



United States Department of the Interior

FISH AND WILDLIFE SERVICE
Washington D.C. 20240



In Reply Refer To:
FWS/FOIA

February 27, 2024

Letter via email at: dlrinaldi@netscape.net

Mr. Dean Rinaldi
85 Whipple Road
Kittery, Maine 03904

REF: DOI-FWS-2024-000299

Dear Mr. Rinaldi:

This responds to your Freedom of Information Act (FOIA) request dated January 27, 2024, in which you seek the following: *All information between the dates of August 1, 2020 and January 15, 2021 regarding FWS Realty's proposal to Support the Pink House Inc to get into a new Agreement to Initiate Exchange for The Pink House at 60 Plum Island Turnpike, Newbury, MA 01951, including all communications leading to, and following, a conference call on September 25, 2020, and the signing of the AIE in December 2020.* Please refer to tracking number noted above in communications regarding this request.

Response

In response to your request, 143 pages are being released to you. Based on this office's review, we reasonably foresee that disclosure of certain information in documents that fall under this request would harm an interest protected by one or more of the nine exemptions to the FOIA's general rule of disclosure. Accordingly, from the responsive records, portions of 16 records are partially redacted pursuant to FOIA Exemption (b)(5) and (b)(6), as described below.

Exemption 5 of the FOIA

Exemption 5 allows an agency to withhold "inter-agency or intra-agency memorandums or letters which would not be available by law to a party... in litigation with the agency." (5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(5)). Exemption 5 therefore incorporates the privileges that protect materials from discovery in litigation, including the deliberative process, attorney work-product, attorney-client, and commercial information privileges.

We partially redacted six pages pursuant to the commercial information privilege of Exemption 5. The information withheld under this privilege consists of active conference call telephone numbers and access codes, which could be used to conduct conference calls by parties outside the government or used to call in to monitor internal government conversations. We are withholding it because disclosure to the public would chill communications between federal employees, harm the government's ability to exchange information, and waste government financial resources.

When the government enters the marketplace as an ordinary commercial buyer or seller, the government's information is protected under the commercial information privilege if it is sensitive information not otherwise available, and disclosure would significantly harm the government's monetary functions or commercial interests. In regard to conference call numbers, if the information was released, the government's financial interest would be significantly harmed as the calls would no longer be private and the funds spent on purchasing the information would be wasted. We are releasing the majority of the communication that would not harm the Service's commercial interests.

Exemption 6 of the FOIA

Exemption 6 allows an agency to withhold "personnel and medical files and similar files the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(6). We are withholding 16 pages in part under Exemption 6.

The phrase "similar files" covers any agency records containing information about a particular individual that can be identified as applying to that individual. To determine whether releasing records containing information about a particular individual would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy, we are required to balance the privacy interest that would be affected by disclosure against any public interest in the information.

Under the FOIA, the only relevant public interest to consider under the exemption is the extent to which the information sought would shed light on an agency's performance of its statutory duties or otherwise let citizens 'know what their government is up to.' The burden is on the requester to establish that disclosure would serve the public interest. When the privacy interest at stake and the public interest in disclosure have been determined, the two competing interests must be weighed against one another to determine which is the greater result of disclosure: the harm to personal privacy or the benefit to the public. The purposes for which the request for information is made do not impact this balancing test, as a release of information requested under the FOIA constitutes a release to the general public.

The information that has been withheld under Exemption 6 consists of contact information (e.g. email addresses and phone numbers), and we have determined that the individuals to whom this information pertains have a substantial privacy interest in withholding it. Additionally, you have not provided information that explains a relevant public interest under the FOIA in the disclosure of this personal information and we have determined that the disclosure of this information would shed little or no light on the performance of the agency's statutory duties. Because the harm to personal privacy is greater than whatever public interest may be served by disclosure,

release of the information would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of the privacy of these individuals, and we are withholding it under Exemption 6.

The undersigned is responsible for this partial denial. This response to your FOIA request was made in consultation with Andrew Tittler, Attorney-Advisor, Office of the Solicitor, Northeast Region, U.S. Department of the Interior (Department).

Mediation/Dispute Resolution

If after contacting us as described below, you need further information or assistance with your request, you may wish to seek dispute resolution services from the Department's FOIA Public Liaison, Natasha Jones by email at doifoiapublicliaison@sol.doi.gov.

If you need further information or assistance after contacting the Department's FOIA Public Liaison, you may wish to seek dispute resolution services from the Office of Government Information Services (OGIS). The 2007 FOIA amendments created the OGIS to offer mediation services to resolve disputes between FOIA requesters and Federal agencies as a non-exclusive alternative to litigation. Using OGIS services does not affect your right to pursue litigation. You may contact OGIS in any of the following ways:

Office of Government Information Services
National Archives and Records Administration
8601 Adelphi Road - OGIS
College Park, MD 20740-6001
E-mail: ogis@nara.gov
Web: <https://www.archives.gov/ogis>
Telephone: 202-741-5770
Fax: 202-741-5769
Toll-free: 1-877-684-6448

Please note that using OGIS services does not affect the timing of filing an appeal with the Department's FOIA & Privacy Act Appeals Officer.

Appeal Rights

You may appeal this response to the Department's FOIA/Privacy Act Appeals Officer. If you choose to appeal, the FOIA/Privacy Act Appeals Officer must receive your FOIA appeal no later than 90 workdays from the date of this final response. Appeals arriving or delivered after 5:00 p.m. Eastern Time, Monday through Friday, will be deemed received on the next workday.

Your appeal must be made in writing. You may submit your appeal and accompanying materials to the FOIA/Privacy Act Appeals Officer by mail, courier service, fax, or email. All communications concerning your appeal should be clearly marked with the words: "FREEDOM OF INFORMATION APPEAL." You must include an explanation of why you believe this response is in error. You must also include with your appeal copies of all correspondence between you and FWS concerning your FOIA request, including your original FOIA request and

this response. Failure to include with your appeal all correspondence between you and FWS will result in the Department's rejection of your appeal, unless the FOIA/Privacy Act Appeals Officer determines (in the FOIA/Privacy Act Appeals Officer's sole discretion) that good cause exists to accept the defective appeal.

Please include your name and daytime telephone number (or the name and telephone number of an appropriate contact), email address and fax number (if available) in case the FOIA/Privacy Act Appeals Officer needs additional information or clarification of your appeal.

DOI FOIA/Privacy Act Appeals Office Contact Information

Department of the Interior
Office of the Solicitor
1849 C Street, N.W.
MS-6556 MIB
Washington, DC 20240
Attn: FOIA/Privacy Act Appeals Office
Telephone: (202) 208-5339
Fax: (202) 208-6677
Email: FOIA.Appeals@sol.doi.gov

Conclusion

For your information, Congress excluded three discrete categories of law enforcement and national security records from the requirements of FOIA. See [5 U.S.C. § 552\(c\)](#). This response is limited to those records that are subject to the requirements of FOIA. This is a standard notification that is given to all our requesters and should not be taken as an indication that excluded records do, or do not, exist.

This completes the Service's response. If you have any questions regarding this request, please contact Government Information Specialist, David Tischer, by email at david_tischer@fws.gov.

Sincerely,

FOIA Coordinator