

**In The Matter Of:**  
*PUBLIC HEARING CONCERNING MEXICAN WOLVES*

---

*PUBLIC HEARING*  
*December 3, 2013*

---

*Bartelt & Kenyon*  
*111 West Monroe Street, Suite 425*  
*Phoenix, Arizona 85003*  
*Phone 602-254-4111 Fax 602-254-6567*  
*bartelt@qwestoffice.net*

Original File Mexican Wolf Hearing.txt

Min-U-Script®

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR  
FISH AND WILDLIFE SERVICE

In Re:  
The Proposed Rule, "To remove the gray wolf from the List of Endangered and Threatened Wildlife, but to maintain endangered status for the Mexican wolf by listing it as a subspecies; and to revise the Nonessential Experimental Population of the Mexican Wolf."

---

Tuesday, December 3, 2013

---

HEARING OFFICER: Lesley Travers  
OPENING REMARKS: Dr. Benjamin Tuggle  
PRESENTER: Sherry Barrett  
LOCATION: Hon-Dah Conference Center  
777 Highway 260  
Pinetop, Arizona  
TIME: 6:06 p.m.

REPORTED BY:  
Cindy Bachman

1 (Commencement of public hearing.)

2 \* \* \* \* \*

3 MS. TRAVERS: Good evening. On behalf of the  
4 United States Fish and Wildlife Service, I welcome you  
5 to this public hearing regarding two proposals: to list  
6 the Mexican wolf as an endangered subspecies in the  
7 Southwest and to delist the gray wolf in the contiguous  
8 U.S.; and to revise the Nonessential Experimental  
9 Population of the Mexican wolf.

10 My name is Lesley Travers. I will be your  
11 hearing officer today. My company is Travers  
12 Consulting, and I am not affiliated with U.S. Fish and  
13 Wildlife Service, and I don't represent them. I  
14 represent no point of view with respect to the proposal  
15 that is the subject of this hearing. My role is to  
16 conduct this hearing in an orderly manner, such that we  
17 receive your comments accurately into the record.

18 I would like to recognize the following elected  
19 officials.

20 MS. ALLEN: Sylvia Allen, Navajo County  
21 Supervisor, District 3.

22 MR. WATSON: Gary Watson, Mohave County.

23 MS. GRIFFIN: Gail Griffin, State  
24 Representative, District 14.

25 MR. SANDLER: Lewis Sandler, but I'm

1 representing Arizona Senator Burges.

2 MALE SPEAKER: Is Senator Burges here?

3 MR. SANDLER: That's all I know. I've got her  
4 statement. She emailed and said she wasn't making it.

5 MALE SPEAKER: Is Senator Burges in the room?

6 MS. ALLEN: She is here, but she was in line  
7 trying to pay her dinner ticket. She's coming.

8 MR. WELLER: Barry Weller, Supervisor,  
9 Apache County.

10 MR. CAMPBELL: Ron Campbell, Greenlee County

11 MR. NOEL: I'm Representative Mike Noel from  
12 Southern Utah. I'll represent eight rural counties in  
13 that area.

14 MR. DETRO: Jim DeTro, Okanogan County  
15 Commissioner.

16 MR. WHEELER: Terry Wheeler, Mayor of Globe.

17 MS. TRAVERS: I would also like to recognize  
18 the following representatives from the U.S. Fish and  
19 Wildlife Service who are in attendance today:

20 Dr. Benjamin Tuggle, Southwest Regional  
21 Director, who will represent the Southwest Region and  
22 the Services, Washington D.C. headquarters office; and  
23 Ms. Sherry Barrett, Mexican wolf Recovery Coordinator;  
24 and the many Fish and Wildlife Service officials from  
25 the Southwest Region and Arizona Field Offices and the

1 U.S. Forest Service that are staffing this hearing  
2 tonight.

3 Also assisting with this hearing are  
4 Cindy Bachman, our court reporter from Bartelt and  
5 Kenyon Court Reporting.

6 At this point, I'll turn the floor over to  
7 Dr. Benjamin Tuggle and Ms. Sherry Barrett. They will  
8 provide opening remarks and give a brief PowerPoint  
9 presentation that explains the proposal to list the  
10 Mexican wolf as an endangered subspecies in the  
11 Southwest and to delist the gray wolf elsewhere and on  
12 the proposal to revise the Nonessential Experimental  
13 Population of the Mexican wolf.

14 DR. TUGGLE: Good evening. My name is  
15 Benjamin Tuggle, and I'm the regional director for the  
16 U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service in the Southwest region.  
17 Our region's jurisdiction covers Arizona, New Mexico,  
18 Texas, and Oklahoma.

19 I'm here tonight, along with these Service's  
20 representatives, to hear testimony and receive comments  
21 from the proposals to revise the Nonessential  
22 Experimental Population of the Mexican wolf, to delist  
23 the gray wolf in the continuous United States, and  
24 maintain protection for the Mexican wolf by listing it  
25 as an endangered subspecies.

1           This hearing tonight is the second that we've  
2 had scheduled in the Southwest, basically, to listen to  
3 your comments on those two proposals and place them on  
4 the record.

5           Public hearings also will be scheduled in  
6 Arizona and New Mexico in early 2014 to receive  
7 comments on the draft Environmental Impact Statement  
8 that will address the potential impacts of the proposed  
9 revisions of the Nonessential Experimental Population  
10 rule.

11           It is our intent that we take comments on the  
12 final determination and results of these proposals that  
13 we are proposing. We intend for them to be accurate  
14 and effective as possible, and towards that end, we are  
15 seeking the best scientific and commercial data  
16 available.

17           We will base our final determination, in part,  
18 on the testimony received tonight, as well as the  
19 testimony from other hearings and all written comments  
20 that we receive.

21           On behalf of U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service,  
22 I want to express my appreciation to the White Mountain  
23 Apache Tribe for allowing us to use the seating room  
24 here at the Hon-Dah Conference Center. I also want to  
25 thank all of you who are in attendance tonight for

1 making your way here.

2 We've learned a lot since we first reintroduced  
3 wolves into the wild in 1998. And this knowledge has  
4 led us to propose the revisions that you're going to  
5 hear about tonight.

6 On June 13, 2013, we published a proposed  
7 rule -- proposed revision of the Nonessential  
8 Experimental Population of the Mexican wolf for the  
9 Mexican wolf Nonessential Experimental Population in  
10 Arizona and New Mexico.

11 The proposed revision includes, one,  
12 modification of the geographic boundaries established  
13 for the Mexican wolf reintroduced in the 1998 final  
14 rule.

15 Two, modifying a management regulation  
16 established in the 1998 final rule, which governs the  
17 release, translocation, natural dispersal, and the tape  
18 of Mexican wolves.

19 And, three, clarification of certain  
20 definitions and parts of that rule.

21 As we move forward with our efforts to recover  
22 Mexican wolves in Arizona and New Mexico, we will  
23 retain the Nonessential Experimental designation for  
24 the wild population of Mexican wolves that we currently  
25 have on the landscape. This will provide us with the

1 greatest management capability and flexibility that we  
2 will need to recover this species.

3 Now I would like to turn the floor over to  
4 Sherry Barrett, who is the Mexican Wolf Recovery  
5 Coordinator for the Fish and Wildlife Service, who will  
6 present a brief PowerPoint presentation on the proposed  
7 changes to the Mexican wolf Nonessential Experimental  
8 Population.

9 Thank you and welcome.

10 MS. BARRETT: Thank you and welcome to  
11 everybody. Thank you for coming tonight. I am going  
12 to give a brief presentation.

13 I had a longer presentation during our  
14 information meeting this afternoon, but I want to  
15 provide as much time as possible for those who want to  
16 speak, to be able to provide their testimony.

17 The history of the ESA protection for the gray  
18 wolf overall in the 1960s and '70s several subspecies  
19 of gray wolf were listed under the Endangered Species  
20 Act in the precursor to the Endangered Species Act,  
21 which was promulgated in 1973.

22 In 1978, those subspecies were consolidated  
23 under a single listing of the gray wolf. And in 1978,  
24 there were only a few hundred wolves that were existing  
25 in the lower 48, and those were in Northeast Minnesota,

1 Isle Royale, and in Michigan.

2 In our approach to the gray wolf recovery from  
3 that 1978 rule, we noted that we would implement a  
4 recovery program in three portions of the United  
5 States: in the Western Great Lakes, the Northern Rocky  
6 Mountains, and in the Southwest, where we have the  
7 Mexican wolf.

8 When we listed those wolves in 1978, there were  
9 only a few hundred, like I said, in Northeast  
10 Minnesota, Isle Royale, Michigan. And today, we have  
11 over 5,000 gray wolves in the lower 48.

12 The Northern Rocky Mountains area and the  
13 Western Great Lakes, these areas shown in yellow, those  
14 are now delisted. Those are no longer protected under  
15 the Endangered Species Act. And this area in Hatchee  
16 is more appropriately the range of the endangered red  
17 wolf (*Canis rufus*).

18 So the areas that we're talking about right now  
19 for delisting are those areas in blue, outside here  
20 (indicating). And then we're proposing to reclassify  
21 the Mexican wolf in the Southwest and then down into  
22 Mexico as an endangered subspecies.

23 So what are we doing right now? We're looking  
24 at how the Endangered Species Act applies to the gray  
25 wolf into the future and looking to see if there are

1 any valid, listable entities remaining that need  
2 protection of the Endangered Species Act.

3 And it's important to remember that the  
4 Endangered Species Act fails to make the distinction of  
5 species. The criteria for listing under the Endangered  
6 Species Act is that it has to be a valid subspecies,  
7 species, or a distinct population segment. It has to  
8 be endangered extinction throughout all or a  
9 significant portion of its range, and it's also likely  
10 to become endangered in the foreseeable future  
11 throughout a significant portion of its range.

12 So our proposal, based on an extensive analysis  
13 of that -- and you can find that analysis in the  
14 proposed rule on the website -- is to focus our ESA  
15 protection for the Mexican wolf by listing that as a  
16 subspecies, *Canis lupus baileyi*, as endangered wherever  
17 found; remove the current gray wolf listing from the  
18 rest of the United States; and then improve the  
19 Experimental Population rule for the Mexican wolf so  
20 that we can achieve recovery of that and get towards  
21 the delist in process in the future.

22 So our purpose for the revisions to the 1998  
23 Mexican Wolf Experimental Rule are to enable the  
24 establishment of a viable, self-sustaining population  
25 that will ultimately contribute to the recovery of the

1 subspecies.

2           There are several geographic changes that I'm  
3 not going to go through. I went through those in the  
4 earlier session. You can find those online.

5           There are also management changes that we are  
6 looking at and also administration clarifications that  
7 we've become aware of over 15 years since we had that  
8 experimental population rule in place.

9           So at today's hearing, we have a proposed  
10 listing of the Mexican wolf as an endangered  
11 subspecies; removing the Endangered Species Act  
12 protection for the rest of the gray wolf species;  
13 proposed revisions to the Mexican Wolf Experimental  
14 Population; and we're here to receive both your oral  
15 and written testimony. It's important to note that  
16 both the oral and the written testimony have the same  
17 weight.

18           And I'm going to turn the hearing back over to  
19 the hearing officer. Thank you.

20           MS. TRAVERS: Thank you, Benjamin and Sherry.

21           This is a public hearing under Section 4 of the  
22 Federal Endangered Species Act. Notice of this public  
23 hearing was published in the Federal Register on  
24 October 28, 2013, starting on page 64192.

25           The U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service will accept

1 comments and information on these proposals postmarked  
2 on or before December 17, 2013.

3           You may submit comments in writing to us today.  
4 Written comments may be submitted to the staff at the  
5 registration and information tables. They may be  
6 submitted electronically or mailed as a hard copy.

7           After review and consideration of your comments  
8 and all other information gathered during this and  
9 other previous comment periods, the Service will make a  
10 final determination.

11           The purpose of this hearing is to receive your  
12 comments on this proposal, both oral and written.  
13 Comments on all aspects of the proposal are very  
14 important and will be carefully considered.

15           Because of the importance of your comments, it  
16 is necessary that we follow certain procedures during  
17 this public hearing. If you want to present oral  
18 comments at this hearing, please go to the registration  
19 table outside of this auditorium and sign up. When you  
20 register, indicate any organization that you are  
21 representing in your comments today.

22           With the exception of elected officials, all  
23 oral comment registration cards have been pooled and  
24 will be drawn at random. This process was implemented  
25 to encourage attendance at this afternoon's information

1 meeting and to provide for a fair process that allows  
2 us to receive oral testimony from as many different  
3 perspectives as possible within the allotted time  
4 frame.

5           The following process is designed to maximize  
6 efficiency and provide speaking opportunities to as  
7 many participants as possible. Periodically throughout  
8 this hearing, I will call groups of names for those  
9 registered to provide oral comments.

10           When your name is called, please come forward  
11 and take a seat in the reserve section at the front of  
12 the auditorium near the microphone. When it is your  
13 turn, please begin your presentation by stating your  
14 full name, spell it for the record, and indicate if you  
15 represent an organization.

16           If you are reading your comments, please take  
17 care to read them slowly enough for the court reporter  
18 to understand. Also, if possible, the reporter would  
19 appreciate a copy of the comments you read, and you can  
20 deposit them in the box near the microphone. Please  
21 return to your original seats in the auditorium after  
22 you speak.

23           This is an informal hearing, and, therefore,  
24 you will not be questioned in connection with your  
25 comments. Your comments or questions are being

1 recorded by the reporter to preserve them for the  
2 record.

3 If you are called to speak and choose not to  
4 speak or provide short comments, you may not yield your  
5 time to another speaker. Because the purpose of this  
6 hearing is to receive your comments, the Service will  
7 presume any questions are for the record.

8 The Service's formal response to questions and  
9 issues raised during the comment period, including at  
10 this hearing, will be published in the final rule.  
11 The Service will not respond to questions at this  
12 hearing.

13 Please keep in mind that the reporter will not  
14 record any statements from the audience or any  
15 statements which are made to the audience. Comments  
16 must be made directly into the microphone, facing the  
17 front of the room.

18 I ask that you treat each speaker with respect  
19 and refrain from making comments from the audience.  
20 Questions, comments, applause, jeers, or demonstrations  
21 from the audience will not be allowed. I appreciate  
22 everyone's cooperation in minimizing distractions.

23 Out of respect for the speakers, I ask that you  
24 please refrain from photographing individuals as they  
25 present their comments. Videotaping should be done

1 only along the side aisles, no closer to the front than  
2 row 4, or along the back of the room.

3 In the interest of all who chose to provide  
4 verbal testimony and to prevent unreasonable disruption  
5 during this public hearing, we would like to inform you  
6 that Ryan Benson, representing BigGame Forever, and  
7 Patrick McDowell from Shake, Rattle, & Troll will be  
8 videotaping today's proceedings. If you wish to obtain  
9 contact information for these people, please visit the  
10 registration desk.

11 We also have another videographer,  
12 Maureen Hackett, Howling for Wolves.

13 Those that identified themselves as elected  
14 officials and State Game and Fish Agency Directors on  
15 the registration cards will be our first speakers and  
16 will be given two minutes each.

17 Members of the public will follow with  
18 two-minute slots for the remainder of the hour.  
19 Because of the number of people expected to speak,  
20 strict adherence to time limits is necessary by all  
21 speakers. I will let you know when your time is up.

22 I will call five-minute breaks after each hour  
23 to allow the court reporter to rest, or as we deem  
24 necessary.

25 I will now call the first group of names, which

1 are the elected officials and the Game and Fish Agency  
2 Directors.

3 James Uqualla, Gregory Sheehan, Larry Voyles,  
4 Jim DeTro, Senator Judy Burges, Barry Weller,  
5 Ron Campbell, Supervisor Sylvia Allen, Navajo County,  
6 Kimberlee Mulhern, Dale Shankee, Sandy Bahr,  
7 Terry Wheeler, Gail Griffin, Michael Noel, and  
8 Gary Ross.

9 Anyone of you can --

10 MR. SHEEHAN: I'm first up, so let me know if I  
11 did this wrong.

12 My name is Gregory Sheehan. It's spelled --  
13 do you need the last name spelled and the first?

14 MS. TRAVERS: Just last.

15 MR. SHEEHAN: Sheehan, S-h-e-e-h-a-n. I'm the  
16 director of the Utah Division of Wildlife Resources.

17 Our comments today, the State of Utah supports  
18 the delisting of the gray wolf (*Canis lupus*) in the  
19 contiguous United States. Once wolves are delisted  
20 throughout Utah, its wolf management plan will fully  
21 take effect and the species will be managed by the  
22 state, as it has managed other large predators, such as  
23 the cougar and bear.

24 We agree that the gray wolf and its constituent  
25 subspecies, excluding the Mexican wolf, are not in

1 danger of extinction throughout all, or a significant  
2 portion, of their respective ranges and are not likely  
3 to become so in the foreseeable future.

4 The Mexican wolf subspecies listing is,  
5 however, procedurally flawed because the Service has  
6 failed to articulate the reasons or involve the public  
7 in its decision to abandon the DPS listing. The choice  
8 to list it as a subspecies as opposed to a DPS is a  
9 discretionary act subject to NEPA review.

10 The proposed endangered subspecies listing  
11 protects the wolf anywhere found in the United States.  
12 This prevents states outside of the Mexican wolf's  
13 historic range and the federal government from managing  
14 or controlling dispersing wolves.

15 Mexican wolves that disperse into Utah and  
16 Colorado will interbreed with northern wolf subspecies,  
17 and their progeny will not contribute to Mexican wolf  
18 recovery. Dispersal and inbreeding degradation of these  
19 hybridized wolves to core Mexican wolf populations in  
20 Arizona and New Mexico will swamp the unique, genetic  
21 features of the subspecies and jeopardize its recovery.

22 Additionally, the proposed 10(j) area should be  
23 extended south to include all Mexican wolf habitat  
24 within Mexico. By including Mexico in the experimental  
25 population, all Mexican wolves found outside the 10(j)

1 area will presumptively originate from the experimental  
2 population.

3 This presumption will eliminate the inherent  
4 uncertainty and debate in classifying the origin of the  
5 Mexican wolf, the purposes of capture and return.

6 Additionally, we, as the State of Utah, take  
7 the position that the Mexican wolf never historically  
8 inhabited Utah or Colorado and should not be introduced  
9 there at any future time as the expansion occurs.

10 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

11 Next speaker, please.

12 MR. UQUALLA: My name is James Uqalla. I am a  
13 member of the Havasupai Tribe from northern Arizona,  
14 in the Grand Canyon. I am also representing the  
15 essence of the ceremonial list and traditional people  
16 within the indigenous tribes throughout the Southwest.

17 Part of our responsibilities within our  
18 journeys is to be able to respect and honor all those  
19 that are a part of the living within creation. The  
20 four-leggeds are considered to be a very powerful part  
21 of the whole.

22 It is also important for you, and all those  
23 that are listening, to remember that the teachings  
24 within the indigenous lands was that we are a part of  
25 their land. We have been given the privilege to be on

1 the areas that they are now inhabiting.

2 But as a result, our stories from time  
3 beginning says that we are also in close relationships  
4 and we tell of stories where we, as the two-leggeds,  
5 also were shape shifters into many of the four-leggeds,  
6 winglets, and all that is of the living.

7 It is important for us to be able to be in  
8 responsibility of all that is a creation within  
9 Turtle Island. And when situations of this sort arises  
10 and it brings endangerment to our brothers, our  
11 sisters, the four-leggeds, it is important for the  
12 medicine groupies to be able to make voice and say that  
13 this is a part of responsibility for all that is  
14 inhabiting Turtle Island, which is the United States,  
15 and to be able to give us and all that is taught in  
16 these times to be able to work harmoniously.

17 There are tribal and spiritual laws that do  
18 govern the well-being of the --

19 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

20 MR. UQUALLA: -- indigenous people.

21 Thank you.

22 MS. TRAVERS: Next speaker, please.

23 MR. DETRO: For the record, I'm Jim, J-i-m,  
24 DeTro, D-e-T-r-o, Commissioner from Okanogan County in  
25 the state of Washington.

1           When I was first elected and engaged in the  
2 wolf war in the west, we challenged the ESA on the  
3 basis of the verbiage that stated, to reintroduce the  
4 species, it had to be an indigenous species to the  
5 area.

6           Our wolf was an 85-pound American gray wolf.  
7 That wolf -- or the wolf that was shoved down our  
8 throats was a 185-pound Mexican Mackenzie Valley Arctic  
9 gray wolf. Our objection was met with the rhetoric;  
10 a Wolf is a Wolf is a Wolf is a Wolf.

11           On that note, I challenge you to be consistent.  
12 You cannot now break out a subspecies, the Mexican gray  
13 wolf, and give them special protection. A wolf is a  
14 wolf is a wolf.

15           With that, I'll remind you of the spotted owl.  
16 30 years after the listing of the spotted owl on to the  
17 destruction of a multibillion-dollar timber industry.  
18 Destroyed custom, culture, and economic stability of  
19 communities, families, small businesses, and caused  
20 bankruptcies and divorces. All in the name of an owl.

21           Now we see the junk science that led to the  
22 listing has come home to roost. No pun intended.

23           30 years later, the spotted owl was still in  
24 decline by 40 percent. Now the so-called experts say  
25 that the fault is in the barn owl. And yet not one

1 agency, not one tree hugger, not one dingy bird watcher  
2 has come forward to say we were wrong.

3 Not in my county, the largest in the state,  
4 ninth largest in the nation. My county is bordered on  
5 the north by Canada, bisected by Highway 97, and the  
6 Colville Indian reservation occupies the southeastern  
7 corner of the county.

8 So if a wolf crosses the line, recognized only  
9 by man at the B.C., where there are 10,000 wolves,  
10 there's a \$350 bounty on him.

11 Come back across the line to Highway 97, on one  
12 side, he's delisted, and on the other side, he's  
13 listed.

14 Colville Indian reservation that occupies the  
15 southern eastern corner of Okanogan County, there are  
16 nine kill permits. Wolves migrate --

17 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you, sir.

18 Next speaker, please.

19 MS. ALLEN: Good evening. Thank you very much  
20 for holding this hearing. I'm Sylvia Allen, A-l-l-e-n,  
21 Navajo County Supervisor.

22 Recently, Supreme Court Justice Roberts said  
23 this quote, "The federal government has expanded  
24 dramatically over the past two centuries, but it still  
25 must show that a constitutional brand of power

1 authorizes each of its actions."

2 This saying does not apply to the states  
3 because the Constitution is not the source of their  
4 power. State governments do not meet the  
5 Constitutional Authorization Act. Our cases refer to  
6 this general power of governing -- possessed by the  
7 states, but not by the federal government -- as the  
8 police powers.

9 The framework does ensure that powers, which in  
10 the ordinary course of affairs concern the lives and  
11 liberties and properties of the people, were held by  
12 governments more local and more accountable than a  
13 distant federal bureaucracy.

14 So I feel this responsibility as an elected  
15 official to protect the health, safety, and welfare of  
16 my citizens.

17 The 10(j) rule governing the management of  
18 Mexican wolves in Arizona and New Mexico should  
19 recognize this constitutional police powers of the  
20 states to protect the health, wealthfare, and safety of  
21 its citizens.

22 And I appreciate the language right now that's  
23 in the proposed 10(j) rule. It just needs to be  
24 stronger, I feel. Specific language allowing citizens,  
25 landowners, permittees, or County law enforcement to

1 take or injure a wolf if the wolf is engaged in  
2 killing, moving, body chasing, stalking, threatening,  
3 or harassing humans, pets, livestock on private land,  
4 their livestock on public lands or reservation lands.  
5 Wolves showing signs of fearless behavior are becoming  
6 desensitized to human encounters and must be removed  
7 permanently.

8 I feel that when people realize that they have  
9 these rights to protect themselves and their property,  
10 that a lot of this contention of having the wolves out  
11 there will leave.

12 Now, also Navajo County feel strongly that the  
13 10(j) rule must disclose full social, culture, and  
14 economic costs and impacts on local residents and local  
15 governments. Potentially, in the past, include the  
16 loss of tax revenue, the increased costs due to the  
17 presence of introduced wolves.

18 Navajo County recently --

19 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

20 MS. ALLEN: Thank you very much.

21 MS. TRAVERS: Next speaker, please.

22 MS. MULHERN: Good evening. My name is  
23 Kimberlee, K-i-m-b-e-r-l-e-e, Mulhern, M-u-l-h-e-r-n.  
24 I'm a consultant to Cochise County, Arizona, and I've  
25 come to this public hearing to read into the record a

1 statement regarding the gray wolf proposed rule on  
2 behalf of Cochise County, Arizona.

3 Cochise County strongly supports the proposed  
4 rule to remove the gray wolf from the list of  
5 endangered and threatened species. In addition,  
6 Cochise County supports the delisting of all wolves,  
7 including all subspecies, distinct population segments,  
8 and other taxonomic or regulatory definitions.

9 We support State Game & Fish Department  
10 management of the Mexican wolf.

11 The County has strong opposition for obtaining  
12 protection for the Mexican wolf by listing it as an  
13 endangered into the proposed revisions to the  
14 Nonessential Experimental Population of the Mexican  
15 wolf.

16 Due to its location along the U.S./Mexico  
17 border, Cochise County is uniquely affected by the  
18 proposed revision of the Nonessential Experimental  
19 Population of the Mexican wolf because of the proximity  
20 to wolves being introduced in Mexico and would be  
21 affected by efforts in the nearby Blue Range as well.

22 The proposed revision threatens our rule of  
23 customs, culture, and the continued decline of our  
24 native wildlife in southern Arizona.

25 Elk are not present in Cochise County. The

1 number of deer, especially mule deer, has been  
2 decreasing in recent years. In addition, Longhorn  
3 antelope herd populations are fragile. Other predators  
4 are moving into urban areas of the county in search of  
5 food. Cochise County does not have the prey base to  
6 support another predator such as the Mexican wolf.

7 The U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service needs to  
8 return to the base of the premises of the Endangered  
9 Species Act, including the use of the best available  
10 commercial and scientific information.

11 Although the public may mean well, many  
12 comments of proponents of the wolves are based on  
13 emotion. It is the job of the U.S. Fish and Wildlife  
14 Service to use the best available science and not  
15 emotion.

16 Thank you for the opportunity to comment.

17 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

18 Next speaker, please.

19 MR. WATSON: Thank you very much. My name is  
20 Gary Watson, supervisor from Mohave County.

21 In August of 2013, I attended the meeting in  
22 Albuquerque, New Mexico, and asked this question:  
23 From a genetic standpoint, what is the estimated number  
24 of Mexican wolves required for a viable, permanent,  
25 sustainable population?

1           And since then, I have no answer for that.  
2   After talking to several veterinarians and several  
3   people at Northern Arizona University in genetics, that  
4   number will have to be in the range at a minimum of  
5   2,100 to 2,500 wolves in order for them to be  
6   sustainable.

7           That is also depending on the dispersal area.  
8   It also depends on the prey population and movement.

9           Ladies and gentlemen, there are 36,000 prey.  
10   There's elk, deer, and antelope being removed from our  
11   prey base each and every year. Thank you very much.

12           MS. TRAVERS: Thank you. Could you please  
13   spell your last name for the record?

14           MR. WATSON: Watson, W-a-t-s-o-n.

15           MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

16           SENATOR GRIFFIN: Thank you. My name is  
17   Gail Griffin. I'm a state senator representing  
18   southwestern Arizona, District 14, which includes a  
19   large portion of the area that is subject to the new  
20   wolf release under the U.S. Fish and Wildlife's  
21   proposed rule.

22           Hundreds of people have contacted me in  
23   opposition to the new proposed rule. It is with great  
24   alarm that I stand here tonight to express my  
25   opposition to the U.S. Fish and Wildlife proposal to

1 dramatically expand the Mexican wolf recovery program.

2 In October, I held a public meeting in Greenlee  
3 County and did what no U.S. Fish and Wildlife employee  
4 has done for years, I talked to the people in Greenlee  
5 County. My seatmates and I sat for three hours as  
6 dozens of Greenlee County residents testified about the  
7 close encounters they've had with the Mexican wolves,  
8 about how they've lost cattle to the Mexican wolves,  
9 and how they have lost money and countless hours of  
10 time, not to mention mental and the emotional anguish,  
11 to these Mexican wolves.

12 It's easy for you sitting in Albuquerque or  
13 Washington, D.C., to look at a map and see northern  
14 Greenlee County as an open and wild country where  
15 wolves can roam freely.

16 But there's something Fish and Wildlife is  
17 choosing to ignore. There are people there. There are  
18 families there. And, yes, there are children there.  
19 All of whom are being put at risk for federal  
20 government's release of wild predatory animals whose  
21 instinct is to kill.

22 From the beginning, U.S. Fish and Wildlife's  
23 wolf recovery system has been fundamentally flawed, as  
24 it relied on faulty science, inadequate communication  
25 and coordination with the affected stakeholders, and

1 the misguided premise that puts its interest of  
2 dangerous predators ahead of public interests, as well  
3 as the public safety.

4 It's difficult to understand why the U.S. Fish  
5 and Wildlife is considering an expansion of the Mexican  
6 wolf when it is clear that it's formed on faulty data  
7 from the beginning.

8 We urge the Service to withdraw the proposed  
9 rule and follow the rules and regulations. 10(j)  
10 regulation requires the Service to work with the state,  
11 tribal officers, and --

12 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

13 Next speaker, please.

14 MS. GRIFFIN: -- others. Thank you.

15 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

16 SENATOR BURGES: Good evening. Senator Judy  
17 Burges, District 22, J-u-d-y, B-u-r-g-e-s.

18 I'm here before you to express my concern for  
19 reintroduction and expanding the territory of the  
20 Mexican gray wolf into counties in Arizona.

21 While the reintroduction of a predator species  
22 may be an exciting endeavor, there are intricate risks  
23 to citizens, pets, livestock, ranching business, and  
24 the wildlife, in general. Furthermore, the gray wolf  
25 is known to carry a disease known as zoonotic.

1 Colorado State University has accomplished  
2 multiple lab tests on the wolf and discovered an  
3 infection with a dangerous tapeworm. And these worms  
4 are carrying hydatid cyst disease, which is transferred  
5 to elk and other wildlife by wolf feces. Wolves in  
6 Idaho are also showing this disease.

7 Why should the good citizens of Arizona find  
8 themselves in the same serious predicament, which could  
9 cost millions of dollars in lost wildlife and domestic  
10 livestock, as well as a danger to humans? And then add  
11 the tremendous adverse behavior modifications. Surely,  
12 each of you has a moral compass that won't allow such a  
13 travesty to occur.

14 Arguments have been distributed as to the wolf  
15 and how these predators are benign. But an evaluation  
16 written by Pylorus Eist brings to light another side to  
17 this kind of predator, that wolves are smart enough to  
18 test potential prey, to find weakness, and exploit it.

19 The heinous and hated realm used to describe  
20 wolves are little ways for wolves to (inaudible) of  
21 opportunity, including citizens.

22 Retired investigation wildlife biologist,  
23 Jim Pierce, researched this behavior and exposed the  
24 lie. Wildlife biologists exposed the extortions of  
25 evidence to exonerate the wolves, reserve a larger aim

1 of the fantasies about the gray wolf to remain on the  
2 endangered species list.

3 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you, Senator Burges.

4 Next speaker, please.

5 MR. WELLER: Thank you. My name is Barry,  
6 B-a-r-r-y, Weller, W-e-l-l-e-r. I am the District 3  
7 supervisor for Apache County, Arizona. I also have  
8 been given the permission to speak for Bucky,  
9 B-u-c-k-y, Allred, A-l-l-r-e-d, who is the county  
10 commissioner in Catron County, New Mexico.

11 Director Tuggle, Ms. Barrett, I draw your  
12 attention to the fact that Apache County and -- Catron  
13 County, New Mexico, and Apache County, Arizona are the  
14 two most severely impacted counties of the Mexican gray  
15 wolf. I'd like you to listen in that light.

16 All of the introductions have been done pretty  
17 much in Greenlee County, but in your own published maps  
18 by the IFT, Interagency Field Team, shows that all  
19 those bins are now parked in Apache County and  
20 Catron County. So the impact is in our counties. And  
21 I'm asking you to listen in that light.

22 Before I go into minimal detail of that, I'd  
23 like to draw your attention to a letter, November 13,  
24 2013, written to the Honorable Dan Nash, Director of  
25 U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, from over 70

1 Congressional members of the United States Congress,  
2 signed by them.

3 And I'd like to suggest that you take that as  
4 my general comment to say that Apache County fully  
5 supports the delisting of the gray wolf. And there's  
6 much detail to that, and we agree with all the facts  
7 and issues that are associated are in there, so I don't  
8 have to go into those details.

9 This same document suggests that you do not  
10 continue with the process of the Mexican wolf until the  
11 process is better understood.

12 They did not go into great detail, but I will  
13 bring to the issue I attended the earlier meeting, and  
14 there was, obviously, great controversy and  
15 polarization of this issue. And some of that comes  
16 about to questionable genetics, questionable population  
17 target shortfall, questionable litigation limitations,  
18 questionable conversations --

19 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you, sir.

20 Next speaker.

21 MR. CAMPBELL: Good evening. My name is  
22 Ron Campbell, C-a-m-p-b-e-l-l, Greenlee County  
23 supervisor representing District 2, which is home to  
24 the Blue Range wolf recovery area.

25 We want to thank you for scheduling this

1 hearing, which provides a forum for the local residents  
2 that are heavily impacted by the program and the  
3 proposals to express their views.

4 Greenlee County has been on the forefront of  
5 the reintroduction program for the last three decades.  
6 At times, we have been the only county at the table,  
7 and we have stayed active as a member of IMAC, OMAF,  
8 and the MMT, to make sure our residents -- our ranching  
9 community, in particular -- have a voice.

10 This hearing is conducted so the U.S. Fish and  
11 Wildlife gains comment on their proposals to delist the  
12 gray wolf. It maintains the protections for the  
13 Mexican gray wolf as well, as revisions to the  
14 Nonessential Experimental Population rule for the  
15 Mexican gray wolf.

16 However, the time frame set by the Service has  
17 been expedited to the point of making it almost  
18 impossible for anyone to be able to gather all the  
19 information so that they can make informed comments.

20 Along with that, important documents that would  
21 be beneficial have not been made public, such as the  
22 draft recovery plan or a draft Mexican wolf management  
23 plan. Without these documents, it severely limits the  
24 ability to evaluate the proposals.

25 The approach taken has forced counties,

1 agencies, tribes, and the public into unacceptably  
2 brief comment periods on such critical issues.

3 We also do not believe that the Service has  
4 fully evaluated or disclosed all reasonable listing  
5 alternatives to the proposed actions. Until such time,  
6 we feel the Service should administratively relist the  
7 Mexican gray as experimental to maintain the  
8 protection, as they have the authority to do so.

9 The relist should also state that the wild wolf  
10 occurring in Arizona and New Mexico, outside the  
11 current Nonessential Experimental Population area,  
12 should be considered an unlisted gray wolf.

13 We also believe that the United States Fish and  
14 Wildlife has not adhered to NEPA regulations in their  
15 own policies regarding NEPA compliance and forwarding  
16 this proposal to revise the 1998 final rule.

17 We request that the rule be retained without  
18 substantial ramifications --

19 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you, sir.

20 MR. CAMPBELL: Thank you.

21 MS. TRAVERS: Next speaker, please.

22 MS. BAHR: My name is Sandy Bahr, S-a-n-d-y,  
23 B-a-h-r. And I have a letter to read from  
24 Representative Chad Campbell. He's the Minority Leader  
25 for the Arizona House of Representatives, representing

1 Legislative District 24.

2 (Reading) "Thank you for the opportunity to  
3 provide comments on the important issue of true  
4 recovery of the Mexican gray wolf in the Southwest.

5 "It is unfortunate that despite the mandates of  
6 the Endangered Species Act, recommendations from  
7 scientists, and strong support from the public, the  
8 U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service continues to manage  
9 Mexican gray wolves to the detriment of their recovery.  
10 That must stop, and true recovery of this endangered  
11 animal must begin.

12 "The Mexican gray wolf is the most genetically  
13 unique and most imperiled subspecies of gray wolf in  
14 North America, with only three breeding pairs and 75  
15 total wolves in the wild this year.

16 "Mexican wolves are endangered by inbreeding,  
17 which affects their reproduction, as well as by  
18 government shooting and trapping and by the restrictive  
19 boundaries established currently.

20 "While I have significant concerns about many  
21 of the proposals from U.S. Fish and Wildlife relative  
22 to the Mexican gray wolves, I do support the changes in  
23 the proposed rule that would expand the area where  
24 wolves can roam and allow wolves to be released  
25 directly into the Gila National Forest of New Mexico

1 and to bring more diverse genes into the population.

2 "I cannot support the other proposals which  
3 will hinder the recovery of this highly endangered  
4 animal, however.

5 "Mexican gray wolves need strong protections  
6 that the Endangered Species Act provides, so the  
7 designation of Experimental Nonessential should be  
8 removed. With so few wolves in the wild with such a  
9 strong need to maintain and foster genetic diversity in  
10 these wolves, they are absolutely essential.

11 "Also establishing additional wolf boundaries  
12 is also inappropriate.

13 "As a native Arizonan and someone who has  
14 served our state as an elected official and as someone  
15 who has spent time enjoying the lands where you can now  
16 hear the howling, see the paw print, or on a lucky day,  
17 catch a glimpse of a wolf, I urge the U.S. Fish and  
18 Wildlife Service to step up and take full  
19 responsibility --

20 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

21 MS. BAHR: -- to do everything to --"

22 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you. Thank you.

23 Next speaker, please.

24 MR. VOYLES: I'm Larry Voyles. I'm the  
25 director of the Arizona Game and Fish Department.

1 My last name is spelled V-, as in Victor, -o-y-l-e-s.

2 First, we will be providing in-depth written  
3 comment, so these will be abbreviated comments right  
4 now.

5 First of all, I'd like to thank the Fish and  
6 Wildlife Service for holding this hearing here in the  
7 Mexican wolf recovery area. Our department and  
8 commission were deeply troubled by the initial  
9 announcement of the public hearings in Washington D.C.,  
10 Albuquerque, and Sacramento, California, but no week  
11 was here.

12 We were among the first to request those  
13 meetings. And I really sincerely want to thank  
14 Dr. Tuggle and Sherry Barrett for your role in ensuring  
15 that we have hearings within the Mexican wolf recovery  
16 area for the people that will be most affected by the  
17 Mexican wolf recovery.

18 The Mexican wolves that exist in the wild  
19 today, in total, every one of them, exists in the wild  
20 because of a 10(j) rule that was, in fact, the result  
21 of a long negotiated effort and agreement between the  
22 U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service and the affected states  
23 and stakeholders, setting forth the rules by which you  
24 could balance the needs of the Mexican wolf recovery  
25 with those of the people that live on the landscape and

1 the other natural resources that are affected.

2 75 wolves on the landscape now. 50 percent  
3 increase in the last three years. Virtually all of  
4 which are a wild form of wolves. That's far from being  
5 a failure. In fact, it's on the road to success.

6 And that's solely due to the use of the 10(j)  
7 rule as a mechanism to gain those kinds of public  
8 support. Those of us who sat through the meeting  
9 earlier, the information session, this is the question  
10 from all sides of the aisle. We're very much aware --  
11 painfully aware, if you will, of the --

12 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you, sir.

13 Next speaker, please.

14 MR. VOYLES: Thank you.

15 MS. TRAVERS: Next speaker.

16 MR. WHEELER: Good evening. Can you hear me?

17 MS. TRAVERS: Yes.

18 MR. WHEELER: Good evening. My name is  
19 Terry Wheeler, T-e-r-r-y, W-h-e-e-l-e-r. I'm currently  
20 the mayor of Globe.

21 We want to comment on the delisting of the gray  
22 wolf, which we agree is appropriate. Both the gray  
23 wolf and the Mexican wolf must be delisted as a T&E  
24 Species and put under the management of the appropriate  
25 State Game and Fish Agencies.

1           Globe is a city in east central Arizona, the  
2 county seat of Gila County. We are a unique little  
3 city, founded in the 1870s, mining and ranching, which  
4 is very important to our economic base today.

5           Business diversification, outdoor recreation,  
6 tourism, higher education opportunities are some of the  
7 additions to our economic structure that are allowing  
8 us to move forward.

9           The expansion of the Mexican wolf population is  
10 in Gila County -- and that's Tonto Basin -- will put  
11 all of Gila County, including Globe, at full wolf  
12 expansion. Wolf expansion will exacerbate livestock  
13 and wildlife deprivation, as well as add harm to the  
14 health and welfare of our citizens. It will destroy  
15 our outdoor recreation and tourism programs that are  
16 essential to our economic base and future development.

17           The sad truth is that the wolves are already  
18 here. I ranch north of Globe, and we have seen and  
19 followed their tracks while riding on the ranch.

20           Recently, a wolf was seen in Payson.

21           Wolves released in Gila County will be in  
22 Scottsdale in the real near future, munching down on  
23 pink Pomeranians, pampered polo horses, or kids chasing  
24 soccer balls.

25           If you think it can't happen, talk to the

1 residents of Reserve, New Mexico. Reserve was a  
2 bustling, vibrant community until the endangered  
3 species put them out of business, the spotted owl and  
4 then the wolf. If you don't think it can happen to  
5 them, it will happen to the rest of us just as well.

6 So please for the sake of our people, our  
7 families, our towns, our resources --

8 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you, sir.

9 MR. WHEELER: -- do not release any more  
10 wolves.

11 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you, sir. Thank you very  
12 much.

13 Next speaker, please.

14 Do we have no more elected officials?

15 MR. NOEL: Thank you. My name is Mike Noel,  
16 N-o-e-l, just like Christmas. Merry Christmas to  
17 everybody.

18 I'm from southern Utah. I represent rural  
19 District 73, which contains eight rural counties. It's  
20 the largest rural district in the state of Utah. I'm  
21 here today because I'm worried about the people in this  
22 area down here and the fact that maybe these wolves  
23 might end up in my district.

24 In my district, we've had many, many species  
25 listed: the Mexican spotted owl, the Kanab ambersnail,

1 redfin minnow, the goshawk, the Welsh's milkweed, Utah  
2 prairie dog, the Gunnison Sage-grouse, and the Coral  
3 Pink Sand Dune tiger beetle, which is going to shut  
4 down one of our best parks, down near the Sand Dune  
5 State Park.

6 Let me just tell you this, and this is for  
7 Dr. Tuggle. I appreciate you being here today. You  
8 had these hearings in Albuquerque, and you had them in  
9 Colorado, in Denver, and you had them in Sacramento and  
10 Washington, D.C. But this is where the impact will be,  
11 right here in this area.

12 You've already impacted citizens in southern  
13 Utah. You've already impacted them in Arizona.  
14 I'm here to tell you it cost thousands of jobs. People  
15 are upset. People are angry.

16 I'm a cattleman. These animals will go out,  
17 and they will kill cattle. You've already seen it.  
18 We had a gentleman here that lost thousands and  
19 thousands of dollars. At a thousand bucks a head for a  
20 calf, how much could we pay for it?

21 You have got a population now in my district  
22 that are very angry with what's going on. They're  
23 angry at the federal government. They're angry at the  
24 Fish and Wildlife Service. Because we want to state --  
25 we want the people of our state to manage the resources

1 in our state and not someone in D.C. and not someone in  
2 another state.

3 We want it done here right in our area.  
4 That's what has to happen.

5 (Audience applause.)

6 MS. TRAVERS: Okay. We would ask that you not  
7 applause or cheer. Please respect everyone and their  
8 comments, please. The longer you clap and shout and  
9 sing, the shorter amount of time they'll have to  
10 testify. So it's up to you.

11 MS. MARTIN: My name is Tomi Martin. I'm a  
12 Gila County Board of Supervisor from Payson. I want to  
13 thank you very much for bringing this hearing to us.  
14 It's important to me that you did that, and I very much  
15 appreciate it.

16 My position isn't, are we going to have a wolf  
17 or not; it is how are we going to have this wolf? And  
18 I would like to weigh in on the impinging rule; we need  
19 it strengthened.

20 I'd like to see us, in fact, instead of having  
21 the corridor between I-40 and I-10, have it border to  
22 border. It makes no sense to me for a wolf to go  
23 across I-40, and then suddenly, it's an entirely  
24 different situation than it was on the other side of  
25 the road.

1           And I would like to see us be able to manage  
2 that critter, his life, if we don't have a 10(j) rule,  
3 whether or not its removed, relocated, or be able to  
4 kill it. There are times that that's going to be  
5 necessary, I think.

6           I do not want to see them released in Gila  
7 County. I don't want to see them released in Tonto  
8 Forest. I think they need to continue to be released  
9 where they are. And by the time they get to us,  
10 they're more of a wolf than a dog, and I think that's  
11 important too.

12           I'll have people say we have lots of wilderness  
13 areas throughout Arizona. We have some postage stamped  
14 wilderness areas that, again, if you can walk across in  
15 a day, a wolf certainly could.

16           We had a lot of vacant land, but we're not  
17 confident like the Frank Church-River of No Return  
18 Wilderness. And that needs to be taken into  
19 consideration, as to where we release them and how they  
20 react and adapt when they get there.

21           And that's all I have. Thank you very much.

22           MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

23           We've received all of the elected comments.

24           Now we will go with oral comment registration cards  
25 that have been pooled and drawn at random, if Trevor

1 would hand me the box.

2 I'm going to grab a handful. We're going to  
3 start with these. I'm going to call about ten names,  
4 bear with me. So please listen carefully.

5 Karen Michael, Dasi Bhaktivedanta, James  
6 Goughnour, Edwina Vogan, Leland Hogan, Danny Giovale,  
7 Dave Freiss, Leslie Johnson, Carey Dobson.

8 If you people would please step forward and  
9 begin testimony in any particular order.

10 MR. HOGAN: My name is Leland Hogan,  
11 L-e-l-a-n-d, H-o-g-a-n. I'm president of the Utah Farm  
12 Bureau Federation, and our organization has 29,000  
13 members in Utah. And I also represent policy from the  
14 America Farm Bureau Federation that has 6 million  
15 members across the United States.

16 Agriculture and food contributes more than  
17 17 billion to the Utah economy, more than 14 percent of  
18 the state's GDP. Agriculture is the foundation for  
19 80,000 jobs and 2.7 billion in wages.

20 More than 70 percent of Utah's farm-based sales  
21 come from the livestock sector, with cattle and calves  
22 being the largest contributor.

23 Cattle and sheep operators are the major  
24 contributors to Utah's rural economy and community tax  
25 structure. Disruption of the normal behavior of

1 livestock by wolves has the impact not only by loss of  
2 life, but it also affects weight gain and reproduction.

3 The Utah Farm Bureau and the American Farm  
4 Bureau support the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service's  
5 proposal to remove the gray wolf from the list of  
6 threatened and endangered species. However, we do not  
7 support the proposal to maintain the endangered status  
8 for the Mexican wolf.

9 There is no provision in the U.S. Fish and  
10 Wildlife Service recovery plans that deem Utah as  
11 essential to the recovery of either the gray wolf or  
12 the Mexican wolf.

13 Any wolves, either gray wolf or Mexican wolf,  
14 that makes its way into Utah should fall under the  
15 management of the state of Utah. Thank you very much.

16 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

17 Again, I want to remind you if you do have  
18 written comment that you're reading, if you could  
19 provide that to someone back at the registration tables  
20 or up front to us, that would be great.

21 And written comment is just as important as  
22 oral comment. Thank you.

23 MR. GOUGHNOUR: James Goughnour,  
24 G-o-u-g-h-n-o-u-r.

25 Mexican gray wolves were introduced in Arizona

1 by an act of Congress in 1997. At that time, the law  
2 designated a certain area and a certain number of  
3 wolves, about 100, to be established.

4 Today we're near that goal with 75 to 85 wild  
5 wolves and a couple of hundred in captivity that could  
6 be released. So logic and the law would say that it's  
7 time to call the program a success and end it.

8 However, now the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service  
9 wants to expand the range and have an unlimited number  
10 of wolves. The creation of the new subspecies of  
11 wolves is not supported by scientific data, nor does an  
12 expansion of this program supported by the people who  
13 would most directly be impacted by it.

14 I also want to refer to this letter from the  
15 U.S. Congress that was signed by 75 house  
16 representatives and senators. And what was unique is a  
17 lot of the people that signed it, like Senator  
18 Oral Hatch from Utah and Michele Bachmann, all have  
19 experience with this. They know where this program is  
20 headed, and they signed that letter.

21 So I would ask you if you haven't seen that  
22 letter, I have a copy of it here and you can surely  
23 read that.

24 Let me just take one paragraph from that  
25 letter. (Reading) "The full delisting of the gray wolf

1 is long overdue. Since wolves were first provided  
2 protection under the ESA, uncontrolled and unmanaged  
3 growth of wolf populations has resulted in devastating  
4 impacts on hunting, ranching, and tragic damages to  
5 historically strong elk herds, moose, Big Horn sheep,  
6 and mule deer."

7 This is why we believe it's critical that you  
8 reconsider your decision to list the Mexican gray wolf  
9 as a subspecies under the ESA, which would have a  
10 severe impact to private landowners, including ranches  
11 in Arizona and in New Mexico --

12 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

13 MR. GOUGHNOUR: -- and surrounding states.

14 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

15 Next speaker, please.

16 MS. BHAKTIVEDANTA: Hello. My name is  
17 Dasi Bhaktivedanta, D-a-s-i, B-h-a-k-t-i-v-e-d-a-n-t-a.

18 I feel like the differences that I've heard  
19 today are due to some of us hold hands on concentric  
20 viewpoints and some of us do not. And so I want --

21 MS. TRAVERS: Could you speak up just a little  
22 bit. Thank you.

23 MS. BHAKTIVEDANTA: Some of us hold hands on  
24 concentric viewpoints, that humans are the center, and  
25 some of us do not. Some of us hold the viewpoint that

1 humans are a part of the greater whole. And I fall in  
2 the latter category, but I understand and I have people  
3 in my life that I love that hold the other viewpoint.

4 So I just hope that we can find some common  
5 ground by not seeing each other as enemies, but as --  
6 you know, talk and hear each other's viewpoints. And  
7 I'm honored to have been here today to hear viewpoints  
8 from both sides.

9 My problem is that we're wasting wolves  
10 delisted. We've seen wholesale slaughter. So after so  
11 much investment in the wolves being brought back from  
12 the brink of extinction to when they've been left to  
13 the whims of the states, they're just being slaughtered  
14 almost for fun in some cases.

15 And so I think we can do better than that.  
16 We can find a way around that.

17 Human beings, I believe, are not the center of  
18 nature; we're a part of a larger picture of life. And  
19 it's the human species whose behavior has thrown the  
20 balance of nature off. Our actions have caused many  
21 species to extinction or to the brink of extinction.  
22 When the balance is thrown off, we all suffer,  
23 including humanity.

24 So I think that's all I have to say. I'm very  
25 nervous, and I'm sorry. I thank everyone for coming

1 out here and just showing their support to whatever  
2 side they hold dear. And thank you very much.

3 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

4 Next speaker, please.

5 MS. JOHNSON: Hi. My name is Leslie Johnson,  
6 L-e-s-l-i-e, J-o-h-n-s-o-n.

7 My husband owns the Flying H Ranch. We border  
8 the White Mountain Apache Indian reservation for  
9 37 miles. It takes us three hours to drive that 37  
10 miles. You never get out of second gear.

11 But as we're driving along, we do see camps.  
12 We do see people. So there are people out there. We  
13 are right in the center of where you're proposing to  
14 expand your Nonessential Population area. So we are  
15 definitely opposed to it.

16 It takes us 45 days to gather all our cows to  
17 brand, vaccinate, and so on. So I don't see where  
18 we're going to find wolf kills to be compensated from a  
19 compensation program that is basically nonexistent at  
20 this point.

21 We know people that have ranches in the Blue.  
22 The wolves put them out of business and that one of  
23 them is our game warden now.

24 I believe that the wolves should be expanded or  
25 put wherever their native area is. I have many

1 historical books that talk about hunting in our area.  
2 There were grizzly bears, mountain lions, regular  
3 bears, coyotes, bobcats. Not one mention of a wolf  
4 anywhere. So our area is not an historical area for  
5 wolves. So they should not be reintroduced there.

6 To me, the wolf reintroduction in our area is  
7 the same as having a convicted felon who's a murderer  
8 move to your neighborhood, and the government pays for  
9 their housing and food. It's the same thing.

10 My husband is one of those people who thinks  
11 outside the box. He says why don't they just buy a  
12 ranch, put a fence around it, let the wolves exist  
13 there. Let them breed there. Let them live there. If  
14 somebody wants to go hear them howl, let them camp  
15 there.

16 Why do they have to put them where we have  
17 families, where we're making our livelihood?

18 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you, ma'am. Thank you.

19 Next speaker, please.

20 MR. GIOVALE: Hi. My name is Danny Giovale.  
21 It's G-i-o-v-a-l-e.

22 I'm from Flagstaff, and I am a business owner.  
23 I don't ranch cattle, but I actually make outdoor  
24 equipment. So I manufacture and design equipment for  
25 people who hike outdoors and go in the back country.

1 I'm here to share my view that the wolf  
2 recovery area should, in fact, be expanded. I-40 is  
3 right through Flagstaff. And for us to fill that  
4 border for the expansion -- it's very awkward to be  
5 right on the border line.

6 We're enthusiastic, many of us in the outdoor  
7 community, to have wolves north of I-40, as well as  
8 south of I-40. So I'm falling on that kind of outer  
9 cusp here.

10 It was nice to hear earlier in the  
11 informational session that the border seemed more like  
12 a potentially temporary thing that more wolves would  
13 eventually need to be introduced north of I-40. I  
14 heard that in the earlier informational session from  
15 Ms. Barrett, and that was encouraging.

16 So I'm here to encourage that and definitely  
17 not having the nonessential specification on the  
18 listing. And I believe the best science, from what  
19 I've been able to get from the conservation community,  
20 does promote wolves for the health of our elk and  
21 wildlife in the Flagstaff area.

22 So I would like to promote that idea, and  
23 that's all I have. Thank you.

24 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

25 Next speaker.

1 MR. DOBSON: Carey Dobson, C-a-r-e-y,  
2 D-o-b-s-o-n. I'm a rancher out here in Springerville,  
3 in Vernon area.

4 Dr. Tuggle, it was good to see you again.  
5 I came to see you in D.C. in about 2000. 2002 is when  
6 we came there, and I've had wolf issues ever since.  
7 This year was very bad and traumatic on our outfit.

8 Two years ago, we sold our sheep outfit.  
9 I've been there for four generations with my family,  
10 and I have fifth and sixth on the ground. We are still  
11 running cattle now, but as you can see, the sheep  
12 outfit didn't make it up there. We had a lot of issues  
13 on our private and on our public lands.

14 I'm very proactive. I've worked with a lot of  
15 outfits, with the defenders of wildlife. Game and Fish  
16 done a lot of good things out there that seemed to work  
17 sometimes, but, again, like I said, this year we've had  
18 over 12 deprivations confirmed. And that's not all the  
19 ones that we found that we didn't -- you know, it was a  
20 full-time job for me to do it. I wasn't able to go do  
21 all the other stuff. I had to just go ride our permits  
22 this year.

23 Like I said, we didn't get to find them all,  
24 but we did have 12 confirmed. And on one outfit,  
25 that's pretty good. And that's just the kills. I'm

1 not talking about the cows that didn't breed back.  
2 There's a lot of issues there. And we need to do a lot  
3 more stuff that -- we're not getting help where we need  
4 help out on our force.

5 What are SOPs? We don't go by any guidelines.  
6 We have nothing to go by. I mean, if we go back, that  
7 paradise pack, in 2002 to now, has got over 40  
8 confirmed deprivations.

9 Where are we at? We finally took out one wolf,  
10 and now we're looking at maybe taking out the other  
11 female, which I hope we get done. But it isn't -- I  
12 mean, for 13 years, nothing? These are the issues that  
13 we need to look at.

14 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you, sir.

15 MR. DOBSON: Thank you.

16 MS. TRAVERS: Next speaker.

17 MR. FREISS: My name is Dave Freiss,  
18 F-r-e-i-s-s. I represent the Utah Cooperative Wildlife  
19 Management Unit Association in Utah.

20 Utah's program incentivizes private landowners  
21 to take advantage of wildlife populations on their  
22 land. And it is encouraged, active wildlife management  
23 by landowners on private lands.

24 Our membership owns 2 million deeded private  
25 acres of wildlife rich land in Utah. It consists of

1 hundreds of ranches and represents hundreds of Utah  
2 families.

3 Our concerns are about rural economies and open  
4 spaces. Ranches across the West have started to go  
5 away because of the development pressures and failed  
6 livestock businesses and agricultural businesses in  
7 those economies.

8 We're worried that population declines in deer  
9 and elk, due to wolf predation, would put in jeopardy  
10 more farms and ranches in rural communities,  
11 potentially damaging those economies irreversibly.

12 We look to the Fish and Wildlife Agency to take  
13 into consideration our concerns and maybe look into  
14 other or more in-depth environmental impacts that this  
15 massing of wolf population would incur.

16 We support delisting and having state agencies  
17 manage our wildlife populations. Thank you.

18 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

19 Next speaker.

20 I'm going to call a few more people to get  
21 ready to speak.

22 Hailey Sherwood, Matt Cronin, Sandy Bahr -- has  
23 she already spoken?

24 MS. BAHR: Yeah, I spoke for the  
25 representative.

1 MS. TRAVERS: Okay.

2 Wallace Schulthess, Tom Jenny, Ryan Benson,  
3 Byron Bateman, Roxanne George, Kathy Cheetham,  
4 Dorothy Reed-Inman, Jim Parks, Carrie Robbs, and  
5 Carolyn Eppler.

6 MS. VOGAN: Hi. My name is Edwina Vogan,  
7 V-, like in Victor, o-g-a-n.

8 I am here as a citizen of Arizona and as a  
9 lover of the land and the wildlife. I was raised in a  
10 rural area of farmers and hunters. Many of the people  
11 in attendance here today depend on the land for their  
12 living or for a part of it. No one wants to destroy  
13 that way of life.

14 I'm here to speak in favor of the Mexican gray  
15 wolf reintroduction program. However, I am not in  
16 favor of the ruling that increases the likelihood that  
17 more wolves will perish under the proposed rulemaking  
18 if implemented.

19 There are many disturbing aspects of the new  
20 rule, but I want to speak to what I think needs more  
21 definition and more fair application.

22 Specifically, I do not support the expansion of  
23 the term "take." Take, as in will be taken on private  
24 lands, that wolves will be taken on state land, that  
25 wolves will be taken on private lands, and that wolves

1 will be continued as always when livestock are  
2 identified -- are not identified with the kills.

3 I would ask that the rule be reevaluated and  
4 that the term "taken" be more defined in the proposed  
5 rule to continue the goal of reestablishing the Mexican  
6 gray wolf.

7 The wolf program has been under assault since  
8 the program began with the shootings of wolves, with no  
9 accountability for any of the killings. A program  
10 can't be successful and achieve a minimum of 100 wolves  
11 when wolves are targets for those who do not support  
12 the program, don't want the rules, and the sole purpose  
13 is to subvert and destroy the program.

14 The expansion of the "take" aspect of the  
15 proposed rulemaking is a wrongheaded approach, and I  
16 ask that U.S. Fish and Wildlife reevaluate the overall  
17 proposed rule that's more fair to the survival of the  
18 Mexican gray wolf. Thank you for the opportunity.

19 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

20 Next speaker.

21 MR. JENNEY: I'm Tom Jenney, Arizona Director  
22 of Americans for Prosperity.

23 We believe that protection of our natural  
24 resources is a state of economic growth most likely to  
25 be achieved under a system of well-specified,

1 well-protected, and transferable private property  
2 rights in natural resources.

3 A system of private property rights imposes  
4 market discipline on the users of resources because the  
5 wealth of property owners is at stake if they make bad  
6 decisions. And if property rights are transferable,  
7 owners must not only consider their own values, but  
8 also what others are going to pay.

9 Finally, private property owners can be held  
10 liable, under the tort system, for uses of resources  
11 that harm other persons for property.

12 Unfortunately, the federal government has  
13 chosen to place a huge portion of Western lands under  
14 the management of government bureaucrats. No matter  
15 how smart government resource managers may be, they do  
16 not have localized knowledge of the incredibly complex  
17 interaction of ecological systems with global  
18 economies.

19 And no matter how well-intentioned bureaucrats  
20 may be, they do not have any incentives to efficiently  
21 manage natural resources.

22 We have seen the failure of federal-forced  
23 management in the disastrous Rodeo-Chediski fire in  
24 2002 and the Walla fire in 2011.

25 Under the Endangered Species Act, government

1 bureaucrats have chosen to impose wolf for  
2 reintroduction on Western property owners. The  
3 bureaucrats who implemented this policy and the  
4 environmental activists who support this policy do not  
5 have their own property at stake.

6 Instead the costs of wolf reintroduction are  
7 borne by taxpayers, by school children cowering in kid  
8 cages, and by ranchers and shepherders and other local  
9 resource users.

10 Sadly, the bureaucrats and environmentalists  
11 cannot be held liable under the tort system for the  
12 damage they cause to local property owners.

13 Fish and Wildlife spends millions of dollars  
14 every year on this program, and yet it has almost no  
15 funds to compensate the damage this program causes to  
16 local property owners.

17 This policy is not efficient. It's not fair,  
18 and it must be changed. Thank you.

19 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

20 Next speaker.

21 MS. MICHAEL: My name is Karen Michael,  
22 M-i-c-h-a-e-l. My husband and I are second- and  
23 third-generation New Mexicans and current residents of  
24 Arizona. We've lived in the Southwest our entire  
25 lives.

1           The loco is not just an icon of the Southwest;  
2           it's an important component of healthy ecosystems. We  
3           like knowing Mexican gray wolves are out there, and  
4           we're not the only ones.

5           According to polls, the vast majority of  
6           Arizona and New Mexico residents support the  
7           reintroduction of Mexican wolves. The concern is that  
8           U.S. Fish and Wildlife may hurt some of the proposals.

9           I support the proposal for the releases of  
10          Mexican wolves throughout the Blue Range wolf recovery  
11          area. But U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service needs to  
12          replace an outdated 1982 plan with an upgraded,  
13          comprehensive recovery plan that is scientifically  
14          sound. U.S. Fish and Wildlife needs to think outside  
15          its boundary box, especially considering the fact that  
16          wolves do not read maps.

17          The proposed rule to recapture Mexican wolves  
18          that stray outside the experimental population area is  
19          counterproductive to their recovery and ignores  
20          biologists who have determined that the current  
21          recovery area doesn't provide enough suitable land,  
22          which makes it virtually impossible to establish a  
23          self-sustained population.

24          I would also like to thank the White Mountain  
25          Apache Tribe for their support. Thank you.

1 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

2 Next speaker.

3 One second, please. The court reporter needs  
4 just a few seconds.

5 THE COURT REPORTER: Okay. I'm ready.

6 MS. TRAVERS: All right. Thank you.

7 MS. REED-INMAN: Dorothy, D-o-r-o-t-h-y, Reed,  
8 R-e-e-d, Inman, I-n-m-a-n.

9 I'm a 26-year resident in the White Mountains  
10 and a retired schoolteacher. I've lived in the  
11 Rocky Mountains since 1972, and that's what I'm all  
12 about. It's just being out in nature. That's where  
13 I'm coming from.

14 The points I want to make right away before I  
15 run out of time is that I'd like to see direct releases  
16 of Mexican wolves throughout the Blue Range wolf  
17 recovery area.

18 I'd like to see them returned to the Grand  
19 Canyon region. I think that they could use some wolves  
20 to keep those elk moving because it's getting pretty  
21 beat up there. I'd like to see them into southern Utah  
22 for the same reason, Northern New Mexico, Southern  
23 Colorado.

24 I think these areas are essential for Mexican  
25 wolf recovery. I'd like to see Mexican wolves

1 designated as essential, and I'd like to see a  
2 comprehensive recovery plan, and I'd like to not  
3 include an expanded provision for takes.

4 Now, where am I coming from? I get out in the  
5 woods a lot. I'm a hiker, a cross-country skier, a  
6 birder. I'm retired; I don't rely on these other  
7 industries. I am a homeowner in Pinetop for all these  
8 years, so my voice counts too.

9 And I see, from my research, that wolves can  
10 make a positive impact on the environment by keeping  
11 ungulates moving. They restore willows and Aspen and  
12 create a lot of things, like vegetation, which are  
13 really getting beat up in the Southwest here.

14 The birds come back. The fish are better off.  
15 It all fits together. It's all part of nature's plan.

16 That's all I have to say. Thanks.

17 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

18 Next speaker.

19 MS. CHEATHAM: My name is Kathy Cheatham,  
20 C-h-e-a-t-h-a-m.

21 I feel that the proposal for the Mexican wolves  
22 is a noose for the wolves in the ecosystem that,  
23 apparently, politicians and the U.S. Fish and Wildlife  
24 Service can pretend this will help wolves, but know  
25 deep down in their hearts that it won't help wolves at

1 all, just bring them closer to extinction.

2 Trying to save wolves is one thing. But unless  
3 they're allowed to expand their territory naturally  
4 without being trapped and being dragged back from  
5 across that imaginary boundary line that politics  
6 decides and not science, that all they amount to is  
7 token animals.

8 Wolves should be allowed to go to the  
9 Grand Canyon and further, and we should be using  
10 methods that work to protect all our animals, wild and  
11 domestic, instead of the attitude that we're not going  
12 to change the way we've done things for decades.

13 Some ranches are trying methods that work and  
14 haven't lost any livestock. And that's up in northern  
15 wolf country in Montana and Wyoming. It seems that  
16 some people have local phobia, and they're whipping  
17 themselves and others into a frenzy, building cages for  
18 kids and other nonsense.

19 The experimental part makes no sense. They've  
20 been here longer than us. It's a no-brainer. They are  
21 essential.

22 Maybe elk wasting disease wouldn't have gotten  
23 a foothold if there had been wolves out there calling  
24 the sickly animals instead of the humans out there  
25 looking for the biggest animals in their prime to

1 shoot.

2           These Mexican wolves are doing exactly what God  
3 intended them to do, and it should be up to us to learn  
4 to live with them. It isn't easy, but we have to  
5 change our habits and look at things differently.  
6 We're supposed to be stewards of this earth and all the  
7 creatures and not their executioners.

8           We have to release more of the wolves and  
9 protect them before that generic window closes. We  
10 have to let them go with no boundaries. They are  
11 essential, and we have to protect them.

12           What win would there be for the wolves in the  
13 Grand Canyon? For sure it would be a win for the  
14 condors and also for the --

15           MS. TRAVERS: Thank you. Thank you.

16           (Audience applause.)

17           MS. TRAVERS: Next speaker. Next speaker.

18           Please hold your applause.

19           MR. CRONIN: Hi. I'm Matt Cronin, C-r-o-n-i-n.  
20 I'm at the University of Alaska, Fairbanks, research  
21 professor of animal genetics.

22           I think that the genetics issue has been  
23 overplayed or overemphasized, first of all, with the  
24 reproduction of the wolves you've been talking about  
25 being good, and I think it was 95 percent of the

1 animals are now wild born.

2 The measure of fitness is reproduction and  
3 survival, so you've got a fit population. And I don't  
4 think that inbreeding is an issue at this point. You  
5 can always correct it later with introducing Rule 3 of  
6 AI.

7 Maybe a more important issue is that the  
8 Mexican wolves went through a very large bottleneck.  
9 They don't represent the original population. They  
10 came from a small Canis population.

11 Assessing the subspecies is somewhat futile in  
12 that respect. However, subspecies, in general, are  
13 basically a subjected category. They are not a hard  
14 scientifically blank category.

15 Recently the (indiscernible) when I was in  
16 California (indiscernible) added the wood bison,  
17 published in the papers this year, have been shown not  
18 to be legitimate subspecies. And this phenomenon of  
19 naming species and subspecies has been termed by the  
20 broad scientific community as inflation, splitting  
21 things into groups with the intent of granting  
22 conservation, again.

23 The entire scientific community outside of the  
24 wildlife is recognizing this. And it's very important  
25 that we realize that subspecies as a scientific

1 category is subjective. It's not definitive. The  
2 scientific community agrees on it.

3 So I suggest you use the entire body of science  
4 and the recent discrediting of subspecies that have  
5 been listed and reconsider the science.

6 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

7 Next speaker.

8 MR. SCHULTHESS: I'm Wallace Schulthess,  
9 S-c-h-u-l-t-h-e-s-s. I'm currently serving as the Utah  
10 Cattleman's president. I've had a cattle operation in  
11 northern Utah and Wyoming, and I've had personal  
12 first-hand experience with wolves.

13 In 2001, I had 16 head of livestock that were  
14 killed by wolves. In today's market, that would be  
15 \$16,000. In 2001, they were \$8,000. Defenders of  
16 Wildlife eventually sent a deprivation payment to me  
17 for \$225. It didn't work then. It needs to be  
18 revised, from what I've heard here today. I just  
19 wanted to comment on that.

20 I'm not opposed to the wolf reintroduction.  
21 I think that the gray wolf should be delisted  
22 nationwide. It's worked in Wyoming. We're not a bunch  
23 of vigilantes that go up there and slaughter wolves  
24 unexpectedly.

25 If someone comes into your home, there's a law

1 that says they can't cross that border. Wolves can't  
2 read signs. They can't obey laws. But they do need to  
3 be taken back and held within those areas.

4 My only tie to this area is that I have a  
5 daughter that lives in Clovis, New Mexico. I hear  
6 people when they come from out of town and start giving  
7 their opinions of what should happen in these areas.

8 But I do feel that gray wolves should be  
9 delisted and the Mexican wolf recovery program should  
10 go on in the valleys that are set and not expanded to a  
11 great deal, only with the approval of the state of  
12 Arizona and New Mexico. Those people who are elected,  
13 certain people of the state, especially those who are  
14 private landowners. There's a reason that it's called  
15 private land, and we should respect that private land  
16 right.

17 If you work on the compensation part of it, if  
18 you work on collaborative effort, you'll find that  
19 ranchers are in favor of protecting any species, but we  
20 need to remain in business, and sometimes the  
21 regulations that are put on by Fish and Wildlife  
22 Service are over restrictive.

23 And I can leave those comments with you.

24 Thank you.

25 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

1           Next speaker.

2           MR. PARKS: Hello. My name is Jim Parks,  
3 P-a-r-k-s. I'm president of the Coconino County Farm  
4 Bureau & Cattle Growers Association. And I really  
5 appreciate the honor of being able to speak to you all.  
6 Thank you very much.

7           We support the delisting of the gray wolf.  
8 We disagree with the listing of the Mexican wolf.

9           It's terrible that the wolf has emotions  
10 running pretty high on this wolf recovery issue.  
11 The wolf is a beautiful known creature when seen in  
12 photographs in its natural habitat, running freely and  
13 unencumbered across the snow-covered hillside. It's  
14 this free spirit of the wolf that has captivated  
15 emotion of many thousands of people across the  
16 landscape of imagination in the world of urban and  
17 suburban peoples.

18           The reality of the wolf is an entirely  
19 different matter. From the practical side of the issue  
20 in rural areas of this country, where rural people  
21 actually have to live with the wolf, the wolf is far  
22 from romantic as an idol, and as it is viewed by our  
23 suburban cousins.

24           It's pretty easy to be emotional about a  
25 dangerous predator when you live in the relative safety

1 of a city. And a dangerous predator is exactly what  
2 the wolf is naturally, genetically, and predisposed to  
3 be. The wolf kills to eat, and the wolf also kills for  
4 fun, called reflex killing by biologists, killing and  
5 wasting as many as three or four others in the herd  
6 before each one is eaten.

7 I received an email recently from my brother,  
8 Bruce, who lives in Oregon, where wolves have recovered  
9 to the point where they're a real danger to people,  
10 livestock, and especially when put in the wildlife.

11 Bruce works for the Oregon State University on  
12 the experimental farm that the university in Union,  
13 Oregon. The farm has a small herd of cattle in the  
14 summer on a Forest service ranch permit. The cattle  
15 are hauled up to the forest from the farm in early  
16 spring to summer pasture.

17 He states: (Reading) "Jim, I think I told you  
18 that we lost nine head of cattle to the wolves last  
19 summer. They all died at the same time. The wolves  
20 chased them, backed them up against the barb wired  
21 fence, and then just slaughtered them."

22 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you, sir.

23 MR. PARKS: Thank you.

24 MS. TRAVERS: Next speaker.

25 MR. BATEMAN: My name is Byron Bateman,

1 B-a-t-e-m-a-n. I'm from North Salt Lake, Utah.

2 Utah has a multibillion dollar industry with  
3 our wildlife, our livestock industry, and our tourist  
4 industry. We sit in the middle of both of these wolf  
5 programs that are going on.

6 We watched our neighbors to the north go out of  
7 business in the livestock industry. We saw their  
8 wildlife herds decimated. Herds of elk reduced from  
9 20,000 down to 1,200 or less.

10 States that can't sell all of their hunting  
11 licenses losing great sums of revenues and jobs because  
12 of wolves.

13 Our job is to protect the people of Utah and  
14 the economy of Utah and growth. We want to see that  
15 growth throughout the West.

16 We support the delisting of the gray wolf in  
17 the lower 48 contiguous states. We don't think that  
18 any wolf should be allowed anywhere outside of this  
19 historic range anywhere in the United States.

20 If there is a Mexican wolf and 90 percent of  
21 the original historic range is across the border in  
22 Mexico, then that's where your emphasis should be on  
23 any kind of recovery, not here in the United States  
24 with less than 10 percent of their historic range.

25 To think that you would allow the wolves to

1 cross I-40 and come north towards Utah is just  
2 unacceptable.

3 You need to look at what's happened in the last  
4 18 years since wolves have been turned loose in the  
5 three states in the north and take that into serious  
6 consideration, the economic impact and how many lives  
7 you've ruined and stuff with the wolf.

8 I just ask you that you delist, as I mentioned  
9 earlier, the lower 48 contiguous states. Thank you.

10 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

11 Next speaker, please.

12 MR. BENSON: Hello. My name is Ryan Benson,  
13 B-e-n-s-o-n. I am the national director of BigGame  
14 Forever.

15 We have approximately 25,000 members  
16 nationwide, and many of those members live in the state  
17 of Arizona. We will be submitting written comments  
18 from 17 chapters in the state today. We have  
19 signatures from 600 chapters on those 17 letters.

20 There is strong statewide support for ensuring  
21 that there are safeguards to protect our wildlife. It  
22 would be the cautionary tale that comes from the  
23 Northern Rockies is not whether the wolf as a species  
24 is good or bad. That's not really the question.

25 The question is one of management and whether

1 we should be able to -- whether states and whether  
2 local communities, should be able to protect indigenous  
3 wildlife populations.

4 For the last hundred years, sportsmen and  
5 livestock producers have been strong components of  
6 multi-species conservation. We understand that we need  
7 to invest in our wildlife populations. Elk, deer, and  
8 other species on the landscape are largely there as a  
9 result of the investment by sportsmen in those  
10 communities.

11 We feel strongly that this investment needs to  
12 be protected. And the best way to do that is to ensure  
13 the states have management authority to address  
14 unsustainable predation as it arises.

15 State governments are fully qualified to  
16 responsibly manage wolf populations and to meet the  
17 needs of local communities and wildlife populations.

18 We also strongly feel -- and this has been  
19 stated repeatedly -- that the mandates of the  
20 Endangered Species Act should not force populations  
21 outside the historic range. This is a dangerous  
22 precedent, both from a legal and biological  
23 perspective.

24 I will submit the rest of my comments -- my  
25 written comments for the record. Thank you.

1 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you, sir.

2 Next speaker.

3 I'm going to call three more while this one  
4 comes up: Lonn Tate, Judy Bensinger, and Bonnie  
5 Danowski.

6 MS. EPPLER: Carolyn Eppler, E-p-p-l-e-r.

7 I support the delisting of the gray wolves and  
8 inclusion of the Mexican wolf in that delisting. The  
9 reason for that is there are clearly flaws in the  
10 analysis that you've done to date. You haven't  
11 followed NEPA or ESA ruling by collaborating with our  
12 state and local agencies, as well as cooperators.

13 Further, as you move forward with the analysis  
14 to document the importance of delisting and the  
15 benefits of delisting, I ask that you consider what the  
16 IUCN states in their guidelines.

17 (Reading) "The introduction should only take  
18 place where the habitat and landscape requirements of  
19 the species are satisfied and likely to be sustained  
20 from the foreseeable future.

21 "The possibility of natural habitat change  
22 since exculpation must be considered. Likewise a  
23 change in the legal and political or cultural  
24 environment since species exportation must be  
25 ascertained and evaluated as a possible constraint."

1           Had you coordinated with local governments  
2 since our findings? You had not done that a few weeks  
3 ago. Have you started that yet? This is a question  
4 that needs to be answered. The IUCN requires that you  
5 do this.

6           Further, while supporters of predator  
7 reintroduction programs believe in the concept of  
8 restoring the balance of nature, it is not possible to  
9 artificially improve this balance. Ecosystems are in a  
10 constant state of change, which has been sped up by  
11 various programs, such as your wolf program, in an  
12 artificial manner.

13           Research has demonstrated that wolf pups, even  
14 with intense socialization with humans, still show  
15 aggressive behavior. How have you considered this fact  
16 specific to placing wolves in what many refer to as an  
17 urban forest?

18           With the severe economic problems in our  
19 country and state, you should consider the negative  
20 impacts to our wildlife as --

21           MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

22           Next speaker.

23           MS. SHERWOOD: Hi. My name is Hailey Sherwood,  
24 H-a-i-l-e-y, S-h-e-r-w-o-o-d. Thank you for letting me  
25 speak.

1 I'm speaking as a farmer, as a person who has  
2 shepherded several hundred head of sheep as well as  
3 cattle and horses.

4 I'm speaking to support the recovery of the  
5 Mexican gray wolf species. I think biodiversity is  
6 essential to all life, and I think deeming something as  
7 artificial because they're being recovered, even though  
8 they've only been absent from the area is -- I think  
9 that's very subjective.

10 I think there's a cultural stigma against  
11 wolves, and I find there's a lot more predatory threats  
12 from mountain lions and from coyotes that I've  
13 experienced while I've been a farmer and a shepherd.  
14 And this is coming from many years of experience in  
15 northern Arizona.

16 I fully support communities having complete say  
17 of what goes on in their communities. I live in  
18 Flagstaff right now so maybe I'm not being as directly  
19 impacted.

20 I also support the Fish and Wildlife Service to  
21 do much more comprehensive studies about how this will  
22 impact the ecosystems in the area of what's considered  
23 a traditional homeland, how this will impact the people  
24 who are directly in those counties that are having the  
25 wolves reintroduced there.

1 Thank you for letting me speak.

2 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

3 Next speaker, please.

4 MS. BAHR: My name is Sandy Bahr, B-a-h-r, and  
5 I'm the chapter director for the Sierra Club, Grand  
6 Canyon Chapter.

7 On behalf of our 30,000 members and supporters  
8 in Arizona, I strongly encourage the U.S. Fish and  
9 Wildlife Service to expedite actions needed for Mexican  
10 wolf recovery. It is time to remove the limits that  
11 have hindered the full recovery of these endangered  
12 animals from the arbitrary lines on a map to the  
13 nonessential designation, and to provide them the  
14 protection the Endangered Species Act mandates.

15 As part of your responsibility under the ESA,  
16 it is imperative that you act quickly to allow direct  
17 releases of Mexican wolves throughout the Blue Range  
18 wolf recovery area. This has been recommended by  
19 experts for more than a decade and has a sound basis in  
20 science and in the law.

21 This change is essential to ensure the genetic  
22 integrity of the animal, as well as their ultimate  
23 recovery.

24 Sierra Club has never supported the  
25 Nonessential Experimental status of these animals, as

1 the wild population is essential to the recovery of the  
2 species. That has become clearer than ever over the  
3 last 15 years. The nonessential designation is likely  
4 to appreciably reduce the likelihood of recovery of  
5 Mexican wolves in the wild.

6 Sierra Club supports the provision in the  
7 proposed rule to allow Mexican wolves to disperse  
8 naturally from the Blue Range wolf recovery area and  
9 into the Mexican wolf experimental population area and  
10 to occupy an area without the requirement of bringing  
11 them back.

12 We also support the proposal to move the  
13 southern boundary in Arizona and New Mexico from  
14 Highway 10 to the U.S./Mexico border.

15 The Service proposal to allow wolves to  
16 disperse no farther north than I-40 is contrary to  
17 recommendations from scientists and the Service's own  
18 Mexican wolf recovery team.

19 We look forward to the day when the Mexican  
20 gray wolf is fully recovered throughout its range and  
21 is fulfilling its essential ecological role throughout  
22 the southwestern landscape. Thank you.

23 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

24 Next speaker.

25 MS. GEORGE: My name is Roxanne George,

1 R-o-x-a-n-n-e, G-e-o-r-g-e. Thank you for the  
2 opportunity to speak tonight. I also want to thank the  
3 White Mountain Apache Tribe for sharing their land with  
4 wolves. Their willingness to do that exemplifies good  
5 stewardship.

6 I live in Flagstaff, Arizona. I hike and camp  
7 on the lands that are a part of the Blue range wolf  
8 recovery area and on lands that are within the expanded  
9 area proposed.

10 Giving critically endangered Mexican gray  
11 wolves Endangered Species Act protection in their own  
12 right is long overdue, and I strongly support that  
13 proposal, but not in the context as strictly protection  
14 for gray wolves.

15 I, like most Arizonans, welcome the return of  
16 Mexican wolves and want to see them thrive. They have  
17 been missing for too long. And many of us seem to  
18 forget that we do not restore endangered species for  
19 their benefit, but for ours. Mexican wolves are a good  
20 example of that.

21 We and our public land stand to benefit  
22 tremendously from restoring wolves to their natural  
23 role. Our level of economy stands to benefit  
24 enormously as well. Wolves have contributed over  
25 \$35 million a year to the Yellowstone region and could

1 bring significant new revenues to rural Arizona  
2 communities.

3           Unfortunately, very little in the proposed  
4 changes to the rule will move recovery forward. I  
5 support expanding the area where wolves can roam and  
6 allowing initial releases throughout the Blue Range.  
7 But the rest of the proposal, including boundaries  
8 under wolf nuisance and loosened restrictions on tape,  
9 should be discarded as inconsistent with recovery.

10           It will be a great tragedy if we lose these  
11 important native animals from the wild a second time  
12 because you sacrificed your mandates to recover  
13 endangered species to political considerations.

14           Thank you.

15           (Audience applause.)

16           MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

17           Please hold your applause.

18           Thank you.

19           Next speaker.

20           MS. ROBBS: Hello. My name is Carrie Robbs.  
21 That's R-o-b-b-s.

22           I'm from Pleasant Valley. And I say this with  
23 much emotion that me, along with my parents, have  
24 pooled our resources, and we are first-generation  
25 ranchers. And I don't know if anybody in this room

1 quite understands what that means.

2 It is hard to be a first-generation rancher.  
3 This is our very first year. And this program  
4 jeopardizes everything that we have just put in and  
5 everything that we're holding for our family.

6 I want to start by saying I do support the  
7 delisting of the gray wolf, and then I also support the  
8 delisting of the Mexican gray wolf.

9 Part of the ESA criteria for -- the criteria  
10 for ESA states that it must be a valid subspecies, and  
11 scientists do not agree. It is not agreeable that it  
12 is, indeed, a subspecies. And it's something that  
13 needs to be addressed.

14 I also want to say that cattle ranching is not  
15 just about producing meat for people; although, it is a  
16 high-quality protein meal for people, one yearling calf  
17 taken by a wolf would supply over 1,400 people with  
18 that quality protein meal. So if you take into  
19 consideration the 400 cattle already killed on the Blue  
20 Range, that is a quality protein meal for 572,000  
21 people.

22 Those are major impacts, and we're not even  
23 talking about the byproducts from those animals. So  
24 you might not eat meat, but I'm sure you drive a car.  
25 I'm sure you utilize things that come in plastics.

1 I'm sure you drive on roads. All these byproducts are  
2 important to our everyday lives, including medications.

3 There are so many things we take into  
4 consideration when we talk about the impacts just of  
5 cattle ranching, let alone the population as a whole.  
6 These areas that you're talking about are highly human  
7 populated. They are one of the most popular recreation  
8 sites in our state, and they're going to impact --

9 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

10 I'm going to call some more names.

11 Jim Warren, L. Eppler, Jerry Grimes, Steve  
12 Clark, Mike Hobbs, Dennis Pirch.

13 Thank you.

14 MS. BENSINGER: My name is Judy Bensinger,  
15 B-e-n-s-i-n-g-e-r.

16 I would like to voice support for direct  
17 releases throughout the Blue Range recovery area. I  
18 would also like to voice support for the expansion of  
19 the Blue Range recovery area.

20 I understand the concerns of those who fear  
21 human/wolf conflict, but the actual number of  
22 human/wolf conflict is extremely low. And if we were  
23 to irradiate any species for the potential of human  
24 conflict, we would have to get rid of bears, mountain  
25 lions, bobcats, a whole bunch of species.

1           My husband and I live in a rural area in Dewey,  
2 Arizona. We live about a mile away from the national  
3 forest. We co-exist on a daily basis with mountain  
4 lions, coyotes, javelina, all sorts of animals. We use  
5 common sense, and we get along just fine. Thank you.

6           MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

7           Next speaker.

8           MR. GRIMES: Good evening. Jerry Grimes,  
9 G-r-i-m-e-s.

10           I'm representing the 30,000 Elks of the  
11 Benevolent and Protective Order of Elks of Arizona.

12           The Elks of Arizona, we support the work of the  
13 Arizona Elks Major Projects, which I am the current  
14 president of. We are strongly opposed to the release  
15 of the Mexican gray wolf into the mountains of  
16 Northeast Arizona.

17           The Arizona Elks sponsor a wilderness youth  
18 camp, which is located about 50 miles north of Globe,  
19 Arizona, near Young in Arizona. Each summer, over  
20 1,000 children -- which about 25 percent represent  
21 disabled individuals, young adults -- stay at the Elks  
22 Youth Camp, along with their parents, Scout leaders,  
23 and other support personnel.

24           We are very concerned that the release of the  
25 Mexican gray wolf to this area could result in

1 potential danger to the children who use the Elks'  
2 sponsored camp.

3 On most days at the camp, children come across  
4 deer, an occasional elk, and the many other wild  
5 animals that are located in that area. These animals  
6 could bring the Mexican gray wolf to the Elk property  
7 and, in turn, in contact with the city kids who are  
8 able to beat the heat of Tucson and the Metropolitan  
9 Phoenix area when they stay at the Elks youth camp.

10 The safety of the children who use the Elks  
11 camp should be the first priority of those conducted by  
12 the Fish and Game Community. The introduction of the  
13 Mexican gray wolf would be, in the opinion of the  
14 Arizona Elks, a mistake and a potential threat to the  
15 children who use the camp. Thank you very much.

16 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

17 Next speaker.

18 MR. HOBBS: Mike Hobbs, Colfax County,  
19 New Mexico. I appreciate this opportunity to talk to  
20 you a little bit this afternoon.

21 Ladies and gentlemen, the ranching community  
22 has co-existed, for a time immortal, with heavy loads  
23 of predators. We have been able to do this -- we've  
24 been able to co-exist because we had the ability to  
25 work closely with our state wildlife agencies. We're

1 not having to try to communicate with you folks that  
2 are so isolated from us in D.C.

3 We want to work -- we don't want the Mexican  
4 gray wolf to be extinct. That was never our objective.  
5 But we do want our states to have the ultimate  
6 authority and control over the ultimate dispensation of  
7 this program.

8 We do not like what you're doing. We do not  
9 believe that you are in touch with us. When asked for  
10 specific data, we are referred to some ambiguous  
11 website that works just as well as the Obama Care  
12 website works. And we're getting fed up with it.  
13 We're tired of it.

14 We want common sense put back in to the rules  
15 and the regulations that you folks promulgate on us,  
16 and we're trying to work within. Please cooperate with  
17 us. We're trying to cooperate with you. Thank you.

18 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

19 Next speaker.

20 MS. DANOWSKI: Good evening, and thank you.

21 My name is Bonnie Danowski, D-a-n-o-w-s-k-i, raised on  
22 a farm in Iowa. And I now live in the Phoenix area.

23 I do not support the Fish and Wildlife  
24 Service's premature delisting of the gray wolf from the  
25 endangered species list and relisting it as a second

1 subspecies.

2 Please consider also opening the area north of  
3 Interstate 40 to the wolves, their natural habitat  
4 crucial to the Mexican gray wolf recovery.

5 In the last decade, ten animals have gone  
6 extinct. I can remember scanning the Arizona skies and  
7 missing the bald eagle. I can also remember what a  
8 thrill to see this marvelous bird flying once again  
9 over the mountains in our beautiful desert.

10 I think this was only because keeping it on the  
11 endangered list gave the eagle time to get  
12 reestablished in its native habitats. And now this  
13 magnificent creature flies throughout our country.

14 I think of my granddaughter who already will  
15 not see the Ivory-billed Woodpecker, extinct in 1994;  
16 the Mexican grizzly, 1964; and the Western black  
17 rhinoceros, in 2011.

18 I hope that the Mexican gray wolf will not be  
19 in that category, but I truly fear, backed by many  
20 scientific studies, that unless the Mexican gray wolf  
21 is kept on the endangered list, we will soon be seeing  
22 the last of them.

23 Time magazine recently had the picture of a  
24 deer on the cover with the word "Pest." Until we  
25 humans once again learn to respect and honor other

1 living creatures on our planet, this dying out of  
2 species will continue.

3 Can we really afford to keep upsetting the  
4 ecosystem because of shortsightedness and sheer  
5 selfishness? It is our choice.

6 Will my granddaughter learn about the Mexican  
7 gray wolf only from a textbook or hiking in our  
8 beautiful Arizona mountains? I hope it's through a  
9 hike. Thank you.

10 (Audience applause.)

11 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

12 Next speaker.

13 Please hold your applause.

14 MR. PIRCH: Dennis Pirch, P-, as in penguin,  
15 -i-r-c-h, from Payson, Arizona. 42 years of public  
16 high school teaching and still in that business, I have  
17 a pretty good understanding of the folks in Payson,  
18 having educated three generations.

19 I might add that I had the opportunity to go to  
20 a meeting created by the Arizona Game and Fish  
21 Department in Shaw Valley, where over 200 Paysonites  
22 showed up. And I might add of the 200 that showed up,  
23 I think it was overwhelmingly that they were concerned  
24 and did not want the reintroduction of the Mexican gray  
25 wolf -- or introduction of the Mexican gray wolf into

1 the Tonto National Forest.

2 Now, I do want to make sure that you  
3 understand, of the 200-plus that were there, there were  
4 two people in support. One was a member of the U.S.  
5 Fish and Wildlife, I believe. Her friend said, "I have  
6 no dog in the fight so I won't take a stand."

7 And the third person was a paid lobbyist from  
8 the Sierra Club. So I want to make sure you understand  
9 that that was one element and one group that I  
10 attended.

11 There was another meeting that I showed up at  
12 that there was about 150 members of the community, a  
13 totally different diverse group. They were  
14 overwhelmingly against the introduction of the Mexican  
15 gray wolf to Gila County, to the Payson area.

16 I went to a third meeting, where there were  
17 about 100. There were a couple that were in favor,  
18 but, again, the great majority.

19 So I think I'm speaking for the folks in Payson  
20 and I think I'm speaking for the folks in the Tonto  
21 National Forest that are totally surrounded, that we  
22 have a question.

23 And the question is: Do the local folks in the  
24 national forest want the wolf? And I have to say the  
25 bottom line is no, we do not want it in Payson, nor in

1 Gila County.

2 And thank you for your time and thank you for  
3 letting me speak.

4 (Audience applause.)

5 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

6 Next speaker.

7 Please hold your applause.

8 MR. EPPLER: My name is Larry Eppler,  
9 E-p-p-l-e-r, and I support the delisting of the gray  
10 wolf. The proposal for the Mexican wolf, however, is  
11 flawed, in my opinion.

12 My request to you is for you to consider site  
13 specific issues and concerns of all of the families who  
14 have been impacted by the Blue Range wolf program both  
15 in Arizona and New Mexico, specifically the social and  
16 economic impacts.

17 I also request that you consider all  
18 scientifically validated research, including the fact  
19 that the IUCN states the gray wolf species, including  
20 the so-called Mexican gray wolf, considers the species  
21 stable.

22 Have you, U.S. Fish and Wildlife specialists,  
23 considered the possibility of the wolf killing a  
24 defenseless child or other persons by placing or  
25 allowing expansion of the wolf into an area that

1 includes one of the most frequented urban forests in  
2 the Southwest, being the Tonto?

3 The myth of the true wilderness can be easily  
4 confirmed simply by reviewing the management of those  
5 areas we consider wilderness, such as wildlife refuges  
6 or designated wildernesses in the United States.

7 It has been found through land management that  
8 for many sites hands-on management is necessary to  
9 create the best sustainable habitat. Review of  
10 management access across the natural forest wilderness  
11 area and others demonstrates the common use of the  
12 exception clause of the wilderness act. This clause  
13 allows manipulation of the wilderness to meet minimum  
14 requirements for the administration of the area.

15 Have you considered in your proposal that with  
16 existing mandates and policy, as well as established  
17 ecosystems or established communities, there is already  
18 well-established biodiversity and intensively managed  
19 systems in the area proposed replacement of the wolves?

20 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you, sir.

21 MR. EPPLER: Thank you.

22 MS. TRAVERS: Next speaker.

23 I'm going to read a few more names. Steve  
24 Smith, Bob Brister, Billie Hughes, Kim Crumbo, and  
25 Jean Ossorio.

1           MR. CLARK: My name is Steve Clark, C-l-a-r-k.  
2 I'm the executive director of the Arizona Elk Society,  
3 also the organizer of a group called Arizona Alliance  
4 of Responsible Land Users.

5           I represent many sportsmen here in Arizona.  
6 And up until now, the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service  
7 has long ignored the voice of Arizona sportsmen and  
8 women in our state.

9           Sportsmen are the backbone and primary funders  
10 for the reintroduction and growth of most of the  
11 consumptive gaming in the United States. We have  
12 raised millions of dollars to restore wildlife to the  
13 landscape.

14           As the Service knows, the State of Arizona owns  
15 that wildlife, and sportsmen continue to fund the bulk  
16 of the management of that wildlife. Arizona does not  
17 have the prey base to allow for a future expansion of  
18 this program. The lack of quality habitat and current  
19 climate conditions will allow the wolves to decimate  
20 elk and deer in Arizona. This, in turn, will force the  
21 ranching community to shoulder the burden of increased  
22 wolf/cow conflicts.

23           The current balance of wildlife will not  
24 support the expansion of the Mexican gray wolf outside  
25 the area of the current 10(j) Blue Range wilderness

1 recovery area. Expanding this recovery area into an  
2 area that is not historic range is irresponsible and  
3 destructive to the state of Arizona.

4 Furthermore, the recovery of the Mexican gray  
5 wolf needs to focus on Mexico since 90 percent of the  
6 historic range is in Mexico.

7 Recreational use of the area being considered  
8 for the recovery expansion is among the highest in  
9 Arizona, which will lead to a high rate of conflicts  
10 and likely higher wolf mortality and removal. A fact  
11 that it could reduce public support for the effort.

12 Lead agencies here in the state indicate that  
13 adequate funding is needed to carry out the  
14 reestablishment project in the Blue Range wolf recovery  
15 area. Greatly expanding that area to include areas of  
16 the Mogollon Rim and the Coconino National Forest will  
17 dilute available funds that, to date, have been  
18 limited. This will reduce the likelihood of obtaining  
19 the population of wolves. Thank you.

20 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

21 Next speaker.

22 MR. BRISTER: My name is Bob Brister,  
23 B-r-i-s-t-e-r. I came down from Salt Lake City, Utah.  
24 I wish I didn't have to do that. I wish we could have  
25 held a hearing in Salt Lake and in other parts of the

1 West, but regardless, I'm here.

2 We need a robust population of Mexican wolves  
3 in the Blue Ridge wolf recovery area. We need to have  
4 more direct releases. We need to move wolves out of  
5 captivity into the wild population.

6 We need to allow wolves to migrate back to  
7 Utah. Wolves are native to Utah. You heard from Utah  
8 politicians earlier; they do not represent Utah public  
9 opinion.

10 Utah public opinion supports wolves. Don't  
11 take my word for it, read the State of Utah Wolf  
12 Management Plan. It will tell you the statistics in  
13 there.

14 Utah and Colorado need wolf populations in  
15 order to keep the metapopulation of wolves genetically  
16 healthy and for long-term viability.

17 As it stands in Utah and in other states in the  
18 interior West are in decline because of the lack of  
19 predators to keep elk on the move. Wolves will help  
20 the landscape in Utah, as well as other Western states.

21 Please follow the ESA. Please follow the law.  
22 Use the best science. Have wolf populations in  
23 southern Colorado and southern Utah. Thank you.

24 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

25 Next speaker.

1           MR. SMITH: Good evening. My name is  
2 J.F. Smith. I'm a rancher from Gila County. I've been  
3 a senior guy here on the res, and I've been here for  
4 35 years.

5           Two minutes would not be enough time for me to  
6 tell you all the field experience that I've had with  
7 these wolves, but your program has been a classic  
8 federal overreach.

9           An historic observation would be when  
10 (indiscernible) is imposed on the populace, sometimes  
11 civil disobedience. I suggest you take your wolves and  
12 turn them loose on the Potomac River.

13          MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

14          Next speaker.

15          MR. WARREN: Good evening. My name is  
16 Jim Warren, W-a-r-r-e-n. I'm here representing the  
17 National Wild Turkey Federation, the Arizona chapter  
18 thereof.

19          Thank you very much for hosting this. This is  
20 great to get all sides exposed here, and it's important  
21 that the feelings of democracy gets to be heard.

22          The Turkey Federation -- just to let you know  
23 our Turkey Federation has over 228,000 members  
24 nationwide. It's a big organization. And we have over  
25 1,200 in Arizona, so we carry some impact.

1           We're not against the listing of the Mexican  
2 gray wolf. We're adamantly against the further  
3 expansion of packs into the new area. A number of  
4 these proposed areas have never, in modern history,  
5 held such species, and they should not be introduced  
6 now, supposedly to enhance their recovery from an  
7 endangered list.

8           There's a reason the name Mexican is used in  
9 describing the species. They originally inhabited  
10 Mexico and southern Arizona, not Colorado, not central  
11 or northern Arizona or northern New Mexico.

12           The Service originally established a limited  
13 recovery area and a population goal. While our goal  
14 has not been formally reached, the territory of the  
15 packs have extended well beyond the original areas.

16           Wolf sightings have been reported in some  
17 communities along the Mogollon Rim, far and away from  
18 their intended recovery range. We don't need more  
19 individual impacts in those areas.

20           We would remind the Service to consider the  
21 probable impact of a greatly expanded recovery  
22 territory upon other species. Some under consideration  
23 for listing as endangered.

24           As an example, we are intimately acquainted  
25 with -- the Turkey Federation has spent the last 20

1 years restoring the once extirpated Gould's turkey in  
2 southern Arizona. Today people in that part of the  
3 state are thrilled to see the majestic bird in mountain  
4 ranges.

5 How long will it be before the Mexican gray  
6 wolf develops a taste for Gould's turkey?

7 You need to recognize the impact of wolf  
8 population on ranchers, outdoorsmen, and others.  
9 They're protecting school children at bus stops over in  
10 Reserve. Is this a zoo in reverse? Do we put citizens  
11 in cages --

12 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you, sir.

13 MR. WARREN: -- so animals can run free?

14 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

15 Next speaker.

16 MR. CRUMBO: My name is Kim Crumbo. That's  
17 K-i-m, C-r-u-m-b-o. I wouldn't kid you about that.

18 I'm a native Utahan, but I've lived for 30  
19 years in northern Arizona, Grand Canyon National Park.

20 I'm the father of two grown boys now. We had  
21 raised them in Grand Canyon, in a small community, in a  
22 park with a bunch of wildlife, including coyotes and  
23 bobcats and cougars. And we only had a little bit of  
24 problems with elk. But they grew up and learned how to  
25 live with wildlife constantly in our backyard. And so

1 I know you can do that.

2 I support the utilization of the best available  
3 science in this whole process. I oppose delisting of  
4 the gray wolf nationwide, simply because I'd like to  
5 see wolves in some of these states -- Utah, where I  
6 live now -- and also because it is supported by the  
7 best available sciences that those animals play an  
8 important ecological role, as well as to provide quite  
9 a bit of wonderful experience and opportunities.

10 I support the listing of the Mexican wolf as an  
11 endangered subspecies, but I oppose the Nonessential  
12 Experimental label. I think, at the very least, it  
13 should be essential experimental population.

14 I suggest -- actually, support eliminating the  
15 whole concept of the Mexican wolf experimental  
16 population area.

17 I think that wolves should be allowed to  
18 inhabit areas that are suitable for their population  
19 growth, and certainly the Mexican wolf recovery team of  
20 scientists planning subgroups make up a recommendation  
21 that you have at least three connected populations of  
22 wolves, and those include areas north of the  
23 interstate. Those are essential for effective recovery  
24 of the Mexican wolf subspecies.

25 And thank you for allowing us to speak.

1 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

2 Next speaker.

3 MS. HUGHES: I'm Billie Hughes, H-u-g-h-e-s.  
4 I'm a second-generation Arizonan; my son, third; my  
5 grandson, fourth.

6 I have come to the White Mountains since the  
7 late '40s or early '50s. We lived in Tucson. My  
8 father worked for the Arizona International Guard, and  
9 his sanity was to be able to come to the wild country  
10 and enjoy hunting and fishing and just being outdoors.

11 I was lucky enough a few years ago to go with  
12 my sister and we happened to hit double synetica, not  
13 looking for wolves, but we heard them howl. And that  
14 was transformation.

15 My mother and father never heard a wolf howl.  
16 My son has not, and my grandson has not. And I hope I  
17 don't leave a world for them where there are no wolves  
18 howling.

19 I'm a native of Arizona. I represent the White  
20 Mountain Conservation League and Great Old Broads for  
21 Wilderness. I border the Forest Service. We have had  
22 wolves come close. I've never been lucky enough to see  
23 one, but have found signs. I welcome them. I take  
24 care of them.

25 I do not support the delisting of the wolf

1 nationwide. I do support the essential status, the  
2 protected status, for the Mexican gray wolf. I do not  
3 support limiting their habitat. They need to be able  
4 to move. We need to be able to put these into the  
5 Gila, into all of the different areas and return this  
6 animal to its role in protecting our environment.  
7 Thank you.

8 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

9 Next speaker.

10 MS. OSSORIO: Good evening. My name is  
11 Jean Ossorio. That's spelled J-e-a-n, O-s-s-o-r-i-o.

12 I come to this hearing today having just spent  
13 my 340th and 341st night tent camping in the home range  
14 of the Mexican wolf pack, in this case, the Elkhorn  
15 pack.

16 In this season, when it's a tradition to  
17 express gratitude, I am deeply thankful that the  
18 Mexican wolf, extinct from this land for over 50 years,  
19 has returned.

20 Once more loco pups stumble from the mouths of  
21 rocky dens to greet the sun. I've seen half-grown pups  
22 coming through the snowdrifts in secluded meadows.  
23 Older ones learn from their elders how to be wolves,  
24 tracking and killing elk, forming packs, and producing  
25 the next generation of lobos.

1 All is not well with our lobos, however.  
2 Scientists tell us that more releases are necessary to  
3 genetically rescue our population in jeopardy from  
4 inbreeding depression.

5 At least two more wild populations, with some  
6 genetic exchange between them, are necessary for  
7 long-term survival and recovery. The ideal places,  
8 they say, are the Grand Canyon region and the Southern  
9 Rockies, Northern New Mexico, and Southern Colorado.

10 This proposed rule would effectively prevent  
11 wolves from reaching those areas, against the  
12 recommendations of the science panel of the current  
13 recovery team.

14 Please ammend the proposal, allowing wolves to  
15 move freely across human designated boundary lines. If  
16 formal boundaries are needed to define the experimental  
17 population area, let them be Interstate 70 on the north  
18 and the Mexican border on the south.

19 Please complete the recovery plan. Complete  
20 this EIS and get on with more releases. Thank you.

21 And thanks to the White Mountain Apache Tribe  
22 for hosting this meeting and hosting packs of lobos on  
23 their tribal land.

24 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

25 I'm going to call more speakers. John Tate,

1 Tom Macnab, Thomas Hulen, Mike Edwards, and  
2 Brianna Edwards.

3 MR. EDWARDS: Hi. My name is Mike Edwards,  
4 E-d-w-a-r-d-s.

5 I'm unnested, but I've been to school, and I  
6 remember my classes. I know Mother Nature keeps a  
7 harmony in nature. For thousands and thousands of  
8 years, our ecosystem has been healthy. It's only the  
9 introduction of humans that have destroyed our ecology  
10 and decimated the whole population.

11 I'm here to support the wolves. I believe they  
12 should be released in the wild. I believe the borders  
13 should be taken away and let Mother Nature determine  
14 where the wolves should roam and habitat.

15 I understand the ranchers' financial losses  
16 because of wolves, and I believe the federal government  
17 should reimburse the ranchers for their financial  
18 losses so that they don't take it out on the wolves.

19 Let wolves be in the wild. Let them find where  
20 they need to live by themselves. Thank you.

21 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

22 Next speaker.

23 MR. TATE: My name is John Tate, T-a-t-e.

24 I reside in Heber. I'm a life-long resident of  
25 Arizona, board member of the CMLUA, Citizens for

1 Multiple Land Use and Access.

2 I have lived in this country and spent time  
3 here all my life. My father was a logger, who watched  
4 the wildlife. We've enjoyed the wildlife. I'm a  
5 sportsman. I hunt. We have a good elk herd. Not so  
6 good for the deer.

7 About 100 years ago, there was no elk in this  
8 country. They were killed off by settlers and wolves  
9 together. In 1912, my hometown of Winslow replanted  
10 those elk. 100 years later, we have one of the finest  
11 herds of elk -- not in numbers, but in quality -- in  
12 the nation.

13 I have friends that worked 16 years for a paper  
14 company in the Northwest. I have friends all over the  
15 Northwest. I talk to them all the time.

16 Their elk herds are devastated by wolves.  
17 Their hunting is devastated. Their economy is shot.  
18 We don't want that here. We can't afford that here.  
19 Our deer herd is in not so good shape already. We  
20 don't need more predators.

21 We have an old rule for bear. We have an old  
22 rule for lion and coyotes. We want control of these  
23 dogs turned over to the Arizona Game and Fish. Thank  
24 you.

25 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

1 Next speaker.

2 MS. EDWARDS: Hi. I'm Brianna Edwards.  
3 I'm here today to help save the Mexican gray wolves.  
4 And I think they should run free and go wherever they  
5 want.

6 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

7 Next speaker.

8 MR. MACNAB: I'm Tom Macnab. That's  
9 M-a-c-n-a-b, as in dangnabbit.

10 Our country has a constitution that recognizes  
11 us as free people. And it recognizes our right to  
12 defend ourselves. Our right to defend our lives,  
13 liberty, and our property.

14 And I'm going to quote you a thing that was  
15 given by the Scottish nobles to the English after the  
16 Battle of Bannockburn, where Scotland became an  
17 independent nation, won by Robert de Bruce against  
18 Edward II.

19 (Reading) "As long as 100 of us remain alive,  
20 we shall never in any way submit to the domination of  
21 the English. For it is not for glory we fight, nor for  
22 honor or for riches, but for freedom alone, which no  
23 good man loses but with his life."

24 Thank you very much.

25 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

1 Next speaker.

2 MS. TRAVERS: Thomas Hulen.

3 MR. HULEN: My name is Thomas Hulen, H-u-l-e-n.  
4 I'm a lifelong Arizona resident. I hunt and fish in  
5 Arizona, as well as several other Western states.

6 I do not support the delisting of the gray  
7 wolf, and I also believe that the Mexican wolf should  
8 be considered essential population. I don't think  
9 there's any way that we can say that 75 wolves in the  
10 wild with two breeding pairs is anywhere near recovered  
11 population. And I question if 100, or even more than  
12 that, would represent that.

13 I do think that we should allow the Mexican  
14 wolf to expand its natural range. We have excellent  
15 evidence that the range was much greater than what's  
16 been proposed by the Fish and Wildlife Service. We  
17 actually have good museum specimens that can verify  
18 that for us.

19 I don't think we should be punishing wolves for  
20 being successful, and I do think, and do appreciate,  
21 the fact that here in the west of the United States,  
22 we have millions of acres of public land that's really  
23 for the use of all of us and not just a few people that  
24 happen to live nearby who make their living from it.

25 It really belongs to all of us, and we should

1 covet that land and protect it the best we can,  
2 including wildlife, which many people seem not to think  
3 that wolves are a part of that wildlife equation.

4 So thank you very much.

5 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

6 This hearing is scheduled to end at 8:30 p.m.  
7 However, due to the large number of registered  
8 speakers, we will take a two-minute break to determine  
9 if we can extend the hearing.

10 We are off the record.

11 (A recess was taken from 8:30 p.m. to  
12 8:32 p.m.)

13 MS. TRAVERS: We will hear from five more  
14 speakers. We are on the record.

15 Stephanie Nichols-Young, Mary Ellen Bitturf,  
16 Corwin Hulsey, Gina Edwards, and Mary MacNab.

17 Next speaker.

18 Please take your seats and allow the speaker to  
19 present. Thank you.

20 MS. MACNAB: I think one thing that's been  
21 overlooked is the fact that the wolves were put on --

22 MS. TRAVERS: Excuse me. What is your name?

23 MS. MACNAB: Mary Macnab, M-a-c-n-a-b.

24 I think one of the things that people are not  
25 taking into consideration, a lot of people come up here

1 and think that it is actually wilderness. But, you  
2 know, our wild and urban interface is in ruins. And  
3 there are communities there. There are economies  
4 there.

5 And as Dr. David L. Leach -- or is it L. David  
6 Leach -- said in the paper that I read -- he's sort of  
7 considered a grand old being of wolf reintroduction.

8 He said that -- and it was kind of enlightening  
9 to me. He said that after wolves recover in their  
10 primary recovery area, eventually as their numbers  
11 expand, they'll wander onto agriculture land.

12 Well, these Mexican wolves for an insight were  
13 put on lands that were entirely agricultural for the  
14 primary recovery. So no wonder there's problems.

15 And people from the city come up and they do  
16 not see that these are people's lands that they run  
17 their livelihoods on. All they see is wilderness.

18 And man is essential to certain balances in  
19 nature too. There's a ranch right on the border of  
20 Arizona and New Mexico, and it has a third of the  
21 entire willow fly population. The reservation is on  
22 each side, where the kettle prinsap (phonetic) have  
23 maybe two or three nesting pairs.

24 It has the densest songbird nesting habitat in  
25 North America. It's got 90 native fish. You know, I

1 can't think of what else.

2 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you, ma'am.

3 Next speaker, please.

4 MS. BITTORF: Thank you for allowing me to  
5 talk. I'm Mary Ellen Bittorf. It's B-i-t-t-o-r-f.

6 I'm president of the White Mountain Audubon  
7 Society, and I'm the founder of the White Mountain  
8 Nature Center. I'm a native Arizonian, and I favor  
9 keeping the Mexican gray wolf listed on the Endangered  
10 Species Act.

11 I believe they're very important to us up here,  
12 to our economy. We've heard a lot of people talk about  
13 how they're not helpful. I know that watching wildlife  
14 in Arizona, as a tourist state, is very important, and  
15 a lot of people come up here to see the wildlife.  
16 Wolves are part of the wildlife.

17 At Audubon and the Nature Center, we have  
18 programs. And, invariably, any program we have that  
19 includes wolves is one of the most popularly attended  
20 programs.

21 I think that I agree with keeping the gray wolf  
22 listed. I do not like the smorgasbord of ways that  
23 people can legally kill the wolves. I think it would  
24 be very difficult for Game and Fish or anybody else to  
25 find a way to protect a wolf that's been killed or find

1 that it was killed illegally. Thank you very much.

2 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

3 Next speaker.

4 MS. NICHOLS-YOUNG: Good evening. My name is  
5 Stephanie Nichols-Young. Sorry, it's a long one.

6 N-i-c-h-o-l-s, hyphen, Y-o-u-n-g.

7 I'm here representing the Animal Defense League  
8 of Arizona. We're a statewide animal protection group  
9 with over 5,000 members here in our state.

10 First, we do support release of wolves  
11 throughout the recovery area. We appreciate that  
12 change to the wolf.

13 We want to express our support for expanding  
14 the recovery area. We support taking the boundary down  
15 from I-10 to the border of Mexico. We're concerned  
16 about the I-10 -- or going to the I-40. We believe it  
17 needs to be further north.

18 We think it's incredibly important -- we know  
19 the Mexican wolves want to come from the current area  
20 and disperse up the Mogollon Rim, and we think it's  
21 incredibly important they be allowed to do that. But  
22 they need to be able to go north of I-40 because the  
23 habitat there at the Grand Canyon region has been  
24 studied, and we know it's better habitat.

25 We know there's a better prey base. There's

1 less dense roads. So there's going to be less  
2 conflict. It's incredibly important that we allow that  
3 habitat to be utilized by wolves.

4 And I want to point out that I say this as  
5 someone whose family owns land on the Mogollon Rim and  
6 has owned that for back a generation.

7 My husband's family, they fished and hiked and  
8 everything along the Rim. I've gone up and down many  
9 trips, backpacked for days. So we've been out in that  
10 area and understand that we'll be coexisting with  
11 wolves too, and we support it, saying that.

12 So sorry to digress to the personal comment.

13 We also want to note that these wolves are  
14 essential that are in the wild. It's incredible to  
15 think that captive wolves were able to go back in the  
16 wild, form packs, learn how to be wild again.

17 And the knowledge that those wolves have, the  
18 genetic population that they are, is incredibly  
19 important. And there is genetic research to support  
20 that.

21 I will stop there and say thank you for the  
22 opportunity to speak. Thank you to Fish and Wildlife.  
23 Thank you to the White Mountain Tribe for allowing us  
24 to use their facility.

25 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

1 I'm going to call two more names.

2 Maureen Hackett and Eva Hernandez.

3 Next speaker.

4 MS. EDWARDS: Hi. My name is Gina Edwards,  
5 E-d-w-a-r-d-s.

6 I'm here to support the Mexican gray wolf.  
7 I oppose the delisting of the gray wolf across this  
8 great nation. Excuse me. I'm a little emotional.

9 Wolves faced almost being extinct, just like  
10 our Bald Eagle and the American buffalo. And so too  
11 did the wolves, and now they're coming back.

12 And to delist the gray wolf, I don't believe in  
13 that. I want to have the wolf there, and the Mexican  
14 gray wolves especially.

15 I'd love to see huge populations of the Mexican  
16 gray wolf for my daughter's future generations and her  
17 grandchildren and her children's grandchildren, to be  
18 able to witness in the wild, and especially to go above  
19 I-40 into the Grand Canyon. I think it would help the  
20 economy up there.

21 Thank you.

22 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

23 Next speaker.

24 MS. HACKETT: Thank you for allowing me to  
25 speak. My name is Maureen Hackett. I came in from

1 Minnesota, and I founded a group called Howling for  
2 Wolves.

3 I'm here to deliver thousands of signatures  
4 supporting the expanded recovery of the Mexican gray  
5 wolf and opposing the blanket delisting of the lower  
6 48 wolves.

7 Our experience in Minnesota has been mostly  
8 favorable in terms of attitudes towards wolves, but I  
9 think it shows how wolves throughout the United States  
10 are at risk under state management. While wolves are  
11 our ally and vegetation growth and there are good  
12 reasons to keep them on the landscape.

13 And, in fact, I just wanted to share with some  
14 of the hunters that when we had the highest numbers of  
15 wolves, we had the highest numbers of white-tail deer.  
16 And that was in the early 2000s.

17 Wolves, you know, have other roles that we're  
18 still trying to understand in public health, such as  
19 Lyme disease.

20 But as soon as the wolves in Minnesota were  
21 post-delisted, we rushed to a hunt. A hunt ensued,  
22 despite a sound wolf management plan that called for a  
23 five-year wait.

24 And in states where the wolves have been  
25 delisted, they've been hunted. And a wolf hunt creates

1 unpredictable results for wolves and for farmers. Even  
2 states like Minnesota are not really prepared for the  
3 potentially increasing depredations caused by these  
4 hunts, possibly due to breaking up packs, randomly  
5 killing well-functioning wolf packs in the wild.

6 Non-lethal methods have not been given for  
7 support of the farmers in our state. And we need to  
8 come together for that.

9 We were lucky enough to delay the delisting  
10 long enough to show that our wolf population did not  
11 expand as David Leach had predicted. It was stable  
12 from '98 to 2008 without a hunt, before the delisting.  
13 And then within one year of the delisting, you've  
14 dropped our population to near 1988 levels, 25 percent.

15 The wolf still faces many, many challenges,  
16 including hate. More than any other species. I will  
17 read you one thing off of a Facebook cite called "Jerry  
18 Kill Wolves Rig."

19 (Reading) "I shot one out my back door  
20 yesterday. It was still alive after the first shot, so  
21 I bashed it with a baseball bat several times. I got  
22 busy, and it's still out there howling."

23 This kind of hate doesn't exist --

24 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

25 MS. HACKETT: -- for other species.

1 MS. TRAVERS: Next speaker, please.

2 Next speaker.

3 MS. HERNANDEZ: Hello. It's been a long night.  
4 Thank you for letting me speak. I'm here to --

5 MS. TRAVERS: What's your name?

6 MS. HERNANDEZ: Oh, sorry. Eva Hernandez,  
7 H-e-r-n-a-n-d-e-z.

8 I'm here to oppose the wolf delisting, the gray  
9 wolf, in general. It has been proven scientifically  
10 and not supported by many scientists that they still  
11 need more time to recover. Pack structure is extremely  
12 important, and the ecosystem recovery is amazing. Now  
13 this is a great example of this.

14 I'm also here to say that I do not support the  
15 delisting -- or taking the delisting of the Mexican  
16 gray wolf as a subspecies. And I am in support of  
17 possibly doing more research before making any ruling,  
18 any sort of recovery plan for them.

19 The recovery plan was originally done in 1981.  
20 That is severely outdated. It really, really needs to  
21 be revised and looked at before any kind of new laws  
22 can be made.

23 It is extremely essential for these animals in  
24 a healthy ecosystem to be able to disperse and have  
25 connectivity between different parks and different

1 land. They don't, unfortunately, read maps.

2 The Grand Canyon eco-region is a prime place  
3 for them to be able to disperse. A study done by a  
4 girl at Ault, they actually looked at the population  
5 connectivity in that area. They used GIS and new  
6 technology that hasn't been used in the recovery plans  
7 before, showing that it is suitable habitat.

8 So in both those cases, I cannot support  
9 delisting, and I definitely would like to see more  
10 science with that rather than politics. Thank you.

11 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

12 Next speaker. Corwin Hulsey.

13 Oliver Starr.

14 MR. STARR: Good evening. My name is  
15 Oliver Starr, S-t-a-r-r. I'm the grandson of a  
16 well-known Colorado cattlemen.

17 I studied canine anthology at the University of  
18 Colorado and have spent the last 30 years studying and  
19 raising wolves. I believe I know and understand these  
20 animals in a way few others do. I also grew up in the  
21 culture of fear and hatred of wolves that permeates the  
22 ranching community.

23 In spite of this conflicted background, I am  
24 opposed to the blanket delisting of gray wolves and  
25 strongly in favor of more comprehensive efforts to

1 recover the Mexican gray wolf.

2           While there are some valid concerns about  
3 wolves, there is no question that wolves are more  
4 important to the health of ecosystems than cattle.  
5 Wolves belong in the landscape, while cattle are the  
6 damaging and evasive species that fouls the water,  
7 destroys the range, and out competes natural ungulate  
8 populations. Beyond this, much of the land where  
9 cattle are grazed belongs not to the ranchers but to  
10 we, the people.

11           Wolves have existed in the dynamic balance with  
12 their prey for a millennium. They do not decimate  
13 herds, as someone just claimed, but regulate them in  
14 harmony with nature. Wolves manage themselves. They  
15 do not need to be managed.

16           Some argue that states are better suited to  
17 managing their wolf population. But we have seen how  
18 that has worked out for the wolf, and we've seen the  
19 photos of the horrors visited upon wolves in every  
20 state where management rights have been returned.

21           This is not management; it is extermination.

22           The Mexican gray wolf is a unique subspecies  
23 that requires ongoing federal protection and expansion  
24 of the recovery range and additional releases.

25 Anything less will result in the second extinction at

1 the hands of man.

2 These animals are not an experiment. They are  
3 an essential component of an ecosystem that evolved  
4 before man even set foot in these lands.

5 Wolves are highly intelligent, social, and  
6 mutually interdependent creatures. They work together  
7 and care for each other, and they suffer anguish when  
8 they lose a member of their families.

9 In the 30 years I've spent working with wolves,  
10 I found them to be more humane than the humans that  
11 glorify in snuffing them out.

12 It will only be through continued and expanded  
13 federal protection that the Mexican gray wolf can  
14 regain its foothold in suitable territories --

15 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you, sir.

16 MR. STARR: -- and exert a crucial role --

17 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you, sir.

18 MR. STARR: -- as the most --

19 MS. TRAVERS: Thank you.

20 On behalf of the U.S. Fish and Wildlife  
21 Service, we appreciate the time and effort you took  
22 this evening to present your comments. They have been  
23 very informative and will be fully considered in their  
24 final decision.

25 Again, as a reminder, written comments may be

1 submitted to the staff at the registration table, or  
2 they may be submitted to the U.S. Fish and Wildlife  
3 Service by December 17, 2013.

4 The hearing is closed. I show the time to be  
5 8:45. We are off the record.

6 (The hearing concluded at 8:45 p.m.)

7 \* \* \* \* \*

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

STATE OF ARIZONA        )  
                                  )  ss.  
COUNTY OF MARICOPA    )

BE IT KNOWN that the foregoing hearing was taken before me, CINDY BACHMAN, Certified Reporter No. 50763, in and for the State of Arizona; that the testimony was taken down by the Voice Writing method and thereafter translated into text via speech recognition under my direction; that the foregoing pages are a true and correct transcript of all proceedings had upon the taking of said hearing, all done to the best of my skill and ability.

I FURTHER CERTIFY that I am in no way related to any of the parties hereto nor am I in any way interested in the outcome hereof.

DATED at Tempe, Arizona, this 17th day of December, 2013.

---

Cindy Bachman, CR  
Certified Reporter No. 50763