

**A MANUAL FOR CONDUCTING
NATURAL RESOURCE
DAMAGE ASSESSMENT: THE ROLE OF ECONOMICS**

Prepared for:

Division of Economics
Fish and Wildlife Service
U.S. Department of the Interior

Prepared by:

Robert E. Unsworth and Timothy B. Petersen
Industrial Economics, Incorporated
Cambridge, Massachusetts

PREFACE

This manual is intended as a training tool for U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service field personnel in the application of economics to assess damages resulting from the release of oil or other hazardous materials to the environment. The purpose of the manual is not to provide a step-by-step guide for the conduct of primary economic analysis, but to provide an understanding of how economics fits within the overall damage assessment process. With this understanding, Service personnel can work as members of the damage assessment team to assure that investigations which are performed are of maximum benefit to the overall damage assessment process.

This manual was prepared under contract with the Division of Economics, U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service. We received assistance in the development of this manual from a number of Department of the Interior and National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration employees. These include: Mark Barash, Jim Bennett, Ron Britton, Linda Burlington, Jim Caudill, David Chapman, John Charbonneau, Rick Dawson, Pete Escherich, Robin Kohn Glazer, Shelly Hall, Michael Hay, Roger Helm, Jim Hirshfield, Hart Hodges, Frank Horvath, Carol Jones, Drew Laughland, Norman Meade, Bruce Peacock, Dick Pederson, Cindi Perry, Steve Robertson, Dave Rosenberger, Anne Secord, Dan Sparks, Molly Spredudo, Barry Stein, Patty Stevens, and Jeff Underwood.

This manual reflects the final guidelines on natural resource damage assessment published by the U.S. Department of the Interior and the proposed guidelines on natural resource damage assessment published by the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration as of April 1995.

This manual does not represent official Department of Interior or Fish and Wildlife Service guidance or policy. The opinions and assertions expressed in this manual are solely those of the authors.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Executive Summary	vii
ES.1 Introduction	vii
ES.2 An Overview of Natural Resource Damage Assessment	viii
ES.3 Restoration Costing for Purposes of Natural Resource Damage Assessment	ix
ES.4 Primary and Secondary Methods for Compensable Value Determination	x
ES.5 The Role of Time in Natural Resource Damage Assessment	xi
ES.6 Uncertainty in Damage Assessment	xii
INTRODUCTION	CHAPTER 1
1.1 The Purpose of This Document	1
1.2 Relationship of Natural Resource Damage Claims to CERCLA Site Remediation and Oil Spill Response Activities	2
1.3 An Overview of Natural Resource Damage Assessment	2
1.3.1 Components of a Natural Resource Damage Claim	2
1.3.2 The Meaning of Services and Value in Natural Resource Economics	3
1.3.3 What Categories of Economic Damage are Compensable?	5
1.3.4 What Categories of Economic Damage are Not Compensable?	6
1.3.5 The Relationship Between Restoration Costs and Compensable Values	7
1.4 Tracking Assessment Costs	9
1.5 Interior's Trust Resources	9
1.6 Overview of Manual	11
THE DAMAGE ASSESSMENT PROCESS	CHAPTER 2
2.1 Introduction	13
2.2 Preassessment	16
2.2.1 Assessment Procedures Available Under DOI and NOAA Rules	18

2.3	Assessment Planning	21
2.3.1	Development of a Preliminary Estimate of Damages	22
2.3.2	Preparation of a Damage Assessment Plan	26
2.4	Assessment	28
2.4.1	Injury Determination	28
2.4.2	Injury Quantification	29
2.4.3	Damage Determination	29
2.4.4	Data Gathering to Support Compensable Value Determination	30
2.4.5	The Need for Focused Studies	30
2.4.6	Perishable Data	31
2.5	Post Assessment	31

**RESTORATION COSTING FOR PURPOSES OF
NATURAL RESOURCE DAMAGE ASSESSMENT CHAPTER 3**

3.1	Introduction	33
3.2	DOI and NOAA Guidance on Restoration Costing	34
3.2.1	The Role of Cost in Restoration Alternative Selection	34
3.2.2	Categories of Cost to Include in the Restoration Cost Estimate	35
3.2.3	Cost Estimating Methodologies	35
3.2.4	Pooling of Restoration Funds	36
3.2.5	Phased Approach to Natural Resource Restoration	37
3.3	Typical Restoration Cost Components	37
3.3.1	Planning Costs	39
3.3.2	Implementation Costs	39
3.3.3	Project Evaluation and Monitoring Costs	39
3.3.4	Costs of Acquiring Equivalent Resources	40
3.4	Time Frame of Restoration Activities	40
3.4.1	Inflation	40
3.4.2	Recurrent Expenses	41
3.5	Uncertainty in Restoration Costing	41
3.6	Restoration Costing Example	42

PRIMARY METHODS FOR COMPENSABLE VALUE DETERMINATION	CHAPTER 4
4.1	Introduction 45
4.2	Overview of Economic Valuation 46
4.2.1	The Concept of Consumer Surplus 46
4.2.2	Methods for Estimating Compensable Values 48
4.3	Market-based Approaches 50
4.3.1	Market Demand and Supply Models 50
4.3.2	Fee Losses 51
4.3.3	Appraisal Methodology 52
4.4	Added or Averted Cost 52
4.5	Revealed Preference 53
4.5.1	Travel Cost Models 53
4.5.2	Property Valuation Models 54
4.6	Factor Income Methodology 56
4.7	Contingent Valuation 56
4.8	Habitat Equivalency 60
	Case Study: Injury to Service-Owned Lands 64
4.9	Identifying and Addressing Double-Counting 67
SECONDARY METHODS FOR NATURAL RESOURCE VALUATION: BENEFITS TRANSFER	CHAPTER 5
5.1	Introduction 69
5.2	Definition of Benefits Transfer 70
5.3	Steps for Benefits Transfer 71
5.3.1	Identify Resources and Services 71
5.3.2	Identify Relevant Existing Studies 72
5.3.3	Evaluate Applicability of Existing Studies 72

5.3.4	Conduct Full Benefits Transfer	78
5.4	Uses and Types of Benefits Transfer	79
5.4.1	When to Use Benefits Transfer	79
5.4.2	Types of Benefits Transfer	80
	Case Study: Economic Damages Resulting from Diminished Recreational Services ...	81
	Case Study: Economic Damages Resulting from Injury to Endangered Species	85
	Case Study: Transferring a Valuation Function for Groundwater Valuation	87
	Case Study: Economic Damage Resulting from Injury to Migratory Waterfowl	89
5.4.3	Transfers of Activity Data	92
5.5	Limitations of Benefits Transfer	93
5.6	Commonly Referenced Sources for Use in Benefits Transfer	93
5.7	Use of Public and Private Expenditures and Activity Data	94

The Role of Time in Natural Resource Damage Assessment **Chapter 6**

6.1	Introduction	97
6.2	Key Concepts in Discounting	98
6.2.1	Discounting in Damage Assessment	99
6.2.2	Individual Rate of Time Preference	100
6.2.3	Real and Nominal Discount Rates	101
6.3	DOI and NOAA Guidance on Discounting	102
6.4	Discounting Compensable Losses for Purposes of Natural Resource Damage Assessment	103
	Example: Discounting Compensable Losses to Generate a Present Value Damage Claim	104
6.5	Expressing Damage Assessment Costs in Present Value Terms	106
	Example: Calculation of Present Value Damage Assessment Costs	107
6.6	Capital Budgeting for Purposes of Restoration Costing	108
6.6.1	Interest on Recovered Funds	108
	Example: Estimating the Present Value of a Restoration Cost Claim	109

**ASSESSING UNCERTAINTY AND
DATA LIMITATIONS IN DAMAGE ASSESSMENT CHAPTER 7**

7.1 Introduction 111

7.2 Sources of Uncertainty in Damage Assessment 111

7.3 The Value of Additional Information 112

Case Study of a Damage Assessment Under Uncertainty 113

APPENDICES

Appendix A: ABBREVIATIONS AND GLOSSARY OF TERMS 119

Appendix B: ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY 127

Appendix C: SAMPLE FORMAT FOR
ECONOMIC DAMAGE ASSESSMENT DOCUMENT 145

REFERENCES 151

INDEX 161