

Appendix D
EIS Scoping Comments

Buckeye EIS NEPA Scoping Comment Summary

Commenter	Date	Topic	Theme	Comment Summary	Comment Page #	Treatment of Comment in EIS
Diane McConnell	February 9, 2010	Bat habitat	Potential habitat locations	Includes map with caves that could be winter habitat for Indiana Bats in Salem Twp., Champaign County.	1	
Ohio Power Siting Board Staff	March 1, 2010	Expedient review	Financial advantages to commencing construction	There may be financial advantages, both at the state and federal level, to commencing construction of the proposed project by a certain date.	3	
Ohio Power Siting Board Staff	March 1, 2010	Renewable energy	Compliance with renewable energy requirements	Renewable generation from the proposed wind facility could be used to assist in complying with the renewable energy requirements.	3	
Ohio Power Siting Board Staff	March 1, 2010	Operations	Limitations on project operation	<p>Limitations on project operation (such as curtailment regimes for turbines during prime activity) may impact the economics of the project and may also reduce the amount of renewable energy credits (RECs) generated by the facility.</p> <p>Recommends that any consideration of cut-in speeds rely on the scientific data available to date on the topic.</p>	4	
Ohio Power Siting Board Staff	March 1, 2010	Administrative	Ohio Department of Natural Resources	Requests that the Ohio Department of Natural Resources (ODNR), be consulted during the course of the development of any Habitat Conservation Plan.	4	
Ohio Power Siting Board Staff	March 1, 2010	Conditions for any permit	Staff recommended conditions	<p>Staff recommended conditions from Staff Report in Case No. 08-666-EL-BGN. (Case was pending at the date of the letter). Conditions relate to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Compliance with all applicable permits and authorizations - stream crossing plan 		

Commenter	Date	Topic	Theme	Comment Summary	Comment Page #	Treatment of Comment in EIS
				<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - electric collection system plan - tree clearing plan - access plan - erosion and sedimentation control measures - best management practices (BMPs) when working in the vicinity of environmentally-sensitive areas - develop and implement a post-construction avian and bat mortality survey plan - if applicable, develop a Habitat Conservation Plan (HCP) and obtain the associated Incidental Take Permit (ITP) from the USFWS - prepare a Phase I cultural resources survey program for archeological work - conduct an architectural survey of the project area 		
Van Kley & Walker, LLC, for Union Neighbors United,	March 1, 2010	Habitat	Need to protect forested ridge tops and agricultural/fragmented forest habitats	Protection of both forested ridge tops and agricultural/fragmented forest habitats is vitally important for this species, and both are located in the area in and around EverPower's turbine sites.	3	
Van Kley & Walker, LLC, for Union Neighbors United,	March 1, 2010	Presence of bats	Bats are prevalent in nearby areas	Indiana bats are also prevalent in nearby areas, from which they can fly into EverPower's turbines.	4	
Van Kley & Walker, LLC, for Union Neighbors United,	March 1, 2010	Cumulative impacts	EverPower's turbines will exacerbate the population losses already being experienced.	Indiana bat populations are under assault from a variety of threats, including White-Nose Syndrome and the loss of summer and winter habitats.	4	
Van Kley & Walker, LLC, for Union	March 1, 2010	Environmental Impact	Environmental Impact Statement	There is potential for significant impacts on the Indiana bat; an Environmental Impact Statement	5	EIS is being prepared

Commenter	Date	Topic	Theme	Comment Summary	Comment Page #	Treatment of Comment in EIS
Neighbors United,		Statement	(EIS) should be prepared	(EIS) is the appropriate level of review for the EverPower project and the other wind energy projects proposed for western Ohio.		
Conservation Law Center	March 1, 2010	Environmental Impact Statement	Environmental Impact Statement (EIS) should be prepared	This request for an ITP requires an EIS under NEPA.	2	EIS is being prepared
Conservation Law Center	March 1, 2010	Environmental Impact Statement	Uncertainties; information gaps can be filled within the time frame of an EIS	<p>There are many uncertainties regarding the local impacts of the Project on the Indiana bat. Several of these information gaps can be filled within the time frame of an EIS and all of the gaps should be analyzed in detail within an EIS.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. uncertainty about Indiana bat habitat needs and use; 2. uncertainty about how many Indiana bats will be killed by the Project's wind turbines over the next several decades; 3. uncertainty about the relationship between local features of the Project site and Indiana bat mortality at that site; 4. uncertainty about the technical specifications of the facility and bat mortality at the site; 5. uncertainty about the impacts of the Project on Indiana bat migration and summer habitat degradation; 6. uncertainty about the ability of possible mitigation and minimization strategies to compensate for the loss of bat individuals and reproductive potential. 7. Cumulative impacts; - 11 additional uncertainties <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - demographic parameters, population trends, and habitat needs and use; - local features of a site and bat mortality 	5-6	

Commenter	Date	Topic	Theme	Comment Summary	Comment Page #	Treatment of Comment in EIS
				<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - technical specifications of wind energy facilities and bat mortality - impacts of wind energy development on Indiana bat migration and summer habitat degradation; - mitigation and minimization strategies to compensate for the loss of bat individuals and reproductive potential; - degree of wind energy development in the Eastern and Midwestern U.S. over next several decades; - how many Indiana bat individuals will be killed by wind turbines over the next several decades; - impact and spread of White Nose Syndrome; - impact of climate change on Indiana bat habitat and hibernacula; - aggregate impact of multiple other threats, such as pathogens and climate change, to the Indiana bat and the availability of high quality summer habitats, migration pathways, hibernacula, and swarming sites over the next several decades 		
Van Kley & Walker, LLC, for Union Neighbors United,	March 1, 2010	Combined or programmatic EIS	These projects should be jointly evaluated through a combined or "programmatic" EIS	<p>If constructed, this and the other projects proposed for western Ohio would present unique risks to the Indiana bat insofar as they would be the first wide-scale wind energy facilities in this portion of the species' range.</p> <p>Potential effects of the wind projects on Indiana bats is highly uncertain and unknown.</p> <p>Action may establish a precedent for future actions with significant effects or represent a decision in principle about a future</p>	5	

Commenter	Date	Topic	Theme	Comment Summary	Comment Page #	Treatment of Comment in EIS
				consideration. Action is related to other actions with individually insignificant but cumulatively significant impacts.		
Van Kley & Walker, LLC, for Union Neighbors United,	March 1, 2010	Categorical exclusion	Project should not be eligible for any categorical exclusion	The individual and cumulative effects of the EverPower project taking into account the effects of White Nose Syndrome and the additional wind energy projects proposed for western Ohio cannot be deemed to be "minor or negligible."	6	
Van Kley & Walker, LLC, for Union Neighbors United,	March 1, 2010	Other bat species	EverPower's project will also harm other species of bats	EverPower's bat consultant found seven bat species in the project area.	7	
Van Kley & Walker, LLC, for Union Neighbors United,	March 1, 2010	Human environment	impacts on the quality of the human environment, including noise, health effects, and shadow flicker, and adverse socioeconomic impacts	The EverPower project will have significant impacts on the quality of the human environment, including noise, health effects, and shadow flicker, and adverse socioeconomic impacts such as diminution in property values.	7	
Van Kley & Walker, LLC, for Union Neighbors United,	March 1, 2010	Conditions for any permit	If the USFWS issues an incidental take permit, the permit should contain the conditions necessary to protect the Indiana Bats	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. prohibit EverPower from damaging any caves that could serve as bat hibernacula 2. protect the trees in which Indiana bats reside while not in hibernacula. 3. no tree clearing should occur between April 1 and November 30 in areas in which Indiana bats may reside 4. require all turbines to be at least five miles away from Indiana bat capture and roost locations, including maternity colonies to prevent Indiana bats from flying into wind 	7-9	

Commenter	Date	Topic	Theme	Comment Summary	Comment Page #	Treatment of Comment in EIS
				<p>turbines or dying of barotraumas - that is the Indiana bat's travel range from summer roost sites for foraging</p> <p>5. require a 10-mile setback from hibernacula.</p> <p>6. establish a suitable setback between riparian corridors and streams habitat and the turbines</p> <p>7. shut down turbines at night during low wind so that Indiana bats will not be struck by the blades during calmer conditions in which they are more likely to fly.</p> <p>8. submit a meaningful post-construction bat mortality plan that not only counts and records the number of bat deaths, but also prevents excessive bat deaths.</p> <p>9. use a phased approach to project development. For the first two years, EverPower should be allowed to construct and operate 1/5 of the planned turbines while monitoring the turbines' effects</p>		
Conservation Law Center	March 1, 2010	Research	Research	Intensive multi-year surveys using the latest technology are needed to identify whether and to what extent Indiana bats may use the Project area for migration and/or summer foraging or roosting		
Jim & Karel Davis	June 14, 2010	Wildlife	Endangered Species Act.	Do not exempt the project from the Endangered Species Act. Protect the endangered species from all possible threats from mankind.	1	
Piqua Shawnee Tribe, Gene Park, Elder,	June 24, 2010	Cultural resources	Sacred Indian Mound and archeological sites	<p>Requests protection of sacred sites including Indian Mounds and archeological sites. Requesting a complete site test. One Turbine will be located very close to the Sacred Mound; concerned about the construction footprint at that location (map enclosed with comments).</p> <p>Requests that the Siting Board allow the necessary Archeological surveys to be</p>	1,2	

Commenter	Date	Topic	Theme	Comment Summary	Comment Page #	Treatment of Comment in EIS
				conducted within all wind turbine sites.		
Van Kley & Walker, LLC, for Union Neighbors United,	June 25, 2010	Conditions for any permit	night curtailment in low wind	Emphasize that night curtailment in low wind will not adequately protect the bats unless accompanied by five-mile setbacks separating the turbines from roost or capture locations and ten-mile setbacks from hibernacula. If turbines are allowed in areas frequented by Indiana bats , the Maximally Restricted Operations Alternative should be employed.	2	
Van Kley & Walker, LLC, for Union Neighbors United,	June 25, 2010	Conditions for any permit	Maximally Restricted Operations Alternative	Maximally Restricted Operations Alternative should be used if EverPower does not substantially supplement its efforts to find the existing Indiana bat roosts, maternity colonies, and hibernacula in the project area.	3	
Van Kley & Walker, LLC, for Union Neighbors United,	June 25, 2010	Conditions for any permit	southern meteorological tower	Southern meteorological tower is a hot spot of bat activity. USFWS should not allow EverPower to install wind turbines within a setback distance of five miles of this tower.	4	
Lindsay Masters, Jon Ippolito, & Aubrey Coffey-Urban	June 25, 2010	Permit issuance - research need	If the USFWS cannot determine what the effect on the endangered species will be, it cannot grant the permit	More research should be conducted in order to determine: (1) what attracts bats to the area, (2) how many bats would be killed both directly and indirectly by the wind turbines; and, (3) potential ways to deter bats from the area. Other harmful factors that could negatively affect the survival of the species.	2, 4	
Lindsay Masters, Jon Ippolito, & Aubrey Coffey-Urban	June 25, 2010	Conditions for any permit	Habitat	The best way to increase the amount of summer roosting habitat available would be to create a new section of forest with a diverse age structure in a riparian environment.	2	
Lindsay Masters, Jon Ippolito, & Aubrey Coffey-Urban	June 25, 2010	Conditions for any permit	Research	The USFWS should use the Champaign County wind energy site as a bat-wind turbine study location throughout the course of its development.	5	

Commenter	Date	Topic	Theme	Comment Summary	Comment Page #	Treatment of Comment in EIS
DiAnne Doss	Undated (file date 7-19-10)	Need	Energy efficiency	These 490 foot wind turbines are not efficient. They have a massive environmental footprint and any energy generated by them is miniscule.	1	
DiAnne Doss	Undated (file date 7-19-10)	Wildlife	Takes	Application will potentially lead to the destruction of not only the Indiana Bat population, but to numerous wildlife species.	1	
Julie Scordato	Undated (file date 7-19-10)	Wildlife	Takes	Very wary of the idea that a take permit can mitigate the impact of the turbines on our bat population. Besides the endangered species factor, the Indiana Bat, like honey bees, and other native pollinators/pest controllers are integral to Champaign County's agricultural well being.		
Vicci Weeks	Undated (file date 7-19-10)	Wildlife	Takes	A HCP should not be allowed for this facility due to the lack of information regarding endangered Indiana Bat migration. Ohio is bordered by 2 states having the largest over-wintering populations of endangered Indiana bats...Indiana and Kentucky. We should not be sacrificing endangered species for wind power, regardless of how much money is involved. Because of the amount of land fragmented by wind power along with its invasion of air space, these species are particularly at risk from the implementation of a HPC.		
Robert Wagner, President Board of Directors, International Dark-Sky Association	Undated (file date 7-19-10)	Lighting impacts	Model Lighting Ordinance	Recommends a Model Lighting Ordinance be developed for the Indiana Bat, comparable to model ordinances developed for Marine Turtles.		
Robert Wagner, President Board of Directors, International	Undated (file date 7-19-10)	Lighting and birds	Obstacle Collision Avoidance Systems technologies	Recommends investigating Obstacle Collision Avoidance Systems technologies that can operate FAA lights in passive mode until		

Commenter	Date	Topic	Theme	Comment Summary	Comment Page #	Treatment of Comment in EIS
Dark-Sky Association				needed. Such a system will also reduce incidental takes of migrating birds that may be attracted to FAA lighting.		
Paul Friesema	Undated (file date 7-19-10)	Administrative		Request to be on mailing list.	1	