Portland Harbor NRDA: Phase 2 Work Plan

David Allen
Stratus Consulting Inc.
Marquette, MI

April 23, 2010
Agenda

- Interaction between trustees and participating parties
- Debit calculations
- Restoration planning
- Credit calculations
Interaction between the Trustees and the Participating Parties
Phasing Phase 2

- Year 1: efficient input into trustees’ initial positions for Habitat Equivalency Analysis (HEA), Resource Equivalency Analysis (REA), and Benefit Transfer (BT)
- Year 2: resolve disagreements
- Year 3: settlements or move on to Phase 3
Year 1 of Phase 2

- Trustees will propose inputs for HEA, REA, and BT systematically, efficiently, and with real opportunities for participation.
- Participating parties must decide how to participate efficiently and meaningfully.
- Regardless, trustees will move through all of the necessary inputs the first year.
- Best way to determine whether settlement is achievable (for both sides).
Year 1 of Phase 2 (cont.)

- Quarterly in-person meetings
- Exchange of materials between meetings
  - Memoranda
  - Analyses (spreadsheets, model outputs, maps, figures, etc.)
  - Documentation of tentative agreements and disagreements
- Discussions (calls, PowerPoint presentations via web, etc.)
Year 1 of Phase 2 (cont.)

- Trustees will forecast topics for each quarterly meeting, and will prepare analyses and propose inputs for each meeting.
- Participating parties can propose different or additional topics, prepare alternative analyses and inputs, but must decide how to be efficient.
- Purpose of Year 1 is to create an initial view of the entire field to determine the viability of settlement (for both sides).
Year 2 of Phase 2

- Iterate
- Context (which disagreements matter?)
- Reasonable compromises evident?
- Reasonable analyses available to narrow disputes?
- Reasonable data collections available to narrow disputes?
- Efficient, purposeful scheduling and execution
Year 3 of Phase 2

- Consequential disputes either narrow or not
- Each side (or individual parties) determines whether time and energy are better spent on Phase 2 or Phase 3
- Document agreements in principle (binding?) and prepare for timely settlements
Debit Calculations
HEA Debit

- Many “easy” issues (e.g., discount rate and time period)

- First difficult issue: converting sediment concentrations via relevant thresholds into rational habitat % service losses
  - How much of the wheel to reinvent?
  - Benthic versus vertebrate (REA?)
  - Background and baseline
  - Combining chemicals, species, and endpoints
HEA Debit (cont.)

- Easy to disagree
- Easy to point to uncertainty
- Impossible to know how hard to fight without the context of scale and cost of practical restoration opportunities
- So: populate the HEA debit inputs and identify the priorities for further discussion in Year 2
- NOAA tool will allow efficient testing of inputs
Other Debits

- BT
  - How much site-specific data to fine tune transfer from existing economics literature?
  - How much site-specific data to fine tune PH use estimates?

- How to combine HEA, REA, BT, and navigation debits?
Restoration Planning Underway

- Criteria
- Opportunities and priorities within the PH Study Area
- Opportunities and priorities within the larger geographic boundaries for restoration
- How to compare relative costs, relative benefits, and relative cost-effectiveness
- Opportunities to address tribal and recreational losses
Credit Calculations
HEA Credit Calculations

- Site-specific data needed to resolve likely arguments about benefits/effectiveness?
  - Timeline for preservation benefits to accrue (development likelihood)?
  - Timeline for restoration actions to begin and mature (can we really build it?)
  - Geographical nexus
  - Realistic, complete cost estimates that include monitoring and contingencies
HEA Credit Calculations (cont.)

- How to compare assessment habitats (with and without hazardous substances) with restoration habitats (with and without restoration actions) with ideal habitats: **Baseline**
- Can we explain cost-effectiveness variability enough to create reasonable $/DSAY metrics?
- Practicality and timing of restoration banking?
Other Credits

- How to ensure that restoration for BT navigation debits are sufficiently of natural resources?
- How to combine HEA, REA, BT, and navigation credits to allow for comprehensive settlements?