected recovery planning.

Using them in a biological opinion to characterize impacts to the existing population can lead to failure to recognize jeopardy situations or failure to accurately assess and compensate for impacts to panthers.

Using them as estimates of "carrying capacity" and/or current existing population size in a Population Viability Analysis can lead to erroneous conclusions about extinction risk over time.

There are disturbing examples of each of these uses in panther recovery, many critiqued in Beier et al. 2003, 2006; Conroy et al. 2006; and PEER and Eller 2004.

Genetics: The genetic restoration program initiated in 1995 has been a success, but continued success depends on further translocations of P. stanleyana females, originally planned for 1 every 6 years. I have read no explanation as to why additional translocations have not been undertaken.

With regard to the recommendation in Culver et al. (2000) that Puma subspecies be lumped together: the authors relied on a small number of Florida panther pelts (some of dubious origin), and they found that the Florida panther has unique features and is one of the most distinct of the subspecies. The scientific community has not embraced such a revision. Culver's work does not warrant so drastic a step as to remove endangered species status from the panther.

Thank you for considering these comments.

Best regards,
Jane Comiskey
1122 Volunteer Blvd. Ste. 106
jcomiskey@comcast.net

From:	SYDNEY
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov; Chair, Ecology Party of Florida
Subject:	COMMENTS: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 9:54:06 PM
Attachments:	USFWS panther ltr 082917.pdf

Dear Dr. Shindle,

Please see the following comments as justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species.

Attached is the letter version of these comments as the following pdf file: USFWS panther ltr 082917.pdf

I will be forwarding the 7 attachments separately because of the large file size of some of those attachments.

Thank you for the opportunity to provide comments.

Sincerely,
Sydney Bacchus, Ph. D.
Hydroecologist

August 29, 2017

David Shindle, Florida Panther Coordinator
U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service
david_shindle@fws.gov

Re: Justification for maintaining the listing of Florida panthers as an endangered species

Dear Dr. Shindle,

I am providing the formal comments below on behalf of the Ecology Party of Florida (EPF) and myself, for the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service¹s (USFWS) status review for continued listing of the Florida panthers (Puma concolor coryi) as an endangered species. My comments are based, in part, on the approximately 40 peer-reviewed papers, journal articles, book chapters and books, addressing various aspects of the irreversible adverse environmental impacts of groundwater alterations on habitats in Florida and the southeastern coastal plain that I have authored or co-authored.

CUMULATIVE IMPACTS NOT CONSIDERED
Habitat for Florida panthers and a primary prey of these panthers (i.e., white-tailed deer) has been evaluated by Davis (1943); Young and Goldman (1946); Harlow and Jones (1965); Hemker, Lindzey, and Ackerman (1984); Belden and Maehr (1986); Maehr (1987); Maehr, Land, Roof, and McCown (1989); Beier, Choate, and Barrett (1995); Kautz, Kawula, Hoctor, Comiskey, Jansen, Jennings, Kasbohm, Mazzotti, McBride, Richardson, and Root (2006); Benson, Lotz and Jansen (2008); Land, Shindle, Kawula, Benson, Lotz, and Onorato (2008); Onorato, Criffield, Lotz, Cunningham, McBride, Leone, Bass, and Helgren (2011); Frakes, Belden, Wood, and James (2015); van de Kerk, Onorato, Criffield, Bolker, Augustine, McKinley, and Oli (2015); and others.

None of those studies considered the adverse cumulative impacts (effects) related to groundwater alterations that degrade and destroy of essential panther habitat in the primary and secondary panther habitat zones, including habitat for panther dens and habitat for an abundance of high quality prey items that are essential for the nutritional demands of successfully rearing panther kittens in the wild.

As examples, Kautz et al. (2006) and Frakes et al. (2015) recommended no loss of quality and quantity of the remaining panther habitat in southwest Florida, but those publications did not address the highly fractured aquifer system underlying the areas designated as primary and secondary panther habitat zones or how groundwater alterations via those fractures degrade and destroy essential habitat within those zones. In fact, neither those publications, nor the others referenced above addressed the adverse cumulative impacts (effects) of groundwater alterations (e.g., from groundwater withdrawals for municipal, agricultural and industrial/power plant use and from non-mechanical dewatering of the aquifer system from all types of mining) that occur far from the surface footprints via fractures.

Those cumulative impacts also occur within areas considered as ³protected² by those authors, such as Big Cypress National Preserve and Fakahatchee Strand State Preserve, from groundwater withdrawals for municipal, agricultural and industrial/power plant use, from non-mechanical dewatering of the aquifer system from all types of mining, and from oil exploration, even beyond the boundaries of those areas that are presumed to be ³protected.² Those cumulative impacts are in addition to the cumulative impacts from panther deaths due to existing and proposed roads and proposed development projects (e.g., the proposed Rural Lands West subdivision in eastern Collier County, adjacent to the Florida Panther National Wildlife Refuge), which would include traffic in addition to increasing groundwater alterations that will degrade and destroy essential panther habitat. I am including the seven attached publications (submitted individually) as examples of the fractures and cumulative impacts referenced above that result from groundwater impacts to habitats, including habitats essential to the survival of Florida panthers. I urge the USFWS to consider all of those cumulative impacts now and after continuing the endangered status of the Florida panther to ensure the survival and recovery of the Florida panther.

Sincerely,
Sydney T. Bacchus, Ph. D.
Hydroecologist

cc: Ecology Party of Florida (chair@ecologyparty.org)

Attachments

1. Bacchus, S.T. (2006) Nonmechanical dewatering of the regional Floridan aquifer system. Perspectives on Karst Geomorphology, Hydrology, and Geochemistry, 404, 219-234
2. Bacchus, S.T. (2007) More inconvenient truths: Wildfires and wetlands, SWANCC and Rapanos. National Wetlands Newsletter, 29, 15-21
3. Lines, J.P., Bernardes, S., He, J., Zhang, S., Bacchus, S.T., Madden, M., & Jordan, T. (2012) Preferential groundwater flow pathways and hydroperiod alterations indicated by georectified lineaments and sinkholes at proposed karst nuclear power plant and mine sites. Journal of Sustainable Development, 5, p78
4. Bacchus, S.T., Bernardes, S., Jordan, T., & Madden, M. (2014) Benthic macroalgal blooms as indicators of nutrient loading from

aquifer-injected sewage effluent in environmentally sensitive near-shore waters associated with the South Florida Keys. Journal of Geography and Geology, 6

5. Bacchus, S.T., Bernardes, S., Xu, W., & Madden, M. (2015a) Fractures as preferential flowpaths for aquifer storage and recovery (ASR) injections and withdrawals: implications for environmentally sensitive near-shore waters, wetlands of the Greater Everglades Basin and the regional karst aquifer system. Journal of Geography and Geology, 7, 117-155

6. Bacchus, S. T., Bernardes, S., Xu, W., & Madden, M. (2015b). What Georgia Can Learn from Aquifer Storage and Recovery (ASR) in Florida. Proceedings of the 2015 Georgia Water Resources Conference, held April 28-29, 2015, at The University of Georgia, Athens, GA. (eds R.J. McDowell, C.A. Pruitt, R.A. Bahn)

7. Xu, W., S. Bernardes, S. T., Bacchus and M. Madden. (2016) Mapped Fractures and Sinkholes in the Coastal Plain of Florida and Georgia to Infer Environmental Impacts from Aquifer Storage and Recovery (ASR) and Supply Wells in the Regional Karst Floridan Aquifer System. Journal of Geography and Geology 8(2):76-110

From:	Christian Lamelas
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Concern about Florida"s endangered panthers.
Date:	Sunday, August 27, 2017 8:43:08 PM

Dear Dave,

I am a 12th grade student at Hialeah Gardens Senior High who has just read a very concerning news report on the endangerment of Florida Panthers. I am writing to you to voice my opinion on such matter and hopefully help these panthers make a come back in the wild. With as little as an estimated 203 Florida panthers left in existence, I strongly believe that their status should not be reconsidered and brought down to a status of only a "threatened" species. If anything, federal regulators should be working even harder to make sure that these panthers are able to thrive and prosper in their rightful homes. I also believe that developers and ranchers should not be allowed to take land from these panther's ever-shrinking territories. The Florida panther's status should remain as an endangered species so that their population numbers can begin to increase and so more of these panthers can roam in the wild once more.

Sincerely, Christian Lamelas

From: Kelly of the Wild
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Concerned for the Florida Panther
Date: Sunday, August 13, 2017 10:30:26 AM

Hi David!

I read an article on a Tampa Bay news source saying there was the potential for the Florida Panther to be "Delisted" from protected status in the state. They provided your information and I wanted to learn more about this topic.

First, is is true the FWC is discussing this? And second, if yes how and who do I speak with to voice my concern with that decision? I'm a fourth generation Floridian and my family has lived just off conservation land in Kissimmee for 80 years. I love this state and all of it's wildlife and this is a topic that I am passionate about. Any information would be much appreciated!

Thank you so much for your time David! I look forward to your reply!

-Kelly

Kelly Quinn Art
Mobile: (813)-[redacted]
Website: kellyquinnart.com

From:	Carlos-Daniel Cruz
To:	David_Shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Concerning the Florida Panther"s status.
Date:	Sunday, August 27, 2017 4:44:26 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

As a Florida resident and a strong believer of environmental conservation, I believe that it is imperative to preserve the protection of the Florida Panther, and furthermore entitle it as an endangered species in need of land and rights against any sort of hunting, illegal poaching, and non-authorized relocation. The Florida Panther is a sigil of the beauty and unique fauna present in our green State, and both it's memory and existence should be guaranteed for generations to come. Let's not forget that the Panther is our only large feline in the North American wilderness besides the rare accounts of Jaguars in the southern border, and the loss of an animal that represents so much for the woodlands and swamps of Florida would be detrimental for our image as a state with wildlife uncommon for any other parts of the continent for the exception of close states such as Louisiana. The industries waiting to build on land designated for these beautiful animals should be kept at bay, as preservation should always come first before construction.

Sincerely,
Carlos D. Cruz

From:	Annisa Karim
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	conservation status of the Florida panther
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 10:14:03 PM

Mr. Shindle,
Please add this to the record of public comment regarding the conservation status of the Florida panther.

I emphatically urge the service to maintain the panther's "endangered" status – and redouble efforts to protect remaining habitat.

The panther's small core habitat in southwest Florida, less than five percent of its original range across most of the southeast United States, continues to shrink and become more fragmented by the day. Up to a dozen new development projects in that core habitat – including oil exploration across hundreds of thousands of acres, road expansions, new power plant construction, and new subdivisions – are poised to destroy or degrade massive amounts of some of the best upland habitats this species has left. And while the panther population may have recovered from near-extinction in the mid-nineties when only 20 to 30 panthers remained, the current estimate of 120 to 230 panthers is still a tiny number. With continued habitat loss and roadkill continuing to take their toll, that population has almost certainly reached a peak. A record 42 panthers died in 2015 with 30 killed as a result of vehicle collision. That record was equaled in 2016, but with 32 cases of roadkill. With more growth, wider roads, and more cars on those roads, this grim situation is not expected to improve.

To be sure, lessening protections for the Florida Panther will increase the rate of destruction of their habitat - especially in Collier County. Currently, 9 of the largest landowners are petitioning to get incident take permits to kill panthers for their future development. Of course, one cannot get an incidental take permit for an endangered animal, but if you down list the panther - that request will surely be fulfilled.

Again, I emphatically urge the service to maintain the panther's "endangered" status – and redouble efforts to protect remaining habitat.

Annisa Karim
Naples, FL 34116
"Why, our descendants will ask, by needlessly extinguishing the lives of other species, did we permanently impoverish our own?"
- E.O. Wilson, The Future of Life

From: Alicia Murchie
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Continue Panther Protections
Date: Saturday, August 12, 2017 6:57:58 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle:

I am writing to express my support for continued protections of the Florida Panther. Please add my comments into the pile with those who are against reducing protections in any way to this animal, which I've come to know as one of our state symbols, and an important denizen of our wild lands. Essentially allowing its extinction through such reductions in favor of short sighted desires and special interests makes our state look bad and cuts one more string in the web of Florida's already beleaguered ecosystem. Let's not embarrass ourselves by moving backwards in policy and thought on an issue that so many citizens care about or threaten the remaining few hundred of a high profile endangered species by reducing restrictions. With so few alive, this should not even be a question for debate. Thank you for your time.

Best Regards,

Alicia Murchie

From:	Nathan Collins
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Continue Protection of the Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 10:00:53 PM
Attachments:	image002.png image005.png

Hi David,

I read an article today indicating that U.S. Fish and Wildlife is considering lifting ‘endangered status’ on the Florida Panther since developers want to develop the land that is their habitat.

Just like a recent action by FWC to get public opinion about opening a fishing season on the endangered Goliath Grouper, I am astonished that government agencies are looking to uneducated citizens like myself instead of the experienced scientists that have real educuation and research projects.

For some reason some government organizations don't want to use science to make smart decisions, they just listen to the squeaky wheel or lobbyists with deep pockets. There are only 230 panthers, but developers have become the squeaky wheel and want panther protections lifted so that they can make more $$$$ by continuing to develop land that is some of the only remaining habitat for native panthers. Please listen to science instead of dollars. Please protect an important animal with populations that are far from 'recovered'.

Per the Sun Sentinel, http://www.sun-sentinel.com/opinion/editorials/fl-op-editorial-florida-panther-protections-20170822-story.html, the number of panther deaths due to vehicle strikes alone have outnumbered the panther births over recent years. Also panthers have less than 5% of historical territory. When is enough enough? It is time to listen to the science and continue protection of the Florida Panther. Thanks for your help.

Sincerely,
Nate Collins
Key Largo, Florida resident.

PEACH MARINE PARTS

GEORGIA WATERSPORTS

PartsPak

From:	Ron Wentworth
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Cc:	jholic@venicegov.com; Joy Wentworth
Subject:	Continue to Protect the Florida Panther
Date:	Thursday, August 24, 2017 6:32:11 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

My wife, Joy, and I are 28-year residents of Sarasota County. I have followed the plight and slow improvement of the Florida panther for many years.

Venice, FL Mayor John Holic was instrumental in getting a bronze sculpture of a Florida panther installed in our James T Blalock Park in Venice. Joy and I attended the dedication of the panther sculpture at that park several years ago. If you are ever in Venice, I recommend that you visit this park to see the sculptures of the panther and other Florida species including the manatee. They at quite remarkable to see.

From an 8/24/17 article in the Sarasota Herald Tribune, I read that it is estimated that there are only 230 panthers alive in Florida. Presently the Florida panther designation is endangered. Each year since 2012 new records of panther vehicular deaths are set.

Considering the high number of panther deaths this year resulting mostly from highway accidents (13) and the low estimated number of living panthers in Florida (230), I strongly urge you to keep the Florida panther listed as endangered.

Thank you for your attention to this very important issue.

Ron Wentworth
400 Bellini Circle
Nokomis, FL 34275
[redacted]
ronwentworth1@yahoo.com

From:	Carol Church
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Continue to protect the panther
Date:	Friday, August 11, 2017 9:46:47 AM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

I understand the endangered status of the Florida panther is currently under review. Please do not alllow political interests to taint this process. The panther is a powerful Floridian symbol and has barely begun true recovery. We need these amazing animals in Florida. It is tragic to think of them being delisted or of "take" being alllowed. Thank you.

Carol Church
Gainesville, FL

From:	Sharon Levine
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Continued protection for FL panther
Date:	Thursday, August 17, 2017 9:05:17 PM

Hello,
I'm writing to urge you to support continued efforts to protect the Florida Panther. With continued construction and shrinking habitat they need advocacy and protection now more than ever.

Thank you,
Sharon

Sent from my iPhone

From:	Jeanne Rossow
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Cc:	Lucy Rice; Bio Lumines; Marlene Andrusia Anderson; linda kinzler.email
Subject:	Cougar
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 10:19:11 PM

I need to win PowerBall so that I can buy land that is connected to cougar habitat so that they have a bit more!!
Hope the state of florida sees the value and beauty of this predator.

Jeanne Rossow
Rockledge FL

From:	Liana Shakhnazaryan
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Dear Mister Shindle, please read my email
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 10:21:08 PM

I strongly believe that those who love life should love every human and hon-human life. There are so many injustices to fight for the living creatures in this world. One of them is protection of FLORIDA NATIVES- THE PANYTHERS. Until now I had no idea your state had panthers. They should thrive and more people should learn about them. Please increase the protection of these rare species that are suffocating in contestant need to survive because they are pressured by ranchers and miners and other forms of human greed to disappear from the face of this Earth. Please help our world find balance by doing your part and protecting what is in your power to protect. I beg you.

Thank You, David
Peace in Earth.

From:	Rolandito Sosa
To:	David_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Dear Mr Shindle
Date:	Sunday, August 27, 2017 11:47:59 PM

I'm student at Hialeah Gardens Senior High School , my name is Rolando Sosa. My teacher had us the class email you as an assignment after reading you're article about the Florida Panthers. I just wanted to say that I'm very interested in finding out more about the Panthers. I didn't even realize they were ever in danger. As well as I learned a lot from the newspaper article you wrote.
I think that the Panthers should not be killed since even being aggressive they have a life equal to every human being. Thank you for your time Mr Shindle.

Sincerely ,
Rolando

From: medicaldx@aol.com
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Dear sir;
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 4:23:05 PM

I think the Florida Panther should remain on the endangered list.
Thank you for your time

Sent from AOL Mobile Mail

From:	Laurie dAult
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Dear Sir:
Date:	Saturday, August 12, 2017 10:55:47 AM

I'm writing to urge you to continue to keep the Florida Panther on the protected list. This beautiful animal deserves every protection we can afford them.

Thank-you for your kind attention to this matter.

Laurie d'Ault
3381 21st St
Wyandotte, MI 48192

Sent from Laurie's iPhone

From: joycestefancic
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Delis ting Florida Panther
Date: Saturday, August 12, 2017 12:11:47 PM

Mr. Shingle,
I do not understand how the Fl. Panther could possibly be delis Ted, with only 240 individuals left in the wild. Please do not allow this to happen. With species worldwide becoming extinct every day, we cannot allow that to happen to this beautiful, big cat, for no reason.
Thank you,
Joyce Stefancic
Clermont, Fl 34715

Sent from my Galaxy Tab® A

From:	Angela Durand
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Cc:	Fred Grimm
Subject:	Delist the endangered Florida Panther?
Date:	Sunday, August 13, 2017 6:53:36 PM

Are you serious? You guys at the Fish and Wildlife Service(!?!) must have a collective IQ just above plant life.

One might be willing to revise this assessment upon production of intelligible reasons for such an action. However, the record and your website would indicate you either can not or will not.

Has it escaped FWS's notice that Florida is home to a larger than usual number of macho automatic-weapon-toting morons who find in killing a mid-sized endangered feline a sadistic pleasure which confers on them imaginary hero status?

Would one be far from the mark if one inferred that they, together with an abnormally $-obsessed sociopathic governor supported by an legislature, wield sinister influence (read "hunting license income") on your organization? Or does FWS act alone in this venal in(s)anity?

And..... is one just another pathetic tax payer awaiting your comments, breath unbaited.

A Durand, Registered Independent Voter
Coral Gables, FL

From:	Sonja Briscoe
To:	David_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Delisting
Date:	Saturday, August 12, 2017 10:22:39 AM

Sir- Please remove the item from the agenda and allow these animals to live. Trophy hunting is a deplorable act that destroys God'a creatures.

Have a heart! Thank you!

Sent from my iPhone

From:	Gail Herr
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Delisting Florida Panther
Date:	Friday, August 11, 2017 9:22:26 PM

Dear Mr. Shingle,

For every human living in Florida, there are 0.00001117 Florida panthers in existence.

Florida's population grows to roughly 20.6 million and the Florida panther population has dwindled to about 230, mostly due to habitat destruction, what with our tendency to drain and mangle the landscape to make way for another Pizza Hut or whatever excites exurbia these days.

Environmentalists and animal welfare advocates say there is absolutely no scientific basis for the proposed de-listing of Florida's official state animal.

The Florida Panther was first federally protected as an endangered subspecies via the Department of the Interior in 1967, well before President Richard Nixon signed the Endangered Species Act (the Florida panther was given protection in 1973).

Kate McFall of The Humane Society of the United State's Florida leg noted how the number of panthers killed by speeding cars grows every years, and how southwest Florida, their last population center, is the site of aggressive development.

"Panthers are particularly vulnerable to human threats due to their already-low numbers and because they require large ranges," McFall wrote in a July 20 op-ed in the *Bradenton Herald*. "Biologists know that the leading cause of species extinction around the world is habitat loss and human persecution. With developers encroaching more dramatically in southwest Florida, the panthers need the protection the Endangered Species Act provides more than ever."

Adding insult to injury is the fact that Florida Fish and Wildlife Conservation Commission officials looked into making it OK to "take" (read: kill) panthers that encroached on human territory (as if the inverse weren't the problem).

THERE IS NO SCIENTIFIC BASIS FOR DELISTING THE FLORIDA PANTHER!! Our panthers need all the protection we can give them. They should not be hunted under any circumstances.

Do your job. Protect Florida wildlife.

Respectfully submitted,

Gail Herr

2145 SW Waterview Place

Palm City FL 34990

From:	Harriett Jones
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Delisting Florida Panther
Date:	Friday, August 11, 2017 10:30:22 PM

I am writing to protest any reduction in the protection of the Florida Panther as an endangered species. I have been told this is the only opulation of panthers still breeding in the wild in the Eastern United States. Any delisting will be seen as wanton destruction of a species for political gain as well as private monetary gain. Even a board member of our state FWC in Florida wishes to obtain a permit for a 50 Year Take of this endangered species.

Harriett Jones
15950 NE 55 St
Williston Fl 32696

From: jamie lou
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Delisting Florida panthers
Date: Friday, August 11, 2017 8:14:11 PM

This is just terrible that this is even up for consideration.... If we are delisting endangered species maybe we should look a little more into human population control as they are truly the most destructive species and the main reason animals are even listed as endangered. Just sick first hibernating bears bear cubs and wolves and their kits and now this... Wtf is wrong with society??? Sick. Just sick.

From: RICHARD CALDERWOOD
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Delisting is a crime
Date: Sunday, August 13, 2017 3:26:47 PM

From: Matthew Peake
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Delisting of Critically Endangered Florida Panther
Date: Monday, August 14, 2017 12:05:42 PM

Dear Mr Shindle,

I would like to add my voice to those that think the idea of delisting the already critically endangered Florida Panther, of which there are precious few left (I read 230) is a very misguided idea which should be blocked with all the vigour that can be mustered. The idea that building a few more strip malls or condos will outweigh the survival of such an iconic species is laughable. Do you and your boss Larry want to go down in history as the officials who presided over the extinction of a species? What kind of legacy is that for the children and grandchildren of your great state (and yes I have visited on several occasions). Think what sort of gift passing on living examples of a wonderful animal will be to the future generations rather than a few stuffed and decaying specimens in a museum for future generations to mourn and decry their forbears for their short-termism. To block such an awful policy would send a positive message, not just across the state, but across the world, that Florida cares about its wildlife and is a welcoming place for animal loving families to visit and to live.

Thanks for your time and I hope that you do the right thing,

Matthew Peake.

Dr Matthew Peake,
School of Natural and Environmental Sciences,
Devonshire Building,
Newcastle University,
Newcastle upon Tyne,
NE1 7RU.
Tel +44 (0)[redacted]
w: www.ncl.ac.uk/nes

From:	Leslie
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Delisting of Florida panther
Date:	Monday, August 14, 2017 10:21:24 PM

Sir, please keep the Florida Panther listed. There are so few of them and it seems just a few years ago that cougars from Texas needed to be imported in order to save them. There is a lot of public education that needs to be done, as well as connectivity so these cougars are not isolated.

Thank you,

Leslie Patten
Cody WY

From: whitegables@juno.com
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: delisting of Florida panther?
Date: Friday, August 11, 2017 8:14:13 PM

Mr. Shindle,

I can hardly believe that government officials are considering delisting the Florida panther. The number of panthers in Florida is so small, and the continuation of habitat loss, particularly contiguous habitat, puts even more pressure on this animal. We must protect and encourage the populations of the panther as well as our other wildlife, and stop the degradation of the natural life and beauty of Florida.

I urge you to continue to protect the Florida panther to the greatest extent possible.

Sincerely,

Jill Reed
19800 N Hwy 329
Micanopy, FL 32667
[redacted]

From: Carole Deech
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Delisting of Florida Panthers
Date: Friday, August 11, 2017 4:04:53 PM

Mr. Shindle,

I do not believe at this time the Florida Panther has recovered enough for delisting to occur. The Florida Panther has many obstacles to overcome. There is no scientific basis for the proposed delisting of Florida's state animal. Please consider delay or ending this decision. I believe we cannot let this species become extinct.

Thank you for your time,
I think we need to resolve the human conflicts prior to delisting any animal.

Carol Deech

From: Lorene Tompros
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Delisting of Florida Panthers
Date: Saturday, August 12, 2017 8:45:07 AM

Please do NOT process the delisting of Florida Panthers. They need to be protected. We also have a home in Jupiter FL and are passionate about protecting our wildlife.
Thank you,

Lorene Tompros
4004 Manor Oaks Road
Phoenix, MD 21131
[redacted]
reenie4@comcast.net
anniesplayground.net

From:	Brendan Boyle
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Delisting of panther
Date:	Friday, August 11, 2017 7:49:29 PM

Dear Mr Shindle

I urge you to resist any and all efforts to downgrade protections for the Florida panther. The population of this beautiful animal is still extraordinarily precarious and requires active support. Please, please -- these animals face tremendous pressures already, mostly in the form of loss of habitat. I urge -- I beg -- you to continue to protect these great cats.

Sincerely yours

Brendan Boyle
Annapolis MD & Naples FL

From:	Lillian Henderson
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Delisting of the Florida panther
Date:	Sunday, August 13, 2017 2:49:11 AM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

Please stand up for our wildlife and don't delist the Florida panther.

These animals require lots of land and their numbers are already dwindling. Please don't be influenced by those pushing for the delisting to drive more development. There are more important things than developing our lands.

Best,

Lillian Henderson

From:	Kimberly Zenz
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Delisting panthers - don"t do it!
Date:	Monday, August 14, 2017 3:23:29 AM

Dear Mr. Schindle

I am writing to comment on the proposed delisting of the Florida panther. Panthers require a lot of territory and face growing risks while the potential future territory shrinks. They are emblems of the state - please do not take steps to make their survival more difficult while also allowing people to directly kill them and reduce their numbers even more.

Thank you,

Kimberly Zenz

From:	Karin
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Delisting panthers
Date:	Monday, August 14, 2017 5:10:57 PM

David I can't even wrap my head around why these creatures would want to be delisted. Who's watching out for these critically endangered species? Certainly not the people who should be.
I'm hoping you might have some integrity in this matter and protect the species.
Thank you for having morals and standards to protect rather than slaughter which seems to be the current White House disgusting disgraceful despicable answer to wildlife.
Karin Bishop

Sent from my iPhone

From: Deneen Olivieri
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Delisting the Florida Panther
Date: Saturday, August 12, 2017 9:32:47 AM

Hello Mr. Shindle,

I'm writing to encourage you to stand up for the panther and discourage the delisting. Although it has been documented that the panther population has increased, it is said that it has not increased enough to keep them from the danger of extinction. There were more road deaths in 2016 than ever before. No documentations for 2017 yet… as far as I know. But the increase in land destruction, or one would say the increase in building, will have an effect on the panther population as well as where they will be forced to relocate to. The farmers and ranchers want to delist and hunt because it is effecting their 'crop' .Whether it be four legged or rooting from the earth this effects their wallets. It hurts them financially and they don't like this. Its very sad that our society is so comfortable to pave our lands and kill off our wildlife. Or sacrifice out wildlife so that we can become wealthier. When and why did we become so greedy and insensitive? I hope that you will not support the delisting.

Thank you so much for your time,

Deneen Olivieri

From:	Robert Roscow
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Cc:	Ralf Brookes; Rob Hartsell; Heidi Mehaffey; John and Pat Wade Jr.
Subject:	Delisting the Florida Panther
Date:	Friday, August 11, 2017 8:06:32 AM

I am shocked that this is even being considered although given the huge political power of the landed gentry I guess I shouldn't be.
My understanding of the ESA is that there must be multiple viable populations. That is certainly not the case here with most of the population south of the Caloosahatchee River in south Florida. The panthers north of there are in general young males driven out by dominant males. Until this year there were no females reported north of the river. Now that amounts to one with two kittens. Surely that does not amount to a viable population.

Compounding the problem is that the panthers' existing habitat is being fragmented by development and its roads leading to high road kills. Also global warming will be causing a rise in the water levels of this habitat thereby degrading it. The panther can tolerate swampy conditions to a point but swamps do not support the deer populations on which they prey.

The panther is being made out as the culprit here as human populations expand into their habitat and cattle ranches. The panther needs extremely large areas free of humans and houses and cars. Until restrictions are in place limiting this development human-panther conflicts will only increase.

Show us the proof of these preserve areas around Florida where panthers can flourish before basically putting them back on the path to extinction.

Thank you for your consideration.

Robert F. Roscow
127 Woodlawn Street
Hamden, CT 06517
Cell: (203) [redacted]

Sent from my iPhone

From:	Karin Nelson
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Delisting the Florida Panther
Date:	Sunday, August 13, 2017 10:45:31 PM

The science is clear that there is not sufficient recovery of these animals to warrant their delisting. Please ensure that this does not happen.

Thank you,
K. Nelson

From: HARRIET DAMESEK
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: DE-LISTING THE FLORIDA PANTHER
Date: Friday, August 11, 2017 7:29:18 PM

There are 230 panthers left in Florida.
TWO HUNDRED THIRTY!

How can you possible justify de-listing or lowering their threat status.

Please don't be influenced by the SW Florida ranchers or developers. Use facts and common sense.

Thank you.

Harriet Damesek
4 Sandpoint Circle
Ormond Beach, FL 32174

From: James Miller
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Delisting the Florida Panthers
Date: Friday, August 11, 2017 7:02:12 PM

Hello,

I'm a Florida citizen and I'm shocked and appalled about the possibility of delisting a Florida Icon! Please take my email to you about this important issue as being sincere and genuine; I don't think this is the right decision to make!

Thank you for taking time to hear from me about this important issue.

James Miller
Pensacola Florida resident

From:	Ruthann Chesney
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	De-listing
Date:	Friday, August 11, 2017 9:40:37 PM

Please do not put the Florida panther in the sights of trophy hunters and general abusive individuals. They belong to us all and we want them safe. No killing.

Sent from Yahoo Mail on Android

From:	Adrian Treves
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	do more to protect Florida panthers
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 12:46:33 PM
Attachments:	Predators and the public trust.pdf

As a professional wildlife ecologist for >20 years, I write with concern that the FWS is not acting as a trustee, following the U.S. Public Trust Doctrine (PTD). I write this because the FWS is not prioritizing preservation of Florida panthers for future generations nor accounting transparently with the best available science for human-caused mortality of panthers. Instead, I perceive the FWS has been captured by special interests including states and associations of hunters, trappers ,and recreational interests. The attached paper explains how the FWS would act as a prudent fiduciary trustee as required by the U.S. PTD and associated US Supreme Court decisions. Following the North American Model is a bogus and illegitimate application of the US PTD.

--

Adrian Treves, PhD

6010 South Hill Drive

Madison, WI 53705

[redacted] (m)

[redacted] (h)

From:	A and D Duke
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	DO NOT Downgrade Panther Protections
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 5:11:01 PM
Importance:	High

Dear Mr. Schindle: I agree with U.S. Rep Vern Buchanan. See below. Panthers should remain on the Endangered Species list.

Arlene Dukanauskas
[redacted]
Bradenton, FL 34210
dukanam@msn.com

Buchanan Urges Feds Not to Downgrade Panther Protections
Zac Anderson
U.S. Rep. Vern Buchanan is calling on federal wildlife officials to maintain the highest level of protection for the Florida panther under the Endangered Species Act.
Buchanan, R-Longboat Key, wrote a letter Wednesday to Greg Sheehan, the acting director of the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, expressing “my strong concern over reports that the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service may weaken protections for Florida panthers.”
Federal officials currently are reviewing the status of the panther, which is listed as “endangered” with a population estimated at around 200. The federal government recently downgraded the status of another iconic Florida species, the West Indian manatee, lowering it from “endangered” to "threatened." Buchanan objected to that decision.
Buchanan told Sheehan that “major hurdles remain to the full recovery” of the panther.
“Alarmingly, your agency’s standard review comes less than a year after 32 panthers were struck and killed by vehicles on Florida roadways — the highest number of panther-involved accidents ever recorded,” Buchanan wrote in his letter. “Such traffic fatalities have risen more than 65 percent since 2012, outpacing the number of documented panther births. These roadkills are in addition to other causes of death, including poaching and disease.”
The Congressman’s move comes six months after federal wildlife officials decided to downgrade the protected status of the West Indian manatee, leading a bipartisan group of Florida lawmakers led by Buchanan to formally objecting to the decision.
In March, the U.S. Department of the Interior announced that manatees will be considered “threatened” instead of “endangered” under the Endangered Species Act. The change in status could pave the way for state and local officials to roll back manatee protections.
A letter signed by 11 Florida lawmakers — nine Democrats and two Republicans — calls the decision “disappointing and potentially very harmful to the survival of the iconic Florida animal.”
The Florida panther was one of the original 14 mammals named to the endangered species list in 1967, but a critical habitat for the big cats has never been established, “even though one is required by the Endangered Species Act,” Buchanan noted.
Though the review by the agency occurs every five years, Buchanan said he is concerned the safeguards may be weakened because the agency has said it will consider a study claiming the

Florida panther is no different than pumas or mountain lions in western states.
Buchanan was referring to a 2000 study that the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service has come to focus on by geneticist Melanie Culver and three fellow scientists that concluded that all the panthers, pumas and mountain lions in North America are actually a single subspecies. To some, that suggests that Florida panthers are nothing special, genetically.
But Culver, in an interview, said she believes the Florida panther still belongs on the endangered list, just not the way it is listed now. The U.S. Geological Survey scientist concedes that making a change would require a complex solution.
“You’d have to de-list it and then petition it to be listed as another entity,” Culver told the Tampa Bay Times. “That’s a legal problem. They’d have to completely lose legal protection to be protected the right way.”
Florida panthers are the Sunshine State’s official state animal, voted in by schoolchildren over such other contenders as the alligator and the mosquito.

From:	Kim Huffstutter
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Do not change Endangered Status on Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 1:11:19 PM

I am writing to voice opposition to the proposed changes to the endangered status of the Florida Panther. Panthers are still critically endangered. The rampant development of their habitat is the main reason. These lands were never meant to be lived on by humans. Panthers have nowhere else to go and changing their status to threatened will only cause their numbers to plummet again. All reports that I have read on the matter back this up. I am a long time South Florida resident and I want Panthers to remain classified as endangered so their population can continue to increase.

Thank you for your time and attention to this matter.

Kim Huffstutter
Jupiter, FL

From:	Secureland@aol.com
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Do not change Florida panthers endangered status!
Date:	Wednesday, August 23, 2017 9:55:55 AM

It has been a long and difficult fight to bring the Florida Panther back from near extinction. Please do not allow their status as endangered to be changed.
Thank you.
Kathleen Lamarche
Crawfordville, FL

From:	UFDionysus@aol.com
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Do not delist FL Panthers
Date:	Saturday, August 12, 2017 12:09:26 AM

The idea that you are even considering this is insane. Do not delist!

Michael Adler
Gainesville, FL 32601

From:	Patricia Burkett
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Cc:	Pat Burkett
Subject:	Do Not Delist Florida Panther!
Date:	Thursday, August 24, 2017 12:11:00 PM

Delistiing the Florida Panther is about the worst proposal I've seen in wildlife management. And there are a lot of it.

Habitat destruction, increased population are among the increasing challenges facing the Florida Panther.

I know that Climate Change is a forbidden topic, but forbidden or not, it cannot be denied by anyone other than those who will profit from denying it.

A glance at projected high water marks for Florida makes the plight of South Florida clear. the Everglades will see the brunt of it as salt water overtakes the fresh. The Panther and its prey are all at risk.

Please show true concern for our wildlife and do NOT delist the Florida Panther.

Most sincerely,

Patricia D. Burkett
1821 Carlton St.
Longwood, FL

From:	Josef W Goldufsky
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Do NOT delist or eliminate the protections the Florida Panther receives under the ESA.
Date:	Friday, August 11, 2017 11:37:29 PM

Dear David Shindle and the FWS,

Do not delist or eliminate the protections the Florida Panther receives under the ESA. The Florida panther is far from recovered; after all, each year sets a new record for the number of panthers killed by vehicular collisions. With less than 100 left in the wild how could you possibly even think this is the right decision? It is certainly not a decision based on science, let alone a conscionable one. The Florida panther is a national treasure and a key part to the living heritage of the southeastern part of the U.S.. It is also a main reason why I like millions of others sojourn and spend good money in Florida's national parks and wildlife reserves with the hopes of filming and photographing one. Let's not forget, these refuges too are at imminent risk. Please, do your jobs and protect the Florida panther from extinction.

Best Always, Joe

P.S. and for the sake of biodiversity, do something about those invasive boars, burmese pythons, macaques, poachers and barbaric sport fisherman.

Josef Goldufsky, Ph.D.
Dept. of Internal Medicine **I** Amanda Marzo Lab
Rush University Medical Center
Chicago IL, 60612
josef_goldufsky@rush.edu
Lab phone: (312) [redacted]
Cell phone: (847) [redacted]

From: shelley king
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Do not delist panthers
Date: Friday, August 11, 2017 4:21:27 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

As you know, the leading cause of species extinction around the world is habitat loss and human persecution. Panthers are particularly vulnerable to human threats due to their already-low numbers and their need for large ranges. With developers encroaching more dramatically in southwest Florida, the panthers need the protection the Endangered Species Act provides more than ever. Please ensure that panthers are not delisted.

Thank you,
Shelley

From: Dykes Everett
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: DO NOT De-List Panthers
Date: Saturday, August 12, 2017 3:58:00 PM

Dear Mr. Shingle

Please register this email as my objection to a lessening of the protected status of the Florida Panther. Given the drastic reduction in habitat, the low numbers of animals and the genetic challenges with inbreeding due to continued loss of range, NO scientifically compelling case can be made to lessen the current status.

For whatever it is worth, I'm am a Florida native and a rancher, among other hats I wear. Let's keep working to let the Big Cats live and expand their range. We need these apex predators in our systems for a whole host of scientific and moral reasons. Let's take a little less and give them a little more.

Save the big landscape corridors and we'll save the Big Cats, save the Big Cats and we'll save the planet, save the planet and we'll save the people.

Thanks for your consideration.

-Dykes Everett
822 West Central Boulevard
Orlando, FL 32805
[redacted]

D. C. Everett
Sent from my iPad

From: Mary C. S. Gama
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Do NOT delist the Florida Panther from Endangered Species list
Date: Monday, August 14, 2017 3:24:52 PM

Dear Mr. David Shindle,

My name is Mary Gama, and I'm a Florida resident, 32804. I urge you NOT to delist the Florida Panther from the Endangered Species list, because delisting now would be disastrous for the panther.[1]

Panthers are under critical pressure. Loss of habitat and increased human activity directly affects the future survival of the species.[1]

2016 was the deadliest year for Florida panthers. A total of 42 panthers died last year, matching the 2015 totals. More than 80 percent of the deaths involved panthers killed by vehicles. According to the Florida Fish and Wildlife Conservation Commission, there are approximately 120-230 adult panthers in the population. However, these numbers are not enough to ensure its long-term viability as a species.[1] With so few breeding adults left in the wild, and 25% of their numbers susceptible to vehicular death or habitat loss, it is unconscionable to consider delisting them until their numbers are higher and more stable.

Since the listing of the Florida panther as endangered in 1967, panther habitat has significantly declined due to rapid urban sprawl and agricultural land conversions in the panther's habitat range. As a result of panther habitat destruction, changing the status of the panther from endangered to threatened does not meet the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service criteria for delisting.[1]

I urge you not to submit to pressure from developmental and agricultural interests lobbying for this reckless delisting, and to maintain the Florida Panther on the endangered species list. Floridians demand it!

Thank you for your time,

Mary Gama
mary.gama@icloud.com

1 – thebradentontimes.com/delisting-would-put-panthers-in-peril-p18872-158.htm

From: cpryan@wi.rr.com
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Do not delist the Florida Panther
Date: Monday, August 14, 2017 11:12:48 AM

Florida Panthers are few due to the significant loss of habitat in Southwest Florida and deaths by speeding cars as well as other serious risk factors. I believe that further loss of these iconic cats is not "in their best interest". We have vacationed in Florida on numerous occasions, and one thing is clear, the majority of Floridians value and respect their wildlife, particularly their panthers. Hunts as "takes" should not be allowed. Neither the conservation of panthers nor the management of panthers warrants killing them. Rather, non-lethal deterrents should be implemented if Florida truly wants to demonstrate their reverence and respect for these critically imperiled species. Frankly,the recent horrific acts by some of Florida's irresponsible youth shown worldwide in reference to sharks, with no serious repercussions, gives tourists such as myself, pause, to question where Florida "really stands" regarding their wildlife, their citizens, and their wildlife protections. Please send a strong, clear message, that Florida will protect its Florida Panthers!

From:	brisbanesmom
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Do Not de-list the Florida panther
Date:	Saturday, August 12, 2017 12:21:16 PM

Do Not de-list the Florida panther.

(From Creative Loafing article by Kate Bradshaw)
In case you're wondering whether or not it's absurd that the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service could potentially downgrade or eliminate the protected status of the Florida panther, consider the following:

For every human living in Florida, there are 0.00001117 Florida panthers in existence.

Florida's population grows to roughly 20.6 million and the Florida panther population has dwindled to about 230, mostly due to habitat destruction, what with our tendency to drain and mangle the landscape to make way for another Pizza Hut or whatever excites exurbia these days.

Environmentalists and animal welfare advocates say there is absolutely no scientific basis for the proposed de-listing of Florida's official state animal.

The Florida Panther was first federally protected as an endangered subspecies via the Department of the Interior in 1967, well before President Richard Nixon signed the Endangered Species Act (the Florida panther was given protection in 1973).

Kate McFall of The Humane Society of the United State's Florida leg noted how the number of panthers killed by speeding cars grows every years, and how southwest Florida, their last population center, is the site of aggressive development.

"Panthers are particularly vulnerable to human threats due to their already-low numbers and because they require large ranges," McFall wrote in a July 20 op-ed in the Bradenton Herald. "Biologists know that the leading cause of species extinction around the world is habitat loss and human persecution. With developers encroaching more dramatically in southwest Florida, the panthers need the protection the Endangered Species Act provides more than ever."

Adding insult to injury is the fact that Florida Fish and Wildlife Conservation Commission officials looked into making it OK to "take" (read: kill) panthers that encroached on human territory (as if the inverse weren't the problem).

Michelle Mullins, CPDT-KA
Sent from my Verizon, Samsung Galaxy smartphone

From:	Christina Larkins
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Do not downgrade or delist the Florida Panther
Date:	Sunday, August 13, 2017 7:00:13 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

Please accept my comments in opposition to the possible downgrading or delisting of the Florida Panther's protected status for the following reasons:

- they are rapidly losing habitat due to human encroachment;
- their current population in Florida has dwindled to approximately 230 animals;
- there is no scientific basis for the possible downgrading/delisting status of the Florida Panther.

Thank you,

Christina Larkins

From: Barbara Eagan
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Do not downgrade the panther
Date: Thursday, August 24, 2017 12:15:47 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle:

I am strongly opposed to any downgrade of the Florida panther's status. This would be an ill-advised move that as a native Floridian greatly disturbs me. Thank you for your consideration of my position.

Sincerely,

Barbara A. Eagan
13835 Kirby Smith Road
Orlando, Fl 32832

EAGAN APPELLATE LAW
A Professional Limited Liability Company

Barbara A. Eagan
Florida Bar Board Certified Appellate Attorney
(407) 286-2204 · beagan@EaganAppellate.com

WARNING: THE INFORMATION CONTAINED IN THIS ELECTRONIC MAIL TRANSMISSION IS ATTORNEY PRIVILEGED AND CONFIDENTIAL, INTENDED SOLELY FOR THE USE OF THE INDIVIDUAL OR ENTITY NAMED ABOVE. IF THE READER OF THIS MESSAGE IS NOT THE INTENDED RECIPIENT, YOU ARE HEREBY NOTIFIED THAT ANY DISSEMINATION, DISTRIBUTION, OR COPYING OF THIS COMMUNICATION IS STRICTLY PROHIBITED. IF YOU HAVE RECEIVED THIS COMMUNICATION IN ERROR, PLEASE IMMEDIATELY NOTIFY THE SENDER BY TELEPHONE. THANK YOU.

Please consider the environment before printing this e-mail

From:	Joe Roskowski
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Do NOT downlist the Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 4:34:35 PM

In regards to the 5-year review: The single population or Florida Panthers is tenuous at best, and they continue to die in high numbers. Development is fragmenting their remaining habitat and habitat loss due to so called "nuisance flooding" will accelerate, so the situation will continue to deteriorate. This remains an extremely vulnerable population and the situation on the ground in no way resembles the situation in the recovery plan that could lead to downlisting. Do NOT downlist the Florida Panther.

Thank you,
Joe Roskowski

From: Cat Guts
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Do NOT download FL panther
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 9:05:02 PM

I'm an ecologist in FL. The population data supports continued protections for management of this species. Please maintain or even increase protections for this very endangered animal and its habitat.

From:	P. Whitehead
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Do NOT Remove Florida Panther from the Endangered Species List under the Federal Endangered Species Act
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 9:23:43 PM
Attachments:	Transcript testimony - Vol II Sept 4 2015.pdf Item 10(c)-CPA Lee 15-3.pdf

---

Do NOT Remove Florida Panther from the Endangered Species List under the Federal Endangered Species Act
Moreover encourage your Vero Beach

From: P Whitehead <pbackos@hotmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, November 10, 2015 10:20 PM
To: david_shindle@fws.gov; constance_cassler@fws.gov; frakesr@comcast.net
Cc: happyoldfogey@aol.com; ralf@ralfbrookesattorney.com; bleegruninger@comcast.net; gaeakayaks; roynora@comcast.net; d.urich@comcast.net; jlopez@biologicaldiversity.org
Subject: RE: Lee County Parcels - GIS file (Corkscrew Farms)

Dear Dr. Frakes, Mr. Shindle and Ms. Cassler,

I am contacting you to provide an update regarding the status of this development in the Lee County review process.
On October 21st the Zoning Hearing Examiner recommended approval of the radical density increase for the land optioned for this development from 130 units to a ten fold increase of 1325 units.

We were very much hoping the Zoning Examiner would have considered the testimony that I and other civic and environmental community representatives gave at the hearing to reject or at least minimize this density increase.

FDOT's report to the State 'Department of Economic Opportunity' (attached) predicts an increase in daily vehicular trip generation (just from this project alone) from 1,394 to 11,600 daily trips. The potential effects on large and small wildlife freely moving between habitat lands north and south of Corkscrew Rd. will be severe, no doubt. Panther and Bear survivability will be greatly impacted by this development and the traffic it will generate. Human-wildlife encounters will be tragic--mostly for the wildlife-- but potentially for humans in terms of auto fatalites should a high impact crash cause a driver to lose control of their vehicle. Panthers will avoid this land, and be cut-off from accessing adjacent lands suitable for habitat if this development is allowed to occur as it will bring in a massive human presence to an agricultural/conservation area that is presently sparsely populated facilitating excellent wildlife movement. This conclusion is further supported by Dr. Frakes analysis.

I have one more opportunity to provide testimony before Lee County and that is at next Wednesday's (11/18) Lee Board of County Commissioners final zoning hearing for 'Corkscrew Farms'.

Please advise on what further action can be pursued through the US Fish and Wildlife Service to stop this project.

Thank You All for your time and consideration of this matter. I await your advice.

Sincerely,

Patty Whitehead [redacted]
Board Member Responsible Growth Managment Coalition (RGMC)

cc: Ralf Brookes Attorney
Jacki Lopez, Center for Biological Diversity
Wayne Daltry, RGMC
David Urich, RGMC
Bobbie Lee Davenport, RGMC
Connie Langmann, RGMC
Dr. Nora Demers, RGMC

Attachments:

- Southwest Florida Regional Planning Council and FDOT correspondence to Florida DEO regarding Corkscrew Farms
- Testimony of Patty Whitehead, Pete Cangialosi (Estero Council of Community Leaders) asking for denial of zoning change for Corkscrew Farms development. (page 122-150/249 PDF)

Date: Tue, 15 Sep 2015 19:45:41 +0000
From: frakesr@comcast.net
To: pbackos@hotmail.com
CC: david_shindle@fws.gov; constance_cassler@fws.gov
Subject: Re: Lee County Parcels - GIS file

Dear Ms. Whitehead,

I have done a rough analysis of the location of the proposed development with regard to impacts to panther habitat, based on our recent model (see attached map).

In my opinion, this is an extremely bad location for this development with regard to the Florida panther. As shown on the map, the property includes some very good panther habitat and encroaches slightly into the Primary Zone. But even more alarming is the potential to further fragment habitat in the CREW area. The project falls in the center of and is completely surrounded by good panther habitat. Placing a development there would further narrow the already constricted "neck" for panthers to move between the excellent habitat located north and south of the property. Panthers are much more likely to cross through agricultural fields than a residential development. From what I can tell, most of the proposed onsite restoration/buffer area is already good panther habitat or would not be used by panthers (i.e., it is within the development). Therefore, the panther is not receiving any benefit from the proposed compensation. Also, the increased vehicular traffic to and from the development will further cutoff panther movement and increase road mortality. Finally, the potential for increased human-panther contact should be considered. As I have said, the property is virtually surrounded by panther habitat, and interactions of residents and their pets with panthers would be inevitable.

Frankly, I can't believe that this project is even being considered for approval. If we are going to have panthers in south Florida, this is exactly the type of project that, due to it's location, needs to be avoided. I recommend contacting the US Fish and Wildlife Service, South Florida Office to see how they will address these issues.

Sincerely,

Robert A. Frakes, Ph.D.

From: "P Whitehead" <pbackos@hotmail.com>
To: frakesr@comcast.net
Sent: Tuesday, September 8, 2015 3:53:11 PM
Subject: FW: Lee County Parcels - GIS file

Dr. Frakes,

Please find additionally attached the powerpoint slide with the recent Panther telemetries and the power point presentation the developer made to the County Commissioners, County staff and zoning hearing examiner to make the pitch for this proposed project.
One particular slide references 'community outreach', please be aware that there are many on that list that find this project highly problematical as it represents sprawl and urbanization with far-reaching transportation and environmental impacts.

Thank You Again for your time, attention and consideration of this matter.

Sincerely

Patty Whitehead
Responsible Growth Management Coalition

From: pbackos@hotmail.com
To: frakesr@comcast.net
Subject: FW: Lee County Parcels - GIS file
Date: Tue, 8 Sep 2015 17:43:59 +0000

Hello Dr. Frakes,
Please find below the link to access the Lee County shapefiles. The strap numbers to locate the parcels that make up the total 1,365 acres are as listed in the attached page from the option agreement of sale.

Just in case the addresses on the property are as follows:

16871, 17501, 18701 AND 18901 CORKSCREW RD
Lee County, FL

A little later I will send you the power point from the zoning hearing that shows the panther telemetries that exist around and within the property.

Thank you again for all your help.

Sincerely,

Patty Whitehead
Responsible Growth Management Coalition

From: HMcMullen@leegov.com
To: pbackos@hotmail.com
Date: Tue, 8 Sep 2015 13:12:42 -0400
Subject: Lee County Parcels - GIS file

Hello Ms. Whitehead,

The link below will open our Land Records page from which the Parcels shapefile or geodatabase may be downloaded.
http://www.leegov.com/gis/data/gis-data/land-records

Land Records - Lee County Southwest Florida

www.leegov.com

Visit Leegov.com to find useful information for residents, businesses and visitors of Lee County in Southwest Florida

One of the fields is the 17-digit parcel identifier (STRAP) which will allow the recipient to search for and zoom to the subject parcel(s). There is also a link to the Property Appraiser's Property Page which will provide details about the parcel.

Let me know if you have additional questions.

Thanks,
Helena

Helena McMullen
GIS Data Steward
Lee County
1500 Monroe Street, 4th floor
Fort Myers, FL 33901
hmcmullen@leegov.com
Phone [redacted]
http://leegis.leegov.com

Please note: Florida has a very broad public records law. Most written communications to or from County Employees and officials regarding County business are public records available to the public and media upon request. Your email communication may be subject to public disclosure.

Under Florida law, email addresses are public records. If you do not want your email address released in response to a public records request, do not send electronic mail to this entity. Instead, contact this office by phone or in writing.

From:	jacqueline munera
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	DO NOT REMOVE protections for Florida panthers
Date:	Saturday, August 12, 2017 12:18:46 PM

This is such an obvious move to appease the oil industry and land "developers" that want to pave and destroy Florida. The amount of money they have and bring to Florida actually is far less than that of the industries that support tourism and retirement in the state. How long do you think we can keep bringing that money in when we have only pavement, pollution and a destroyed natural environment?

I honestly have no belief that you will even consider what the public really wants, nor what is best for the ecology in which we have to live. But, perhaps this once, you will actually do your job.

Jacqueline Munera
116 oak ridge ave
temple terrace fl 33617

From: Josie B
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Do Not take the Florida Panther off Endangered Species Act
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 8:43:01 PM

The Florida Panther has been on the federal endangered list since the list began in 1967. Even with this status the Florida Panther may not survive. The habitats are disappearing due to urban sprawl and the State of Florida continues to allow businesses and contractors to build in wooded areas that support the dwindling wildlife in Florida. The Florida Panthers require this endangered status under the Endangered Species Act.

From: Tom Smith
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Don"t delist Florida Panther
Date: Sunday, August 13, 2017 11:58:10 AM

Do not delist the Florida Panther!!
It is still an endangered species!
If for no other reason, since you seem to care only about money, remember, it is a unique attraction that brings millions in tourist dollars to Florida every year!

Sent from my iPhone

From: JanetOliver
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Don"t delist our panther
Date: Friday, August 11, 2017 11:26:17 AM

Please don't delist our panther

From:	Leslie A. Goller
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Don"t de-list the Florida Panther!
Date:	Friday, August 11, 2017 8:35:58 PM

As a Florida resident, I write to express my dismay at the FWS' intent to de-list the Florida panther. There is absolutely NO scientific basis for the proposed de-listing of Florida's official state animal. None! Therefor it is totally inappropriate to do so.
Please submit my email to the official record.
Thank you,
Leslie A. Goller, Esq.
2247 Smullian Trail South
Jacksonville, FL. 32217
Lgoller@gmail.com

Sent from my iPad

From: Amanda
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Don"t delist the Florida Panther
Date: Saturday, August 12, 2017 2:24:29 AM

Dear Officials at the Fish and Wildlife Service,

I am writing to express my concern about the potential delisting of the Florida panther as Endangered. I care about the panther and the ecology (and econony) of Florida.

I have many family and friends who live in Florida and have visited a number of times. I have found Florida to be beautiful, diverse in all ways, and having unique and valuable ecology. The Florida panther is an important part of this.

If the Florida panther is delisted it will be much more vulnerable to extinction. It is already seriously endangered and facing serious threats. Please don't let that happen! The Florida panther is worth saving, and it makes Florida richer in a way that's also worth preserving.

Thank you!
Amanda

From: christina aikman
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Don"t remove panther protections
Date: Thursday, August 17, 2017 3:48:46 PM

Dear Sir;

The thought of removing protection of the Florida Panther is very distressing. Our state is amazingly unique and our population of panthers are adapted to the Florida lifestyle. They need to be protected from the encroachment of unrestrained development. The state should rather be focusing on a wildlife corridor so we can ensure a future for all things wild that makes our state what it is!

Thank you,
Christina Aikman

From:	LegalSandy@aol.com
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Don"t Sacrifice Our Scarce Florida Panthers
Date:	Wednesday, August 23, 2017 8:47:30 PM

Dear Sir:

It is the height of absurdity and pandering to special interests to even consider changing the Florida panther's status. Why? For these reasons:

- In 2016 a record 34 Florida panthers were killed by vehicle collisions. As of July 2017, a total of 16 panthers have been found dead this year, with 12 resulting from road fatalities.
- Florida panther habitat is mostly confined to Southwest Florida. In 2010, the population had grown from about 25 adults in 1995 to roughly 100. In 2015 the state estimated their population to be 100 -180. It was again recently updated to between 120 - 230 cats. Even at their best estimates, 230 panthers are not a sustainable population size!
- Schoolchildren picked the panther as the state animal in 1981. This large charismatic umbrella species is the mascot for dozens of schools across the state and is loved by Floridians.
- Tens of thousands of residents have paid a premium for a specialty “Protect the Panther” Florida license plate, sold to pay for the state’s panther research. It is the state’s 5th most popular license plate.
- The U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service [FWS] is the principal federal agency responsible for conserving, protecting fish, wildlife, and plants, and enhancing their habitats for the continuing benefit of the American people.
- FWS has been criticized for opening vast tracts of panther habitat to construction; rubber-stamping development plans that alter panther habitat, and never rejecting incidental take permits for panthers. Over the past two decades, the wildlife service has approved hundreds of development projects that would wipe out thousands of acres of prime panther habitat.
- Florida panthers are still inching back from the brink of extinction. The construction of new houses, roads, and airports in Southwest Florida continue to squeeze the panthers out and fragment their habitat, increasing the likelihood that cats will be hit by cars.

Sandra Walters
Roy Walters, Ph.D.
480 Warrior Trail
Enterprise, FL 32725

From: Belinda Stotler
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Downgrading Status of the Florida Panther from "Endangered" to "Threatened"
Date: Thursday, August 24, 2017 2:50:28 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

I just read an article in the Orlando Sentinel (Aug. 24th) and I cannot believe that the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service is even considering downgrading the protection status of the Florida Panther! The article provided your email address as a means of expressing opinions on a current study to determine if the panther population has increased enough to downgrade its protection status. Many years ago (1970's I believe), I had read that there were only 29 of these magnificent animals left in all of Florida. I had also read that a great many of them were being killed along a particular stretch of highway in south Florida (I believe it was "Alligator Alley" near Fort Lauderdale) and of course their habitat was disappearing due to human activities. This Orlando Sentinel article confirmed that more panthers are still being killed on the roads than are being born, and of course their habitat is continuing to be gobbled up by humans. Even though their numbers have increased since I have read that article in the 1970's, the 230 estimated number of panthers left in Florida is not enough. Florida's demands for more natural and man-made resources (i.e., more roads and highways, real estate developments, fresh water, etc.) has also grown in leaps and bounds due to our state's burgeoning population growth, which continues to grow at a rather fast pace compared to other states. So, I urge you NOT to downgrade its protection status due to the demands of greedy real estate and ranching businesses, etc., whose main focus is to increase their profits at any cost, even if it means destroying wildlife species or otherwise destroying this state's environment.

Various wildlife species all over the world are disappearing at alarming rates and I heard that up to 2/3 of all wildlife will disappear within the next 10-15 years. The main reason for this vast dissemination of wildlife is human caused pollution, selfish greed, habitat encroachment, poaching, over hunting, etc. You have to be aware of this, especially being a biologist, and a part of a service that is supposed to help protect our fish and wildlife populations. Human beings have been a raging plague upon this Earth and we need to start realizing its resources are not infinite. All of the disappearing wildlife and the environmental damage to our air, water and land, are warnings that we cannot continue to ignore, since we are destroying the very things we need to support LIFE. We can make a difference, if all 7.5 billion of us humans can overcome our insatiable greed and selfishness, and learn to work together to share the Earth with other species and so we can survive ourselves. If we don't start doing our part, we may just find the human species listed on the endangered list. Please do all you can to prevent greed from ravaging Florida's environment and wiping out yet another awesome wildlife species.

Sincerely,
Belinda Stotler

From: Emily Hernandez
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Email Panther
Date: Sunday, August 27, 2017 12:52:28 PM

Good Afternoon, Mr.Shindle

It was brought to my attention that panthers were being considered to be moved into the threatened list, after being in the endangered species list for years. I feel like panthers should be left in the endangered species list because they are an A list predator, which can affect many threads of the food chain if they were ever to be wiped out. The ecosystem as a whole will be changed without one of its top predators in the United States by increasing the number of animals in the lower levels in the food chain because they no longer have to fight off their predators. With people wanting to wipe out panthers in their lands, the number of panthers can decrease again if moved into the threatened list. Therefore, panthers should be kept in the endangered species list to make sure our food chain will be kept the same.

Thank you,

Emily Hernandez

From: Pasta44
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: endangered fl. panthers
Date: Tuesday, August 15, 2017 1:38:47 PM

DEAR MR. SHINDLE

I VALUE FL. PANTHER'S HABITAT
WE CAN DO NOTHHING TO STOP THE
WHEELS OF PROGRESS WITH DEVELOPERS
ENCROCHING ON THEIR HABITAT, SO I PROPOSE
UNDER HIGHWAY TUNNELS FOR OUR PANTHERS
TO CROSS THE R0ADS HOPEFULLY THIS WILL HELP
AND LESS OF OUR BEAUTIFUL PANTHERS WILL NOT
BE HIT BY CARS OR TRUCKS…

SO "UNDERGROUND, UNDER HIGVHWAYS, TUNNELS."

THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR YOUR WORK
TO PROTECT OUR PANTHERS,

SINCERELY PATRICIA MARSH
NAPLES FLORIDA..

From:	B. Doran
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Endangered Florida Panther -- KEEP ON THE ENDANGERED SPECIES LIST!!!!
Date:	Saturday, August 26, 2017 7:23:11 PM

Hello:

I can't believe that anyone would even think about taking the Florida Panther off the Endangered Species List!!! There are less than 180 of them in the wild!! That is hardly a population that can go unprotected!!!

PLEASE do *NOT* remove them from the Endangered Species List!!

Bonnie Doran
California 95066

--
To help wolves & other endangered/threatened animals: Defenders of Wildlife @ www.defenders.org

From: shireland
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Endangered Florida Panther. STop.....do not lift the endangered species of our Florida Panther.
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 6:44:23 PM

Sent from my MetroPCS 4G LTE Android Device

From:	M Kra
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Endangered Florida panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 8:48:34 PM

Please do your duty and continue to protect the Florida panthers by keeping them on the endangered species list. Continued development can only decrease their numbers. Panther habitats have been disappearing for years. The remaining rural areas, farm and ranch land, should stay rural and open. Developers will only be happy when Florida becomes a giant parking lot.

From:	Ann Barnett
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Endangered listing
Date:	Friday, August 18, 2017 4:21:55 PM

Sir,
It is critical that the Florida panther continue to enjoy full protection as a federally-protected species until habitat has been improved with safe preserves and viable corridors. This habitat enhancement can be demonstrated only when population truly rebounds with numbers sufficient to prevent in-breeding and population expanding into some of their traditional territories.

Panthers have traditionally thrived in north and west Florida. I have seen them there. I really hope that future generations will be able to hope for a chance at that privilege.

Thank you.

Ann Barnett

*

From:	Stacy Smith
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Endangered Panther
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 6:32:48 PM

As a citizen of Florida, I ask you to maintain the endangered status for the Florida Panther. Also, redouble your efforts to protect their remaining habitats. Thank you

From: Adri Ustariz
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Endangered Panthers
Date: Sunday, August 27, 2017 4:54:12 PM

To whom ever it may concern, I want to provide my opinion regarding keeping the Panthers on the endangered species list. These precious animals need to our protection and help to thrive in their natural habitats. Moving them to threatened would minimalize the granditude of the problem that is their decreasing numbers. Construction and industrialization could never be more important than the natural cycle and food chain of our environment. Henceforth, I hope many think the way that I do and you are able to keep Panthers on the endangered species list. Kindest Regards, Adriana U.

From:	Karen Lewis
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Endangered panthers
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 1:20:00 PM

Please do what you can to keep Florida panthers on the endangered list.

Thank you!

Karen Lewis
11913 Whistling Way
Lakewood Ranch, FL 34202

From: Sinai, Iden
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Cc: iden.sinai@gmail.com
Subject: Endangered Status of Florida Panther
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 2:12:24 PM

David,

I'm writing to you today to ask that the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service continue to list the Florida panther as an endangered species. I'm only 32, and within my lifetime, I can recall when the Florida panther population was around 20 panthers. The genetic pool was so shallow the few panthers that this population produced were sterile or had other birth defects. It is nothing short of a miracle that the population has been above 100 for the past few years, especially considering how many die on the roadways down here each year. I recently read that the 22nd panther to die from a car accident passed away last week.

Given how rapidly Florida continues to develop, and given the fact that there is just one panther population down here (which fails to meet the two stable population requirement under the Endangered Species Act, from what I understand), I hope you keep the panther protected.

Thanks for your time and consideration. Please, do the right thing for this Florida icon.

Best regards,
Iden Sinai

Iden Sinai • *Attorney at Law*

Suite 3200 • 201 North Franklin Street • Tampa, Florida 33602
direct [redacted] • fax [redacted] • main [redacted]
isinai@burr.com • www.burr.com
ALABAMA • DELAWARE • FLORIDA • GEORGIA • MISSISSIPPI • TENNESSEE

The information contained in this email is intended for the individual or entity above. If you are not the intended recipient, please do not read, copy, use, forward or disclose this communication to others; also, please notify the sender by replying to this message, and then delete this message from your system. Thank you.

From:	Ron Wofford
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Endangered
Date:	Saturday, August 12, 2017 5:34:14 PM

As a Florida Master Naturalist and kayak guide I take every opportunity to educate and share my love for all of our amazing wildlife in the areas that I lead groups from around the world. I have had the pleasure of being up close and personal with most of our unique species in Fakahatchee Strand, Big Cypress National and Everglades National Park including the amazing Florida Panther. Please do not create a situation that can cause any additional harm than is currently happening. Keep SW Florida a destination for all the world to enjoy.
Ron Wofford.

Sent from my iPhone

From: Rainold Franco
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Enforce the law
Date: Sunday, August 27, 2017 8:06:59 PM

Don't let the people put does panthers in extinction just because they want to create fancy houses and buildings no they could wait until the panthers grow and if not then they should be finding somewhere else to construct because if it was me I wouldn't let them do that especially when the panthers still are in risk

Sent from my iPhone

From: John Dwyer
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Environmental Humanities, the panther posse at Florida Gulf Coast University
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 5:31:54 PM

Dear Mr. David Shindle:

I ask the service to maintain the panther's "endangered" status – and redouble efforts to protect remaining habitat. The official comment period closes at 11:59 PM on August 29th – but the service will continue to receive comments which provide new information on the panther at any time during the writing of their review.

This five-year status review for the Florida panther is a requirement of the Endangered Species Act. The last review was conducted in 2009 and recommended "no change" in the panther's endangered status – meaning it continues to receive full protection under the Endangered Species Act. South Florida Wildlands is strongly recommending that status again remain unchanged

The panther's small core habitat in southwest Florida, less than five percent of its original range across most of the southeast United States, continues to shrink and become more fragmented by the day. Up to a dozen new development projects in that core habitat – including oil exploration across hundreds of thousands of acres, road expansions, new power plant construction, and new subdivisions – are poised to destroy or degrade massive amounts of some of the best upland habitats this species has left. And while the panther population may have recovered from near-extinction in the mid-nineties when only 20 to 30 panthers remained, the current estimate of 120 to 230 panthers is still a tiny number. With continued habitat loss and roadkill continuing to take their toll, that population has almost certainly reached a peak. A record 42 panthers died in 2015 with 30 killed as a result of vehicle collision. That record was equaled in 2016, but with 32 cases of roadkill. With more growth, wider roads, and more cars on those roads, this grim situation is not expected to improve.

Regulatory mechanisms which could slow this loss and degradation of habitat also remain completely inadequate to the problem. Local county governments, the Army Corps of Engineers, Florida Department of Environmental Protection, Florida Department of Economic Opportunity, South Florida Water Management District, the National Park Service and the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service itself continue to approve nearly every application for new development which comes before them. One recent project now on the table, "Rural Lands West" in eastern Collier County, would create a new 6,000-acre subdivision in prime panther habitat adjacent to the Florida Panther National Wildlife Refuge.

The Florida panther remains an isolated sub-species of the North American cougar. It has had little to no contact with puma populations in the western United States for approximately 100 years – after habitat loss, highway construction, and indiscriminate hunting wiped out those connections. The "eastern cougar" was declared extinct in its last 5-year review conducted in 2011 – making the Florida panther the very last sub-species and breeding population of cougars east of the Mississippi River. The Florida panther was chosen by Florida's schoolchildren in 1982 as our state animal and is also considered an important "keystone species" (of vital importance to the ecosystem where it is found) and "umbrella species" (protection of panther habitat protects numerous other plants and animals – many also rare and endangered - which share its range). It is the name of South Florida's hockey team and numerous school sports teams around the state.

Recent scientific surveys of the Florida panther landscape (Kautz, et al, 2006, and Frakes, et al, 2015) have recommended no loss in either the quality or quantity of the Florida panther's remaining habitat in southwest Florida - if the species is to have any chance of survival into the future. So far, that advice is not being heeded by any of the responsible government agencies.

Please urge the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service to maintain full endangered species status for the Florida panther – and to consider the cumulative impacts to the panther from the many development projects currently underway or under review in its habitat. Ask them to also consider what those projects are doing to the likelihood that the Florida panther will ever recover. Finally, ask the service to exercise its power as a regulatory agency of the United States government – and to fulfill its duties under the Endangered Species Act by protecting the Florida panther's vital but

rapidly shrinking habitat from loss, degradation, and fragmentation.

Please listen to the right voices.

Very truly yours,

John P. Dwyer, Ph.D.
15937 Delasol Lane
Naples, FL 34110-2811
[redacted]
dwyerj1@comcast.net
dwyerjpiii@gmail.com
jdwyer@fgcu.edu

From:	Richard Diaz
To:	David_Shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Feds shouldn"t change Florida Panther protections.
Date:	Sunday, August 27, 2017 9:46:47 PM

Dear David Shindle, I'm writing to you to tell you that I agree with your opinion on Feds shouldn't change Florida Panther protections. For a long time, the Pathers territory has been disappearing and now, they are left with less than five percent of the territory that they used to claim in Florida. One of things that I'm scared of is the extinction of the Florida Panther. As you stated, according to state wildlife officials, from 2014 through 2016, the number of Florida Panthers are killed by drivers outpaced the number of Panthers that were born. To conclude, I strongly agree with your opinion that the Feds should not change Florida Panther protections.

Sincerely,

Richard Diaz

From:	Ernie Barnett
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Cc:	Nick.wiley@myfwc.com; jennifer.fitzwater@myfwc.com
Subject:	Five Year Review of Florida Panther
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 1:31:01 PM
Attachments:	image001.emz image002.png image003.png oledata.mso FloridaPanter5year.pdf

---

Dave –

Attached are comments provided by the Florida Land Council regarding the five year review of the Florida Panther. We look forward to seeing you on the 20th in Vero Beach. I'll reach out in a week or so to coordinate. – Ernie

Ernie Barnett
Executive Director
P.O. Box 10066
Tallahassee, FL 32302-2066

WATER AND LAND ADVISORS, INC.
4524 Gun Club Road, Suite 201
West Palm Beach, Florida 33415
Barnett@FloridaWaterandLand.com
Mobile: [redacted]

From:	Tom Trotta
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Cc:	bryanbecca@gmail.com; Cathy Connolly; Mac Hatcher; "Crooks, Amber"; "Fleming, Elizabeth"; "Rengers, Rosemary"
Subject:	Five year status Review - Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 14, 2017 4:00:25 PM
Attachments:	Friends_Five_Year_Review_Letter_8_2017_Final.pdf

---

Mr. Shindle

The attached pdf contains the comments from the Friends of the Florida Panther Refuge on the five-year status review of the Florida panther. Thank you for the opportunity to comment.

Tom Trotta
Acting President, Friends of the Florida Panther Refuge
P.O. Box 1939
Naples, FL 34146
Cell [redacted]
tom.trotta@floridapanther.org

From:	naluma@aol.com
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Five-year status reviews of 23 Southeastern species--Florida Panther
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 11:59:00 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

As a Floridian, I urge you to maintain the panther's "endangered" status and commit to renewing efforts to protect its remaining habitat.

The panther's small core habitat in southwest Florida, less than five percent of its original range across most of the southeast United States, continues to shrink and become more fragmented. Increased development projects in this core habitat continues to encroach on the panther's viability, destroying or degrading massive amounts of habitat. Moreover, a record number of panthers died in 2015 and 2016 as a result of vehicle collision.

The Florida panther was chosen by Florida's schoolchildren in 1982 as our state animal and is also considered an important "keystone species" (of vital importance to the ecosystem where it is found) and "umbrella species" (protection of panther habitat protects numerous other plants and animals – many also rare and endangered - which share its range).

Please maintain full endangered species status for the Florida panther and consider the cumulative impacts to the panther from the many development projects currently underway or under review in its habitat. Please use your power as a US regulatory agency to fulfill the duties under the Endangered Species Act and protect the Florida panther, by maintaining its viable habitats free of loss, degradation and fragmentation in order for the panther to fully recover.

Thank you for your consideration and your time.

Kind Regards,
Dolores Perera
Hollywood Florida 33019

From: Edward Kellar
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: FL Continued Panther Protection
Date: Wednesday, August 23, 2017 7:29:19 PM

Dear Mr. Shingle,
I am a former remediation engineer with over 40 years experience nationally, including multiple projects around Lake O. and south-central FL. My most recent projects included Fisheating Creek restoration of former and current cattle ranch lands. I have a good understanding of the area ecology and history. I am not anti-development. However, I cannot in any way support or condone any regulatory changes adversely impacting the endangered panther population. I am fortunate to have seen one wild panther in my lifetime; please make sure FWS encourages continued protection of these reclusive creatures, not relaxation of restrictions.

Regards,

Edward M Kellar
Mobile [redacted]
Sent from my iPhone

From: Edward Paul
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: FL panther
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 3:49:14 PM

Keep on endangered species list .

Sent from my iPhone

From: melanie lipton
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: FL panther
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 6:09:45 PM

Please, protect the FL panther and keep it in on the Endangered Species List. Their numbers are still too low and need to increase before being removed from protection. Predators are important to the ecology of an area and keep prey species in balance.
Thank you
Melanie Lipton
Sarasota, FL 34241

Sent from my iPhone

From: David Harbeitner
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: FL panther downlisting
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 10:23:11 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

I am writing to you regarding the upcoming decision the FWS is considering about the status of the Florida panther. I believe the same level of protections that exist today need to be maintained at the present time.

I have been visiting southwest Florida (Charlotte County down to Collier County) since my grandparents moved to Florida in the early 1970's. I have lived in Florida since 1992. During that time, the panther has seen some modest successes in growing its population and range. However, the growth of the human population in Florida and our sprawl into the edges of the Everglades and the surrounding ecosystems greatly exceeds the panthers success. Without protections, it is very easy to envision a quick reversal in the panthers' fortune.

Specifically, the panther should not be downlisted because:
1) the size and distribution of the population do not warrant downlisting its status.
2) the number of deaths caused by vehicle collisions needs to be factored in as likely to increase due to ever increasing development on the edges and (in too many situations) the heart of panther habitat.
3) habitat loss and fragmentation of their habitat is likely to increase even with the existing protections. To reduce their status is to invite additional inappropriate development into their habitat.

Thank you and your staff for considering my opinion as you determine the status of the Florida panther protections. I hope you realize the only way to give this animal a chance at long term survival is to ensure they are protected at the highest level.

Sincerely,
David Harbeitner
225 9th Ave N
St Petersburg, FL 33701

--
David Harbeitner
Political Committee Chair for the Florida Chapter of the Sierra Club

From:	Bonnie Barton
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Fl panther protection
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 7:20:41 AM

David please add my support to to making sure that Florida's state animal, the panther, remains protected under the Endangered Species Act.

Thank you !

Bonita Barton
34234

From: emmettdvm@netzero.net
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: FL panther recovery
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 2:21:09 PM

Dave,

Didn't know you were with FWS now. Congratulations, my friend. Hope everything is working out well for you and the family. Just wanted to throw in my 2 cents that I support all your efforts with the panther recovery plan. I really appreciate the work you have done over the years. Please keep it up and I hope to see you soon someday.

Emmett L. Blankenship, DVM,MS
224 Transart Pkwy
Canton, GA 30114

From:	Branciforte, Kim
To:	David Shindle
Cc:	Eason, Thomas; Knox, Carol; Land, Darrell; Frohlich, Kipp
Subject:	FL Panther Status Review Letter
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 9:44:13 AM
Attachments:	USFWS_FLPanther_5YearReview_082517.pdf

Mr. Shindle,

Attached please find FWC's letter of support for and agreement to participate in the five-year status review of the Florida panther.

The hardcopy is in today's mail.

Kind regards,
Kim

Kim Branciforte
Staff Director - Division of Habitat and Species Conservation
Florida Fish and Wildlife Conservation Commission
620 S Meridian St.
Tallahassee, FL 32399
[redacted]
kim.branciforte@myFWC.com

From:	Lisa Greene
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	FL Panther status
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 2:14:54 PM

PLEASE maintain the panther's "endangered" status – and redouble efforts to protect remaining habitat.

This five-year status review for the Florida panther is a requirement of the Endangered Species Act. The last review was conducted in 2009 and recommended "no change" in the panther's endangered status – meaning it continues to receive full protection under the Endangered Species Act. I fully support recommending that status again remain unchanged.

The panther's small core habitat in southwest Florida, less than five percent of its original range across most of the southeast United States, continues to shrink and become more fragmented by the day. Up to a dozen new development projects in that core habitat – including oil exploration across hundreds of thousands of acres, road expansions, new power plant construction, and new subdivisions – are poised to destroy or degrade massive amounts of some of the best upland habitats this species has left. And while the panther population may have recovered from near-extinction in the mid-nineties when only 20 to 30 panthers remained, the current estimate of 120 to 230 panthers is still a tiny number. With continued habitat loss and roadkill continuing to take their toll, that population has almost certainly reached a peak. A record 42 panthers died in 2015 with 30 killed as a result of vehicle collision. That record was equaled in 2016, but with 32 cases of roadkill. With more growth, wider roads, and more cars on those roads, this grim situation is not expected to improve.

Regulatory mechanisms which could slow this loss and degradation of habitat also remain completely inadequate to the problem. Local county governments, the Army Corps of Engineers, Florida Department of Environmental Protection, Florida Department of Economic Opportunity, South Florida Water Management District, the National Park Service and the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service itself continue to approve nearly every application for new development which comes before them. One recent project now on the table, "Rural Lands West" in eastern Collier County, would create a new 6,000-acre subdivision in prime panther habitat adjacent to the Florida Panther National Wildlife Refuge.

The Florida panther remains an isolated sub-species of the North American cougar. It has had little to no contact with puma populations in the western United States for approximately 100 years – after habitat loss, highway construction, and indiscriminate hunting wiped out those connections. The "eastern cougar" was declared extinct in its last 5-year review conducted in 2011 – making the Florida panther the very last sub-species and breeding population of cougars east of the Mississippi River. The Florida panther was chosen by Florida's schoolchildren in 1982 as our state animal and is also considered an important "keystone species" (of vital importance to the ecosystem where it is found) and "umbrella species" (protection of panther habitat protects numerous other plants and animals – many also rare and endangered - which share its range). It is the name of South Florida's hockey team and numerous school sports teams around the state.

Recent scientific surveys of the Florida panther landscape (Kautz, et al, 2006, and Frakes, et al, 2015) have recommended no loss in either the quality or quantity of the Florida panther's remaining habitat in southwest Florida - if the species is to have any chance of survival into the future. So far, that advice is not being heeded by any of the responsible government agencies.

PLEASE maintain full endangered species status for the Florida panther – and consider the cumulative impacts to the panther from the many development projects currently underway or under review in its habitat. Also consider what those projects are doing to the likelihood that the Florida panther will ever fully recover. Finally, exercise your power as a regulatory agency of the United States government – and fulfill your duties under the Endangered Species Act by protecting the Florida panther's vital but rapidly shrinking habitat from loss, degradation, and

fragmentation.

Once they are gone, there will be no getting them back.

Sincerely,
Lisa Greene

Virus-free. www.avg.com

From:	James Rowell
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	FL Panther
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 9:58:42 AM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

My name is James Rowell, and I am a 5th generation native Floridian residing in Sarasota County, FL.

The Florida panther is a majestic mammal that deserves protection and that is why I am asking you to please do all you can to keep the Florida panther on the Endangered Spiecies List.

Thank you for your efforts in the work you do.

Respectfully,

James W. Rowell.

From: Joe Moye
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: FL Panther
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 9:16:25 AM

Please protect our FL Panther!

From:	Stuart Krantz
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	FL Panther
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 6:29:39 AM

Please keep the FL Panther on the endangered species list. Every species is too valuable to be lost.

Stuart Krantz
25 Hemenway RD, Williamsburg MA 01096-9713
[redacted]
stuartkrantz@gmail.com

From:	Anne Hawkinson
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	FL Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 3:15:58 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle

I am writing this email to you to voice my opinion that the FL panther should remain in protected status.

With numbers dwindling and habitat loss, they need Florida's protection now, more than ever.

Please do right by them and keep them on the Endangered list.

Thanks,
Anne K. Hawkinson
http://www.annehawkinson.com

From:	Jenifer Chilcote
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	FL Panther
Date:	Thursday, August 17, 2017 8:14:27 PM

I am concerned about the population of the FL Panther and would like them to be left on the endangered species list.

Jenifer Chilcote
Winter Garden, FL resident

From: Sharon Freeman
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: FL Panther
Date: Friday, August 11, 2017 10:12:49 AM

As a native Floridian, I am concerned of the possibility of extinction of the FL panther, as well as many other species.
The politicians are not listening to the will of the people! Please continue to protect the FL Panther.
And please send Lake O. South to stop the Bay and Everglades from dying.

Sent from my iPhone

From:	Janet & Bob Corin
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	FL Panther
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 10:24:07 AM

Please keep the FL Panther on the endangered species list and not change its status. With increased housing development , the panther's habitat is being vastly diminished and is thus being forced into more populated areas where they are in greater danger of being killed.

Janet Corin
33598 - zip code

Sent from Yahoo Mail for iPad

From:	John Orjuela
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Fl panthers
Date:	Friday, August 11, 2017 6:49:44 PM

Please protect the fl panther . Their numbers are so very small, please don't stop protecting them.
Sincerely ,
John Orjuela
U.S. Army veteran and life long Floridian

Sent from my iPhone

From: Cathy Cordell
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: FL Panthers
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 9:37:40 PM

Please see it through that the FL Panther remains on the Endangered Animal List. It would be a travesty if the few remaining panthers died out
Sincerely,
Catherine Cordell
Sarasota, FL

Sent from my iPhone

From: Joyce Traynor
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: FL Panthers
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 7:20:48 PM

Please protect our FL panthers!
Thank you,
Joyce Traynor

From: patti todd
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Fl panthers
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 2:05:07 PM

Protect what's left of the panther population.

Thanks! P. Todd

From:	Jack Siler
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	FL Panthers
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 1:29:09 PM

I used to go into the glades with people who lived there back in the early 50s when it was a wildlife heaven with only the rare swamp buggy and on the waterways, the even more rare airboat. Much of the animal life has been replaced by tourists and areas drained for subdivisions and farming.

Please let what has survived this debacle breathe a little longer - including the few remaining panthers. There is no justification for allowing even one more to be killed.

Jack Siler

From: dhealy6@verizon.net
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: FL Panthers
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 1:01:35 PM

Please continue to press our decision makers to continue to protect the FL Panther as an endangered species.

Don Healy, resident of Nokomis, FL

From: Lesa Regan
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Fl panthers
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 7:50:59 AM

Please continue them on full endangered status. Once theyre gone, thats it.

From: teresa crum
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Fl. Panther
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 11:42:02 PM

This animal needs continued protection. Florida is becoming over built, especially in the áreas where panthers need to continúe to roam. Higher numbers are killed on our highways every year.

There is a proposed construction plan which will bring more danger to the continuation of this species in Collier County. It will surely be the demise of fuese beautiful cata ir they are not on the endangered species list. We need to continúe he to protect our environment.

Thank you,
Teresa Crum, Family & Extended Family
Naples Fl

Sent from my LG G Pad F™ 8.0, an AT&T 4G LTE tablet

From:	Dave Young
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Fl. Panthers
Date:	Wednesday, August 9, 2017 4:33:53 PM

Mr. Shindle,
Thank you for reading this e-mail.
I recently read something about the Florida Panther being considered for removal from the Endangered Species list. I sincerely hope this is not true and am firmly against such action.
By doing so would they not lose benefits and funding that protects their survival?
Developers are the problem, taking thousands of acres of their habitat. I know of roads in Lee County where there used to be panther crossing signs. Those signs are long gone because the land through which the road traveled now is filled with commercial and residential properties. And I see it continue to go on when I drive into the "country".
Things are not going to get any better for the panther with the current rate of development.
I hope they are able to remain on the Endangered Species list.
Thank You
Dave Young
Bonita Springs
[redacted]

From: Karen Erbe
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Fla panther
Date: Monday, August 14, 2017 2:21:34 PM

Please do not de-list the Florida panthers. Please let them be.
Karen Stoneburner
Seminole Fl

Sent from my iPhone

From: karen k
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Fla Panthers
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 1:38:35 PM

PLEASE keep our few remaining panthers protected - we're depending on you to help us out.
Thanks,
Karen Kraft, 6737 2nd Ave Cir W, Bradenton, Fl.

From:	Jerry Nashel
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Fla. panthers (NOT the hockey team)
Date:	Thursday, August 17, 2017 2:08:34 PM

Mr. Shindle~

Please do all in your power to protect the Florida panther.

Thank you.

Jerry Nashel
Vero Beach

From:	Adele Thayerweb
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Fla. panthers
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 5:11:33 PM

Please save the panthers and keep them on the endangered list!
Adele K. Thayer
34243

Sent from my iPad

From:	Ruthann Chesney
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Flordia Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 9:43:05 AM

Please help us to maintain the Flirida Panther and it's habitat. So few left, and shrinking homeland availble for them to live. They need to be maintained as endangered and protected with all vigor.

Sent from Yahoo Mail on Android

From:	Anna Xtine
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florid panther/cougar
Date:	Sunday, August 13, 2017 6:22:24 PM

Please contine to protect the Florida Panther. Please do not delist them. Their population is not stable. We cannot allow the extinction of our precious predators. Our country is slowly losing its culture. Our children live with their faces stuck in phones, if we don't save our wildlife the future generations will only have pictures in their phones to look at and buildings. Like our children look at dinosaurs the next generation will have to look at books or films to see wildlife and wilderness that we took from them. Predators are essential to the natural balance of wildlife. Already too many snakes etc there. Our generation has to leave a legacy that includes the animals we share our land with. Our future generations deserve to have what we have. Human overpopulation is destroying so much so it is our duty to protect the few wildlife we have left.

With best regards
Anna Wenstrom
Sent from Yahoo Mail on Android

From: Judith Thompson
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: florida panther protection
Date: Wednesday, August 2, 2017 2:34:29 PM

I write to encourage you to do all you can to protect the Florida Panther. Decimation of the species due to loss of habitat due to development and death through vehicular death has created an untenable situation. The Florida Panther is an iconic symbol of Florida culture/history and environment. It's continued existence is too precious to be left to chance. The State of Florida and the US federal government must do all they can to ensure the panther continues to thrive in the sate.

From:	Eryn Williamson
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panter
Date:	Saturday, August 12, 2017 8:07:01 PM

I do not agree with the delisting of the Florida Panter. Despite its growing populations in a few places in Florida, this species is not flourishing throughout the state. With an increasing human population, habitat loss and fragmentation will continue to put pressure on this species.

I would like to see the continued listing of this species exactly how it is.

Sincerely,
Eryn Williamson

From:	Jacqui .
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panters Article
Date:	Sunday, August 27, 2017 8:49:55 PM

Hello Mr. Shindle,
I am a high school student and am sending this in regards to the article about the Florida panthers and how they are possibly going to be changed to "threatened" rather than endangered. My science teacher let us read this article in class and I was interested in the debate over the species. I hope the animals have access to large spaces of land and are heavily protected because the drop in population to the 20s that they had years ago was worrying. I hope as time passes that more panthers are reproduced and that the species grows. Nowadays there are quite a few panthers, but I hope they are soon much larger in number and are protected from any harm that can come to them.

Sincerely,
Jacqueline Brito.

From:	Amarilis Alorda
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panters Protections
Date:	Saturday, August 26, 2017 3:57:53 PM

Hello Mr. Shindle, my name is Amarilis Alorda. I´m a student from Hialeah Gardens Senior High School. I´ve heard about how endangered the florida panters have become. I personally think that their staus should change from endangered to threatend. We shouldn´t stop the progress we´ve made since the 1970s. I think we should continue the steps we´ve taken in recooperating the lives of these beautiful wild mammals.

From: Alexandra Farrell
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida panters
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 11:38:12 PM

I support continuing to protect Florida panthers. They are an important native subspecies and deserve our support for a chance at continued survival.

From: Jamshid Parchizadeh
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida panther - Congressman Vern Buchanan
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 2:08:22 PM

Dear Dr. Shindle,

My name is Jamshid Parchizadeh and I am an Iranian zoologist. We do have the same problem in Iran. The Asiatic cheetahs *Acinonyx jubatus venaticus* only occur in central Iran and there are only 43 individuals left in the wild. More than 15 cheetahs were killed between 2001 and 2016 due to wildlife-vehicle collisions. My colleagues and I are working on some practical mitigation measures with which we can at least reduce the number of cheetah fatalities due to car accidents. So far (after consulting lots of experienced scientists and our own efforts) we have concluded that wildlife crossing structures in conjunction with fencing are the only practical solutions to reduce wildlife-vehicle collisions involving cheetahs. Of course, animal detection systems may be useful, but we have found four main drawbacks with these systems compared to wildlife crossing structures in combination with fencing. Standard and enhanced wildlife warning signs can be practical if they are very specific in time and place, otherwise, they are no use. I will be happy to help to enhance the conservation status of Florida panthers if I can be of any help.

Sincerely yours,

Jamshid Parchizadeh

From:	Vanessa Romero
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther - endangered species
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 9:09:19 PM

Please I urge the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service to maintain full endangered species status for the Florida panther – and consider the cumulative impacts to the panther from the many development projects currently underway or under review in its habitat. I ask to also consider what those projects are doing to the likelihood that the Florida panther will ever recover. Finally, please exercise your power as a regulatory agency of the United States government – and fulfill your duties under the Endangered Species Act by protecting the Florida panther's vital but rapidly shrinking habitat from loss, degradation, and fragmentation.

Thank You,
Vanessa

From:	Harold Clapp
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther - Keep it Protected!
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 4:24:29 PM

As a Florida native I am asking you to please leave protections as they are for this beautiful but elusive creature. I myself have not seen one but still feel comfort that we are doing all we can to protect what few panthers remain in my state.

Thanks

Harold Clapp
Nokomis Florida

From:	nh3417@aol.com
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther - Keep on Endangered Species List & Increase Their Protection
Date:	Thursday, August 24, 2017 11:33:22 AM

Dear Dave,

I urge you to keep the Florida panther on the Endangered Species list and do everything possible to protect these magnificent creatures.

These Florida panthers need more protection, not less, and much larger habitats in which to roam and flourish.

Do not allow oil and gas exploration, fracking, waste disposal or residential developments encroach any further on the Florida panthers' already shrinking habitat.

You do not want to be remembered as the man who allowed one of the most magnificent species of large cat to become extinct, do you? If you don't act to protect the magnificent *Puma concolor,* it will become extinct.

The Florida panthers' survival depends on you and your leadership. Please, do everything you can to protect these majestic animals for all of the citizens of the world.

Sincerely,
Mary Lawrence

From:	Mel Wathen
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Cc:	dan_ashe@fws.gov; cyn_dohner@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther - Maintain on Endangered Species List & Increase Their Protection
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 9:05:32 AM

Dear Dave,

I urge you to **keep the Florida panther on the Endangered Species list** and do everything possible to protect these magnificent creatures and encourage them to multiply.

These Florida panthers need more protection, not less, and much larger habitats in which to roam and flourish.

Do not allow oil and gas exploration, fracking, waste disposal or residential/commercial developments to encroach any further on the Florida panthers' already shrinking habitat.

You do not want to be remembered as the man who allowed one of the most magnificent species of large cat to become extinct, do you? If you don't act to protect the magnificent Florida panther, it will become extinct.

As there are a scant 200 Florida panthers left, the survival of their species depends on you and your leadership.

Please, do everything you can to protect these majestic animals for all of the citizens of the world.

Sincerely,
Mel Wathen

From: mburnett77a@cfl.rr.com
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther - please protect it
Date: Saturday, August 26, 2017 10:49:26 AM

You have the power to keep the Florida Panther on the endangered species list. PLEASE help this animal to not go extinct.

M. J. Burnett

From: rodger skidmore
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther - Pro and Con
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 8:38:47 PM

Greetings Mr. Shindle,

I am not sure of the arguments against the panther as they live in the wild and don't, as a rule, pose a threat to humans.

An argument for the panther is not that it is cute or macho, it is that it is part of the balance of nature. It eats shall game - rodents, etc. more than it brings down calfs, etc. And, since it was here for hundreds of thousands of years, it really does have a right to live in this land. WE have made it difficult for it to live here so WE should do all WE can do to help it survive.

Best regards,

Rodger Skidmore
Sarasota, FL 34235

From:	Sound Soul Counseling
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida panther - protect them, please
Date:	Saturday, August 12, 2017 3:21:03 AM

Please provide protection for Florida Panther.
Sincerely,

Zita

Sent from ProtonMail mobile

From: Laurie Flebotte
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther - Urgent Request
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 10:09:13 AM

Dear Mr. Shindle;

Please continue to protect the panther's 'endangered status' under the Endangered Species Act and increase efforts to protect the remaining habitat in the upcoming status review. This panther is an isolated sub-species of the North American cougar and is the last sub-species of panther east of the Mississippi River. It is a symbol of much in our state, our state animal, hockey team, numerous schools sports teams.

As you are aware, the habitat for this majestic native of Florida continues to come under attack from development projects of varying and nature and value. The small population remaining continues to suffer annually from loss of habitat and road kill accidents.

One particular proposed development project named "Rural Lands West" will damage prime habitat adjacent to the Florida Panther Wildlife Refuge. I ask you to work to deny this project and the development and extensive damage it will do as well as others that will further damage the small remaining habitat for this species.

I appreciate your time and advocacy on behalf of the panther and the citizens supporting its' continued survival.

Regards,

Laurel Flebotte
13801 SW 26th Street
Davie, FL 33325

From:	Larise Nicholson
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 1:16:25 PM

Dear David: I'll make this brief but could we please keep protecting the Florida Panther. There are not that many of them and they are still in danger & need protection. Thank you. Sincerely, M.S. Nicholson

Sent from my iPhone

From:	Neliet Crespo
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 7:40:50 AM

Hi, my name Neliet Crespo . I'm writtting to you about changing the Florida panther status from endangered to threatened. I believe that this marvelous animal should have the best shot at reproducing , and us as Floridians, should help at all cost .

From:	Robert Lane
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida panther
Date:	Saturday, August 12, 2017 9:15:47 AM

Please consider keeping the Florida panther on the Endangered Species list. Their numbers are already dangerously depleted, and they need to be protected. Do we really want to see another extinct animal on this planet?

Sincerely,
Jill Lane

Sent from my iPhone

From:	Margaret Kreynus
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida panther
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 4:30:22 PM

These animals are no longer the small docile Florida panther, but large Texas cougars that kill our animals in the Golden Gate Estates area, with families having to confine their children and pets between dusk and dawn.

I refuse to vote for such stupidity and believe it's horrible these beasts are revered over the local populace.

Margaret Kreynus

From:	Matthew Peña
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 5:40:55 PM

Hello David,
I was writing to you for an assignment and i wanted to say or mention that i believe the number of panthers that are alive today is a good amount. And i believe they should be set free so they can grow and prosper on their own. Thanks if you read this!

From,
Matthew Peña

From: Susan Leaventon
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Thursday, August 24, 2017 10:10:30 AM

Hi Folks, This is the draft I put together regarding the panther. I will clean up today and send tomorrow. I am attaching a few FWS papers for your information as well. Have a wonderful day.

Dear David Shindle,

I am writing in regards to the current review of the Florida Panther listing status. The Florida Panther should remain listed as a Federally protected Endangered Species. There is no indication that the status should change. There are several reasons that i strongly object to any recommendation to delist or lessen the status to threatened or unprotected. The Florida Panther population is too low in numbers to be viable without strong, continued protections. We have not come close to target numbers for any change in listing status (See multi-species recovery plan and other sources for further discussion). Almost all panthers reside in a small region in southwest Florida. This range is significantly smaller (perhaps 5-10% of the original distribution). Panthers require large range and a mix of contiguous natural habitat. By delisting the Florida Panther, we open additional lands to development without further review. South Florida is under continued development pressure and currently SW Florida is in a phase of rampant development leading to impacts to not only the Florida Panther but many other Threatened and Endangered plants an animals. The Florida Panther protections provide a means to review development permits and to protect the species for future generations.

As a Floridian, I feel it would be negligent to change the listing status of the Florida Panther. We know from extensive public surveys that the Florida Panther is a symbol of natural Florida and highly regarded by the public. it would be unfair to future generations to allow this beautiful animal to be further threatened due to change in listing status. SW Florida has multiple large Development of Regional Impact submissions currently under review. Several have already been approved. Without proper authority for review (delisting of panther), natural areas may be subject to further development and protected areas may be impacted due to regional impact. Continuity in habitat is critically important to the Florida Panther.

The idea that panthers are abundant because they are seen in urban areas has very little to do with population but much more to do with development of natural home range and limited habitat. This is a very false assumption that some may try to perpetuate. It is not supported by data!

I do feel there are many challenges and do not discount the difficulty of managing habitat for the Florida Panther. Clearly the large range/spatial extent needs mean we need to work together to come up with solutions. Many of our largest natural area land holders should be engaged and supported. if areas that are currently used for grazing are converted to development, we will further compartmentalize already limited habitat. I recognize that panthers may at sometimes take cattle as food. These numbers are fairly limited and we should work to provide limited compensation for losses (to ranches) rather than lose lands and/or delist the panther. We spend tens of millions of dollars on T&E protections when a beef cow sells for approximately $[redacted] on market (depending on size, sex, and quality). it seems that this is minimal compensation relative to the potential to lose 10s of thousands of acres to development or to lose support of large natural areas landholders. At a minimum we should recognize these problems and work toward a common solution.

As ongoing land pressures continues, whether it be development, water storage, or loss in continuity of natural areas (road building etc), we continue to put pressure on the Florida Panther. I appreciate the opportunity to voice my opinion and hope that the Federal government and the USFWS will maintain the Endangered Species status for the Florida Panther.

Sincerely,

Susan Leaventon, M.A., M.Ed.
Sleaventon@gmail.com

From: don beverly
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther (Endangered Status)
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 10:33:06 AM

As a lifelong resident of South Florida and someone raised in the Glades, I've seen once frequent sightings of the Florida panther reduced to seldom, if ever, as both their habitat and population have been eliminated. To consider removing their "endangered" status under these circumstances will only hasten their further demise and ultimate extinction for the same reasons which have produced the problem.

The time is long past for expecting these animals to survive and prosper without our help as those who caused their endangerment, thus even considering removal of any protection we can provide simply disregards reality.

Don Beverly
don@donbeverly.com

Sent from my iPad

From:	Judith Dunbar
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida panther
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 11:05:04 PM

I live in Sarasota county on Palmer Ranch. Last week an adult panther was seen 8 doors down from my house. Currently there is way too much residential building in Sarasota which is wreaking havoc on the scarce habitat of these endangered animals. Stop the overbuilding! We are driving some Florida wildlife to extinction! Save the Florida panther!

Sincerely,

Judith Dunbar
8286 Shadow Pine Way
Sarasota FL 34248
Jtaydun@gmail.com

Sent from my iPhone

From: MSing
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther 5 year review status
Date: Tuesday, August 22, 2017 11:14:11 AM

Greetings Mr. Shindler,

As native Miamians and full-fledged Florida conservationists, we urge you to maintain the current status of the Florida panther as a separate sub-species.

Additionally, because panther populations are notoriously difficult to accurately count, there is no solid evidence to even consider a downgrade of their current status. What is a fact is that the panthers suffered their deadliest year so far at 15 deaths, which is NOT a valid argument that their numbers have rebounded, only that their habitat continues to be diminished by business development in Florida.

You especially should not heed any recommendations from MOST of the commissioners on the current Florida Fish & Wildlife Conservation Commission, most notably Commissioner Liesa Priddy, who is an Immokalee rancher. Ms. Priddy puts her ranch and personal gains ahead of the interests of protected species.
However, you should note that Commissioner Ron Bergeron, who does not allow his status as a rancher to interfere with the facts and who does NOT support any downgrade of the Florida panther.

We remember when panthers were brought back from the brink of extinction, when less than 30 remained in Florida, and we do not want to see their numbers decline. There is a new appetite for saving our unique Florida eco-system, and the Florida panther is included in that equation.

We most humbly urge you during this five-year review to maintain the current protected status for the endangered Florida panther, which REMAINS a separate subspecies unique to our state.

Thank you in advance for your careful consideration!

Regards,
Martha Singleton & Walter Walkington
6600 SW 79 Avenue
Miami, FL 33143

From: Furedy, David R (GE Transportation)
To: Shindle, David
Subject: Florida Panther 5 yr Status Review.
Date: Friday, August 25, 2017 3:24:41 PM

Florida Panther 5 yr Status Review.

David S,

I would like to first start off saying that you and your team do an excellent job with the panther program especially given today's political environment and the financial challenges your team face.

Here are my comments

I look at the overall program as having two options based on what you decide with Taxonomy.

- Should you decide to list the panther the same as all other North American puma I think they should be then changed to a distinct population segment, this would allow you to bring in more cats from texas to help with genetics and I would be fine with allowing limited permits to remove problem cats so residents don't feel as "helpless" should they lose a pet or livestock repeated times (not a 1 strike rule but maybe a 3 or 5 strike rule depending on the situation). This would then maybe make ranchers and residents more willing to work with the USFWS especially with moving cats north to start new populations.
- Should you decide to leave the panther listing as is as a separate subspecies I feel many of the rules that you currently have should stay the same and a lot of that is due to the limited genetics you have, so any lost cats would possibly be lost genetics for future generations.
- Either way the panthers should remain listed as endangered, it is just do you call it a DPS or leave them as a distinct subspecies.

New populations - Next is either way the USFWS need to start working on new populations north of the river. That can be accomplished by making the south your quote unquote captive breeding grounds. You could remove cats from that area in both panther and human dense regions and move them north to either a designated spot that you are starting this new population or just far enough north that dispersing cats from the south wouldn't end up right in another cats territory. (I called the south a captive breeding grounds cause it would just be in the wild rather than a zoo and I say captive due to the limited number that cross the river). But either way the panthers will never be removed from the ESA if we don't actively start a new breeding population. And that use to not be possible due to the limited number of panthers in south florida, but now that they are more stable I think moving some is definitely viable.

Land/Habitat – I believe more land acquisition to keep wildlife corridors accessible is vitally important and should also be a high priority. Preventing fragmentation of habitat is a key component.

Conservation Efforts that have benefited the species - No hunting, no harassment. Genetic

restoration. Aid to locals in the form of pet & livestock husbandry, protection, & funding programs. Agency, partner Groups, & individuals doing panther & wildlife outreach. Speed limits & underpasses. Land acquisitions, & ongoing restoration efforts on the panther refuge.

Threats - Humans: their attitudes, activities, & population, development, encroachment, & roads.
- Panthers, their restricted gene pool & solitary population, which could fall or fail to disease, man made or natural disaster.
- Habitat loss, fragmentation, & degradation. Climate change which could have potential negative effects on the landscape.

Other Recommendations – Have an online panther specialist that focuses more time crushing the rumor and conspiracy groups pages and agendas prior to gaining strength. These groups going unchecked and unquestioned have a huge effort to twist data and use it to change the public's perception of panthers. So maybe if the group focused on going on those forums and answering questions and trying to state facts it would kill rumors before they spread.

Education efforts – This has to be larger than just south florida. The entire east coast since it has been so long without having a large predator needs educated from grade school on up what the real risks of predators are. They need shown what to do if they encounter an predator and what the true statistics of being harmed by one are.

Feel free to reach out if you have any questions or comments.

Thanks again for your service to the community

David Furedy

From:	Brett Hartl
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther 5-year review
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 2:51:35 PM
Attachments:	ASM-SCBNA Letter on Florida Panther 5-year Review.pdf

---

Please accept the following comments from the Society for Conservation Biology North America and the the American Society of Mammalogists.

Thank you,

Brett Hartl
Vice President for Policy and Programs
Society for Conservation Biology North America

From:	Laura Ciociola
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida panther campaign
Date:	Thursday, August 10, 2017 9:40:38 AM

Hi, David, as part of our outreach to our members, we wanted to highlight the review of the Florida panther plan FWS is considering and offer an avenue for them to make public comment before August 29. Is there a site where you all are collecting comments on this issue?

If not, rather than flood your inbox, I can create a sign-on letter and collect everyone's contact information and then send it along to you. We can have up to 1,000 people participate in these types of actions, so I wanted to see from you what is most helpful from your end.

Thanks so much for your guidance,

Laura

Communications and Development
Florida Conservation Voters
[redacted]
laura@fcvoters.org
www.FCVoters.org

From:	Jessica Garafola
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther classification
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 8:17:43 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,
I'm a Florida resident, originally from Connecticut, and I need to ask you to maintain the Florida Panther classification as endangered rather than change it to threatened. I urge you to maintain the endangered status for this species and also protect its habitat from development projects. I have been so sickened by the storm in Houston--and the research shows that the population grew very quickly and developers used land that was needed to drain the area. Development can't be allowed to ruin our habitat and those other creatures of our ecosystem. Please keep the Panther as endangered and block development that harms the Panther.
Sincerely,
Jessica Rose Garafola

From:	Robert L Trescott
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Cc:	Tom Koch
Subject:	Florida Panther Comment
Date:	Thursday, August 24, 2017 1:54:35 PM

David, Tom Koch a good friend and hunting partner forwarded to me your contact information so that I could comment.

I hunt two areas: one is inside of the Glades County Hunt Club and the other is just northwest of Lakeport. I have seen a Panther within the hunt club on two occasions. The first 5 years ago and the second two years ago. No telling whether a female or male. During the past two years we have seen no rooting or other signs of pigs.

Our other property near Lakeport use to be over run with pigs. For the past two years we have seen no signs of pigs. We have not seen a panther, but tracks could be indicative of their presence.

Wishing you the best,

Robert L. Trescott

Sent from my iPhone

From:	Sarah Hollenhorst
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther comment
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 10:18:21 PM

I am asking that the Florida Panther keep its Endangered status. 22 panthers have been killed just this year, most by vehicle collisions. Many have been young females. This can't continue or this iconic Florida predator will go extinct. I ask that you immediately take a more proactive stance on the Florida Panther's preservation by expanding habitat preservation and limiting development and road construction in panther habitat, reducing speed limits, creating wide corridors, educating the public more thoroughly, extending protections and preserving habitat North of the Calusahatchee, and expanding collaring and monitoring of panthers. The future of the Panther is in your hands.
Sincerely,
Sarah Hollenhorst
9347 SW Raccoon Trail
Arcadia, FL 34266
[redacted]
sarahlh7101@gmail.com

Sent from my iPhone

From: Andrew McElwaine
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther Comment
Date: Wednesday, August 23, 2017 1:40:12 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

I urge you to maintain endangered species protections for Florida panthers as you conduct your review of the panther's protected status under the Endangered Species Act. The Florida Panther is the only remaining breeding population of large cats east of the Mississippi. It qualifies for Endangered Species Act protection regardless of any taxonomic classification the Service may choose to describe the panther. It qualifies either as an isolated population, and endangered subspecies, or an endangered species.

It is estimated that fewer than 200 Florida panthers remain, which makes them some of the most endangered mammals on earth. Residential development and traffic in south Florida have already pushed them to the brink of extinction. Now oil and gas development in the Big Cypress National Preserve, the panther's home in the Florida Everglades, could push them even closer to extinction.

Removing Florida panthers from the endangered species list would strip them of their protections when they need them most.

You have the power to preserve the panther's last defense against extinction. Please keep Florida panthers protected as endangered under the Endangered Species Act, before we lose them forever.

Thank you.

Kind regards,

Andrew S McElwaine
921 James Street
Pittsburgh, PA 15212

From:	Veronica Nickel
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther Comment
Date:	Friday, August 11, 2017 11:13:55 AM

Hello David,

I'm a Florida resident of Delray Beach. I heard on the radio today that there is a public comment period regarding keeping the Florida Panther on the endangered species list. I believe that there hasn't been enough success with the current recovery plan to safely take them off the endangered list and ensure repopulation. I urge the U.S. Wildlife Service to maintain their current status and continue protection efforts.

Many thanks,
Veronica Nickel
780 NW 29th Ave, Apt A
Delray Beach, FL 33445

From:	Ron Sutherland
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov; Leopoldo Miranda; kevin_godsea@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida panther comments from Wildlands Network
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 3:50:12 PM
Attachments:	Florida panther comment by WN August 2017 final.pdf

---

Hi David, Kevin, and Leo,

Attached please find brief comments from Wildlands Network regarding the conservation status of Florida panthers.

To boil them down to just a single sentence: Please don't forget that Florida panthers belong across the southeastern US, not just in South Florida, and FWS should be taking robust conservation actions accordingly.

Thank you very much for your time, and I hope you are all doing well. I'd enjoy talking with you soon about the Florida panther situation, if any of you will be around over the next couple of weeks?

Ron

--
****
Ron Sutherland, Ph.D.
Conservation Scientist
Wildlands Network
[redacted] cell
www.flickr.com/photos/redwolfreality/albums
www.wildlandsnetwork.org

From: Kandz, Dave
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther comments
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 11:31:23 PM

I am opposed to changing the protection status of the Florida Panther for the following reasons :

A. There are only an estimated 230 panthers remaining in Florida. That's to few to justify relaxing protection.

B. From 2014 through 2016, the number of Florida panthers killed by drivers (88) outpaced the number of panthers that were born (61), according to state wildlife officials. This fact, coupled with (A) above, makes relaxing protection even more unthinkable.

C. There has never been any critical habitat designated for the Florida Panther, and yet property owners are asking for exemptions to federal protections for panthers and other endangered species for a new development that could spread across 152,000 acres in eastern Collier County.

Please do not change the protection status of the Florida Panther from "endangered", and start the process of designating critical habitat for it.

Dave Kandz
9685 2nd St. N
St. Petersburg, FL 33702
dave@rbdigital.biz

From: Marcela
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida panther conservation status
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 7:52:57 PM

Please maintain full endangered species status for the Florida panther – and consider the cumulative impacts to the panther from the many development projects currently underway or under review in its habitat. Also, consider what those projects are doing to the likelihood that the Florida panther will ever recover. Finally, exercise your power as a regulatory agency of the United States government – and to fulfill your duties under the Endangered Species Act by protecting the Florida panther's vital but rapidly shrinking habitat from loss, degradation, and fragmentation.
Thank you
Marcela McGrath

From: sirrocket@me.com
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther delisting decision.
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 3:05:49 PM

Sir,
As a resident of Florida and a lifelong advocate for all Big Cats I am asking that you/FWS continue to keep our Florida Panthers on the endangered species list.
Science has clearly shown the numbers today are too low (180-200) to sustain them, much less down list or take them off the endangered list and the more we take their habitat away the closer they are coming in contact with humans and traffic, killing them and causing their extinction.
In 2015 Florida Panthers were featured on a $1.00 silver coin from Tuvalu, designed by fellow friend and Florida resident, numismatist Chuck Daughtry, the Florida Panther is our official state animal and we cannot afford to lose anymore of them.

I understand your position, you are caught in between people like me, politicians and builders/businesses but at some point we must understand that humans and animals are equally a part of our ecosystem, so to rid one will hurt both.
Please do not let politics and big money decide their fate, let the science, the majority of Floridians and animal lovers from all over decide their fate.

Respectfully,

Suzanne Stewart
PO Box 110516
Lakewood Ranch, FL
34211-0007

From:	Robert Sickler
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther Delisting
Date:	Saturday, August 12, 2017 8:15:57 PM

I do not agree with the delisting of the Florida Panther. Despite its growing populations in a few places in Florida, this species is not flourishing throughout the state. With an increasing human population, habitat loss and fragmentation will continue to put pressure on this species.

I would like to see the continued listing of this species exactly how it is.

Sincerely,
Robert Sickler

From:	Shasta McNasty
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther Delisting
Date:	Saturday, August 12, 2017 4:22:30 PM

I'm a Florida citizen from Winter Park (32792) and I strongly oppose downgrading the Florida panther's "endangered" status. Their habitat is subject to aggressive development and there are only about 230 remaining--unlike the booming human population of 20,600,000. Please keep the Florida Panther on the "endangered" list until their numbers have drastically increased and their habitat is no longer under assault.

Thank you,

Chloe Conradi
32792

From: Kitin72
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther Delisting
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 3:43:41 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,
With only 230 Florida panthers remaining in the Sunshine State and their habitat continuing to shrink from human forces, developers and ranchers are pushing hard for the panther to be removed from the endangered list.
The justification given is the small increase in Panther population since 2014. This is faulty reasoning. In the same time period, Panther vs. vehicle fatalities (88) still far outpaced viable births (61). The population is still not at a sustainable level when those numbers are factored in.
I implore you to leave the Florida Panther's Endangered status intact!
Sincerely,
Lori A. Nelson

Sent from AOL Mobile Mail

From: margo
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther designation
Date: Friday, August 25, 2017 2:24:10 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

I believe that the Florida panther is highly endangered. I have lived here in Florida since 1997 and have searched far and wide and have never seen one alive. I have seen them dead on the side of the road.

Please do whatever is necessary to maintain the Florida panther as an highly endangered species.

Thank you,
Margo Robison
[redacted]
5929 Eastlake Dr
New Port Richey, Fl 34653

Sent on a Sprint Samsung Galaxy Note® 3

From:	Patty Quinby
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida panther Do Not Delist as endangered speciies
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 8:37:59 AM

Please protect the Florida panther. Florida has had so much development that reduces the wildlife habitat. Removing the Florida panther from the endangered species list will enable more development. I was born in Florida and have watched the beautiful, vibrant landscape turned into dead zones of development. Please don't allow this.

From: Aaron Richmond-Gernant
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther Ecological Emergency
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 4:41:08 PM

I urge you to keep the Florida Panther on the Endangered Species Act. It was one of the first animals placed on the list and it still is in critical conditions. I urge you to keep this critical predator to the Florida Ecosystem under protection.

--

Aaron Richmond

Student Assistant

Housing and Residential Education

University of South Florida

From:	Charles Fischer
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther Endagered Species
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 11:22:16 AM

Please maintain the Florida Panther with full endangerd species status.

Thank you
Charles Fischer
Miami Beach, FL

From: Jennifer
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther Endangered Species Designation
Date: Friday, August 25, 2017 10:31:42 AM

Please keep the Florida Panther on the Endangered Species List. It is our Florida State Animal. With Florida's population increasing at a fast rate, the panther's habitat is decreasing and there are more deaths with the increased auto traffic. The Florida panther needs to continue to be protected by the Federal Endangered Species designation as it struggles to survive in Florida. Thank you for your consideration. Jennifer Beach (Merritt Island , Florida)

From:	Rob Morey
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther Endangered Species List
Date:	Sunday, August 13, 2017 2:47:01 PM

I strongly believe the Florida Panther should be maintained on the Endangered Species List and be afforded the highest level of protection under the law. As a 61 year old native Floridian, I have seen irretrievable habitat loss in our state. By protecting species at the top of the ecosystem we help insure better habitat for innumerable other species which are less well known but no less deserving of protection.

Sincerely,

Kim O'Brien
2635 Florida Ave. S.
St. Petersburg, FL
33705

From: Jones,Linda Lee Ann
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther Endangered Species Listing Comment
Date: Thursday, August 24, 2017 11:02:50 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

As a lifelong Floridian, a wildlife ecologist/environmental education professor at the University of Florida, a member of the Board of Directors of the Conservation Trust of Florida, and a concerned citizen, I am writing to respectfully request that the Florida panther KEEP its Federal endangered species status.

As the official state mammal of Florida and a keystone umbrella species, it is especially important to ensure the continued survival of this iconic mammal whose primary reason for endangerment is loss of habitat.

Continued Federal endangered species protection is critical until at least two stable, healthy populations of panthers have been re-established in Florida. Please do not put the Florida panther population's recovery in jeopardy after so many have worked so hard to save this species!

Respectfully,
Dr. Linda Cronin Jones

Sent from my iPhone

From: Phillis Weis
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida panther endangered species protection input
Date: Wednesday, August 23, 2017 5:26:26 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

I think the Florida panther needs to be re-introduced to parts of its original range as I feel that the exotic Burmese pythons will be the competing top predator that will tilt the odds to extirpation for the remnant population holding on in South Florida. It has been established that the Burmese pythons have colonized most of the Everglades and are continue to extend their range to all parts of South Florida and have already colonized Big Cypress National Preserve and crossed Alligator Alley and are currently extending their range towards Lake Okeechobee and have basically established themselves over the entire range of the remaining panthers. It has been determined that the pythons feed on the same prey on the same animals as the panthers. Our remaining Florida panthers have too little territory, too much competition and it is time to start re-introduction NOW!

Sincerely,
Peter Weis
Tallahassee

From: linda.duda5648
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther Endangered Species Protection
Date: Sunday, August 6, 2017 10:31:56 AM

Mr. Shindle:

All of us who LOVE Florida urge you to protect the panthers. These magnificent animals are going extinct from humans, vehicles and development in the State.
The panthers need the protection of the Endangered Species Act. PLEASE HELP.

I fell in love with Florida on my first visit in 1970 and vowed to retire here. Blessed that we retired here in 1998.

We love the wildlife & marine life -
most especially the Panthers, bears and manatees.
It hurts my heart to know the Panthers are going extinct, bear hunts are killing bears and boaters are going too fast in areas manatees frequent.

We also love the Everglades and the Gulf of Mexico and our beaches.
It is sad that pythons are decimating the Everglades with very little being done to STOP them.

The Governor and big sugar are standing in the way of Lake O releases being sent to the Everglades. The east-west releases should NOT happen. These releases affect the water and beaches, marine life, tourism, etc.

We urge you to do whatever you can to protect the things that make Florida a very special paradise.

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Linda Duda

Sent via the Samsung Galaxy S® 6, an AT&T 4G LTE smartphone

From: Andrew Gottlieb
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther Endangered Species Status Review
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 10:52:01 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

I am writing in regard to the current review of the Florida Panther listing status. The Florida Panther should remain listed as a Federally protected Endangered Species. There is no indication that the status should change. There are several reasons that I strongly object to any recommendation to delist or lessen the status to threatened or unprotected. The Florida Panther population is too low in numbers to be viable without strong, continued protections. We have not come close to target numbers for any change in listing status (See multi-species recovery plan an other sources for further discussion). Almost all panthers reside in a small region in southwest FL (and limited portions of the Everglades). This range is significantly smaller (perhaps 5-10%) of the original distribution. Panthers require large range and a mix of contiguous natural habitat.** By delisting the Florida Panther, we open additional lands to development without further review. South Florida is under continued development pressure and currently SW Florida is in a phase of rampant development leading to impacts to not only the Florida Panther but many other Threatened and Endangered plants an animals. The Florida Panther protections provide a means to review development permits and to protect the species for future generations. (See Collier, Lee and Hendry County Comprehensive Plans for future land use maps, for details on DRIs, and change in spatial extent and connectivity of natural areas. Also see roadway widening figures- recent, current and planned. Note that the number of panther deaths along roads continue to be extremely high).

In addition to urban expansion the State of FL (SFWMD) is using and plans to use several large natural areas for disperse water storage. Although water storage is greatly needed in Florida, plans should be closely reviewed to confirm that they will not negatively impact the florida panther and other T&E species. Hydrology of many area wetlands that were previously drained (i.e. Alico and others), can be restored thereby increasing water storage without harming native communities (and in some cases providing significant habitat restoration benefit). However, increasing hydroperiods (depth and duration) beyond community tolerance can negatively impact the panther and other species. We need to be clear that these features are not merely constructed as reservoirs but rather as natural water storage with natural hydroperiods (as opposed to current drained conditions). Disperse storage can both restore historic wetlands and adjacent habitat while at the same time seasonally storing water. This can provide the larger spatial extent and connectivity of natural areas that the Florida panther requires. (please note, this does not mean reservoirs should not be constructed in other areas but rather disperse water storage should not be developed as deep water features)

As a Floridian (and an Ecologist), I feel it would be negligent to change the listing status of the Florida Panther. We know from extensive public surveys that the Florida Panther is a symbol of natural Florida and highly regarded by the public. it would be unfair to future generations to allow this beautiful animal to be further threatened due to change in listing status. SW Florida has multiple large Development of Regional Impact submissions currently under review. Several have already been approved. Without proper authority for review (delisting of panther), natural areas may be subject to further development and protected areas may be impacted due to regional impact.

The idea that panthers are abundant because they are seen in urban areas has very little to do with population but much more to do with development of natural home range and limited habitat. This is a very false assumption that some may try to perpetuate. It is not supported by data!

I do feel there are many challenges and do not discount the difficulty of managing habitat for the Florida Panther. Clearly the large range/spatial extent needs mean we need to work together to come up with solutions. Many of our largest natural area land holders should be engaged and supported. If areas that are currently used for grazing are converted to development, we will further compartmentalize already limited habitat. I recognize that panthers may at sometimes take cattle as food. These numbers are fairly limited and we should work to provide limited compensation for losses (to ranches) rather than lose lands and/or delist the panther. We spend tens of millions of dollars on T&E protections when a beef cow sells for approximately $[redacted] on market (depending on size, sex, and quality). it seems that this is minimal compensation relative to the potential to lose 10s of thousands of acres to development or to lose support of large natural areas landholders. At a minimum we should recognize these problems and work toward a common solution.

As ongoing land pressures continues, whether it be development, water storage, or loss in continuity of natural areas (road building etc), we continue to put pressure on the Florida Panther. I appreciate the opportunity to voice my opinion and hope that the Federal government and the USFWS will maintain the Endangered Species status for the Florida Panther. Please feel free to contact me if you have questions or would like to discuss further.

Sincerely,
Andrew Gottlieb, Ph.D.
Aquatic and Landscape Ecologist
adgottlieb71@gmail.com

**Clearly the Caloosahatchee under modern configuration limits expansion. I hope the USFWS will continue to work with partner agencies to establish corridors for northward expansion (and growth of populations to the N).

From: D S
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther Endangered Species Status
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 2:14:40 PM

Dear Fish and Wildlife Service Representative,

The Florida Panther is a magnificent animal and an integral part of of Florida's environmental and cultural heritage. I urge you to retain full protected status for these animals whose very existence remains increasingly threatened by habitat loss and other challenges. Please do everything possible to save these iconic reminders of what natural Florida was like before being so degraded by mankind.

Thank you,

Donald Shockey

Donald P. Shockey
AICP-CUD | CNU-A | LEED GA | PQP
95 NW 41st Street, Miami FL 33127 [redacted]
dpsmiami@hotmail.com

From:	Christine Dann
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther Endangered Species Status
Date:	Tuesday, August 22, 2017 3:53:15 PM

Good afternoon Mr. Shindle,

I am writing to ask you to please relay to the appropriate persons that myself and many other people object to the federal government's plans to revisit the endangered status of Florida panthers.

There are only 220 Florida panther left in the wild. They have many environmental and developmental pressures already that make their continued existence in danger. Any other plans to change their status from the endangered species list places them in grave danger of extinction.

Please do not remove the endangered species of Florida's state animal, which in 1981 the school children of Florida chose to have as the official state animal.

Thank you for your timely and serious consideration of this request, Dr. Jeffrey and Christine Dann

From: Captain John Bailey
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther Endangered Species Status
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 11:14:26 AM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

I am writing you regarding the discussion to down list the status of the Florida Panther.
The Florida Panther is an endangered species and its status should reflect that reality.

Here are the reasons why:

1. The size and distribution of the Florida panther population is insufficient to down list the status of the subspecies to threatened.

2. Vehicle collisions are a major threat to the Florida panther population.

3. The effects of continued habitat loss and fragmentation are even more severe than previously acknowledged.

4. Research indicates that crowding due to habitat limitations may be reducing kitten survival and placing a limit on population growth

Please keep these realities in mind so that we may fully protect this species.

Sincerely,
John Bailey
Boca Raton, FL
Sent from Mail for Windows 10

From:	Marilu
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida panther endangered status
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 10:52:37 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle

Ban trophy hunting in Florida. I expect the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service to stand up for Florida's iconic species.
Your job is to protect and preserve, and not kill and destroy. What is needed is more habitat and for Florida to complete and maintain the wildlife corridor that is essential for panthers and bears, among others, to survive.
Cattle raising is one of the most environmental destruction actions humans are engaged in. Habitat destruction and hunting to raise beef is morally wrong. Killing an animal for a photo and a trophy is morally bankrupt.

Thank you from a conservation voter,
Marilu Dempsey

Little Wekiva Road, altamonte Springs
Florida 32714

From:	Brian Scherf
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther Endangered Status Comments
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 10:38:30 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

I am writing in support of keeping the endangered status of the Florida Panther. No change is warranted due to the following factors:

- The current estimate of 100 - 200 panthers is only a tiny fraction of its historic population.
- Panther habitat is less than 5% of its historic range. There is continuing and fast paced habitat loss, degradation, fragmentation and looming climate change impacts.
- Continuing and likely increasing future roadkill. In 2015 a record 42 panthers were killed with an increasing road network and traffic density -- over 20% of the estimated high range of the population in one year!
- Reduced prey base due to habitat loss, hunting and invasive species.
- Inbreeding due to reduced population size and habitat.

The USFWS must consider the above negative cumulative and synergistic impacts on the panther. In addition the USFWS must utilize the best available science in reviewing the status of the Florida Panther.

In summary, no change is warranted. Keep the Florida Panther's endangered status.

Sincerely,

Brian Scherf
Hollywood, FL

Sent from my iPad

From:	Sheryl Schroeder
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther Endangered Status
Date:	Wednesday, August 16, 2017 12:47:37 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

I am contacting you as a big cat advocate and a very concerned citizen who wants to keep the Florida Panther's endangered status intact.

The U.S. Fish & Wildlife Service should continue to establish and sustain three viable populations of at least 240 Florida panthers each. 240 is nowhere near enough for these animals to be considered stable. The FSW should also do more to protect habitat by critically evaluating proposed development projects, selectively permitting new construction, and prioritizing the conservation of panther habitat in Southwest Florida. The Fish & Wildlife Service has already opened huge tracts of panther habitat to construction and seemingly never says no to building plans. This has to stop. Florida panthers are an iconic species that are on the brink of extinction. The time to protect them is NOW.

Please keep the Florida panther’s protective status as endangered and don't change the recovery criteria for the state’s most beloved animal. The Florida panther is beloved by many and thousands of people have purchased the special "Protect The Panther" license plate, it is the state's 5th most popular plate, but this is not enough. We have to make sure they can build their numbers back up to a sustainable count. Habitat loss because of new buildings, roads and airports in Southwest Florida continue to push our panthers out and wipe out their habitat, increasing the likelihood that these beautiful big cats will be hit by cars.

KEEP THE ENDANGERED STATUS, PLEASE!
No hunting, no trapping, and some protected "no development" safe areas for them!

Thank you,
S. Schroeder

From:	Connie Bransilver
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther Endangered Status
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 10:39:30 AM

Dear Dave,

While there is little we can add to the torrent of objections to de-listing the Florida panther, we do want to focus on our personal despair at our species' dwindling attachment to the natural world, epitomized by the protections surrounding the designation of an animal as "endangered." Though we have done much to restore the vigor of the Florida panther, it cannot be removed from the endangered list unless and until there are viable populations interacting throughout Florida and at least into Georgia. Today there are not.

I am not optimistic, however. Raising condos is so much more profitable, and greed and indifference seem to be in the ascendence.

We selected Deb Jansen and Roy McBride as a Guardians of the Everglades because of their work with the panthers — Roy since 1975. As the keystone species throughout south Florida, as the panther goes, so goes the Everglades and our piece of natural Mother Earth.

Thank you, Dave, for all your work.

Sincerely,
Nicholas and Connie

NICHOLAS PETRUCCI
CONNIE BRANSILVER
Guardians of the Everglades®
1719 Trade Center Way, #3
Naples, FL 34109
[redacted]
Open Wed. 2:00 - 7:00 pm
GuardiansoftheEverglades.com
ConnieBransilver.com
NicholasPetrucci.com

HELP US FINISH THIS PROJECT!

Tax deductible donations: WIFV.org, a 501(c)(3) organization.

INTERNATIONAL LEAGUE OF CONSERVATION PHOTOGRAPHERS

From: rutharella@comcast.net
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther ESA Review
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 5:00:24 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle:

I would like to add my voice to the many who have already commented in favor of maintaining full ESA protections for the Florida Panther. The management guidelines developed to support the ESA listing of the Panther are clear in their requirement for 3 breeding populations to become established before considering a de-listing. While this has not yet been achieved, it is clear that the one documented breeding population in SW Florida remains viable and capable of dispersing. Sightings of panthers north of the Caloosahatchee in recent years would seem to suggest that the panther can eventually extend into additional breeding populations within the state, and perhaps in Georgia and elsewhere. This dispersal should remain the goal for the Florida panther. (Re-location is an option that is not being utilized.)

Unfortunately, continuing development of essential habitat continues to make recovery difficult. But, this is another reason why the listing is so essential. Not only does the ESA listing allow this keystone species to continue its recovery – but the listing serves to protect vital habitat for countless other species that co-exist with the Panther.

While it would seem obvious during the 5-year listing review that the ESA listing should remain in effect - there are certain parties who would argue that the panther will never recover beyond SW Florida and so should lose ESA protection. Some suggest that simply maintaining a sustainable population in SW Florida is a better choice. Yet - how would this be achieved – by de-listing and managing with a hunting season? This is not a popular alternative amongst wildlife enthusiasts. Losing ESA protection would also put wildlife habitat at greater risk.

Maintaining the ESA listing – or not – remains a choice. I hope that you and the FWS will recognize that a choice was made years ago – to save the Florida Panther. A choice was made to allow a vital predator species to return to its original range in Florida and perhaps beyond. To take any action other than to maintain the current listing status of the Florida Panther – would put the species on the road to extinction.[1]

I ask that you maintain the current ESA listing status of the Florida Panther. Thank you for your consideration.

Sincerely,
Ruth Nichols

1. **Why Not the Best? How Science Failed the Florida Panther**, by Liza Gross, PLoS Biol 3(9): e333. August 23, 2005

From:	Hailee Borges
To:	David_Shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida panther extinction and endangerment poll
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 11:07:34 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

My name is Hailee Borges, i am a student in Hialeah gardens senior high school, in grade 11. My biology teacher bought the attention to me and my classmates that the Florida panther population is nearly 230! It was also brought to my attention that there will be an election to vote whether the panther be kept under extinction ranks, where they will be kept safe and alive under the protection of rare and near extinct species or to be ranked under endangered animals, where they an lose their protection and once again become extinct or close to it.

In my opinion the panther should be kept under extincted ranked species because if they are removed from their rank they will be exposed to different dangers and not be protected as well as they are under the rank they stand in now, my concern is if they are changed from there is if they will be killed or start disappearing or becoming extincted like i mentioned before. These are beautiful pumas as they also call them, their numbers should not go down but always go up in every way possible.

Thank you for taking the time to read this email , i give you my condolences. Hailee Borges

From:	Billyby54
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida panther Five-Year Review comments
Date:	Sunday, August 27, 2017 4:57:01 PM

Good morning, David! Bill Samuels here.

I don't know when you will actually get to read this, but I have also sent a FAX copy of it that you might get before the computer e-mail flood subsides some. We posted this as an Open letter on our Florida Panther Project FB Page and have received pretty positive feedback. I hope you are well and I wish you the very best as you begin to wade through all of these cards and letters and form letter-type petitions, crayon drawings, and all the rest of it.

You have a tough job ahead. I personally believe in prayer, and if you don't mind will be praying for you as this Review, and your recommendations, really does affect a lot of people down there in a personal way. It isn't just some touchy-feely issue for them. It is real life, real time.

If I can assist you or the Service in any way, shape, or form all you have to do is ask!

Respectfully, Bill Samuels

Open Letter to David Shindle, United States Fish & Wildlife Service
re: Florida Panther Five-Year Review

I believe the die was cast regarding the panther in Florida all the way back in the mid- and late 1960s when Walt Disney selected central Florida for his new Walt Disney World theme park. When he obtained the backing and influence of the fledgling Interstate Transportation Commission, and when I-95, I-75, and I-4 were conceived and came to fruition, the possibility for a free-ranging, totally self-sustaining population of panthers in south Florida for future generations to enjoy vanished forever.

Lacking the political and economic will to do otherwise, we have watched, and will continue to watch, as prime south Florida wildlife habitat gets bulldozed and sodded at the rate of more than 1,000 acres a week. We will watch as more than 350,000 new residents a year move into the State, and though it may not be altogether true, it certainly seems like every single one of them is coming to south Florida, from roughly I-4 southward. We will continue to watch as Permits for large projects like Ava Maria, and the Florida Gulf Coast University, and others, are rubber stamped and built, over all objections, right smack dab in the center of existing prime documented panther habitat, and smaller golf course-type communities continue to be approved and sell out before the paint is even dry in the new homes.

By itself, these events may mean economic growth and jobs to many people. What they mean for the panther is not so good. The National Park Service's Sonny Bass put it very succinctly and accurately in an interview many years ago, probably in the late 1980s, when he stated the problem may not be in actual panther numbers, the problem is them being completely cut off from any opportunities to breed and keep genetic diversity for the health of the animals in south Florida as a whole.

Therein we have the problem. The devil is in those details.

We can continue to protect the existing population of panthers in south Florida, and vaccinate every kitten, and install fencing until every single plot of ground down here is fenced in like a zoo. We can spend millions on more and more underpasses, and install so many "Slow Down- Wildlife Ahead" signs until you cannot even see the trees from the road. But we will still have the same problem as we have faced since I-4 was built, and central Florida began the relentless flow of blacktop and concrete from Tampa across to Daytona. Our panthers need more breeding diversity than south Florida can provide.

It has become my fear that the particular geography of Florida, as a peninsula with only so much land between the Gulf of Mexico to the Atlantic Ocean, and having most of it paved over already, makes the south Florida efforts ultimately an unwinnable battle. I am not optimistic that waiting for a "natural" dispersal of south Florida panthers northward, to potentially re-populate north Florida, (and even further northward into historic former range in other southeastern States) is going to work. We are simply losing too much habitat, too fast.

Even with the recent exciting news that several female panthers, and even kittens, have been confirmed north of the Caloosahatchee, they are still south of I-4. Nearly 30 years into this recovery, and we still do not have confirmed females north of the bottleneck that exists at I-4. If we can save some of the St. Johns River basin, as efforts by the Florida Wildlife Corridor folks are attempting to bring attention to, there still is a chance of some significant dispersal up the east coast of Florida, albeit a slim one. I do not believe it is enough.

In the meantime, we are seeing increasing signs that the south Florida panther numbers vs. suitable habitat tables may have in fact reached their breaking point. Despite this year's slight drop in roadkill mortality, it is irrefutable that they have climbed steadily since 2011 or 12. And a recent story published in a Naples newspaper chronicles the very rapid increase in farm and domestic depredations by panthers in south Florida. Numerous anecdotal reports from landowners and farmworkers throughout south Florida reveal their fears that the panthers' prey base has been severely compromised by several factors, and could worsen these depredations. These could be signs the population is at saturation, as has also been suggested in various Agency reports over the past several years.

Additionally, because of the recent publication of data from the International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN) regarding the taxonomy of North American pumas, and their apparent decision to list all pumas from the Arctic Circle down to Central America, from the Atlantic to the Pacific, and including the Florida population, as "Puma concolour cougar", all the same animal, it is my understanding that compelling arguments in favor of completely de-listing the Florida panther may now be at hand.

In consideration of all the above, I believe the time for bold action by the USFWS is now. I recommend that the Service pursue by all means a definite and documentable plan to re-locate a number of the panthers from south Florida into approved areas of north Florida, by whatever means are <u>currently available</u> under the Endangered Species Act, and to do it soon. I do fully understand the reasons why re-locations are not normally favored by wildlife agencies.

In addition, more funding needs to be diverted to landowner compensation in cases of panther depredation on private property lands determined to be in primary or secondary panther habitat zones in south Florida.

Third, new non-lethal measures for property owners in primary or secondary habitat in south Florida to better protect and deter predators from their property be sought by the Service from landowners, and be evaluated for safety by both the Service and the Florida FWCC, and approved for use at landowners request on a case-by-case basis.

Respectfully submitted,

Bill Samuels
President, The Florida Panther Project
Sarasota, Florida

From:	Claudia Schuabb
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida panther input
Date:	Tuesday, August 1, 2017 10:36:08 PM

Hello David ,
I would like to express my concerns about changing the current status of the panther. I really think they are still a threatened species and should be kept that way to make sure they get enough protection and funds to support the remaining populations throughout Florida ' ecosystems. As we all know the habitat destruction is escalating due to zoning changes and careless acts of our government.
Claudia leonard

From:	Kendra Zaynab Macey
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther IS Endangered
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 8:03:47 PM

Good evening, Mr. Shindle,

I hope that you are hearing from many people on the subject of our endangered Florida panther, and I hope that the majority of them are not interested in delisting the panther as an endangered species. It is plain enough to see that if an animal exists in a quantity of only 230 estimated alive on the planet, THAT animal is definitely *endangered*. We do not need to bow to those who only see profits to be made, even over the destruction of limited living beings and resources. History has revealed the flaws in this way of thinking. Some profit while MANY suffer.

Let us do better than the past and make not only *the right choice*, but also the intelligent one, which is, to preserve Florida panthers and keep them on the Endangered species list. I hope you see the logic in this and help make this happen.

You are appreciated. Thank you for your work.

Kendra L. Macey
M: (305) [redacted]

"There's no scarcity of opportunity to make a living at what you love; there's only scarcity of resolve to make it happen."--Dr. Wayne Dyer

---

Virus-free. www.avast.com

From:	Gary Szpatura
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther is gravely endangered
Date:	Thursday, August 24, 2017 11:47:32 AM

I am writing to request that the Florida Panther's status be maintained at endangered. With only a little more than 200 left and ever shrinking habitat, they are clearly very and gravely endangered. I suggest:

- collaborative efforts to best address the overall needs of the panther, developers, and ranchers.
- continued efforts to preserve the lands north of the Caloosahatchee and promote corridors for panthers to expand to that territory.

I am strongly against changing the Florida Panther's status to threatened, let's find ways to help the Panther that are reasonably compatible with the needs of developers and ranchers.

Thank you,

Gary Szpatura
Venice FL

From: dpfeffer1952
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida panther keep endangered status !
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 3:16:32 PM

Sent from my T-Mobile 4G LTE Device

From: Jan Vertefeuille
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida panther listing
Date: Tuesday, August 15, 2017 3:25:59 PM

Dear Agent Shindle,

I am writing to urge the USFWS to maintain the Florida panther's endangered species designation and continue to implement the current recovery plan.

While a recent genetic study has raised questions about the Florida panther's taxonomy, there is no scientific consensus that the Florida population is wrongly classified as a distinct subspecies. Thus, its protections should remain unchanged.

In addition, human population expansion and traffic fatalities continue to put intense pressure on the small population of panthers in the state. The USFWS recovery plan remains critical to the panther's chances for longterm survival.

Sincerely,
Jan Vertefeuille
321 Pedro St
Venice FL 34285
[redacted]

From: ndeforge13
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida panther listing
Date: Monday, August 21, 2017 1:23:13 PM

Greetings:
Please add my name to your list for petitioning the Federal Government on keeping the Florida Panther on the Endangered Species list for a long time until we help their numbers increase !

Why is it taking so long to put upwildlife crossing signs on southwest Fl roads? Keep writing articles in any and all newspapers on this issue. Thank you for your work.

Sincerely
Nancy DeForge

Sent from Samsung tablet.

From:	David Hynes
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida panther maintain endangered species status
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 10:05:39 AM

Please keep Florida panthers on endangered species list . Please assist with maintaining vital habitat. This is a key species to Florida ecosystem . Please!
Carla Hynes
Sent from my iPhone

From:	Mary Ann Starus
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther Needs Continued Protection
Date:	Saturday, August 12, 2017 12:20:41 AM

Please do not de-list the Florida Panther. It needs continued protection to survive and thrive.

Mary Ann Starus
Duluth, MN

From: C R Hestdalen
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther Needs Your Help
Date: Sunday, August 20, 2017 1:15:55 PM

Subject: Florida Panther Needs Your Help

Please do everything to keep the Florida Panther on the Endangered Species List. Their natural territory is threatened every year with more and more Florida housing growth, and the subsequent traffic growth.

Keep our Florida Panthers protected.

Thank you.

Connie R Hestdalen CPA
11570 SE 53 CT
BELLEVIEW FL 34420-3965

Sent from my Verizon Wireless 4G LTE Smartphone

From:	Sherry Williams
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther Please let it remain on the endangered species list.
Date:	Sunday, August 13, 2017 10:16:18 PM

Humans are killing wildlife outright, and taking their habitat. We will soon be left alone on the planet with its vile weather, rising seas, heat, etc.

We must to all things possible to save the panthers. Don't take away their protections.

Thank you.

Sherry Williams
Charlotte NC 28211

From:	Pires, Ricky
To:	Dave Shindle
Cc:	Kevin & Ann"s Gmail; Roca, Dr. Maria
Subject:	Florida panther posse statement
Date:	Wednesday, August 23, 2017 10:21:30 PM

<!--[if lte mso 15 || CheckWebRef]-->

Pires, Ricky has shared a OneDrive for Business file with you. To view it, click the link below.

FGCU Wings of Hope Program-Florida Panther Posse Program-Awareness message.docx

<!--[endif]-->

Dave, Are you sending this statement, or do I send it to NRDC and how?
Hope this is what is needed to help the Florida panther and its habitat.
Thank you, Ricky
Please let me know you received this email. (text me?) [redacted]

Ricky Pires
Director
FGCU "Wings of Hope"
Email: rpires@fgcu.edu

"Florida has a very broad public records law. As a result, any written communication created or received by Florida Gulf Coast University employees is subject to disclosure to the public and the media, upon request, unless otherwise exempt. Under Florida law, e-mail addresses are public records. If you do not want your email address released in response to a public records request, do not send electronic mail to this entity. Instead, contact this office by phone or in writing."

From: dureskyclan1@cox.net dureskyclan1@cox.net
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Cc: Steve D.
Subject: Florida Panther protected status
Date: Thursday, August 24, 2017 3:30:09 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

After reading an editorial from the Ocala Star Banner, I was shocked to discover that our beautiful and rare Florida panther is under consideration to removed from the "Protected" species list! I'm sure you know that this is an iconic species that was on the brink of disappearing from our state, and it has only been through an aggression protection campaign for many years that it has rebounded slightly. This recovery still has a long way to go. It is unthinkable that the panther is even being considered for removal or reclassification. Please do whatever is necessary to ensure that this majestic and unique mammal - our state animal - has the protection it needs for years to come.

Thank you for your time.

Steve Duresky, Niceville, FL [redacted]

From: Juan Acosta
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther Protection
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 10:05:26 PM

I strongly believe that Florida Panthers should stay in the endangered species because they are one key part of our ecosystem and they contribute a lot the balance on the food chain. They should also stay because we have done so much work to preserve them that it's just not enough panthers in Florida for it to be all thrown away and moved to the threatened level in which in my opinion is not enough for the amount of panthers that we have today in date.

Sent from my iPhone

From: Jaquel Kryskiewicz
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther Protection
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 10:39:06 AM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

I implore that every effort is made to ensure that the Florida Panther remains on the endangered species list, thus maintaining it's status with protections.

The estimated 230 Panthers that are in the wild is still a low number for any species to exist and not be considered endangered.

Florida residents cannot allow for any possibility of hunters to chomp at the bit for the opportunity to kill such a majestic animal.

Florida cannot afford to lose one of it's examples of beauty this state possesses. We are more than palm trees and sunny beaches. We are the Everglades and every creature not seen that are struggling to flourish in a diminishing habitat.

I can be contacted by this email deccatronix@gmail.com or by cell [redacted] for further comment.

Sincerely,

Jaquel Kryskiewicz

From:	Dean Mades
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther Protection
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 7:28:18 AM

I urge the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service to maintain the current “Endangered” status of the Florida panther.

A lifetime hydrologist, civil engineer, and former employee of the USGS, I have witnessed the steady loss of habitat throughout Florida. The big cats still need protection, in my humble opinion.

Dean Mades, P.E.
(941) [redacted]

Virus-free. www.avast.com

From:	Margaret Parsons
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida panther protection
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 5:08:56 PM

Mr. Shindle,

I have a BS in biology and believe that all things on earth are interconnected. To risk extinction of one if to diminish the whole.

I urge the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service to make sure that Florida's state animal, the panther, remains protected under the Endangered Species Act. We only have about 250 of them left! I am unwilling to risk their possible exstinction which could become a reality by changing their protection under the Endangered Species Act.

Thank you for consideration in this matter.

Margaret Parsons

From:	Brenda Green
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida panther protection
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 3:06:01 PM

As a Floridian, I request that our Florida panthers remain on the endangered protection list. On their behalf I ask that you give consideration to our state's animal since it is unable to speak for itself.
Best, Brenda K. Green, Sarasota

Sent from my iPhone

From:	Stephanie Tatge
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther Protection
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 1:14:05 PM

Dear David,

The Florida panther is our state animal. There are fewer than 250 left - I urge you to take action to protect them and all our indigenous fish and wildlife.

Stephanie Tatge
Sarasota

From:	Laney Poire
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther Protection
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 1:03:10 PM

I strongly support keeping protections for the Florida Panther. The top members of our food chain are vital to the health of our ecosystem, which is not divided by state or region but is a single whole. If we remove protections we effect everyone on the north American continent and beyond. Thank you.

Sincerely,

Laney

Laney Poire
Manager
Beetle's Garden
beetle'sgarden.com

"Wishing Wellness to you and your companions."

From: Marg Chauvin
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther Protection
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 12:46:05 PM

Mr. Shindle,

As Florida continues to experience unrestrained growth, building, and loss of native habitat it is the responsibility of humans to protect our wildlife. Of special concern is the Florida Panther which requires a large range of free space for continuing the species. Yes, the state does have protected forests and lands; however, the lands are not always contiguous. Further development in Collier County and south Florida will be a death sentence for this rare and beautiful cat. Panthers need unobstructed and safe passage land which was available for centuries and is now threatened by development.

I ask,
Why develop wet lands when Florida faces both a sea level rise and a depletion of our precious aquifer?
Do we really need more building in sensitive areas?
Haven't those who allow development read the conclusion of "A Land Remembered" by Patrick D. Smith?
...They must not be true Floridians.

The Florida Panther is the last remaining eastern cougar species and I personally don't want it to become extinct as the passenger pigeon did. Unless, we keep it on the endangered species list and quit developing land they will be the next Canary In The Mine.

I am concerned for our future. Being a Florida native with roots back to 1766, graduate of University of Florida, retired Florida teacher, and current volunteer for the Florida Park Service - I am vested in Florida. Don't ruin what remains of our precious state.

Thank you for considering my comments.
Sincerely
Marg Chauvin
Citra, FL
[redacted]
margchauvin@live.com

Volunteering for worthy causes

From:	Paula Sheldon
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther Protection
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 12:21:39 PM

Dear David Shindle, please continue safeguarding Florida's panthers by keeping them on the endangered list. There are very few left.
Also, I strongly urge you to protect Florida's black bears. I absolutely abhor the previous licencing to kill our bears and hope that never happens again.
Thank you, Paula Sheldon

From: Joel Hernandez
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther Protection
Date: Sunday, August 27, 2017 8:18:54 PM

Hello Mr. Shindle, I am a student from Hialeah Gardens Senior High School writing to you today about why Florida Panthers should stay at their rank as an endangered species and why they should keep their rights to be protected by our state government. These animals have become extremely rare in Florida even though it's literally in their species name and the reasoning for this is because of how their homes are being demolished for neighborhoods and walmarts all across the state, however with the laws protecting them currently being up, the species is flourishing much better than how they were many years ago. Now the government is thinking about lowering their rank as an endangered species just because there's over 100 panthers in the wild currently. That isn't right considering how they must compete with alligators and the invasive pythons of the everglades currently. I believe that these animals require the protection laws they have currently and maybe even double then what they have. If you had the patience to read this, thank you for your time.

From:	Teresa Ligorelli
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther Protection
Date:	Sunday, August 27, 2017 10:11:27 AM

Mr Shindle,

Please keep the Florida panther's protective status as *endangered* and do not change the recovery criteria for the state's most beloved animal.

The Florida panther needs to be protected.

Thank you

From: Michael Cortese
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther Protection
Date: Friday, August 25, 2017 3:27:32 PM

David,

I am writing to you as a concerned Floridian about the proposed status change for the Florida panther. I feel that its population is still too small to remove it from the endangered list. This is an elegant animal that needs all of the protection that we can offer. Please do whatever you can to make my voice, and others like me, heard!

As a small offer of my support, I have been a Florida panther license plate owner - to help bring awareness to the public.

Thank you,

Michael A. Cortese
730 Bayside Drive
Tarpon Springs, FL. 34689-7020

From:	Janet Michea
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther Protection
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 2:46:27 PM

Dear David Shindle,

Please maintain the Florida panther's "endangered" status, and redouble efforts to protect remaining habitat.

Sincerely,

Janet Michea

Janet Michea
[redacted]
jmichea@comcast.net
JanetMicheaDesign.com

"Life is short. Spend it with people who make you laugh and make you feel loved."

From: Terry Kinane
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther Protections Should Not Be Changed
Date: Friday, August 25, 2017 6:21:49 PM

PLEASE do what needs to be done to maintain the Florida Panther status as endangered.

The Florida Panther's predator remains humans, and the ratio between the two is increasingly at odds for the Panther's continued survival.

There are less than 180 of these majestic cats in existence in the world, most living around Okaloacoochee Slough, including the Florida Panther National Wildlife Refuge, near Naples, Florida, on land a mere 5% of their original roaming area.

They birthed 61kittens over two years; their predators, the Florida human population, increased by 733,228 during that same two years.

The Florida Panther remains endangered. 180 Florida Panthers versus more than 20.6 million Floridians. [I can't even find the ratio]

61 births over two years; 88 killed by cars over two years. [Can that be a decreasing population growth rate?]

PLEASE, please, help Florida's State animal, the Florida Panther, avoid extinction.

Gratefully yours,

Terry Kinane
Florida resident for over 57 years.

From:	vee bee
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida panther protections
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 5:26:54 PM

Hello. I strongly support the Endangered Species Act. Without it, our wildlife would be marginalized and murdered to extinction by greedy, selfish humans. Florida panthers were here long before humans roamed the earth. They have more of a right to be here than we do. They are intelligent, sentient beings deserving of our respect, consideration, and protection. Please protect these beautiful creatures before it's too late. Please prove thar us humans have evolved into kinder, more compassionate beings aware of the other living beings who also call Mother Earth home.

Thank you.

Sincerely,
Veronica B.
Austin, TX

From: William Brandon
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther Protector
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 6:00:32 PM

Dear Sir:
I would strongly encourage you to do your
utmost in setting aside additional land in
SW Florida to protect this beautiful and threatened animal. By protecting its habitat
you are protecting hundreds of other animal species. We all must be committed
Environmentalists or we shall surely lose
our precious Florida to the combination of urban sprawl and Climate change.
Thank you so much.
Sincerely,
Dr William H Brandon, MD, FACP

Sent from my iPhone

From: Robin Schapiro
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida panther protextion
Date: Saturday, August 12, 2017 1:23:57 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

What would Florida be without its wildlife and waters to set it apart? Simply Disney World? Florida is a destination for so many because of the differences to be found here. It seems, though, that when some are settled to stay that they become supremely micro in their concerns, sometimes all they way down to their own front lawns at all costs.

The Florida panther is endangered and should absolutely remain so classified. They are a treasure, not a nuisance. In fact, not only should they remain on the endangered list, lands should be set aside as ranges for them as well as the other creatures that we share this land with. Plenty of land such as they require.

Most sincerely,

Robin

Robin Schapiro
[redacted]
2302 Hyde Parkway
Melbourne FL 32901

From:	Greg Wheeler
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther public comment
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 11:05:12 PM

Hello David,

I apologize if I've reached you in error; I'm hoping to submit a public comment on the Florida Panther's endangered-species status and management and found your email address in an article published by the Miami Herald. I looked up the FWS page on the Florida Panther, but it didn't mention the review period or list any means of submitting a public comment.

I imagine you're getting a lot of input right now (the NRDC put out a mailing that was, to be frank, rather alarmist), so I'll keep my own comment on-topic: "The Florida Panther faces numerous challenges to the size of its population, from a thin gene pool to an increasing number of deaths due to vehicle strikes. While there have been indications that the species' population is growing, this growth would not necessarily be sustainable were the species to be left to its own devices. As such, it would be premature to withdraw protections currently being received by the species or to reduce the population targets previously identified for delisting the species."

Thank you for your service, and, again, sorry if I reached you in error.
All the best,
Greg

From: AYMEE LAURAIN
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther Recovery Plan review
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 11:50:12 AM

I would like to express my position on the review for the Florida Panther Recovery Plan. At this point it would irresponsible to consider de-listing or even down listing. From an ecosystem perspective there are issues that may put pressure on the populations. While they are allegedly growing in population, this progress can easily be disrupted by mass development which has already begun to take place in panther habitat and which has been a subject of a mass political battle throughout the state. Vehicle accidents continue to be a problem as does flooding. While some claim the road mortalities are a result of increasing populations, development and urban sprawl should not be ruled out. Furthermore, behaviors from outside factors causing displacement should be considered. Hunting was identified as a deterring factor in Big Cypress. (Janis and Clark, 2002) This could be forcing panthers to seek prey elsewhere or to prey on cattle which creates a negative perception of Florida Panthers among ranchers who seek for depredation permits.

Genetic diversity continues to be a concern. With five haphlogroups having been identified only one holds root to Florida. (Ochoa et al 2017) This could mean there are evolutionary adaptions that could hinder long term survival. For example the nasal passage which adapted to survive in the humid Florida climate may not be as dominant among the gene pool from Texas. (Goldman, 1946)

Equally, their role as an apex predator is vital. The repeated demand for increased hunting of prey such as deer and feral pigs demonstrates that man is not a sufficient means of population control and a more efficient animal is needed for this task. Until prey levels are sufficiently managed to where human interference is entirely removed the protection of the Florida Panther should not be dismissed.

Finally, the Florida Panther has been an iconic species which has been a highlight of Florida tourism. Native Floridians hold a bequest value to this native species and the role they play in the ecosystem. Those who coexist in panther habitat appreciate the beauty and cherish the opportunity to occasionally see one of these magnificent creatures. They develop a personal bond to their local panthers who they have spent years harboring a connection with, watching them grow, observing their behaviors, and watching the passing of offspring. Fracturing the protection for our Florida Panthers will fracture any trust between the people and the government body.

Aymee Laurain
Director
Imagine Our Florida, Inc.

From: Sid Harring
To: David_Shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther Recovery
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 11:27:27 AM

I strongly urge that the FWS do much more to protect the Florida panther and the unique Florida ecosystem that the panther depends on. The continued spread of urban sprawl not only endangers the panthers, but destroyed the entire ecosystem of the state. The FWS needs to become more proactive, and exercise a much stronger regulatory function against the many threats to the ecosystem. Existing governmental efforts, particularly at the local level, are promoting a very short sighted emphasis on development that is already beyond control. Protecting panther habitat also protects the natural heritage of Florida.

Sid Harring

From:	Rebecca Dalton
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther Recovery
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 3:25:32 PM

Please do not reverse the progress we have made in establishing a sustainable population of the Florida panther.
As you know, diversityof species is crucial to a healthy environment and ecosystem.
Please plan for the health and recovery, not the destruction of our natural world.
It is Florida's greatest asset.
Panthers need our protection.

Thank you.
Sincerely,
Rebecca Dalton

From: Marc and Patricia Davies
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther Retention on Endangered Species List
Date: Wednesday, August 16, 2017 12:35:13 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle:

Florida is blessed with a vastly different ecosystem setting it apart from anywhere else in the country, and even the world. The flora and fauna are a part of what makes living here so spectacular and drives tourism. Many of us choose this as our home because of its diversity and unique lifestyle experiences.

This letter is in support of retaining our state animal, the Florida Panther, on the endangered species list. The panthers are part of what distinctively identifies Florida.

There is room enough here for our heritage and the future. I think of the late 1800s and early 1900s when our waters were overfished to promote vastly growing tourism and our various bird populations devastated in the name of fashion. How preposterous this seems now. We shouldn't make the same mistake with the Florida Panther and be judged on the wrong side of history. How ironic it would be to remove the Florida Panther from the endangered species list on the 50 year anniversary of the list's inception.

It would be short-sighted to remove the panther from the endangered list based on the fact that cross-breeding has taken place to rebuild the population. What are Americans if not people bearing a multitude of DNA from every country and continent? It defines the very essence of being American—not weakens us.

While there may be a delicate balance between the cats' existence and cattle loss, compromise and compensation can be reached. Conservations groups, corporations and even some ranchers are bound together to preserve the Florida Panther.

Thank you for the opportunity to voice this opinion in support of the Florida Panther remaining on the endangered species list.

Sincerely,

Patricia Davies

18246 Nestlebranch Court

Hudson, FL 34667

From: hicyndiw@aol.com
To: David_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther Review
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 4:14:47 PM

Mr. Shindle,

I have not had the pleasure of meeting you, and no disrespect meant, but I hope I don't. At least, not in the field. My husband and I run about 60 head of cattle in SW Florida, mostly South Lee County. We previously leased a property from the SFWMD that bordered on a Panther Mitigation area managed by the Audubon Society on one side, and the Corkscrew Swamp Sanctuary on the other. We currently have leases on the other side of Corkscrew Rd now, some Lee County 20/20 property and a private lease as well. We also have a lease off of SR 82.

I am happy to say, we have not, at our current leases, suffered any panther depredations that we are aware of. We have in the past had many missing calves that we suspect were taken by a panther, although we never found the carcass. As cattle producers in this area, we are not anti-panther, and neither are any of the other cattlemen and women we know. We ARE opposed to feeding them an unlimited supply of calves, but for us personally, that has not been an issue. I know that it has been for some others. With an eye to the future, and knowing that panther numbers will most likely continue to increase (even though I am of the opinion SW Florida is bursting at the seams with them now), I would like to share some things I think need to happen to reduce panther/livestock/human conflict.

1. Be much more pro-active about relocating panthers that have become acclimated to human presence and have learned to rely on livestock for food as is happening in Golden Gate. Allowing this to continue is a danger to the children in the area, as well as a detriment to good relations between FWC, USFW, and residents in the area. If relocation is not an option, other options need to be made available to deal with these panthers, even if that means captivity or euthanasia.

2. Make it easier for cattle producers who are running cattle in large pastures to claim panther depredation and receive compensation. I believe this is already being done, and I applaud you all for that.

3. Allow people to use deadly force against a panther that is in the act of attacking their animals and also in their yard. No one should be expected to allow a panther into their back yard to kill their animals and not be permitted to protect them. Along with that, allow people to haze any panthers seen in their yard or neighborhood (but not in the act of attacking their animals) with non-lethal means, to frighten them away and hopefully prevent future problems.

4. Stop using SW Florida as a breeding ground and hoping that the overpopulation creates enough pressure on these animals to force them to expand their boundaries naturally. Overcome whatever obstacles there are to simply relocating panthers to wherever it is you want them to take a foothold. This method is creating a huge amount of ill will towards the panther, which is only going to make it harder to get other populations in Florida to accept them later. I personally believe this method is also forcing the panthers to learn to rely on livestock for food, a habit that will eventually lead to more conflict and distaste for these animals by ranchers and hobby farmers.

These animals should be "shy, rare, and elusive". We should all be thrilled to catch just a glimpse of one, it should not be a common occurrence for people to be shooting pictures, video, or having run ins almost daily with them. It's a recipe for disaster. If that means removing them from the endangered list, so that the above steps can be taken to ensure not only the panther's survival in our state, but to preserve the people's admiration of them, then that is what needs to be done.

Thank you for your time and efforts,

Cyndi Widener

[redacted]

From:	Andrea Naccarato
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida panther review comments
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 6:58:16 PM
Attachments:	Florida panther 5-year status review comments - Andrea Naccarato.docx

---

Dear David,

Please consider my comments regarding the Florida panther's 5-year status review (attached and pasted below). Thank you!

I am writing to encourage the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service to maintain the current protections given to the Florida panther (*Puma concolor coryi*). The Florida panther should retain its endangered listing because of the massive increase in human population in Southwest Florida, the panther's current isolation from the rest of its species, and its subsequent inability to act as top predator in terrestrial ecosystems within its historic range. These three reasons alone should be adequate to demonstrate the Florida panther's endangered status. However, recent genetic research also indicates that Florida panthers possess at least one unique DNA sequence that distinguishes them from other puma populations. The puma species and Florida's ecosystems would lose diversity and functionality, respectively, if the Florida panther were allowed to go extinct.

Collier County and Lee County are two of the fastest growing counties in the United States. As a long-time resident of Naples, I have personally witnessed the destruction of valuable ecosystems in Collier County and this destruction has only intensified over the past 15 years. The projected "build-out" for Collier County includes 1.4 million people by 2050 and pushes the urban boundary to State Road 29. With new towns intended for eastern Collier County, less and less space will remain available for Florida panthers. If the Florida panther were to lose its designation as endangered, I fear there would be little to no means to oppose large-scale destruction of the remaining Florida panther habitat.

Roadkills have been the nemesis of Florida panthers for decades now. Sadly, a record high number of 34 panthers were killed by cars in 2016. With well over 1 million people commuting within and between Collier and Lee Counties, the threat of increasing roadkills is not going away. In order to reverse this unfortunate trend, endangered species regulations calling for protective fencing and alternate wildlife routes near roadways must exist. Besides the decline in Florida panthers by roadkills, the roads themselves fragment the landscape and inhibit natural movement of Florida panthers.

Although predator bounties that originally caused the Florida panther's isolation in southern Florida are no longer a threat, the panthers remain isolated all the same. Today,

human-caused habitat fragmentation is the roadblock that keeps these “southeastern pumas” disjunct from the rest of their species. The panther’s current absence from such a large expanse of its historic range (i.e. the rest of Florida and southeastern United States) should be strongly considered as criteria for an endangered listing. Although the Florida panther population has increased since their genetic rescue in 1995, more time under Endangered Species Act protection is required to achieve the 3 subpopulations of 240 individuals each (as required by the Florida panther recovery plan). Regulations and funding for preservation or restoration of connected habitat corridors to reach this recovery goal would be much more likely if the Florida panther retains its endangered designation.

As top predators, the absence of Florida panthers from their historic range may have a disturbing impact on the functionality of southeastern ecosystems. When predators are removed, their prey populations may unsustainably increase then crash when limited resources are consumed. The loss of predators often sets off a domino effect throughout an entire ecosystem. The chain of events could result in a dysfunctional ecosystem that is no longer able to provide its services to the biotic community (including humans). Conservation measures should remain in place until Florida panthers have reclaimed their role throughout the southeastern U.S.

Although I do not personally believe the Florida panther must be “genetically unique” to remain listed as an endangered (sub)species or distinct population segment, a recent research study (Ochoa et al. 2017) did document a Florida-specific DNA sequence (i.e. haplotype) within the Florida panther population. Although more research is needed, Ochoa et al.’s result suggests that Florida panthers are indeed unique on a genetic level. Even if this example of a genetic “signature” had not been found, the Florida panther’s gene pool would still represent the best remaining genetic combinations for their adaptations in southeastern ecosystems.

Since the Florida panther population hit its lowest point when only 20-30 individuals were known, dozens of biologists and other conservation professionals have worked passionately to stop the loss of pumas from Florida. A major turning point was reached just this year when Florida panther breeding was documented north of the Caloosahatchee River. While this is an important step in the recovery of the Florida panther, they are not “out of the woods” yet. Taking the long view, Florida panthers will not truly be recovered until they reunite with their long-lost cousins across the Mississippi River. They (and we) still have a long way to go.

Thank you for considering my comments.

Sincerely,

Andrea Naccarato, M.S. (Environmental Science)

- Current environmental educator
- Graduate research in population genetics
- Internship experience in wild cat conservation (i.e. South Texas ocelots)

From:	Julee Felinski
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther Review
Date:	Monday, August 14, 2017 11:56:52 PM

David,

Based on Matt Schwartz's comments, I understand the Five-Year Review for the Florida Panther is soon approaching. Our Everglades and other parts of Florida are some of the only remaining habitat for this endangered animal and it's important that we continue to protect it. PLEASE do all you can to keep the Florida Panther on the Endangered list so that it remains protected from hunters and further loss of habitat from development.

Thank you,
Julee Felinski

From:	ethan perk
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther Review
Date:	Monday, August 7, 2017 9:33:17 PM

Dear David,
i don't agree to change and lessen the Florida Panther's status.Let's keep protecting this animal.

Regardless if the Panther is a Panther or a Cougar, we should protect this animal as much as is humanly possible.
Humans have repeatedly encroached and reduced the acres of wilderness and forests in Florida. This has directly affected the numbers of these beautiful creatures.

Best Regards,

Ethan E. Perk

From:	Christian Stump
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther Review
Date:	Thursday, August 3, 2017 5:42:22 PM

Hi David!

Hope all is well!

I'm writing on behalf of the Florida panther. It's my sincere hope that these animals retain their endangered status. Recently, there's been a lot of debate focusing on whether or not panthers truly are a unique puma subspecies. Taxonomy aside, these animals *are* unique and they *are* special. They're an isolated population of fighters and survivors - and they still need our help.

Federal protections for Florida panthers are needed now more than ever. There is simply no pressing need to remove them.

Thank you for your time.

Christian Stump

From: Emily Lowery
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther Review
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 5:06:51 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

An aspiring wildlife biologist myself, I just finished reading the article featured on the Tampa Bay News website: “Geneticist Says Florida Panther Still Deserves Endangered Species Protection”. In addition to having a passion for conservation, I am also a life-long Floridian and to see my state’s iconic top predator at risk for protection removal in my own backyard so to say, is extremely disheartening. I know I speak for many when I say that protection removal is not in question if preservation of the species is to continue. From a technical perspective, I understand the need for accurate reclassification from a distinct subspecies to the general subspecies, but I believe that the legal situation surrounding the big cat of de-listing, renaming, and petitioning again for protection when only 200 of these animals are currently estimated to be left is too risky. I believe this is a special case, where updated taxonomy should take a backseat (at least for the meantime) to ensure the survival of this important ecosystem predator. Thank you for considering my input and accepting public review of this important issue.

Sincerely, Emily Lowery
(Florida native Biology Major student)

Sent from Mail for Windows 10

From:	Rusty Countryman
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Cc:	Nita Countryman
Subject:	Florida Panther Status and Protections
Date:	Thursday, August 24, 2017 1:26:26 AM

Mr. Shindle -- Having just read an article in the /Sun Sentinel/ of Miami, I find it very troubling that U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service is seriously considering changing the conservation status of the Florida Panther to financially benefit a few developers and ranchers in Florida.

Updated population estimates for Florida Panthers is 120 to 230 adult and subadult panthers, according to a February 2017 report. This many panthers would require 8,000–12,000 square miles of habitat and sufficient genetic diversity in order to avoid inbreeding due to a small population size. However, a study in 2006 estimated that there was about 3,800 square miles free for the panthers. Allowing developers and ranchers to further reduce available territory would negatively impact the survival of the Florida Panther.

Any changes to the conservation status of the Florida Panther would negatively impact the numbers of the Florida Panther and ultimately their survivability. Changes to their conservation status must be upgraded, rather than reduced.<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Florida_panther#cite_note-36>

--
Rusty Countryman
rusty.countryman@gmail.com

From:	Jason Rylander
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Cc:	Elizabeth Fleming; Ben Prater; Jacob Malcom
Subject:	Florida Panther Status Review Comments
Date:	Tuesday, August 22, 2017 5:16:49 PM
Attachments:	DOW Comments Panther 5-Year Review FINAL SIGNED.pdf

---

Dear Mr. Shindle:

On behalf of Defenders of Wildlife, please find attached our comments on the Florida Panther 5-year status review. Please do not hesitate to contact us if you should have any questions.

Sincerely,
Jason Rylander

Jason Rylander
Senior Staff Attorney
Defenders of Wildlife
1130 17th Street N.W. Washington D.C. 20036-4604
Tel: (202) [redacted] | **Fax:** (202) [redacted]
Mobile: (202) [redacted]
jrylander@defenders.org | www.defenders.org

"Extinction is quite literally a fate worse than death." Sen. William Spong

From: Zach Andreucci
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther Status Review
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 9:49:48 AM

Hello Mr. Schindle,

I am writing you today to voice my concern that more needs to be done to protect the Florida Panther. The endangered species status that the species currently enjoys must be maintained if they are to continue to survive. And not only should the status be maintained, but efforts must be increased to protect their shrinking habitat. This animal is an important member of Florida's ecology. It has lived in these locations for its entire existence and has only within the last hundred years began fade from existence. This species has as much of a right to survive in Florida as the human population. Please, please push to protect this species and its habitat so future generations are able to learn about a living species instead of an extinct one.

Thank you very much!

Regards,

Zach Andreucci

From: blake faulkner
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida panther status review...
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 10:08:06 PM
Attachments: Florida panther status review under the ESA .eml

---

Sent from Mail for Windows 10

From: Harvey Bernstein
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther Status Review
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 3:26:07 PM

Please maintain the current full protection status for the Florida Panther. I believe that the species, and especially its habitat are under environmental assault in Florida. The species needs all the help that we can give.

Thank you,
Harvey Bernstein
8250 S.W. 72 Ct. #819
Miami, 33143

From:	Theresa Evans
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther status
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 7:19:51 AM

Dear Mr. David Shindle,

Please speak up on behalf of our wildlife in the state of Florida, especially the panther.

You are our voice and the voice for the iconic Florida panther for it's survival on behalf of the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service to make sure that Florida's state animal, the panther, remains protected under the Endangered Species Act. Fewer than 250 panthers remain in our state and they deserve to be protected from extinction!

I am saddened that the survival and well being of the wildlife in our country is being tossed to the side like their lives and participation to the environment have no impact. There are many scientific studies that say otherwise.

I greatly appreciate your expertise to assist in the protected status of what few we have left.
I am counting on you to make the right decision.

Thank you,
Theresa Evans
Sarasota, Fl.

From:	Grant Campbell
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Cc:	Matthew Schwartz; Doug Young; Roy David Walker
Subject:	Florida Panther status
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 4:38:39 PM

David Shindle
8/26/2017
Florida Panther Coordinator
U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service

Dear Sir:

I am writing to ask that the Florida Panther's "endangered status be maintained.

With the rapidly decrease of available habitat and the high mortality rate due to vehicular collisions, illegal killing and interspecies fighting, the population is far below any standard that would qualify delisting and reproduction is not out-pacing mortality.

For decades, building permits, oil production and exploration, and expanded cattle ranching have decreased the panther habitat to a mere fraction of that required to support a viable panther population.

Florida Panthers need a dedicated habitat, and because Florida panthers are an umbrella species, other wildlife, such as black bears, Eastern Indigo snakes, wood storks and other endangered species would benefit from such a designation.

The past five-year status review for the Florida panther, as a requirement of the Endangered Species Act recommended "no change" in the panther's endangered status – meaning it must continue to receive full protection under the Endangered Species Act.

Since there has been no significant growth to the panther population and since there has been a significant reduction in habitat, it is the recommendation of the South Florida Audubon Society that there be no change in the endangered status of the Florida panther.

Thank you for all you do to conserve our valuable resources,

Grant Campbell
Director of Wildlife Policy
South Florida Audubon Society
wildlife@southfloridaaudubon.org
[redacted]

From:	Joan Davis
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther status
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 3:36:27 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle:

I have been a Floridian for over 50 years. As a Floridian, I have come to love much of what makes our state unique and special. The health of Florida's environment and its wildlife are extremely important to me and to millions of other Floridians. This has been proven repeatedly by the documented evidence of voters intent to safeguard the environment and protect our wildlife.

The Florida Panther is under siege due to rapid loss and degradation of habitat and all the ramifications that brings. The panther's territory has been squeezed and shrunk to an alarming degree. Poorly regulated development is problematic as are other contributing factors. The yearly increase in fatalities, particularly road fatalities due to increased traffic is heartbreaking. As our state's beloved and official animal, we must do all we can to better protect them.

Keeping the Florida Panther status as an officially designated Endangered Species is very important and the right thing to do. I know the majority of Floridians agree. Please do all you can to maintain this ESA for our panthers.

Sincerely,

Joan Davis
426 Beauregard Ave NE
Palm Bay, FL 32907
[redacted]

Virus-free. www.avg.com

From:	Megan Valdes
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther status
Date:	Saturday, August 26, 2017 9:46:48 PM

Hello! I read about the potential status change of the Florida Panther and just wanted to weigh in. I believe the best idea would be to keep the panthers endangered until they make a stronger comeback.
Thank you very much for reading, and for your work!
~Megan, concerned student

Virus-free. www.avast.com

From:	Henderson, Sam
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther status
Date:	Friday, August 25, 2017 1:48:29 PM

Please keep the Florida Panther on the endangered species list. This unique animal is the very definition of endangered, and the loss of these protections will drive it toward accelerated extinction.

Thank you.

Sam Henderson
Mayor, City of Gulfport FL
[redacted]

From:	Susan Pulling
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther status
Date:	Wednesday, August 23, 2017 8:44:44 PM

Dear Sir: My husband and I are long time Florida residents. We request that the Florida Panther not be removed from the endangered species list. The population of 230 is very small, and will shrink quickly if protections are removed. Respectfully, Susan Pulling and Parker Robinson

Sent from my iPhone

From:	David Richman
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther status
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 1:12:47 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle:

We are writing to support the retaining of endangered status for the Florida panther. We have both lived in Florida for over five years in the past and one of us (Lynda) was born and grew up there. We now reside in Washington state, but still remember our experiences in Florida's great wild places. Neither of us has ever seen a Florida panther, although we would have been delighted to see one. Panthers are symbolic of the native Florida wild country and their loss would be a great calamity.

Please retain endangered status for the Florida panther.

Sincerely,

David B. Richman, Ph.D. (Zoology, University of Florida, Gainesville)
Lynda Goin, M.Ed (Early Childhood Education, University of Florida, Gainesville)

From:	Thomas Daniel
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther under ESA
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 4:16:00 PM

Please could you make sure the USFWS keeps the Florida Panther protected under the Endangered Species Act.

Thomas Daniel

From: swertz
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida panther
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 6:24:35 PM

Protection of the Florida panther!
Sent from my Verizon Wireless 4G LTE Smartphone

From: Amy Allison
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 5:55:36 PM

Dear David -

Please consider keeping the panther's as endangered in the South Florida Wildlands and work towards expanding their habitat. As a new Florida resident, my family and I appreciate the efforts to protect what makes this state unique and a treasure.

Best wishes,
Amy Allison

--
@sodadna
Soda DNA
ph: [redacted]

From:	natalie mades
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 5:30:42 PM

Hello Mr. Shindle,
I am contacting you regarding my concern for the dwindling numbers of the Florida panther, as a result of increased mining and development in Florida, destroying its natural habitat.

I have lived in Florida for 53years, the last 14 in Lake Mary, nd I am dismayed at the out of control growth and destruction of the beautiful environment and concerned that many animal species are disappearing. I would like to see increased protection for the Florida panther.

Very truly yours,

Natalie Mades
Lake Mary, Florida

From: Kimberly Mitchell
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 5:12:48 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle-

On behalf of the Everglades Trust, I write to implore the US Fish and Wildlife Service to keep the Florida panther on the endangered list.

Sincerely,

Kimberly Mitchell

Kimberly Mitchell
Executive Director
Everglades Trust, Inc.
Cell [redacted]
Kimberly@EvergladesTrust.org

From: brenda.kayne@gmail.com
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 5:12:23 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle

It is very important that we protect our Florida Panther. We need to maintain its endangered status and we need to find ways to enlarge his habitat - find ways to use our land and water better. There is room for us all, but human beings need to be much more thoughtful and active about it. And we must undo the damage we have done.

Sincerely,
Brenda C. Kayne
from Fernandina Beach, FL
32034

--
www.songsforall.com

From:	Amanda Waigand
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 3:41:33 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

Please make sure our panther remains protected under the Endangered Species Act. There are so few left.

Congressman Buchanan sent notice of the deadline for the decision by the Fish and Wildlife Service. He gave your name and email address to send you our thoughts on keeping the Florida Panther as an Endangered Species.

They are, and we should.

Thank you for your time and attention.

Amanda Waigand

From:	Jonathan Staufer
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 3:40:05 PM

It is of the utmost importance that the recovery efforts for the Florida Panther be intensified rather than scaled back.

The recovery plan for the species calls for establishing 3 populations of 240 animals each. However, the FWS has been dragging its heels, literally for decades, on starting any new reintroduced population of the cats. During that time, *thousands and thousands of acres of prime Florida panther habitat have been lost to urban development.*

Now it is urgent for the agency to work with state partners and initiate new populations before it becomes too late to ever contemplate rewilding the southeast landscape with top carnivores, including Florida panthers. Two likely target regions would include north Florida (e.g. Apalachicola National Forest, Eglin Air Force Base, and Osceola National Forest/Okefenokee National Wildlife Refuge in southern Georgia), and also the southern Appalachians (Great Smoky Mountains National Park and the surrounding Pisgah, Nantahala, Chattahoochee, and Cherokee National Forests). In both areas, robust landowner outreach and incentive programs should be launched right away, to help address local concerns about the impact of restoring mountain lions back to the landscape.

In addition to starting new reintroduction programs, the FWS should also designate critical habitat across the former range of the species, in an interconnected arrangement sufficient to support 720+ panthers. Large development projects should be steered away from the critical panther habitat, and wildlife road crossings (with panther-proof guide fences to funnel animals to the crossing structures) should be required on all new road projects within the critical habitat network for the big cats.

Thank youd for your time and consideration.

Sincerely,

Jonathan Staufer

--
Jonathan Staufer
Grappa Fine Wines & Spirits
Since 1977, Vail's Bottle Shop
100 E. Meadow Dr., #32
Vail, [redacted]57
Main: [redacted]
Offic[redacted]
Fax: [redacted]

From:	robynnemes@comcast.net
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 3:34:44 PM

David, I am writing to encourage the maintenance of the Florida panther's endangered status and also to encourage increasing efforts to preserve remaining habitat. We are so fortunate to have this reclusive animal in our midst. I am most grateful for any efforts you can make on behalf of this species.

Sincerely ~ Robyn Nemes

From:	PENNY REID
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 3:05:16 PM

Please maintain the Florida panther's "endangered" status -- and redouble efforts to protect remaining habitat.

Penny Reid
Fernandina Beach, FL

From:	gibbopaul@yahoo.com
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 3:01:45 PM

Dear David
Please maintain full endangered species status for the Florida panther ! ! ! - and consider the cumulative impacts to the panther from the many development projects currently underway or under review in its habitat.
Please also consider what these projects are doing to the likelihood that the Florida panther will ever recover.
Also please exercise your power as a regulatory agency of the United States government. Please I urge you to – and to fulfill your duties under the Endangered Species Act by protecting the Florida panther's vital but rapidly shrinking habitat from loss, degradation, and fragmentation.
Leave future Floridians a legacy to be proud of, and be a happy partner in that decision
I go all over the world as well as Florida and tell the young kids of the plight of the Panther, and how the good people are helping.
Roaring regards
Paul Gibbons
http://www.soccerinthecommunity.org/

Sent from Yahoo Mail on Android

From:	Linda Peckett
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 2:30:56 PM

Please maintain the panther's endangered status and double down on protecting it's habitat. We can make a difference now, but if we choose not to....once they're gone that's it. This planet is meant for more than humanity alone.
Sincerely
Linda Peckett

From: Colette
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 2:18:59 PM

Please continue to protect the Florida Panther within the Endangered Species Act. With on 5% of its habitat remaining, it is up to us to protect this magnificent creature. Not only is the Florida panther an umbrella species, it is also a keystone species. And it is the last sub-species of cougar east of the Mississippi River. Please protect it.

Thank you,

Colette Dennehy

From:	Laura McDowell
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 2:18:48 PM

To Whom it May Concern: Please, keep federal protections for the Florida panther under the Endangered Species Act!

Fewer than 250 panthers remain in our state.

Thank you,

Laura McDowell

From: Susan Price
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 1:50:16 PM

I support keeping protections in place for the Florida Panther under the Endangered Species Act. I don't believe their numbers are sufficient as yet to warrant withdrawal of the protections at this point, or truly any time in the near future.

Thanks for your time,

Susan Price
pricesep@yahoo.com

Confidentiality Note: This e-mail message may contain information that is privileged and/or confidential. If you are not the addressee or an authorized recipient of this message, any distribution, copying, publication, or use of this information for any purpose is prohibited. If you are not the addressee or an authorized recipient of this message, please notify the sender immediately by e-mail and then delete this message.

From:	Sabrina Mijares
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 1:33:45 PM

Dear David Shindle,

I urge the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service to maintain full endangered species status for the Florida panther – and to consider the cumulative impacts to the panther from the many development projects currently underway or under review in its habitat. Please consider what those projects are doing to the likelihood that the Florida panther will ever recover. I ask that the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service exercise its power as a regulatory agency of the United States government and fulfill its duties under the Endangered Species Act by protecting the Florida panther's vital but rapidly shrinking habitat from loss, degradation, and fragmentation.

Sabrina Mijares

From: Maryanne Steingold
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 1:26:50 PM

***Please--protect the Florida Panther's Endangered Status.

From:	Bob Howell
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 1:03:46 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle.

One of the most thrilling moments of my life out west was to hear a mountain lion (as they are called out west) calling in a canyon. This was in Colorado. I searched all over the west and never did see a mountain lion in the wild. I have tried to see the Florida Panther as well. Never have. I have seen tracks and there were reports of one in our neighborhood.

It would be a huge disappointment and failure if the only way I ever get to see this magnificent creature is in a zoo. This is one of the most unique mammals in Florida, or the Southeast for that matter. It deserves to be protected and allowed to roam and thrive in the habitat that it adapted to. Please maintain all protections for this beautiful cat.

Thank you,

Bob Howell
Pasco County, Florida

From: Harlan Sandberg
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 11:36:25 AM

To whom it may concern-

I would strongly urge that the USFWS not only continue the protection of the Florida Panther under the endangered species act but to institute a program which would give the Panther real protection from the fragmentation of Panther habitat which has been occuring in the past and is now accelerating due to new developments being approved in prime panther habitat.

If the Fish and Wildlife Service and other govt. agencies do not enforce the act and mitigate habitat fragmentation than endangered species listing is meaningless. It is time for meaningful protection for the panther. Recent surveys have recommended "no loss in either the quality of quantity of the Florida panther's remaining habitat in southwest Florida if the species is to have any chance of survival into the future.

The Panther is our state animal, yet its small core habitat is constantly shrinking under the pressure of roadbuilding, powerplants,
and new subdivisions which are consistently approved by county, state and federal agencies with apparently no concern that development on the Panther.

It is time for the USFWS to do its job, retain endangered status for the Florida Panther and institute meaningful protectections before this magnificent animal is gone.

Harlan Sandberg
1142 SW 4th Ave
Pompano Beach, Florida 33060

From:	Harriet Fricker
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 11:34:42 AM

Sir let the facts speak we actually have 15 real Florida Panthers in existence. The rest were brought I believe from Texas to make our Panthers better. However human greed has taken over the thought process of man. Why must we have open season on these animals? Isn't it bad enough your filling in Everglades and pushing animals out. Think its time to push human race out and leave what animals we have alone. Bad enough pythons are roaming and killing most native animals. If you pass this then your all animal cruelty. Give yourself a pat on the back and say no more animals we got this little law that said just shoot them. Well in my book I would prefer to shoot the hunter your useless and nothing is hard. You have scopes fancy lights for nitrs stronger bullets and what does the animal have? Same thing he started with hundreds of years ago. You just plain trophy hunters. But you don't need to build in everglades stay the hell out. You dam near got every piece of land built on back off you fools. You will regret making animals extinct to satisfy your GREED.

From:	Jennifer Vreeland
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 10:17:47 AM

Hello David,

As a Florida resident and someone who cares about the environment, I would like to urge the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service to do all they can to ensure that the Florida Panther remains protected under the Endangered Species Act. As you know the panther is a keystone species and as its numbers dwindle it opens the opportunity for invasive predators to move in and alter the balance of the system. We already see the effects of the invasive epidemic in which we can thank ourselves for creating and with no predators to help control the numbers, it will only get worse. The panther is vital to a healthy system; We did this and we need to fix it simple as that. Until we can learn to live with nature and not against it the Florida panther remains threatened. More needs to be done to teach folks how to live in harmony with the panther and new regulations with regards to eco-friendly development need to be put in place, until that happens the panther remains in peril. Concerned citizens are here to help, take advantage of that!

Thank you,
Jennifer Vreeland

From: MJ
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 10:13:50 AM

Mr. Shindle;

As a 3rd generation Floridian, I am deeply concerned for the preservation of our wildlife and the habitats that they need.

Uncontrolled development and lack of concern for our environment has caused many species to loose what little habitat they need to survive.

The Florida Panther is an endangered species of our state, and needs to remain on this list.

Unless, government officials realize that reckless over development motivated by greed is going to do more harm than good to our state, we are on a collision course for disaster.

More and more sinkholes are opening up, and the state is being sucked dry from over building and over population.

Please consider the facts.

Thank you,

Mary Jane Jeffery
St. Petersburg, Fl

From: jean and tim
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 10:08:51 AM

Sir:

The Florida Panther needs to remain on the Endanger Species list, as there are less than 250 of them.

Sincerely,

Tim Mulligan

From: Marisa Riggi
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 9:33:56 AM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

I am writing in favor of the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service maintaining full endangered species status for the Florida panther.

The panther's small core habitat in southwest Florida, less than five percent of its original range across most of the southeast United States, continues to shrink and become more fragmented by the day. Up to a dozen new development projects in that core habitat – including oil exploration across hundreds of thousands of acres, road expansions, new power plant construction, and new subdivisions – are poised to destroy or degrade massive amounts of some of the best upland habitats this species has left. And while the panther population may have recovered from near-extinction in the mid-nineties when only 20 to 30 panthers remained, the current estimate of 120 to 230 panthers is still a tiny number. With continued habitat loss and roadkill continuing to take their toll, that population has almost certainly reached a peak. A record 42 panthers died in 2015 with 30 killed as a result of vehicle collision. That record was equaled in 2016, but with 32 cases of roadkill. With more growth, wider roads, and more cars on those roads, this grim situation is not expected to improve.

Regulatory mechanisms which could slow this loss and degradation of habitat remain completely inadequate to the problem. Local county governments, the Army Corps of Engineers, Florida Department of Environmental Protection, Florida Department of Economic Opportunity, South Florida Water Management District, the National Park Service and the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service itself continue to approve nearly every application for new development which comes before them. One recent project now on the table, "Rural Lands West" in eastern Collier County, would create a new 6,000-acre subdivision in prime panther habitat adjacent to the Florida Panther National Wildlife Refuge.

The Florida panther remains an isolated sub-species of the North American cougar. It has had little to no contact with puma populations in the western United States for approximately 100 years – after habitat loss, highway construction, and indiscriminate hunting wiped out those connections. The "eastern cougar" was declared extinct in its last 5-year review conducted in 2011 – making the Florida panther the very last sub-species and breeding population of cougars east of the Mississippi River.

Recent scientific surveys of the Florida panther landscape (Kautz, et al, 2006, and Frakes, et al, 2015) have recommended no loss in either the quality or quantity of the Florida panther's remaining habitat in southwest Florida - if the species is to have any chance of survival into the future. So far, that advice is not being heeded by any of the responsible government agencies.

I ask that you consider what those projects are doing to the likelihood that the Florida panther will ever recover. I also request the service exercise its power as a regulatory agency of the United States government – and to fulfill its duties under the Endangered Species Act by protecting the Florida panther's vital but rapidly shrinking habitat from loss, degradation, and fragmentation.

Thank you,
Marisa Riggi

From:	april lawless
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 9:14:38 AM

Hello,
My name is April Lawless, sister of deceased FWC officer Michelle Lawles.
I'm writing in hopes that you will stand by and support the Florida Panther in continuing to stay on the Endangered Species Act list.

I could site many articles that describe what it means to loose such protection status and what would happen to the ecosystem loosing such a beautiful predator, but I wont. Im sure you already know those things. I'm simply asking to please do what is right for the animal and not for the people. Too many times its take more land and kill more animals because we need to build and make money. Soon there won't be wildlife to protect. So please follow your heart and not be influenced by money or politicians.

Thankyou for your time
Sincerely
April lawless

Sent from Yahoo Mail on Android

From:	Lynette Woodward
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Tuesday, August 29, 2017 8:40:08 AM

Please continue to protect our diminished population of Florida Panther! It's the right thing to do.
Sent from my iPad

From: pittster
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 8:08:36 AM

I cannot object strongly enough to the possible removal of our precious Florida Panther from the endangered species list. Is nothing sacred in this state? Are we so calliused and consumed by our own greed that we're willing to let this beautiful animal go into extinction?

Please do not take this deadly step. Save our Panthers.

Donna Pittman

Sent from my Samsung Galaxy smartphone.

From: Linda
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Tuesday, August 29, 2017 12:03:50 AM

Mr. Shindle,
I support keeping the Florida panther on the endangered species list and all the protections afforded under this Act. Please strive to protect the panther from extinction. Keep this beautiful animal protected and on the endangered species list. With so few left this should be a high priority to assure the panther will survive. Project it's habitat from further destruction so this species can exist for generations to come. There are enough shopping centers, housing developments and roads. Let the panther live and thrive!
Thank you.

Linda Dietrich
Cape Coral, Fl

Sent from my iPad

From: ï»¿mushi
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 11:21:11 PM

Bio-diversity makes for a healthy planet for all lifeforms, including humans. To put money above life is what is threatening humanity's existence. Please keep the Florida Panther on the Endangered Species List.

-- To Boldly Go.....

From:	Rick Harris
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 10:04:55 PM

David, it's been brought to my attention that there are persons trying to have the Panther taken off the endangered list. We need to continue to protect these beautiful animals.
Please stand up for these big cats!
Thanks,
Rick Harris
Lifetime Florida Resident

Sent from my iPhone

From:	Jenny Bramlette
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 10:00:46 PM

Please maintained the endangered status of the Florida Panther and do all you can to protect it's rapidly shrinking habitat. Thank you. Jenny Bramlette

From: Suzanne Morrissey
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 9:52:40 PM

I urge you to continue to preserve the utmost protections for the Florida Panther. When I was in college, I researched the Florida panther. At the time there were only 30 to 60 panthers. They are different from cougars and mountain lions in that the Florida panther has a crook in its tail which the puma cousins do not have.

Cars continue to be the number one predator. How can you remove protections when the number of deaths exceeds the number of births.
Please continue to protect the Florida panther.

Suzanne Morrissey
Mathematics Teacher
Bayshore High School

"Florida has a very broad Public Records Law. Virtually all written communications to or from School District Personnel are public records available to the public and media upon request. E-mail sent or received on the School District system will be considered public and will only be withheld from disclosure if deemed confidential pursuant to State Law."

From: Ruby Budovsky
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 9:51:54 PM

Dear Sir,

I do NOT support a lower level of protection for OUR Florida Panther. Please bolster not diminish protection. Please stand strong against development in Panther habitat.
Between habitat loss and vehicle killings, if the current protection is diminished we will certainly lose the Our Florida Panther to extinction.

Thank You,

Ruby Budovsky

From:	Elias Simo
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 9:51:35 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle, I believe we should keep the Florida Panther as an endangered for the protection of its species. The numbers of Florida panthers are minuscule as is having little over 200 remaining in the wild and even with such a low number count, they are in the process of potentially moving to threatened allowing for farmers and land owners to expand onto their territory, in the process removing their territory. The animals are extremely territorial and removing a small amount of territory can be detrimental since they will fight amongst themselves for land and will have to travel through urban areas to breed. In 2014, the number of Florida Panther roadkill exceeded the number of panthers born that year, urbanization is a direct cause for the near extinction of the Florida panther and would like to ask the FWC to please keep the Florida Panthers endangered until the population comes back to what it was.

From:	Russet Coviello
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 9:05:24 PM

Please do not take the Florida Panther off the Endangered Species List. With all the development in this state of the thousands that seem to be flocking here from the cold, the panther's changes for survival seem dim if this is done. Humans are the biggest impediment to nature as it is. Just sayin’.

Russet Coviello
http://about.me/russetcoviello
russetsrave@gmail.com

From:	Niurka Romero
To:	David_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 8:50:27 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle: I would like to express my dismay with the fact that the Florida panther, an iconic species, is being considered for removal from the endangered species act. As you know, the panthers were almost extinct. Their population has just began to recover. Please do not remove the Florida panthers from the protection of the endangered species act. If this is done, they will surely cease to exist in Florida.

From: Beatrice Stodola
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 8:48:58 PM

Don't downgrade the Florida panther from endangered to threatened.

From: dmandch@aol.com
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 8:48:01 PM

Dear David,

Please maintain the panther's "endangered" status – and redouble efforts to protect remaining habitat. Existing Panther Habitat needs to be protected.

Regards,
Drew Martin
Conservation Chair, Loxahatchee Group, Sierra Club

From: Joan Andersen
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 7:49:55 PM

Please have the Florida state animal, the panther, remain protected under the Endangered Species Act. I just read in the Tampa Bay Times that a female panther had been killed.

From: Alyce McCathran
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 7:19:45 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

I am writing to request that you not take steps to remove the Florida panther from the endangered species list. Since there are only about 200 remaining and their habitat is continually being diminished by more and more land clearing for construction, it is important to preserve the ones we have left. I know that in your position with the Fish and Wildlife Service you are fully aware of this, but I want you to know that there are many Floridians besides myself that care and are concerned about our wildlife and want to see it protected in the strongest way possible.

Thank you for your consideration.

Sincerely,

Alyce McCathran
Apollo Beach, Fl. 33572

From:	Todd Waggoner
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 7:19:41 PM

I am a 50 yr old man from Venice. Been here since 1978. I'm an outdoorsman and a wildlife advocate. Please keep our Florida Panther on the endangered list and protect them.

Thank you,

Todd Waggoner.

From:	walter duke
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 7:12:29 PM

We must do everything we can to protect these majestic cats.

Sent from Yahoo Mail for iPad

From: gini Robinson
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 7:05:29 PM

Please extend the endangered designation for these beautiful animals.
Any additional assistance would certainly be welcomed as well.
Thank you.
--
Sent using Inbox for Hotmail

From: L M Kronholm
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 7:02:19 PM

Please - - PLEASE -- keep the Florida panther as a "protected" species under the ESA. The numbers of Florida Panther are barely adequate to maintain some semblance of genetic diversity and they are terribly threatened by habitat loss. To remove their protected status is to condemn them to extinction!

Linda M. Kronholm
North Port, Florida

From: Joe Moye
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 6:58:10 PM

Please protect the Florida Panther.

From: James
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 6:48:55 PM

Please keep the Florida Panther on the protected list. I have seen them, and they are beautiful.

James C Fetterman

From:	charlotte fleck
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 6:45:58 PM

Please keep on endangered list. Don't give up on them!

Sincerely,

Charlotte Fleck

Sent from Yahoo Mail for iPad

From:	Jura Godbody
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 6:27:38 PM

I live in SWFL Collier County to be exact. I've been lucky enough to see one of these beautiful creatures in the wild. If they're not protected any longer are they going to allow hunting as well? I was at the bear check station at the Picayune and I was disgusted at what I witnessed. I see the same travesty occurring if these big cats are removed from the list. Please keep these felines on the list and protect them from the most savage animals of all humans.

From:	Sean Patton
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 6:16:09 PM

Dear David Shindle,

As a fellow biologist one who studies wetlands and marsh ecosystems I fully support protecting Florida Panthers. Not only are they still critically endangered, protecting them and the large habitats they require will support many other native, threatened, and endangered species. This is obviously an easy answer, protect the Florida Panther and keep the species status as endangered.

Sean Patton

--

Sean Patton
New College of Florida, Sarasota
[redacted]

From: Charles Martoe
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 5:49:19 PM

Dear Mr Shindle,

It has been brought to our family's attention that certain group(s) are pushing to remove the Florida Panther off of the endangered species list. It is, in our family's opinion, that to remove the Florida Panther from the endangered list with only around 250 known to exist in our state, would be an extremely irresponsible thing to do, and would most certainly doom this species from existence. Please do not let this happen. It is the obvious right thing to do.

Thank you,

Charles Martoe

Charles Martoe
7756 102nd ct
Vero Beach, Fl 32967

Should you choose to forward this e-mail, please delete the forwarding history, including mine and any other e-mail addresses included. This will make mining for addresses more difficult for the spammers and help to prevent the spread of viruses. Thank you.

From:	louis7767
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 5:08:43 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

Please keep the Florida panther protected as an endangered species. These magnificent animals are rapidly disappearing from our state. They have as much right to live here as people do. It is essential that they remain protected and that their habitat be preserved. Thanks for taking the time to consider my views on this subject.

Sincerely,
Louis Putallaz
Sarasota, FL 34235

From: Beverly Gilmore
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 5:08:18 PM

Mr. Shindle,.
Please enter my name in support of all efforts to create habitat and encourage development for the Florida Panther. I have lived in Floirida since 1955, in Melrose, Keystone Heights, Gainesville, Santa Rosa Beach and now Tampa Palms. We are lucky here in Tampa Palms to see bobcats, turtles, armadillos, a host of winged inhabitants, including the Sandhill crane and Florida scrub jay. I hope to live long enough to see a panther. I am 84 years old. As a very young woman in Gainesville and a reporter for the Gainesville Sun, I was the recipient of a drink called Panther Piss. I have never forgotten it. Thank you for your support of Florida Wildlife.

Sincerely,
Beverly Gilmore
7801 Tuscany Woods Dr.
Tampa FL 33647
bevgilmore@att.net

Sent from Mail for Windows 10

From: Rebecca Crane
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 5:04:31 PM

I feel as much wildlife conservation that can be done should be done, bar none.

From: EFS
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 5:01:16 PM

Please protect our Florida Panther to maximum available.

Thank you.

Ernesr Smith
Sarasota, Florida
Sent from my iPad

From:	Carol Soustek
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 4:59:57 PM

So much habitat destroyed, few areas for them to travel, do not degrade them. Every protection needed for the panther to gain more ground and live long. So much to lose and never recover. Carol Soustek in Holmes Beach Fl. A native Floridian.

From:	Grace Duffey
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 4:53:44 PM

As a resident of Sarasota County, I urge you to protect the Florida panthers. Please do not downgrade their protection status.

Grace Duffey

From:	Steve Brooks
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 4:47:25 PM

Good afternoon,

I saw on social media that you are the contact and today is the deadline to offer my opinion regarding the Florida Panther.

The panther has dwindled in number in the wild due to an abundance of growth from highway, farming, ranching, homesteading.

If there is any opinion, science shows this creature has not managed to thrive under the pressures of man's push.

You need no reminder that your organization is put in place for the protection of Florida wildlife. I see no evidence that the Florida Panther is either not wildlife nor Floridian.

Your organization has already failed the Florida Black Bear, please do not allow the Panther to suffer extinction because some loud, greedy Floridians think it's a nuisance.

Please keep the Panther on the endangered list.

Thank you for your time.

Sincerely,

Steve Brooks
Orlando, FL

From:	Merle Haber
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 4:42:54 PM

Please continue to protect the Florida Panther, our state animal. The diminishing population demands protection.
Merle Haber
34236

Sent from my iPhone

From:	Elizabeth Garcia
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 4:36:05 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle

The Florida Panther needs to remain protected.

Elizabeth A. Garcia, DVM

Sent from my iPad

From:	Amy de Lorimier
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 4:33:15 PM

Dear David Shindle,

In this era of massive extinction, we have the opportunity and obligation to save as many as we can.

The current recovery plan, adopted in 2008, says USFWS will consider delisting the panther when 3 populations of 240 or more breeding adults in each population has been established and sufficient habitat to support these populations is secured for the long-term. These animals are a long way from forming additional breeding colonies with a total population of 240 panthers.

Pressure to develop lands within the existing primary, secondary and dispersal zones in SW Florida remains high, and the number of panthers killed by vehicles continues to rise every year.

I support compensating landowners for their livestock and give them incentives for maintaining or restoring panther habitat on their land.

Few if any threats to the animal have been eliminated, and the LACK OF HIGH QUALITY HABITAT and connectivity remains a significant barrier to recovery. There is still a long way to go before we should even be considering reclassifying or delisting Florida panthers.

The Florida Panther is a keystone species. It plays a unique and crucial role in the way Florida's ecosystem functions. Without it, the ecosystem would be dramatically different or cease to exist altogether.

If we're going to have the Florida Panther on our license plates as a symbol of the state, we certainly need to do everything in our power to save this species. I do NOT support delisting the Florida Panther.

Regards,

Amy de Lorimier, DVM

St. Francis Animal Hospice
In-Home Hospice, Palliative Care & Euthanasia

Dr. Amy de Lorimier
(Ph): [redacted]
(Fax): [redacted]

care@SFAHospice.com
www.SFAHospice.com

From:	Michael Slagel
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Cc:	Mercedes Martishius
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 4:11:34 PM

Mr, Shindle,

Please allow the Florida Panther the protection that it deserves. Please allow it to stay on the endangered list until it has more of a chance to add to it's numbers. Please don't cave to developers wanting their pockets lined with the blood of the panther!

Sincerely,

Michael Slagel

From:	Wanda
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 4:08:07 PM

Hi,

Per Congressman Buchanan's email, I'm sending my thoughts to you. According to the email 32 panthers were killed by vehicles. What plans are in place to build wildlife bridges across the roads so we can minimize this from happening in the future? Please protect our panthers.

Cheers,
Wanda

From:	Joseph Sapp
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 4:00:37 PM

The Trump administration is rapidly getting a reputation as not caring about our natural treasures or environment. Please don't contribute to that by lowering the protection status of this fine animal. I consider the fact that I have seen one in the wild as one of the highlights of my life. Let's give our children the possibility of having the same experience.

--
Joe Sapp

From:	Fred Rehage
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 3:59:24 PM

Dear Dave,

Please maintain the full endangered species status of the Florida Panther. Please let us not abuse Florida's environment again.

Thanks,

Fredrick A. Rehage.

From: SUSAN MCGIVERN
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 3:59:23 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

I ask you to take action to make sure that our Florida Panthers remain protected under the Endangered Species Act. There are still too few of these animals alive. Thank you for your consideration.

Susan K. McGivern

Manatee County

Sarasota FL 34243

From:	David Driscoll
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 3:55:54 PM

With only 250 Panthers left, the traffic accidents will slowly decimate the remaining population. How could your agency even consider the idea that Florida Panthers aren't endangered?

Not only should they be protected but tunnels need to be constructed to allow panthers to cross Alligator Alley & other major toads. They are doing this in California for Mountain Lions.

David Driscoll
diamond.dave@starpower.net
[redacted]

From: Carolyn Wilkinson
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 3:47:53 PM

Keep protecting!

Carolyn C. Wilkinson

From: p mosher
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 3:37:25 PM

I hardly think a few hundred Florida Panthers equals a full recovery of this species. I insist that they be kept on the endangered species list as they are CRITICALLY endangered.
Do not fall for the arguments of the blood thirsty few that hope to satisfy their personal inadequacies by killing a truly innocent creature!
I insist that your agency exercises its power as a regulatory agency of the United States government – and to fulfill its duties under the Endangered Species Act by protecting the Florida panther's vital but rapidly shrinking habitat from loss, degradation, and fragmentation.
I live in close proximity to the panther habitat. I fully support their continued protection!

Paul Mosher

Thomas Mosher

Richard Mosher

4695 26 Ave SE
Naples FL 34117

From:	Katherine Banos
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 3:35:17 PM

To Whom It May Concern,
I am writing due to the issue that has summoned based on whether the Florida Panther should still be categorized as an endangered animal or not. I believe that 230 panthers is not sufficient enough for them to be removed from that category. Their number has increased immensely but I feel like there still aren't enough, if people decide to start hunting again then their number will most likely drop dramatically again. Florida Panthers should stay as an endangered species until they reach up to about 500 or more. Thank you for taking the time to read what I believe is right and I hope you take it into consideration.

From: Patricia Walker
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 3:21:29 PM

Please DO NOT take the Florida Panther off the Endangered Species list!!! Pat Walker, Sarasota FL

From:	Joan
To:	schindle, david
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 3:01:18 PM

Please keep the Florida Panther an endangered species as recommended by Rep Vern Buchanan
also please do everything you can to seriously prosecute animal and Marine cruelty -
Don't know if it's a felony but it should be. I'm referring specifically to the recent incident of the dragging of the shark and torture of seabirds.

Respectully
Joan Nixon
7263 Plovers Way
Sarasota FL 34242

From: Comcast
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 2:48:45 PM

Please protect these rare and beautiful animals, part of our Florida heritage.
Judith A. Mulligan
Venice FL

Sent from my iPad

From:	Joan Bencheck
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 2:45:02 PM

Please don't remove this beautiful creature from the endangered list - what can be done to increase the number?

Joan Bencheck
Crestview, Florida.

From:	Celia Holman
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 2:42:07 PM

That the Florida Panther has to be under review is in itself absurd. With so few members left and so little habitat, it's a "no brainer" to keep them on the ESL.

The next thing is to give the cats more room by rejecting any new construction growth projects, residential or commercial, that impede their small territory and construct corridors to newly acquired Panther areas to give them more room. Build underpasses so that they can cross major highways unharmed. SPEND SOME TIME AND MONEY ON MAKING THEIR LIVES EASIER.

Listen, humans are not the most important species, only the most destructive one. We are but a small piece of the total of what is Earth's environment/ecosystem. We CANNOT reconstruct what "mother nature" has created. We don't have the millions of years or the smarts, no matter what our overblown egos tell us.

Wake up! Give them federal protection under the Endangered Species Act and begin to plan how to make their habitat larger and more livable. Anything else will be disastrous.

From: Celia, retired Hillsborough County teacher, animal activist and vegetarian, and environmentalist.

From: Clare Kirchman
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 2:37:02 PM

I am writing in support for continuing to list the Florida Panther as an endangered species. I am shocked that this animal would be taken off the list. Please include my comment as part of your efforts to keep them on this list. Thank you, Clare Kirchman, Manatee County

From:	Chuk Williams
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 2:35:45 PM

Mr. Shindle:

We (my wife and I) strongly urge you to do what you can to insure that the Florida Panther remains on the Endangered Species List. We live close to a local park, and we constantly see bald eagles, bobcats, raccoons, etc, etc passing by on our land. The Panther isn't one of the "visible" animals usually seen out in the open, but nevertheless needs to remain being protected. With only approximately 250 remaining, we need to make sure they are.

Please put us down as two people who hope our kids are able to live alongside beautiful animals as we are.

If you have any questions-don't hesitate to write.

Thanks-

Charles Williams/Robin Roarke

From:	Jason Green
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 2:34:26 PM

As a Florida resident, I ask that the FWS keep the Florida Panther on the list of animals protected by the Endangered Species Act.

Thank you,
Jason Green

JASON GREEN
[redacted]
www.jason-green.com

From: Deirdre Callan
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 2:27:17 PM

I am writing to urge the government to ignore the ignorance of Washington DC and the idiot in the White House. Please protect our endangered panthers and Manatees. Thank you, Deirdre Callan

Sent from my iPhone

From:	Patrick Salsich
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 2:22:54 PM

Dear Mr Shindle

I am writing to request that Fish and Wildlife maintain the panther's "endangered" status – and redouble efforts to protect remaining habitat.

Sincerely

Patrick Salsich
926 South N st
Lake Worth, FL 33460

From:	Howard Hochman
To:	David Shindle
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 2:22:18 PM

I just want to say that I am looking forward to seeing that the Florida panther stays on the Endangered Species List. To reduce the listing to “Threatened” when there is only approximately 200 panthers left in Florida is not a smart move. We need to see that the panther is protected until we see growth in this species group.

From:	Bill Hutchison
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Cc:	Vern.BuchananEnews@mail.house.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 2:19:15 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

I fully agree with Congressman Vern Buchanan that the Florida panther should retain its level of protection under the Endangered Species Act and also have a critical habitat set aside for it, as required under said act.

Thank you,

William P. Hutchison

From:	Jessica Sons
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 2:12:47 PM

Please protect the Florida Panther. We would like to have our future be able to see wildlife in its natural habitat and not either extinct or an enclosed cage.

Thank you,

Jessica Sons

From:	W.E. (Bill) Sovik, Jr.
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 2:11:26 PM

Please keep the Florida's state animal, the panther, protected under the Endangered Species Act.

Thank you,

W.E. (Bill) Sovik, Jr
3901 Hamilton Club Circle
Sarasota, FL
34242-1109

From:	paula heggerick
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 1:59:29 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle-

I wish to express my strong concern over reports that the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service may weaken protections for Florida panthers.

Federal officials currently are reviewing the status of the panther, which is listed as “endangered” with a population estimated at around only 200. The federal government recently downgraded the status of another iconic Florida species, the West Indian manatee, lowering it from “endangered” to "threatened."

There remain major hurdles to the full recovery of the panther.

Alarmingly, your agency’s standard review comes less than a year after 32 panthers were struck and killed by vehicles on Florida roadways — the highest number of panther-involved accidents ever recorded. Such traffic fatalities have risen more than 65 percent since 2012, outpacing the number of documented panther births. These road-kills are in addition to other causes of death, including poaching and disease.

Please do not change the status of the Florida panther as was done recently with the manatee. That would be a serious mistake to no longer protect this beautiful animal.

Sincerely-

Paula Heggerick
Sarasota, FL

From: Jackie Jones
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 1:57:22 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

I heartily encourage you to work to continue the “Endangered Status" of the Florida Panther and to also do all you can to keep or enlarge the small habitat left for this amazing animal. There are so many animals in an endangered status that I wonder if our children or theirs will ever see the magnificent creatures on this planet that we have seen. So many have been lost to the explosion of human population and loss of habitat that little remains for them to survive. I have visited Florida as well as Africa and have seen the deplorable loss of elephants in Kenya and we, at least, can do all we can for the native animals in our country.

With good and hopeful wishes,

Jackie Jones
Walnut Creek, CA

From:	Ange Ingram
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 1:57:17 PM

Please do not remove the Florida Panther from the Endangered Species list. No amount of development is worth the destruction of a species. Florida will soon be under water, especially in the panthers' habitat. It's folly to build, build, build.

Please consider your actions with an eye toward our future. We are not entitled to destroy the earth and her natural inhabitants with our greed.

Thank you.

Ange Ingram

From: Gene Rossano
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 1:51:39 PM

I urge you and the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service to make sure that Florida's state animal, the panther, remains protected under the Endangered Species Act.

Gene Rossano
425 Laurel Rd E
Nokomis, FL 34275
geneatbest@yahoo.com

From:	David Colby
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 1:48:30 PM

I support protection of the Florida Panther. If anybody ever saw a Wild Florida Panther in its natural habitat they would be awestruck. I would rather have one Panther than the whole of the Disney Complex.

David Colby
5108 Medalist Road
Sarasota Florida 34243
Dcolby051@yahoo.com
[redacted]

Sent from my iPad

From: JOHN EISEMAN
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 1:44:44 PM

Please keep it protected under the Endangered Species Act.

John Eiseman

From:	Kim Kane
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 1:43:14 PM

Dear Mr Shindle,
Please continue to protect our unique Florida Panther thru the Endangered Species Act. They are beautiful animals, gifts from God, and few of them remain.
Please protect them.
Thank you,
Kim Kane

From: westshores@aol.com
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 1:41:47 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle

I urge you to work to continue protection for the Florida Panther under the Endangered Species Act. There are only 250 panthers remaining here as development has continued across the state at a rapid pace. Our wildlife can not protect itself from human encroachment into its natural environment. We have an obligation to work towards protecting the land and the creatures that were here long before us.

Thank you

Sincerely

Virginia Griese
Lakewood Ranch, Florida 34202

From: Swanson, Andrew
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 1:33:59 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

As more and more of Florida's wildlife is threatened by continued (unbridled) land development, I am flabbergasted that the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service would ever consider down-listing the Florida Panther from "Endangered Species" protections. As a biologist, I assume you must know something of the biology of this rare cat. Despite its genetic relationship with the western puma and cougar, it remains a very unique population, occupying a very specific habitat, and with its own set of unique genetic and physical traits that allow it to survive in our state.

Seriously, if only 200 such cats remain (and that is a conservative estimate), why on Earth would such a rare population be put on the chopping block? It is ridiculous to remove this organism's protections. If anything, it should be offered BETTER protections than it currently receives.

For the sake of a balanced ecosystem, the Florida Panther should NOT be removed from the endangered species protections it so desperately needs.

Sincerely,

Andrew Swanson

_____

Andrew R Swanson
Professor, Natural Science
State College of Florida – Manatee/Sarasota

From:	Nancy Erickson
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 1:31:01 PM
Attachments:	image013.png image014.png

Hello David,

The Florida Panther must stay protected!

Thank you.

arcpoint labs
accurate. reliable. confidential testing.

Drug Alcohol DNA Wellness Background

Visit our website:
ARCpointLabs.com/sarasota

An Independently-Owned ARCpoint Labs Franchise

Sarasota County green BUSINESS PARTNERSHIP

Nancy Erickson, PHR
Owner
ARCpoint Labs of Sarasota
P : [redacted] | M : [redacted] | F : [redacted]
3410 Magic Oak Lane
Sarasota, FL 34232
Connect With Me:

We are accepting new clients and welcome your referrals.

This message may contain legally-privileged or confidential information including PROTECTED HEALTH INFORMATION and is directed to and for the use of the addressee only. If the reader of this message is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any distribution, dissemination, or copy of this message is strictly prohibited. If you have received this message in error, please delete it immediately and send a reply email to the sender to notify them of same or call (877) 23-HIPAA / (877) [redacted] Unless otherwise expressly indicated herein, this message is not intended to be an electronic signature, or constitute an agreement of any kind under applicable law. Thank you for your cooperation.

From:	Jim Hamilton
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 1:30:51 PM

Please continue to protect our Florida Panther.

James & Brenda Hamilton
4226 65th Pl E
Sarasota, Fl 34243
Manatee County

From:	Trudi Pearl
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 1:28:27 PM

Please do your utmost to protect this species. We do not want it to go extinct.

Thank you,

tru pearl
Venice, FL

From:	CHASK@aol.com
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Cc:	chask@aol.com
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 1:25:34 PM

Dear Sir,

I don't live in Florida but I STRONGLY support governmental protections for the Florida Panther.

I live in New Mexico and have watched for years the travails of government's efforts to prevent the extinction of the Mexican Gray Wolf in New Mexico and Arizona. I don't know who or what powers are arrayed against the panther, but I suspect they're probably similar to the commercial moneyed interests that kill so many of the wolves out here. They're mostly related to the free grazing / free-loading cattle ranchers.

Despite years and years of efforts of reintroduction after the difficult job of nurturing the birthing of the few mating pairs in captivity, the battle continues.

EXTINCTION IS FOREVER!

Charles King

From:	Ross Windom
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 1:25:16 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,
I urge you to continue to protect the Florida Panther. With estimates around 250, we need to continue to support this beautiful creature.
As we humans continue to takeover their habitat, we need to double down on our efforts to protect the panthers.

Thank you,
Ross D. Windom
Sarasota Fl.

From:	Doris Sorensen
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 1:24:51 PM

Please, please make sure this endangered animal is protected! We cannot simply let animals be sacrificed to human encroachment. It isn't right.
Thank you, sincerely.
Doris M. Sorensen
Sarasota

From:	Susan Onstine
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 1:24:28 PM

Please do NOT remove the Florida Panther from the endangered species list. There are so few already and the areas where they live are receding so fast. It is our state animal and should be protected.

Even if you don't care, please understand that the people of Florida do.

Thank you,

Susan Onstine

From:	Sarah Kirk
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 1:23:42 PM

Dear Mr./Dr. Shindle,

Please continue to protect the Florida Panther, by keeping it covered by the Endangered Species Act.

Thank you,
Sarah

--
Sarah K. Kirk, DVM, MS (Shelter Medicine)
Sarasota, FL

From:	Reg Irvine
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 1:21:44 PM

It is crucial that we maintain the highest protection for this beautiful symbol of our state. The image of this magnificent cat adorns my license plate and I hope that they will flourish for a long time and not just become memories.

Thanks,
Reg

Reg Irvine
311 Osprey Point Drive
Osprey, FL 34229

Tel: (941) [redacted]

From: Maureen Tulloch
To: david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject: Florida Panther
Date: Monday, August 28, 2017 1:15:27 PM

Please keep the panther on the endangered list.
Maureen Tulloch

From:	Freeman, John
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Cc:	Freeman, John
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 1:14:13 PM

Dear Mr. Shindle,

Please consider that the Florida panther remains protected under the Endangered Species Act.

One of the books that I ask my students to critique is The Sixth Extinction by Elizabeth Kolbert.

Thank you,
Professor John A. Freeman

Environmental Science & Policy
University of South Florida - Sarasota Manatee

Sent from my iPhone

From:	Phil Kane
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 1:14:11 PM

Sir,
Please keep the Florida Panther on the endangered species list.Like many other Floridians ,I don't want them to become extinct.
Sincerely yours, Philip Kane

From:	David Verizzo
To:	david_shindle@fws.gov
Cc:	"Congressman Vern Buchanan"
Subject:	Florida Panther
Date:	Monday, August 28, 2017 1:12:29 PM

Dear Dr. Shindle,

I urge you to do all within you power to ensure that Florida's state animal, the panther, remains protected under the Endangered Species Act. Fewer than 250 panthers remain in our state and they deserve to be protected from extinction!

Thank you.

David Verizzo
5657 Forester Pond Avenue
Sarasota, FL 34243
cell: [redacted]
Fax: [redacted]
email: david@vectorconsult.biz

****
LEGAL DISCLAIMER
****

The contents of this electronic transmission are privileged and confidential, and are intended solely for the use of the individual or entity to whom they are addressed. If you are not the intended recipient, be advised that you have received this email in error and that any use, dissemination, forwarding, printing or copying of this email is strictly prohibited.

If you have received this email in error, please notify us via return email or by faxing us at [redacted] Thank you.