

# Chincoteague and Wallops Island National Wildlife Refuges

## *Draft Comprehensive Conservation Plan and Environmental Impact Statement*

*May 2014*

### **Refuge Vision Statement**

Our vision statement for the refuges is a synthesis of the refuges' purposes, the National Wildlife Refuge System mission and goals, and other biological, legal, and social concerns in which the refuge has a role. It is intended to be an expression of what the refuge will be like in the future in terms of natural resources and visitor experience. Our vision for the refuge, as developed for this CCP/EIS to help provide the core component of management strategies hereafter, is as follows:

*Chincoteague and Wallops Island National Wildlife Refuges encompass extraordinary and ever-changing lands at the edge of the sea, a place where unique habitats and wildlife flourish. In partnership with others, the refuges are a vital part of a larger system of protected lands and waters on the Delmarva Peninsula critical to migratory birds. People from around the world can visit the refuges to learn, recreate, refresh themselves, be inspired by wildlife and wild lands, and renew their connection with nature.*



# Chincoteague and Wallops Island National Wildlife Refuges

## *Draft Comprehensive Conservation Plan and Environmental Impact Statement*

*May 2014*

**Type of Action:** Administrative – Development of a Comprehensive Conservation Plan

**Lead Agency:** U.S. Department of the Interior, Fish and Wildlife Service

**Location:** Chincoteague National Wildlife Refuge  
Wallops Island National Wildlife Refuge  
Chincoteague, Virginia

**Administrative  
Headquarters:** Chincoteague NWR  
8231 Beach Road  
P.O. Box 62  
Chincoteague Island, VA 23336  
Telephone: (757) 336-6122

**Responsible Official:** Wendi Weber, Regional Director, Northeast Region

**For Further Information:** Thomas Bonetti, Planning Team Leader  
Northeast Regional Office  
300 Westgate Center Drive  
Hadley, MA 01035

This Draft Comprehensive Conservation Plan (CCP) and Environmental Impact Statement (EIS) analyzes three alternatives to managing the 14,032-acre Chincoteague National Wildlife Refuge (NWR) and 373-acre Wallops Island NWR over the next 15 years. This document also contains 17 appendices that provide additional information supporting our analysis. Following is a brief overview of each alternative:

**Alternative A** is the status quo and current management alternative as required by the National Environmental Policy Act. This alternative continues current management strategies as established by the Master Plan approved in 1992, and is referred to as our “No Action” alternative.

**Alternative B** would continue established habitat and wildlife management strategies but focus them in light of the new goals and vision established by the CCP. This alternative balances habitat management, public use and access, and administration of the refuge. Alternative B is our preferred alternative.

**Alternative C** would direct staffing and funding towards maximizing habitat and wildlife management strategies. As a result of prioritizing habitat and wildlife management, public use activities and access may be reduced.



## Table of Contents

<b>Chapter 1: Introduction, Purpose and Need, and Planning Background .....</b>	<b>1-1</b>
1.1 Introduction.....	1-1
1.2 Regional Context and Project Area .....	1-1
1.3 Purpose and Need for Action.....	1-3
1.3.1 Need.....	1-3
1.3.2 Purpose.....	1-3
1.4 Refuge Purposes.....	1-4
1.4.1 Chincoteague National Wildlife Refuge .....	1-4
1.4.2 Wallops Island National Wildlife Refuge .....	1-5
1.5 National Wildlife Refuge System Mission .....	1-5
1.6 Ecological Integrity.....	1-6
1.7 National Wilderness Preservation System .....	1-6
1.8 Other Mandates .....	1-7
1.8.1 U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service and its Mission.....	1-7
1.8.2 Refuge System Goals.....	1-8
1.8.3 The Improvement Act (1997) .....	1-8
1.8.4 The Endangered Species Act.....	1-10
1.8.5 Other Federal Mandates.....	1-11
1.9 Significant Concerns .....	1-11
1.9.1 Climate Change/Sea Level Rise .....	1-12
1.9.2 Regional Conservation .....	1-12
1.9.3 Balance Between Public Use and Habitat and Wildlife Conservation.....	1-12
1.9.4 Public Access to the Refuge, in Particular to the Recreational Beach, and Impact on Visitor Experience and the Local Economy .....	1-13
1.10 Other Relevant Plans and Initiatives.....	1-13
1.10.1 International and National Conservation Plans and Initiatives.....	1-13
1.10.2 National Public Use Plans and Initiatives.....	1-14
1.10.3 Climate Change and Sea Level Rise Studies .....	1-14
1.10.4 State, Regional, and Local Plans .....	1-15
1.11 Description of the Refuge.....	1-16
1.11.1 Chincoteague National Wildlife Refuge .....	1-16
1.11.2 Wallops Island National Wildlife Refuge .....	1-18
1.12 Refuge Operational Plans (“Step-down” Management Plans).....	1-20
1.12.1 Fire Management Plan .....	1-20
1.12.2 Prescribed Fire Plan .....	1-20
1.12.3 Annual Habitat Work Plans .....	1-21
1.12.4 Predator Management Plan .....	1-21
1.12.5 Hunt Management Plans.....	1-21
1.12.6 Annual Hunt Program.....	1-21
1.12.7 Inventory and Monitoring Plan .....	1-21
1.12.8 Pony Management Plan.....	1-21
1.12.9 Plans to be Developed .....	1-22
1.13 Refuge Vision and Goals .....	1-22
1.14 Issues and Opportunities.....	1-24
1.14.1 Coastal Habitat .....	1-24
1.14.2 Managed Wetlands (Impoundments).....	1-25
1.14.3 Upland Habitats.....	1-26
1.14.4 Southern Barrier Islands Unit (Assawoman, Metompkin, Cedar) .....	1-26
1.14.5 Partnerships .....	1-27
1.14.6 Visitor Services .....	1-29
1.14.7 Refuge Administration.....	1-34
1.15 Decision to be Made .....	1-39

**Chapter 2: Alternatives Considered ..... 2-1**

2.1 Introduction..... 2-1

2.2 Development of Alternatives ..... 2-1

2.3 Evaluation of Alternatives..... 2-3

2.4 Alternatives and Components Considered but Eliminated from Detailed Analysis..... 2-5

2.4.1 Beach Nourishment..... 2-5

2.4.2 Elimination of Hunting ..... 2-7

2.4.3 Preliminary Draft Alternative “C” ..... 2-7

2.4.4 Elimination of Transit ..... 2-7

2.5 Alternatives Carried Forward for Detailed Analysis ..... 2-8

2.5.1 Existing Management Actions that Continue Under All Alternatives ..... 2-8

2.5.2 Alternative A (Current Management) ..... 2-12

2.5.3 Alternative B (Balanced Approach) ..... 2-50

2.5.4 Alternative C (Reduced Disturbance)..... 2-74

Table 2-2: Summary of Project Features by Alternative ..... 2-86

**Chapter 3: Affected Environment ..... 3-1**

3.1 Introduction..... 3-1

3.2 Physical Environment..... 3-1

3.2.1 Geology and Erosion ..... 3-1

3.2.2 Soils..... 3-3

3.2.3 Air Quality..... 3-10

3.2.4 Hydrology and Water Quality..... 3-11

3.2.5 Climate Change and Sea Level Rise ..... 3-15

3.3 Vegetation..... 3-25

3.3.1 Assateague Island Unit..... 3-25

3.3.2 Southern Island Units..... 3-30

3.3.3 Wallops Island NWR..... 3-30

3.4 Wildlife ..... 3-30

3.4.1 Federal and State Threatened and Endangered Species ..... 3-31

3.4.2 Birds ..... 3-35

3.4.3 Fish and Other Aquatic Species..... 3-43

3.4.4 Mammals..... 3-45

3.4.5 Reptiles and Amphibians ..... 3-47

3.4.6 Invertebrates..... 3-48

3.4.7 Invasive/Exotic Species of Concern ..... 3-50

3.5 Socioeconomic Setting..... 3-51

3.5.1 Socio-Demographic Characteristics..... 3-51

3.5.2 Economic Characteristics of Chincoteague and Accomack County ..... 3-52

3.5.3 Refuge Recreation Visits and Economics..... 3-55

3.5.4 Environmental Justice ..... 3-56

3.6 Land Use Setting and Transportation..... 3-60

3.6.1 Land Use..... 3-60

3.6.2 Transportation and Access ..... 3-66

3.7 Visitor Services ..... 3-75

3.7.1 Hunting ..... 3-75

3.7.2 Fishing..... 3-77

3.7.3 Environmental Education and Interpretation..... 3-79

3.7.4 Wildlife Observation and Photography..... 3-79

3.7.5 Recreational Beach Use ..... 3-80

3.7.6 Other Recreational Uses..... 3-81

3.8 Refuge Administration..... 3-84

3.8.1 Facilities and Maintenance..... 3-84

3.8.2 Staffing ..... 3-90

3.8.3 Volunteer Programs ..... 3-90

3.8.4 Management Units ..... 3-91

3.8.5 Landscape Conservation Cooperatives..... 3-91

**Chapter 4: Environmental Consequences**..... **4-1**

4.1 Introduction..... 4-1

4.2 Soils..... 4-2

4.2.1 Impacts on Soils in Alternative A ..... 4-3

4.2.2 Impacts on Soils in Alternative B ..... 4-3

4.2.3 Impacts on Soils in Alternative C ..... 4-4

4.3 Air Quality ..... 4-5

4.3.1 Impacts on Air Quality in Alternative A ..... 4-5

4.3.2 Impacts on Air Quality in Alternative B ..... 4-5

4.3.3 Impacts on Air Quality in Alternative C ..... 4-5

4.4 Hydrology/Water Quality ..... 4-6

4.4.1 Impacts on Hydrology/Water Quality in Alternative A ..... 4-6

4.4.2 Impacts on Hydrology/Water Quality in Alternative B ..... 4-6

4.4.3 Impacts on Hydrology/Water Quality in Alternative C ..... 4-7

4.5 Vegetation..... 4-7

4.5.1 Impacts on Vegetation in Alternative A ..... 4-8

4.5.2 Impacts on Vegetation in Alternative B ..... 4-8

4.5.3 Impacts on Vegetation in Alternative C ..... 4-10

4.6 Federally Threatened and Endangered Species..... 4-10

4.6.1 Impacts on Federally Threatened and Endangered Species in Alternative A ..... 4-11

4.6.2 Impacts on Federally Threatened and Endangered Species in Alternative B ..... 4-11

4.6.3 Impacts on Federally Threatened and Endangered Species in Alternative C ..... 4-12

4.7 Birds ..... 4-12

4.7.1 Impacts on Birds in Alternative A..... 4-12

4.7.2 Impacts on Birds in Alternative B..... 4-13

4.7.3 Impacts on Birds in Alternative C..... 4-17

4.8 Fish and Other Aquatic Species ..... 4-17

4.8.1 Impacts on Fish and Other Aquatic Species in Alternative A..... 4-18

4.8.2 Impacts on Fish and Other Aquatic Species in Alternative B..... 4-18

4.8.3 Impacts on Fish and Other Aquatic Species in Alternative C..... 4-18

4.9 Mammals..... 4-18

4.9.1 Impacts on Mammals in Alternative A ..... 4-18

4.9.2 Impacts on Mammals in Alternative B ..... 4-18

4.9.3 Impacts on Mammals in Alternative C ..... 4-21

4.10 Reptiles and Amphibians..... 4-21

4.10.1 Impacts on Reptiles and Amphibians in Alternative A ..... 4-21

4.10.2 Impacts on Reptiles and Amphibians in Alternative B ..... 4-21

4.10.3 Impacts on Reptiles and Amphibians in Alternative C ..... 4-22

4.11 Invertebrates..... 4-22

4.11.1 Impacts on Invertebrates in Alternative A ..... 4-22

4.11.2 Impacts on Invertebrates in Alternative B ..... 4-22

4.11.3 Impacts on Invertebrates in Alternative C ..... 4-23

4.12 Socioeconomics..... 4-33

4.12.1 Impacts on Socioeconomics in Alternative A ..... 4-33

4.12.2 Impacts on Socioeconomics in Alternative B ..... 4-34

4.12.3 Impacts on Socioeconomics in Alternative C ..... 4-34

4.13 Visitor Use and Access..... 4-36

4.13.1 Impacts on Hunting and Trapping Opportunities..... 4-37

4.13.2 Impacts on Fishing Opportunities..... 4-38

4.13.3 Impacts on Environmental Education and Interpretation Opportunities..... 4-39

4.13.4 Impacts on Wildlife Observation and Photography Opportunities..... 4-40

4.13.5 Impacts on Recreational Beach Use Experience ..... 4-42

4.13.6 Impacts on Other Uses..... 4-44

4.14 Cultural and Historic Resources ..... 4-50

4.14.1 Impacts on Cultural and Historic Resources in Alternatives A, B, and C..... 4-50

4.15 Refuge Administration..... 4-51

4.15.1 Impacts on Refuge Administration in Alternative A ..... 4-52

4.15.2 Impacts on Refuge Administration in Alternative B ..... 4-52

4.15.3	Impacts on Refuge Administration in Alternative C .....	4-52
4.16	Cumulative Impacts .....	4-52
4.16.1	Resources Evaluated.....	4-52
4.16.2	Actions Included .....	4-53
4.16.3	Results of Cumulative Effects Analysis .....	4-54
4.16.4	Climate Change.....	4-57
4.17	Relationship Between Short-term Uses of the Human Environment and the Enhancement of Long-term Productivity .....	4-63
4.18	Unavoidable Adverse Effects .....	4-64
4.19	Potential Irreversible and Irrecoverable Commitments of Resources.....	4-64
4.20	Environmental Justice.....	4-65
4.20.1	Impacts on Environmental Justice in Alternative A .....	4-66
4.20.2	Impacts on Environmental Justice in Alternative B .....	4-66
4.20.3	Impacts on Environmental Justice in Alternative C .....	4-66
4.21	Environmental Consequences Comparison Matrix by Alternative (Table 4-8).....	4-67
<b>Chapter 5: Consultation and Coordination with the Public and Others .....</b>		<b>5-1</b>
5.1	Pre-Planning Meetings .....	5-1
5.2	<i>Federal Register</i> Notice of Intent .....	5-2
5.3	Public Meetings and Comments .....	5-2
5.3.1	Scoping .....	5-2
5.3.2	Preliminary Alternatives .....	5-3
5.4	Planning Team Meetings.....	5-5
5.5	Other Meetings of Note .....	5-5
5.6	Public Outreach.....	5-7
5.6.1	Newsletters.....	5-7
5.6.2	Web .....	5-8
5.6.3	Radio.....	5-9
5.6.4	Media .....	5-9
5.7	Draft CCP/EIS Public Comment Period .....	5-9
<b>Chapter 6: List of Preparers.....</b>		<b>6-1</b>
6.1	U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service .....	6-1
6.1.1	Region 5.....	6-1
6.1.2	Chincoteague and Wallops Island National Wildlife Refuge.....	6-1
6.1.3	Virginia Ecological Services Field Office .....	6-1
6.1.4	USFWS Economics Division.....	6-1
6.2	Department of Interior .....	6-1
6.2.1	Office of the Regional Solicitor, Northeast Region .....	6-1
6.3	U.S. Department of Transportation Volpe National Transportation Systems Center .....	6-1
6.4	Tennessee Valley Authority .....	6-2
6.5	Planning Team .....	6-2
6.6	Technical Experts.....	6-2
6.6.1	U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service .....	6-2
6.6.2	Other Federal Agencies .....	6-3
6.6.3	Local Government.....	6-3
6.6.4	Commonwealth of Virginia .....	6-3
6.6.5	The Nature Conservancy.....	6-3
6.6.6	Academic Institutions.....	6-3
<b>Acronyms and Glossary .....</b>		<b>AG-1</b>
<b>Literature Cited .....</b>		<b>LC-1</b>



**\*Appendix A: The Proposed Assateague Wilderness .....A-1**

**Appendix B: Other Federal Mandates and Relevant Plans and Initiatives .....B-1**

**\*Appendix C: Laws and Executive Orders Applicable to Chincoteague and Wallops Island NWR CCP..... C-1**

**\*Appendix D: Interim Chincoteague Pony Management.....D-1**

**\*Appendix E: Memorandum of Agreement: Interagency Cooperate at Assateague Island National Seashore and Chincoteague National Wildlife Refuge ..... E-1**

**\*Appendix F: Biological Opinion on Monitoring and Management Practices for Piping Plovers, Loggerhead Sea Turtle, Green Sea Turtle, Leatherback Sea Turtle, and Seabeach Amaranth..... F-1**

**\*Appendix G: Notes on Sea-level Rise and Projected Impacts on Chincoteague NWR .....G-1**

**\*Appendix H: Adapting Now to a Changing Climate: Wallops Flight Facility and the Eastern Shore .....H-1**

**Appendix I: Summary Costs of Draft Alternatives and Comparison of Beach Access Costs ..... I-1**

**Appendix J: Chincoteague National Wildlife Refuge Beachfill. Abbreviated Analysis and Cost Opinion for Maintaining the Existing Parking Areas and Recreational Beach ..... J-1**

**Appendix K: Staffing Charts for All Alternatives ..... K-1**

**Appendix L: Species Lists for Chincoteague and Wallops Island NWRs ..... L-1**

**Appendix M: Chincoteague NWR Economic Analysis in support of CCP..... M-1**

**\*Appendix N: Chincoteague NWR: Recreational Beach Structured Decision Making Process, Locating the Best Site for a Recreational Beach and Parking Lot .....N-1**

**Appendix O: Section 7 Biological Opinion for Alternative B .....O-1**

**Appendix P: Compatibility Determinations ..... P-1**

    Wildlife Observation, Wildlife Photography, and Interpretation..... P-3

    Environmental Education..... P-21

    Fishing (Recreational)..... P-31

    Big Game and Migratory Game Bird Hunting ..... P-47

    Grazing of Chincoteague Ponies ..... P-83

    Horseback Riding ..... P-95

    Research and Studies Conducted by Outside Agencies, Universities, and Organizations ..... P-105

    Shell Collection..... P-113

    Temporary/Short-term Activitives Conducted by Other Federal Government Agencies and/or their Contractors ..... P-119

    Big Game Hunting (Wallops Island NWR) ..... P-127

    Research and Studies Conducted by Outside Agencies, Universities, and Organizations(Wallops Island) ... P-137

**Appendix Q: Findings of Appropriateness .....Q-1**

*\*Not included in print copy. Available online or on CD-ROM.*