

U.S. FISH AND WILDLIFE SERVICE

+ + + + +

INTERNATIONAL WILDLIFE CONSERVATION COUNCIL

+ + + + +

PUBLIC MEETING

+ + + + +

FRIDAY

MARCH 16, 2018

+ + + + +

The International Wildlife Conservation Council met in the South Penthouse, U.S. Department of the Interior, 1849 C Street, NW, Washington, D.C., at 10:15 a.m., Greg Sheehan, Acting Chair, presiding.

MEMBERS PRESENT

GREG SHEEHAN, Acting Chair
BILL BREWSTER, Chair Designate
JENIFER CHATFIELD, Vice Chair Designate
PAUL BABAZ
IVAN CARTER
STEVEN CHANCELLOR
CAMERON HANES
PETER HORN
CHRIS HUDSON
MIKE INGRAM
JOHN JACKSON
GARY KANIA
TERRY MAPLE
KEITH MARK
OLIVIA OPRE
ERICA RHOAD
DENISE WELKER

ALSO PRESENT

JOSHUA WINCHELL, Designated Federal Officer and
Coordinator

CRAIG HOOVER, International Affairs Program,
U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service

DAVID HUBBARD, Office of Law Enforcement, U.S.
Fish and Wildlife Service

MASHA KALININA, International Trade Policy
Specialist, The Humane Society

BILL KITCHEN

PETER LaFONTAINE, Campaigns Manager,
International Fund for Animal Welfare

ANNA SEIDMAN, Director of Litigation, Safari
Club International

GAVIN SHIRE, Chief of Public Affairs, U.S. Fish
and Wildlife Service

C-O-N-T-E-N-T-S

Opening Remarks 4

Member Introductions 9

USFWS International Affairs
Program Briefing 13

U.S. Task Force on Wildlife
Trafficking Briefing 40

Public Comment 68

Discussion 85

Adjourn 139

P-R-O-C-E-E-D-I-N-G-S

(10:15 a.m.)

CHAIR SHEEHAN: Good morning. I think we'll get started now, if everybody -- I think mostly have taken their seats. Good morning, everyone. My name is Greg Sheehan. I'm the Principal Deputy Director of the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service.

I'd like to welcome the members of the newly formed International Wildlife Conservation Council, or IWCC, as we may refer to it today. President Zinke would have been here today, but was not available.

Until a chair and vice chair are selected later today, I will be chairing this meeting. Then I will be serving as an ex officio member of this committee.

I'd also like to welcome those who are joining us in the audience, as well as members of the media who are here today.

A few matters of housekeeping. This room can be quite loud. As you see, it has no carpets or draperies. So, please avoid chatter

1 and side conversations that may be distracting to
2 others.

3 This is a federal advisory committee,
4 and there are rules surrounding the protocols and
5 processes. Of most significance, there will not
6 be any public comments or questions during the
7 presentation. At the conclusion of each
8 presentation, the council members may ask
9 questions of the presenter.

10 There is a prescribed agenda and
11 process to allow for public comments, and there
12 were six formal request submissions, per the
13 deadline, as announced in the Federal Register.
14 Those presenters will receive five minutes each
15 later today.

16 Those will not be question periods of
17 the Fish and Wildlife Service or council members,
18 but a chance for you to offer relevant comments to
19 the IWCC. If you're not already on that list as
20 approved commenters, you will not be able to
21 comment today.

22 Additionally, even if you disagree with
23 a point or want to make a correction that you may

1 believe to be an inaccurate statement, you must
2 save that for a public comment period.

3 If anyone in the audience heckles,
4 speaks up, cheers, claps, or otherwise is
5 disruptive to this audience, you will be escorted
6 out and not allowed to return. There will not be
7 any second warnings.

8 There's a lunch break scheduled from
9 noon until 1:00 p.m. You will be on your own for
10 lunch. If you leave the building, please allow
11 time upon your return to pass through security.

12 Please respect the time of the council
13 members during their lunch hour by not asking for
14 interviews or side meetings.

15 Restrooms are in the back portion of the
16 room, actually on either end of this room,
17 dependent on which way is the back portion of the
18 room to you.

19 I believe that everyone here in the room
20 today has a shared interest in wildlife
21 conservation, both in America and around the world.
22 There are many ways that we protect and enhance
23 those populations, and we believe that hunters and

1 the dollars that they bring to foreign nations
2 contribute towards needed conservation efforts.

3 Last year, the Department of Interior
4 formed the IWCC and an associated charter, which
5 I believe that many of you have copies of. Is that
6 accurate, Joshua? If not, that's available online
7 at the fish and Wildlife Service website.

8 The stated objectives and scope of the
9 charter, the beginning portion of that charter,
10 state the council will provide advice and
11 recommendations to the federal government, through
12 the Secretary of Interior, focused on increased
13 public awareness domestically regarding the
14 conservation, wildlife law enforcement, and
15 economic benefits that result from United States
16 citizens traveling to foreign nations to engage in
17 hunting.

18 Additionally, the council shall advise
19 the Secretary on the benefits that international
20 hunting has on foreign wildlife and habitat
21 conservation, anti-poaching, and illegal wildlife
22 trafficking programs and other ways in which
23 international hunting benefits human populations

1 in those areas.

2 Today, you will see presentations by
3 U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service staff that will make
4 you aware of the types of programs in place now as
5 they relate to the efforts listed and the
6 objectives that I read. More specifically, those
7 include international wildlife conservation
8 funding and field efforts, law enforcement
9 efforts, and wildlife trafficking efforts that are
10 maintained and managed and advised on through the
11 U.S. Task Force on Wildlife Trafficking.

12 All PowerPoint presentations you see
13 today will be available online at the Fish and
14 Wildlife Service website. When will those be
15 available?

16 MR. WINCHELL: I'm sorry, the minutes?

17 CHAIR SHEEHAN: When will the --

18 MR. WINCHELL: Within 30 days. I'm
19 going to work to get them up quite quickly.

20 CHAIR SHEEHAN: Within 30 days, these
21 PowerPoints will be available online.

22 I'd like to take a moment and introduce
23 some of our Fish and Wildlife Service staff that

1 will be assisting today.

2 Joshua Winchell, to my right, is our
3 Designated Federal Officer for the council. He
4 will help make sure that we conduct these meetings
5 properly, that you have the information available
6 that you need as we move forward. He's also
7 responsible for ensuring that notices are
8 published in the Federal Register and organizing
9 feedback, comments, and other information that
10 needs to be disseminated, both internally and
11 externally.

12 Gavin Shire -- could you stand up -- is
13 our chief of public affairs. I know we have a
14 number of media here today, so he would be a contact
15 person for media if you need to reach somebody with
16 the Fish and Wildlife Service.

17 Craig Hoover is a chief in the
18 international affairs program. Craig, raise your
19 hand. Craig will be doing most of the presenting
20 to this body today.

21 David Hubbard is our -- David, raise
22 your hand -- is our special agent in charge of
23 international operations in our law enforcement

1 arena. And he will be giving a portion of a
2 presentation here today, as well.

3 So, with that, I believe we'll do some
4 very quick introductions.

5 MR. WINCHELL: Sorry, Greg, I just had
6 a quick point of clarification. You referred to
7 the presentation that's being given today. That
8 will get up within 24 hours, immediately. I
9 apologize. I thought you were referring to
10 minutes. The presentation will be posted to the
11 council's website immediately after this meeting.

12 CHAIR SHEEHAN: Okay. Thank you for
13 that. I thought 30 days seemed kind of long, but
14 I don't know what all the rules are. Technology's
15 a little quicker than that, I thought, but that's
16 good. Thank you for clarifying that.

17 I believe what we'll do, if we could,
18 is just quickly go around the room. I don't think
19 we're going to ask members to talk about the
20 particular role that they were asked to serve as
21 part of this charter. That's available online.
22 But if we could at least just have you say your name
23 out loud so that everyone knows how to pronounce

1 that properly.

2 Why don't we start down at the end?
3 You'll need to push the button on these microphones
4 and share them a bit, if you would. Speak loudly
5 so that they can hear you, because this is being
6 recorded.

7 MEMBER RHOAD: Good morning. Erica
8 Rhoad.

9 MEMBER CHATFIELD: Good morning. I'm
10 Jenifer Chatfield.

11 MEMBER CHANCELLOR: Steven
12 Chancellor.

13 MEMBER HUDSON: Chris Hudson.

14 MEMBER OPRE: Olivia Opre.

15 MEMBER MAPLE: Terry Maple.

16 MEMBER CARTER: Ivan Carter.

17 MEMBER JACKSON: John Jackson.

18 MR. WINCHELL: Joshua Winchell, DFO.

19 CHAIR SHEEHAN: I mentioned, Greg
20 Sheehan, earlier.

21 MR. HOOVER: Craig Hoover.

22 MR. HUBBARD: David Hubbard.

23 MS. WATSON: Good morning, Rowena

1 Watson from the State Department.

2 MEMBER HORN: Good morning, Peter
3 Horn.

4 MEMBER BREWSTER: Bill Brewster.

5 MEMBER BABAZ: Paul Babaz.

6 MEMBER WELKER: Denise Welker.

7 MEMBER INGRAM: Mike Ingram.

8 MEMBER MARK: Keith Mark.

9 MEMBER HANES: Cameron Hanes.

10 MEMBER KANIA: Gary Kania.

11 CHAIR SHEEHAN: Thank you. I believe
12 we'll begin with the first presentation today. If
13 we move ahead of schedule, then we would advance
14 some of these topics, potentially, to before the
15 lunch hour. I do believe that we won't be done
16 prior to lunch today. So, at this point, we'll
17 kind of play it by ear and see how long these
18 presentations and question periods are taking.

19 So, I think, with that, I'm going to
20 turn it over to Craig Hoover for our first
21 presentation. Thank you, Craig.

22 MR. HOOVER: Good morning, and thank
23 you, Greg, for the introduction. As Greg

1 described, I will provide a brief overview of some
2 of the international conservation work undertaken
3 by the Fish and Wildlife Service in this
4 presentation.

5 So, I would start with that the Fish and
6 Wildlife Service mission is to work with others to
7 conserve, protect, and enhance fish, wildlife,
8 plants, and their habitats for the continuing
9 benefit of the American people. This mission
10 certainly extends to our international
11 conservation efforts, as well.

12 Before I get into the details of who we
13 are, what we do, and how we do it, I'd like to take
14 a step back and talk about why we, as Americans,
15 as taxpayers, and as public servants, care about
16 international wildlife conservation.

17 For one, the world's iconic species --
18 including elephants, rhinos, tigers, great apes,
19 and sea turtles -- capture the hearts and souls of
20 the American people. How do we know? We know that
21 Americans value seeing wildlife and wild places.
22 According to a study in 2015, nearly a third of all
23 U.S. citizens visited a national park or monument

1 while traveling abroad. And we know that U.S.
2 hunters make up a disproportionate number of
3 international hunters, contributing hundreds of
4 millions of dollars to wildlife economies,
5 creating jobs to protect wildlife and habitat, and
6 providing incentives to conserve wildlife and wild
7 places.

8 We know that, even if they might never
9 see animals in their natural habitat, Americans
10 value the existence of iconic species. Since the
11 U.S. Postal Service issued its first stamp to raise
12 funds for international conservation in 2011, more
13 than 38 million tiger stamps have been purchased,
14 raising more than \$4 million to support the
15 conservation of elephants, rhinos, tigers, great
16 apes, and sea turtles.

17 Beyond capturing our hearts and minds,
18 wildlife and ecosystems are also critical because
19 they support billions of people's wellbeing and
20 livelihoods and drive the world's economy. The
21 ways in which wildlife and ecosystems can benefit
22 the economy and humans are seemingly endless.

23 There are consumptive uses, like

1 hunting and fishing, and non-consumptive uses,
2 such as ecotourism. Wild plants and animals serve
3 as food sources for local communities and provide
4 other crucial services. Some species control
5 pests, disperse seeds, pollinate our foods, or
6 provide us with building materials and medicines.

7 One of the ways the U.S. economy
8 benefits is through wildlife trade. The United
9 States is one of the largest importers and
10 exporters of wildlife and wildlife products in the
11 world. Through implementation of the Convention
12 on International Trade in Endangered Species of
13 Wild Fauna and Flora -- mercifully normally
14 referred to as CITES -- we promote sustainable use
15 of native and non-native CITES listed species and
16 combat wildlife trafficking, in collaboration with
17 state agencies.

18 CITES provides the necessary framework
19 for us to do so. It applies to trade in over 35,000
20 species of wild plants and animals. Our
21 participation in CITES is vital in facilitating
22 trade between the United States and the 182 other
23 member countries of the convention. Some of our

1 native CITES listed species that have approved
2 export programs are American alligators, bobcats,
3 river otters, and American ginseng.

4 Although the International Affairs
5 Program and the Office of Law Enforcement, both of
6 which you will hear from today, have the most
7 substantial international portfolio and
8 responsibilities, international conservation
9 efforts occur across our agency, both
10 programmatically and geographically, from the U.S.
11 trust territories in the Pacific, to the Mexico and
12 Canada borders, to our law enforcement attaches
13 stationed in key countries around the world, and
14 to our financial assistance programs for rhinos in
15 Africa, tigers in South Asia, and migratory birds
16 in South America.

17 For the purposes of this presentation,
18 we will focus primarily on our international
19 affairs and law enforcement programs, but I would
20 briefly note that our migratory birds program has
21 international responsibilities associated with
22 migratory bird hunting and implements the
23 Neotropical Migratory Bird Conservation Act.

1 Our ecological services program
2 handles foreign species listing and delisting
3 under the Endangered Species Act. The fisheries
4 and aquatic conservation program implements the
5 Lacey Act with regard to injurious species listings
6 and is engaged in international fishery issues.
7 And our regional programs are engaged in
8 cross-border conservation issues with Canada and
9 Mexico and trust territories in the Pacific and the
10 Caribbean.

11 We recently launched an effort to
12 develop a holistic international wildlife
13 conservation strategy that will lead to an enduring
14 vision that defines the service's niche in
15 international conservation, strengthens
16 cooperation with partners and stakeholders, and
17 leverages additional support for our international
18 wildlife conservation priorities.

19 Through this comprehensive effort, we
20 will articulate the ways in which the service
21 engages in international conservation, we will
22 document our legal mandates, and we will engage
23 external stakeholders and provide opportunities

1 for feedback.

2 Here on this slide, we indicate the
3 detailed process we are undertaking and the
4 timeline for each phase. In this process, we will
5 engage our stakeholders for input. We look
6 forward to engaging the council for its thoughts,
7 as we develop a vision for our current and future
8 international work. We intend to finalize this
9 strategy in the fall of 2018.

10 In the end, we hope to have a strategy
11 that will not only guide international
12 conservation efforts for this administration, but
13 they will provide the basis for the service's
14 delivery of measurable, meaningful conservation
15 achievements for decades to come.

16 I will now hand off to my colleague,
17 David Hubbard, to cover the roles and functions of
18 the Office of Law Enforcement.

19 MR. HUBBARD: Good morning. As Greg
20 said, I am David Hubbard. I'm the special agent
21 in charge of the International Operations Unit for
22 the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service. And I will
23 briefly go over the role of the Office of Law

1 Enforcement within the Fish and Wildlife Service.

2 The mission of the Office of Law
3 Enforcement is to protect wildlife and plant
4 resources. Through the effective enforcement of
5 federal laws, we contribute to the Fish and
6 Wildlife Service efforts to recover endangered
7 species, conserve migratory birds, preserve
8 wildlife habitat, safeguard fisheries, combat
9 invasive species, and promote international
10 wildlife conservation.

11 The service's Office of Law Enforcement
12 is globally recognized as a world leader in
13 wildlife law enforcement and plays a critical role
14 in international wildlife conversation,
15 particularly with regard to regulations of
16 international trade, investigation of wildlife
17 violations, and in the building of capacity of
18 other countries to protect wildlife and combat
19 wildlife trafficking.

20 This slide shows just some of the key
21 components of the Office of Law Enforcement, which
22 I will describe to you in further detail. Our
23 wildlife inspectors are the front-line uniformed

1 wildlife enforcement force in the United States,
2 inspecting wildlife imports and exports to ensure
3 compliance with U.S. laws and regulations and
4 interdicting illegally traded wildlife.

5 This slide shows our current staffing,
6 with 123 wildlife inspectors, 14 supervisory
7 wildlife inspectors, all of which are primarily
8 stationed at major ports of entry and exit
9 throughout the United States. We currently have
10 seven canine teams in place. These dogs are
11 trained to detect frequently illegally traded
12 wildlife and have been a critical additional tool
13 in our effort to combat wildlife trafficking.

14 Our wildlife inspectors are located at
15 37 ports of entry. They work closely with Customs
16 and Border Protection to ensure that wildlife
17 entering or exiting the United States is in
18 compliance with the U.S. laws and regulations.
19 These inspectors have border search authority,
20 enforce federal wildlife laws and regulations,
21 ensure that wildlife trade is conducted legally,
22 and interdict smuggled wildlife.

23 The Office of Law Enforcement's special

1 agents are plainclothes criminal investigators
2 with full arrest and search authority. They are
3 found both at ports of entry and exit and located
4 throughout the United States. They conduct both
5 overt and covert investigations and are
6 extensively trained to utilize a broad array of
7 investigative techniques. They are the
8 professional federal wildlife enforcement model
9 that other countries have sought to replicate,
10 particularly with the growth in the increased
11 sophistication of wildlife trafficking around the
12 world.

13 Though much of the work of the special
14 agents involves domestic wildlife crimes, we are
15 also actively involved in international
16 investigations, such as the much publicized
17 Operation Crash, which is an ongoing national and
18 worldwide criminal investigation focusing on the
19 illegal trade in rhino horn and elephant ivory in
20 response to the international poaching and
21 smuggling syndicates.

22 Charges filed against defendants
23 within Operation Crash include violations of the

1 Endangered Species Act, the Lacey Act, conspiracy,
2 smuggling, money laundering, international money
3 laundering, mail fraud, tax evasion, bribery, and
4 false documents.

5 To date, the investigation has led to
6 convictions of approximately 50 individuals and
7 businesses. Total prison sentences to-date
8 exceed 36 and a half years. Total fines exceed \$2
9 million and total forfeiture and restitution at
10 approximately \$6 million.

11 The Office of Law Enforcement plays an
12 important role in implementing President Trump's
13 executive order on enforcing federal law with
14 respect to transnational criminal organizations
15 and preventing international trafficking, which
16 lists four focus areas, with wildlife being one of
17 the four focus areas.

18 The U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service
19 Forensics Laboratory is the only fully accredited
20 full service lab in the world dedicated to crimes
21 against wildlife. Our crime lab is very much like
22 any typical police lab except for the victim is an
23 animal or a plant. The lab examines, identifies,

1 and compares evidence using a wide range of
2 scientific procedures and instruments in the
3 attempt to link the suspect, victim, and crime
4 scene with physical evidence. The lab provides
5 critical forensic support to the Office of Law
6 Enforcement, as well as to other wildlife crime
7 investigations around the world.

8 Beginning just a few years ago, as part
9 of the U.S. response to the global wildlife
10 trafficking crisis, we began placing wildlife law
11 enforcement attaches in key countries around the
12 world. Currently, we have seven senior special
13 agent attaches stationed around the world. They
14 are stationed in Mexico City; Lima, Peru;
15 Libreville, Gabon; Dar es Salaam, Tanzania;
16 Gaborone, Botswana; Beijing, China; and Bangkok,
17 Thailand.

18 The role of the special agent attaches
19 includes, among other things, coordinating
20 transnational investigations in information and
21 intelligence sharing, supporting Fish and Wildlife
22 Service Office of Law Enforcement investigations
23 that are being conducted domestically here in the

1 United States with a nexus to the area where the
2 attaches are working, assisting in leveraging U.S.
3 government assets for use in
4 counter-wildlife-trafficking efforts, and
5 supporting host government and regional
6 counter-wildlife-trafficking investigations, as
7 well as supporting regional capacity building.

8 Attaches are based at our U.S.
9 embassies. And within the U.S. embassy, the
10 attache serves under chief of mission authority,
11 with full diplomatic status and accreditation from
12 the host country. They report directly to the
13 deputy chief of mission within the embassy, provide
14 regular updates on all activities related to
15 counter-wildlife-trafficking in the region, are
16 considered senior staff within the embassy and a
17 member of country teams supporting the broader
18 diplomatic mission in that region. They also
19 coordinate with other USG agencies in furtherance
20 of the Fish and Wildlife mission. The attaches are
21 not only the service's, but also the Department of
22 Interior's representative within the embassies.

23 And I will turn it back over to Greg.

1 MR. HOOVER: Thanks, Dave. Good
2 afternoon, everyone. Sorry, still morning.

3 The service's International Affairs
4 Program coordinates domestic and international
5 efforts to protect, restore, and enhance the
6 world's diverse wildlife and their habitats, with
7 a focus on species of international concern. The
8 service has international responsibilities under
9 some 40 treaties, U.S. laws, and regulations.

10 The program works with private
11 citizens, local communities, other federal and
12 state agencies, and foreign governments, as well
13 as non-governmental organizations, scientific and
14 conservation organizations, industry groups, and
15 other interested parties to ensure effective
16 implementation of treaties and laws and the global
17 conservation of species.

18 Working with partners around the world
19 to conserve species and their ecosystems, the
20 international affairs program administers an
21 extensive grant program supporting human and
22 institutional capacity building and conservation
23 research, provides technical assistance to

1 wildlife managers in other countries, helps to
2 conserve species at risk through the regulation of
3 international trade, and works closely with states
4 and tribes to help ensure conservation of U.S.
5 species in international trade.

6 The scope of work undertaken by the
7 international affairs program is quite broad. For
8 the purposes of this presentation, and with the
9 time available to us, I'll focus on our financial
10 assistance programs and how we are working with
11 partners to deliver conservation to priority
12 species and issues around the world, ensuring a
13 national heritage for Americans to enjoy for
14 generations to come.

15 A significant aspect of our
16 international conservation effort relates to
17 financial assistance, including under several
18 congressionally mandated, multinational species
19 conservation acts, as well as financial assistance
20 through our regional programs and for emerging
21 priority threats. The multinational species
22 conservation acts include the following.

23 The African Elephant Conservation Act

1 was established in 1988 and has been a critical tool
2 for advancing African elephant conservation.

3 In FY17, fiscal year '17, we allocated \$3 million
4 to African elephant conservation priorities,
5 leveraging over \$7.5 million in additional funds
6 towards those projects. These funds were largely
7 devoted to projects to support protected area
8 management, anti-poaching, and anti-trafficking
9 efforts.

10 African elephants used to number in the
11 millions in the wild, but their continent-wide
12 number is now approximately 400,000. Over the
13 last five to ten years, we've witnessed a
14 resurgence of illegal killing of elephants in
15 Africa to supply the demand for ivory, as well as
16 for meat, and in retaliation for human-elephant
17 conflict.

18 If we do not reverse this trend, we risk
19 losing both forest and savannah elephants. The
20 projects we support through the African Elephant
21 Conservation Fund are making a difference. Our
22 support to at-risk elephant populations and
23 anti-poaching operations, including improved

1 detection, interdiction, and prosecution of
2 wildlife crime, is having an impact.

3 The second of the five multinational
4 species conservation acts passed by Congress was
5 the Rhinoceros and Tiger Conservation Act of 1994.
6 The black market for rhino horn and tiger pelts and
7 body parts has led to drastic declines in rhinos
8 and tigers across their range. In Africa, our fund
9 provides technical expertise and vital funding to
10 protect the remaining rhinos and to restore rhino
11 populations to their previous range on private,
12 tribal, and nationally protected land.

13 In Asia, the status of both rhinos and
14 tigers is bleak, but there are glimmers of hope.
15 Approximately 97 percent of wild tigers were lost
16 during the last century, and experts estimate that
17 there are fewer than 4,000 tigers in the wild. All
18 six sub-species are considered endangered or
19 critically endangered.

20 Where there is consistent support from
21 our Rhino and Tiger Conservation Fund, we have seen
22 improved law enforcement effectiveness and
23 increases in rhinos and tiger populations in

1 several protected areas, strengthening our
2 conservation stewardship legacy for these species.
3 Together, these funds, again, leveraged much
4 needed additional support.

5 In fiscal year '17, our \$4.8 million
6 leveraged an additional \$11.1 million in matching
7 funds. Although African elephants dominate the
8 headlines, both African and Asian elephants are in
9 urgent need of conservation effort. A decade
10 after passing the African Elephant Conservation
11 Act, Congress passed the Asian Elephant
12 Conservation Act.

13 As mandated by Congress, we work to
14 perpetuate healthy Asian elephant populations in
15 their habitats in the wild, enhance protection of
16 at-risk populations and the habitats on which they
17 depend, and to mitigate human-elephant conflict.
18 Our \$1.8 million in fiscal year '17 leveraged a
19 total of \$2.7 million in additional matching funds.

20 Poaching for bush meat, illegal harvest
21 for pets, and habitat loss are major threats to
22 great apes. Habitat loss is driven largely by
23 logging and oil palm plantations, and they're also

1 impacted by disease. In 2000, Congress passed the
2 Great Ape Conservation Act. Since then, we've
3 been working with a trusted network of partners on
4 the ground to sustain viable populations in the
5 wild, prevent habitat loss from forest
6 fragmentation and degradation, and reduce
7 trafficking and consumer demand for illegally
8 harvested apes. Our \$3 million in funding in
9 fiscal year '17 supported 39 projects in 16
10 countries and leveraged an additional \$3 million
11 in matching funds.

12 Lastly, our marine turtle populations
13 today are a fraction of what they once were.
14 Logistically, the issues they face are complex.
15 On nesting beaches, they're targeted for their
16 eggs, meat, shell, skin, and oil. In the water,
17 bycatch is a major threat. Marine turtles can be
18 accidentally or intentionally captured in fishing
19 nets and trawls, as well as by hooks. Aside from
20 nesting beach and bycatch pressures, marine
21 turtles are threatened by coastal development,
22 manmade disasters, such as oil spills, and the
23 degradation of grass beds and coral reefs that they

1 rely on.

2 Since 2004, when Congress passed the
3 Marine Turtle Conservation Act, the service has
4 been working with a network of trusted partners
5 around the world to develop local and institutional
6 capacity for sea turtle conservation, support the
7 creation of national conservation action plans,
8 and reduce bycatch with local communities. Our
9 \$2.2 million in support leveraged a total of \$3
10 million in matching funds in fiscal year '17.

11 So, those are the multinational species
12 conservation funds. I'd like to spend a few
13 minutes talking, also, about our regional
14 programs.

15 Through our Africa, Eurasia, and
16 Western Hemisphere programs, we work with
17 governments, agencies, and other partners to
18 conserve wildlife and other high value landscapes
19 that provide economic, geopolitical, and other
20 benefits to the American people.

21 Our largest regional program is our
22 Africa regional program, which is focused
23 primarily on Central Africa. Central Africa's

1 Congo Basin contains the second largest contiguous
2 tropical forest in the world and is home to some
3 of the most biodiverse and volatile areas on Earth.
4 Our priority is to secure the Congo Basin's
5 wildlife by professionalizing park guards,
6 improving law enforcement effectiveness, and
7 engaging in site-based activities.

8 In fiscal year '17, we supported 22
9 projects in six countries, with \$15 million in
10 funds apportioned through USAID, leveraging \$13.7
11 million in additional matching funds. Just to
12 note, this photo is a funeral procession for one
13 of Virunga Park's rangers. The toll of
14 trafficking has been especially devastating to
15 human lives, with more than 150 rangers killed in
16 the line of duty in ten years.

17 The Western Hemisphere, our own
18 backyard, is the region with the greatest
19 biodiversity on the planet. It is home to half of
20 the world's tropical forests and 40 percent of all
21 of available fresh water on Earth. There are many
22 pressing issues facing wildlife and habitats in the
23 Western Hemisphere, including destructive land

1 use, wildlife trafficking, and human-wildlife
2 conflict. Our funds prioritize species and
3 habitat management, wildlife law enforcement,
4 institutional strengthening, and public-private
5 partnerships. In fiscal year '17, our \$1.7
6 million supported 26 projects in nine countries,
7 leveraging an additional \$1.8 million in matching
8 funds for conservation.

9 The current focus of our emerging
10 priority threats work is on combating wildlife
11 trafficking around the world. Wildlife
12 trafficking is estimated to be a multi-billion
13 dollar business and represents an emerging
14 priority threat.

15 Wildlife trafficking has wide security
16 implications and can have consequences for us here
17 at home. Increasingly, we are seeing evidence of
18 corruption and sophisticated transnational crime
19 syndicates at the center of poaching and illegal
20 trade.

21 Apart from negatively impacting
22 species and ecosystems, trafficking also
23 undermines legal trade in wildlife and

1 wildlife-based products, with economic
2 consequences for individuals, communities, and
3 even countries. Two years ago, we responded to
4 this emerging priority threat by establishing our
5 combating wildlife trafficking program, which
6 provides technical and financial assistance to
7 partners around the world, to address trafficking
8 in priority species.

9 In particular, we worked to strengthen
10 enforcement, reduce demand for illegally traded
11 wildlife, and expand international cooperation and
12 commitment to address the growing threat.

13 These are all priorities outlined in
14 the national strategy for combating wildlife
15 trafficking and reinforced in the Eliminate,
16 Neutralize, and Disrupt -- or END -- Wildlife
17 Trafficking Act, as well as by President Trump's
18 executive order on enforcing federal law with
19 respect to transnational criminal organizations
20 and preventing international trafficking, which
21 was signed on February 9, 2017, and calls for a
22 comprehensive and decisive approach to dismantle
23 organized crime syndicates.

1 In fiscal year '17, we provided \$4.8
2 million and leveraged an additional \$1.9 million
3 in matching funds to support 35 projects in 38
4 countries around the world. Projects ranged from
5 the sniffer dog program to combat wildlife
6 trafficking in Kazakhstan, which is shown here, to
7 training African giant-pouched rats to detect and
8 combat the smuggling of pangolins, the world's most
9 heavily trafficked mammal.

10 So, that is an overview of some of the
11 aspects of the Office of Law Enforcement, as well
12 as the International Affairs Program, particularly
13 our financial assistance work. We certainly
14 appreciate the opportunity to touch on some of
15 these aspects of our international conservation
16 work and look forward to working with you to advance
17 conservation globally.

18 And I'll hand back to Greg.

19 CHAIR SHEEHAN: Thank you, Craig and
20 David, for those presentations. At this point, I
21 believe we'll open some time up to the council to
22 ask questions of our Fish and Wildlife Service
23 staff, or other comments that you would like to

1 make. I'll again remind the audience that this is
2 limited to folks who sit and serve on the IWCC.

3 I do want to note, real quick -- sorry,
4 Mr. Jackson -- there is a clock in the room. It
5 says it's 10 o'clock. It looks like somebody needs
6 to get a ladder up there, since our time changed
7 last Sunday. It is 11:00.

8 So we'll take questions for a while, or
9 comments, and then determine if we want to move on
10 to another presentation or break for lunch at that
11 point. Thank you. Mr. Jackson.

12 MEMBER JACKSON: Curiosity here. The
13 African Elephant Conservation Act was largely
14 driven by a congressman from Houston, Jack Fields.
15 At the time, it was limited to \$5 million. I see
16 the funding of it is less than that, and I believe
17 it always has been. The grants, are they still
18 limited to \$100,000?

19 MR. HOOVER: So, it depends on the grant
20 program. And we lay out what the conditions are
21 on the grant programs in the notice of funding
22 opportunities. But we have some programs that are
23 limited in the amount that we offer, there are at

1 least guidelines, while some of those certainly go
2 beyond that level.

3 MEMBER JACKSON: African Elephant
4 Conservation?

5 MR. HOOVER: African Elephant, I don't
6 believe, is strictly limited to under \$100,000.

7 MEMBER JACKSON: Thank you.

8 MEMBER HANES: I had a question on --

9 CHAIR SHEEHAN: Mr. Hanes.

10 MEMBER HANES: One of the first slides,
11 it mentioned \$325 million. Was that in 2015 or
12 since 2015? I just didn't know. And that was as
13 a result of trophy hunting.

14 MR. HOOVER: Yes, those data were in a
15 recently done report, I think it's a 2015 report,
16 looking at the amount of revenue generated by
17 hunting in East and Southern Africa.

18 MEMBER HANES: I didn't know if it
19 was --

20 MR. HOOVER: It was an average annual
21 amount.

22 MEMBER HANES: Oh, a year?

23 MR. HOOVER: That's right.

1 MEMBER HANES: Okay, good, thank you.

2 CHAIR SHEEHAN: Do we have other
3 questions or comments?

4 Okay, seeing none, I think we will then
5 move into the next presentation, which we will also
6 ask Craig to present again. And then we'll take
7 questions. I believe we'll have adequate time to
8 complete this presentation and field questions or
9 comments before breaking for lunch. If it's a
10 little before noon, we'll end at that point in time.

11 So, with that, I'll turn it back over
12 to Craig.

13 (Pause.)

14 MR. HOOVER: Okay, so, now good
15 afternoon.

16 PARTICIPANT: Not yet.

17 MR. HOOVER: Oh, okay. So, in the much
18 earlier presentation that you saw you heard a lot
19 about what the Fish and Wildlife Service is doing
20 to combat wildlife trafficking at home and abroad,
21 particularly through the law enforcement and
22 financial assistance portions of the Fish and
23 Wildlife Service's international portfolio.

1 In this presentation, we'll put that
2 effort in the context of the larger U.S. government
3 effort to stop poaching and illegal trade in
4 wildlife and wildlife products. The image you see
5 here depicts some of the items seized during
6 Operation Crash, which my colleague described in
7 some detail in his portion of the presentation.

8 First, what is the problem? Over the
9 past several years, we've seen a dramatic increase
10 in the scope and scale of poaching to supply illegal
11 trade. Though elephants and rhinos have received
12 most of the attention and have been most well
13 documented, we have seen landscape scale losses of
14 wildlife populations around the world. This
15 includes pangolins, parrots, turtles and
16 tortoises, coral reef species, and many others.
17 Wildlife trafficking is not only a threat to
18 wildlife, it undermines security, weakens
19 government institutions, and contributes to
20 corruption.

21 It poses a threat to rangers who devote
22 their lives to protecting wildlife and wild places.
23 As wildlife trafficking became more organized and

1 sophisticated, it was clear that the U.S.
2 government response was insufficient. A decade
3 ago, South Africa, which has more than 80 percent
4 of Africa's rhinos, was losing about 20 rhinos a
5 year to poaching.

6 By 2014, the number of poached rhinos
7 per year had skyrocketed to over 1,200. Although
8 we've seen slight increases in poaching numbers,
9 we've just concluded the fifth consecutive year of
10 more than 1,000 rhinos poached for their horn.

11 As the black market price for rhino horn
12 in Vietnam has escalated, so, too, has the violence
13 of rhino poaching, organized, systematic poaching
14 of rhinos by gangs equipped with satellite phones,
15 uniforms, GPS coordinates, night vision,
16 sophisticated weapons, and sometimes even assisted
17 by helicopters and using veterinary drugs. The
18 cost of securing rhinos is high. It requires rhino
19 monitors on foot, well-armed, well-equipped law
20 enforcement officers, competent veterinarians to
21 dart and medicate rhinos injured by poachers, or
22 to dart and move rhinos away from the threat of
23 poaching, and it requires eyes in the sky, aerial

1 surveillance and tracking equipment.

2 Most importantly, it continues to cost
3 the lives of those rangers who have committed their
4 lives to protecting rhinos on the ground. With
5 regard to elephants, some countries have lost 90
6 percent of their elephant population in the past
7 decade. More than 100,000 elephants were killed
8 in a recent three-year period across Africa.

9 In a five-year period, Tanzania lost
10 60,000 elephants, 60 percent of its population, to
11 poaching, all to supply the demand for ivory. In
12 2011, approximately 39 tons of ivory were seized
13 worldwide, equaling the tusks from more than 4,000
14 dead elephants. The rate of ivory seizures
15 globally is largely unchanged since that time.
16 Wildlife trafficking is not just a threat to large
17 gray mammals. Pangolins are thought to be among
18 the most trafficked mammals in the world,
19 threatened by unsustainable and illegal
20 international and domestic trade for their scales
21 and meat.

22 Seizures of pangolin scales and meat
23 are often measured in tons, as shipments make their

1 way from pangolin range states in Africa and
2 Southeast Asia to consumer markets in China.
3 African gray parrots continue to enter illegal
4 trade to supply the demand for pets, despite being
5 listed in Appendix I of CITES and prohibited from
6 international trade.

7 The list goes on. Turtles and
8 tortoises, seahorses, corals, sea turtles, Asian
9 songbirds, thousands of species across the globe
10 are threatened by poaching to supply the illegal
11 trade in wildlife and wildlife products. In
12 recent years, wildlife trafficking has become more
13 and more sophisticated and organized.

14 It has emerged as a crisis that not only
15 imperils wildlife, but also people. It can
16 destabilize local communities and national
17 governments by exacerbating corruption and poor
18 governance and by reducing revenue, including from
19 ecotourism, which many nations and communities
20 depend on, but also from mineral extraction, which
21 impacts U.S. companies in the region. The human
22 tragedy is immense. Around the world, one ranger
23 is killed in the line of duty approximately every

1 three days.

2 In the eastern Democratic Republic of
3 the Congo, the situation is particularly dire. As
4 I noted in the previous presentation, in Virunga
5 National Park, which is Africa's oldest national
6 park and home to the critically endangered mountain
7 gorilla, more than 160 rangers have lost their
8 lives in the line of duty over the past two decades.

9 Amazingly, despite the dangers and
10 risks, park rangers continue to put their lives on
11 the line on a daily basis to protect wildlife and
12 habitats. Legal trade in these and other species
13 is the foundation of significant economies that
14 Americans depend on, whether it's trade in
15 crocodilians for leathers, timber for instruments
16 and furniture, birds, turtles, and snakes for pets,
17 corals for jewelry, sturgeon for caviar, the list
18 goes on. These multimillion-dollar economies are
19 undercut and impacted by illegal trade. To give
20 you an idea of numeric value, this table shows the
21 declared values of U.S. exports of skins of
22 American alligators, bobcats, and river otters in
23 just a three-year period, more than \$390 million

1 in total.

2 In 2013, the president signed an
3 executive order announcing the establishment of a
4 presidential task force chaired by the departments
5 of interior, state, and justice. The task force
6 includes 17 government departments and agencies
7 across the enforcement, assistance, and policy
8 sectors.

9 The executive order called for the
10 development of a national strategy for combating
11 wildlife trafficking. In February 2014, the
12 president signed the National Strategy for
13 Combating Wildlife Trafficking, which laid out a
14 whole of government approach to combating poaching
15 and illegal trade.

16 The three pillars of the national
17 strategy are strengthening enforcement and
18 prosecution, reducing demand for illegally traded
19 wildlife, and expanding international cooperation
20 and commitment. To meet these strategic goals,
21 the task force committed to expanding U.S.
22 government leadership, guided by the following
23 principles: marshal federal resources for

1 combating wildlife trafficking; use resources
2 strategically; improve the quality of available
3 information; consider all links of the illegal
4 trade chain; and strengthen relationships and
5 partnerships around the world.

6 To activate the national strategy, the
7 task force developed an implementation plan that
8 was launched in February of 2015. The
9 implementation plan lays out specific commitments,
10 delivering on each of the 24 objectives of the
11 national strategy, provides progress measures, and
12 identifies lead and participating agencies.

13 The Fish and Wildlife Service is the
14 only agency that is a lead or participating agency
15 for all 24 objectives, but every participating
16 department and agency plays a critical role in
17 delivering on the national strategy and its
18 implementation plan. This is particularly true
19 for the co-chairs and the unofficial fourth member,
20 the U.S. Agency for International Development.
21 The Department of State and USAID lead much of the
22 whole government effort under the pillar focused
23 on international cooperation and commitment. The

1 Department of Justice plays a leadership role for
2 much of the strengthening enforcement pillar.

3 The pillar focused on reducing demand
4 for illegally traded wildlife is largely split
5 between the Fish and Wildlife Service, which leads
6 domestic demand reduction efforts, and the
7 Department of State, which leads much of the
8 international demand reduction effort.

9 But the key to the substantial strides
10 that the U.S. government has made to combat
11 wildlife trafficking over the past few years is
12 that it is truly whole of government. Since 2014,
13 task force efforts and activities have been
14 coordinated across the U.S. government at all
15 levels.

16 The principal level task force provides
17 policy guidance and direction. At the working
18 level, the lead agencies have weekly calls, monthly
19 working group meetings on finance and programs, and
20 quarterly meetings with all task force agencies
21 involved. These meetings ensure strategic and
22 effective use of U.S. resources, eliminating
23 redundancies and identifying key gaps, while

1 allowing us to share lessons learned and develop
2 new lines of concerted effort. Improved
3 intelligence has identified new areas of work.

4 Coordination among U.S. agencies in the
5 field has also greatly expanded. Twelve U.S.
6 embassies and USAID missions, representing work on
7 combating wildlife trafficking in more than 20
8 countries, have established wildlife trafficking
9 working groups with resident agencies involved in
10 conservation, law enforcement, security, defense,
11 and economic development.

12 These processes are augmented by
13 meetings with individual non-governmental and
14 private-sector partners, as well as recurring
15 meetings with our international partners at the
16 bilateral and multilateral levels.

17 2015 and 2016 progress assessments
18 identified major actions taken to date in
19 implementing the national strategy. In 2017, we
20 reported to Congress, via a strategic review, as
21 called for in the END Wildlife Trafficking Act. As
22 we've noted earlier, President Trump prioritized
23 combating wildlife trafficking, including through

1 the executive order on enforcing federal law with
2 respect to transnational criminal organizations
3 and preventing international trafficking, which
4 specifically identifies wildlife trafficking as
5 one of four focal areas.

6 The bipartisan END Wildlife
7 Trafficking Act was signed into law in October of
8 2016. The law enshrines the task force on wildlife
9 trafficking and the national strategy for
10 combating wildlife trafficking. It makes
11 wildlife trafficking a liable offense for money
12 laundering prosecutions.

13 It requires an annual report that
14 identifies focus countries which are determined to
15 be a major source, transit point, or consumer of
16 wildlife trafficking products, and creates a
17 special designation for countries of concern,
18 where governments may be complicit in wildlife
19 trafficking.

20 In November of 2017, we identified 26
21 focus countries and 3 countries of concern. The
22 Fish and Wildlife Service worked closely with the
23 Department of State, the Department of Justice, and

1 USAID, to develop criteria and analyze data that
2 led to the identification of these countries. The
3 END Wildlife Trafficking Act is led by/largely
4 implemented by the Department of State. Initial
5 assessments of each of these countries, these 26
6 counties, have been completed, and we are now
7 working with our interagency colleagues to develop
8 strategic plans to address wildlife trafficking in
9 each country.

10 The task force's work to combat
11 wildlife trafficking is making a difference on the
12 ground, at home, and worldwide. Since 2014, the
13 U.S. government has dedicated more than \$250
14 million to combat wildlife trafficking globally.
15 This funding has been redirected at the local,
16 bilateral, regional, and multilateral levels.

17 Just some of the actions undertaken
18 under the national strategy include a series of
19 administrative actions, to impose a near total ban
20 on commercial ivory trade here in the United
21 States, a similar action by China to match the U.S.
22 effort and close their domestic market, with China
23 being the largest consumer of ivory in the world,

1 domestic and international demand reduction
2 campaigns, and extensive international capacity
3 building programs, training more than 3,000 people
4 in more than 40 countries in 2016 to improve our
5 international law enforcement partners' ability to
6 fight wildlife crime. As you heard from David
7 Hubbard earlier, we have stationed seven wildlife
8 law enforcement attaches in key countries around
9 the world and conducted highly successful and
10 publicized long-term covert investigations to
11 address organized criminal wildlife enterprises.

12 In its final year, USAID's arrest
13 program, which is Asia's regional response to
14 endangered species trafficking, supported 94 law
15 enforcement actions and included seizures that
16 resulted in the arrest of at least 182 suspected
17 wildlife criminals, seized \$3.7 million on
18 contraband, including over 23,000 live animals,
19 3,700 carcasses, and over 7,500 kilograms of
20 wildlife products.

21 Over five years, the arrest program
22 trained 2,300 officers, from 14 countries across
23 Asia, and contributed to more than 1,300 arrests

1 and at least \$150 million in criminal assets
2 seized. We've developed partnerships with other
3 governments, with industries, trade
4 organizations, and conservation organizations, to
5 amplify our efforts to protect wildlife and the
6 habitat on which they depend, to increase
7 patrolling effectiveness, to interdict illegally
8 traded wildlife, to go after wildlife trafficking
9 kingpins, and to educate consumers and change
10 consumptive behavior that is the lifeblood of
11 poachers and wildlife traffickers.

12 We've expanded sniffer dog programs at
13 home and abroad. We've introduced new
14 technologies to detect and identify illegal
15 wildlife and to reach and recruit allies in the
16 global fight to combat wildlife trafficking. This
17 is just a snapshot of the myriad efforts undertaken
18 and ongoing to combat wildlife trafficking across
19 the trade chain.

20 I would encourage you to review the
21 national strategy, the implementation plan, the
22 annual reports, and the END Wildlife Trafficking
23 Act to see all that we're doing to move the needle

1 on this critical conservation issue. We need to
2 continue to commit to a whole of Government
3 approach to bring all the relevant tools to bear
4 and to match our effort to the increasing
5 sophistication of the world's wildlife
6 traffickers. We need to address all parts of the
7 trade chain, protecting habitat, stopping
8 poachers, arresting middle men and the kingpins
9 they supply, and changing behavior in consumer
10 countries.

11 We need to create incentives for local
12 people who live with and can benefit from the
13 wildlife around them, and we need to fully
14 implement the END Wildlife Trafficking Act, which
15 is a mechanism for identifying the current hotspots
16 and bringing resources to bear to address wildlife
17 trafficking where it matters most. We look
18 forward to your thoughts on how we can continue this
19 momentum and continue to strengthen U.S. efforts
20 to combat wildlife trafficking at home and abroad.
21 Thank you.

22 CHAIR SHEEHAN: Thank you, Craig.
23 Hopefully, that's given you some idea of some of

1 the efforts that are being undertaken by U.S. Fish
2 and Wildlife Service, Department of State, USAID,
3 and others who partner -- Department of Justice.
4 With that, why don't we take a few moments for
5 questions and comments on that presentation you
6 just saw?

7 PARTICIPANT: Excuse me. In your
8 slide, the \$390 million to the U.S. economy from
9 the trade in bobcats and alligators and things like
10 that, I'm assuming that's all the legal trade from
11 sustainable use. That leads me to my next comment
12 of the importance of putting value on wildlife in
13 the trade chain for the direct local communities.
14 I don't think that should be overlooked.

15 MR. HOOVER: I agree. Just to
16 confirm, yes, that was legal, sustainable trade,
17 regulated under CITES, and absolutely that's trade
18 that adds value to wildlife, and it ensures its
19 conservation.

20 PARTICIPANT: I'm assuming by
21 sustainable, we mean that as the activity goes on,
22 wildlife becomes more prolific and ecosystems
23 become healthier.

1 MR. HOOVER: That is certainly the
2 goal.

3 PARTICIPANT: Thank you.

4 CHAIR SHEEHAN: Mr. Chancellor.

5 MEMBER CHANCELLOR: Craig, what
6 countries in the world are the primary recipients
7 of the illegal traffic?

8 MR. HOOVER: That's a good and
9 challenging question. Maybe it would be useful --

10 MEMBER CHANCELLOR: Just give me the
11 top three.

12 MR. HOOVER: Let me do this. Let me
13 give you the actual list of countries that were
14 identified under the END Wildlife Trafficking Act
15 as focus countries. That will paint a pretty clear
16 picture for you of what that looks like. The focus
17 countries -- and this is alphabetical order, so not
18 in order of priority or importance.

19 I don't want to unnecessarily castigate
20 Bangladesh, for example, so Bangladesh, Brazil,
21 Burma, Cambodia, Cameroon, China, the Democratic
22 Republic of the Congo, Gabon, India, Indonesia,
23 Kenya, Lao Peoples Democratic Republic,

1 Madagascar, Malaysia, Mexico, Mozambique,
2 Nigeria, the Philippines, the Republic of the
3 Congo, South Africa, Tanzania, Thailand, Togo,
4 Uganda --

5 MEMBER CHANCELLOR: If I can interrupt
6 you for a second, are these the recipients?

7 MR. HOOVER: These are --

8 MEMBER CHANCELLOR: My question was
9 what countries are the primary recipients?

10 MR. HOOVER: Of illegally traded
11 wildlife?

12 MEMBER CHANCELLOR: Yes, not origin.

13 MR. HOOVER: Right. This list of
14 countries is those countries that were identified
15 either as source, transit, or consumer countries.

16 MEMBER CHANCELLOR: I'm more
17 interested in the destination.

18 MR. HOOVER: The primary consumer of
19 illegally traded wildlife, I think there's a strong
20 argument to be made for China to be the primary
21 consumer, but it really depends on the particular
22 species and commodity. It's not difficult to
23 point to a specific species and commodity and

1 identify different primary consumer countries all
2 over the world, including the U.S. role as a
3 significant consumer of illegally traded wildlife.

4 MEMBER CHANCELLOR: What's the
5 comparison, though, say, between China and the
6 second-largest? Are they twice as much, ten times
7 as much?

8 MR. HOOVER: That's not a question --

9 CHAIR SHEEHAN: David, can you answer
10 that with what you're seeing in the law enforcement
11 world? I think, certainly, a number of countries
12 in Asia pose many problems. I think we'll let
13 David talk briefly about, in the law enforcement
14 world, where, as you work on end-point strategies,
15 is a lot of your efforts focused?

16 MR. HUBBARD: Our efforts, in the
17 Office of Law Enforcement, are following the
18 illegally traded wildlife from its source, all the
19 way to where it's being consumed, which is
20 generally the points where the kingpins are located
21 that are financing the trafficking of the wildlife.

22 As Craig pointed out, it very much
23 depends on the commodity as to who the major

1 consumer is. China does consume a variety of
2 commodities in illegally traded wildlife, but
3 other countries -- reptiles, for instance, are
4 primarily trafficked to Europe.

5 That's where the main consumer of
6 illegally traded reptiles is. It varies. As far
7 as the iconic African species, I don't have the hard
8 numbers, but China is right near the top, with other
9 countries in Southeast Asia probably equally in
10 second place, I guess.

11 MEMBER CHANCELLOR: What percentage
12 goes to Asia, in general?

13 MR. HUBBARD: Again, it depends on the
14 commodity.

15 MEMBER CHANCELLOR: But overall.

16 MR. HUBBARD: Of all wildlife --

17 MR. HOOVER: It's just not a question
18 that -- the challenge with documenting contraband
19 trade, illegal trade, is that the data aren't very
20 readily available. As you look segment by
21 segment, type of wildlife trade by type of wildlife
22 trade, illegal trade, certainly there are a number
23 of Asian countries that routinely rise to the top.

1 But as David said, you can certainly point to other
2 illegal wildlife trades, where Europe or North
3 American countries are the primary consumer.

4 CHAIR SHEEHAN: I think -- and I'll ask
5 David to follow up on this and correct me if I get
6 it wrong -- but a lot of these trafficking
7 syndicates are simply not efforts to go traffic
8 some species of wildlife from Point A to Point B,
9 but the syndicates tend to be involved in money
10 laundering, illegal arms trade, sex trafficking,
11 wildlife trafficking, and others. Is that
12 accurate, Dave, what you're looking at when you see
13 these folks that we're often dealing with?

14 MR. HUBBARD: Yes, we're more and more
15 seeing the convergence of other priority crime
16 areas with the illegal trafficking of wildlife.
17 Most of the syndicates and organizations that we
18 are focusing on our efforts on, the largest
19 syndicates and organizations are transnational
20 criminal organizations that will traffic in
21 anything that they can make money in.

22 CHAIR SHEEHAN: Thank you.

23 PARTICIPANT: Craig, you used the term

1 critically endangered on two of the species you
2 cited. That's not a U.S. standard. It's not
3 Endangered Species Act. I think that's the IUCN
4 you're referring to. Thank you.

5 PARTICIPANT: Could I also just point
6 out, on the rhino statistics, it looks, by your
7 statistics, like the rhino poaching has greatly
8 increased recently, but I just want to point out
9 that's just the South African statistics. The
10 focus has been on South Africa, as the rest of
11 Africa is being depleted of rhinos. As the best
12 protected stronghold, that's why it's being left
13 until last, in my opinion.

14 CHAIR SHEEHAN: Thank you --

15 PARTICIPANT: Can I get a
16 clarification on something? I think it said
17 30,000 elephants were poached each year, right, or
18 in 2017, 30,000?

19 MR. HOOVER: Right. So recent
20 poaching data indicates roughly about 30,000
21 elephants lost per year over the last, essentially,
22 decade.

23 PARTICIPANT: For a context, do we know

1 how many elephants have been killed legally a year?

2 MR. HOOVER: We don't specifically
3 track hunting numbers because our authority really
4 focuses on the import of trophies. Certainly, we
5 could evaluate the number of countries that have
6 CITES approved quotas.

7 I don't think there's any country that
8 has a quota of more than 500. I think that's the
9 highest quota for those that have quotas.
10 Certainly, nothing compares -- certainly, the
11 primary driver of elephant loss is poaching for the
12 commercial, illegal ivory trade.

13 PARTICIPANT: Right, I was just hoping
14 for some context on legal versus illegal numbers.

15 CHAIR SHEEHAN: Certainly, a good deal
16 of the legal permitted harvest of elephants is not
17 by Americans, so it isn't necessarily a dataset
18 that we would be actively trying to collect. We're
19 only one country that participates.

20 MEMBER HUDSON: Mr. Hubbard, I believe
21 you said that some countries have lost more than
22 90 percent of their elephant populations, and I
23 think you said in the last ten years.

1 MR. HOOVER: Yes, that was my
2 statement, yes.

3 MEMBER HUDSON: I'm sorry, Mr. Hoover,
4 can you identify those countries?

5 MR. HOOVER: I probably can't give you
6 all of them, but certainly, we've seen dramatic
7 loss in forest elephants; 60 percent of the total
8 forest elephant population is lost. Certainly,
9 some of the Central and North African countries
10 that had already had small populations have had
11 dramatic losses in their total populations. They
12 may have gone, say, for example, from 1,000 to 100.

13 MEMBER HUDSON: Can you tell us whether
14 there's any legal elephant hunting in those
15 countries that have lost 90 percent of their
16 elephants?

17 MR. HOOVER: Tanzania is one example
18 where there's legal elephant hunting, and there's
19 been a dramatic decline in its population, but
20 generally speaking, the elephant strongholds have
21 been in Southern and East Africa, and those are,
22 generally speaking, the countries that have
23 elephant hunting programs.

1 CHAIR SHEEHAN: To follow up, those
2 countries that you're describing in the southeast
3 portion of Africa seem to probably, generally, be
4 doing better with their elephant management.
5 Could you name a couple of countries that I think
6 Mr. Hudson was getting at in more north central
7 Africa, where we've seen those declines?

8 MR. HOOVER: Sure, again, places like
9 the Sudan, Cameroon, some of those countries that
10 have seen dramatic declines in their elephant
11 populations, certainly more stability in most of
12 Southern Africa, including South Africa, and maybe
13 Botswana.

14 PARTICIPANT: Is there any American
15 hunters legally hunting elephant in the Sudan in
16 the last ten years?

17 MR. HOOVER: We certainly haven't
18 authorized any imports from the Sudan in the last
19 ten years.

20 PARTICIPANT: Thank you.

21 CHAIR SHEEHAN: Do we have some more
22 questions or comments? Everyone's a little shy on
23 our first meeting, so I think what we'll do, maybe,

1 is break now for our lunch period, if that serves
2 the body well. Then we'll come back; we have some
3 opportunity for, I believe, 30 minutes for public
4 comment, and then we'll start into a council-driven
5 session, where we'll do some of the formalities of
6 how you would like to shape the future of this
7 council.

8 I hope this was helpful information and
9 a little bit of background, at least, on what's
10 going on here at the Fish and Wildlife Service. We
11 will begin at -- it's 11:35 now. I think we will
12 try to resume again at 12:45, if that would work
13 well for everyone. That's an hour and ten minutes.
14 Again, I mentioned if you opt to leave the building,
15 leave yourself adequate time to go through a
16 variety of security measures to re-enter. Thank
17 you.

18 (Whereupon, the above-entitled matter
19 went off the record at approximately 11:35 a.m. and
20 resumed at approximately 12:45 p.m.)

21 CHAIR SHEEHAN: Hope you all had a good
22 opportunity for some lunch. If you notice
23 outside, it's not snowing any longer. I think when

1 most of you arrived this morning, it was a little
2 bit snowy out there. It's beautiful. I think
3 we're going to finish up the meeting today ahead
4 of schedule, so maybe you'll get a chance to go
5 outside.

6 Those of you who are visiting town, you
7 can kind of start to see some of the cherry blossoms
8 trying to do something, so maybe you can walk right
9 across the street to the National Mall and enjoy
10 a little time there, if you'd like. We have two
11 agenda items left to cover today. One is a public
12 comment period, and the second is business of the
13 body of the council.

14 We'd scheduled to do public comment
15 first, so I believe we're going to do that now.
16 Maybe a couple of reminders. As we talked about
17 earlier, when we noticed this meeting, we had asked
18 for and offered a deadline for those who wanted to
19 speak to inform us of that. We had left that widely
20 open ended for those who reached out to us, but
21 there was a cutoff, listed a cutoff time. We
22 placed everybody who requested prior to the cutoff
23 time to be speakers today. A couple of folks have

1 ultimately declined or are not here, so we only have
2 a few that are going to speak.

3 As I mentioned earlier, we very much
4 appreciate those who will come and participate in
5 a government process. That's what makes our
6 country strong is when voices are able to be heard.
7 But we also, I believe, all are interested and
8 respectful that we have civility in that process.
9 As those of you who get up to speak know, we're
10 allowing you to engage in a somewhat formal process
11 here.

12 Be articulate and state your position,
13 but let's try not to, as I mentioned earlier, have
14 any applause, cheers, clapping, because we will
15 have to ask you to leave if we get into that state,
16 so that we can keep this meeting in a proper state
17 of fashion. With that, we'll do those, and then
18 lead into the business of the council right after
19 that. As we do this, do we have a microphone?
20 Josh, why don't you talk about --

21 PARTICIPANT: Mr. Chairman, could I
22 ask a quick question before we move to that?

23 CHAIR SHEEHAN: Yes.

1 PARTICIPANT: The data that was
2 delivered by these fine gentlemen this morning, but
3 not reflected on the slides, themselves -- I think
4 it was in the notes below -- is that information
5 going to also be made available, or will it just
6 be the slide, itself?

7 CHAIR SHEEHAN: The narrative that
8 went along with those?

9 PARTICIPANT: Yes.

10 CHAIR SHEEHAN: Certainly, that's
11 public record, and we could make that available.

12 PARTICIPANT: It was chock full of lots
13 of numbers.

14 CHAIR SHEEHAN: Yes, tried not to
15 overcomplicate a PowerPoint slide, but certainly,
16 we'd be glad to make that available on the site,
17 as well.

18 PARTICIPANT: Excellent, thank you.

19 CHAIR SHEEHAN: Joshua, how do we lead
20 into this? Then we'll start talking about some of
21 the other matters afterwards. MR.

22 WINCHELL: This is Joshua Winchell speaking, DFO
23 for the council. This was my reminder to myself

1 to ask all of you, when you come to the microphone
2 to speak, it would be helpful if you announced your
3 name, just so it'll be clear who is talking, for
4 people in the back of the room and the sides and
5 the individual who's speaking. Thank you for
6 that.

7 There were seven, I think -- or six
8 individuals, excuse me, that actually reached out
9 to me and requested public comment. I'm just going
10 to go through in alphabetical order and ask if
11 you're here, if you're interested in passing on
12 your request for oral comment, or if you wish to
13 take your time.

14 You have five minutes to do so. Do we
15 have a passable mic that we can -- great, thank you.
16 The first individual who requested public comment
17 is Anna Frostick (phonetic). Anna?

18 MS. FROSTICK: Yes, I am here. I think
19 there was (inaudible).

20 MR. WINCHELL: Okay, thank you. I'm
21 just going through the list of names that I got,
22 so I appreciate that. Masha? We've got a
23 microphone here.

1 MS. KALININA: Is this on?

2 PARTICIPANT: Yes.

3 MS. KALININA: My name is Masha
4 Kalinina, and I offer my comments today on behalf
5 of Humane Society International, the Humane
6 Society of the United States, and the Humane
7 Society Legislative Fund.

8 Regrettably, we conclude that the IWCC,
9 as constituted, represents more of a trade
10 association than an advisory panel that could
11 provide expert professional counsel to the
12 Department of the Interior in execution of its
13 mission. The council's charter makes it clear
14 that it has one fundamental purpose, to promote
15 trophy hunting of foreign species and to relax
16 legal restrictions for importing trophies.

17 There is a conspicuous conflict of
18 interest/concern hanging over this council.
19 Fifteen of its sixteen members represent
20 pro-trophy hunting interests, most of a commercial
21 nature. To be clear, any member who fits the
22 following criteria has a financial interest in
23 easing trophy imports: a member who hunts foreign

1 species that are subject to import permits issued
2 by the Service; a member who guides/hunts for such
3 species; and a member that is a celebrity hunter,
4 promoting hunting of such species. Further, while
5 the publicly available agenda for this meeting was
6 rather broad, we offer following comments on the
7 topics being discussed today.

8 This council must not divert funds and
9 resources from the Fish and Wildlife Service's
10 International Affairs Program's goals so as to
11 promote trophy hunting interests. This council
12 cannot lawfully discuss issues concerning CITES
13 because CITES has the issuance of permits within
14 its remit and numerous members of this council have
15 a financial interest in obtaining CITES import
16 permits or eliminating the requirements for such
17 permits.

18 This council should call for increases
19 in funding to the Service's International Affairs
20 Program, including the Multinational Species
21 Conservation Act, that aim to conserve elephants,
22 rhinos, tigers, gorillas, and more. We note that
23 the president's FY19 budget requests, for the MSCA,

1 the request is \$6 million, a decrease of almost \$5
2 million from the prior year. This cut is far too
3 severe. Our organizations further stress that we
4 oppose the continuation of this council, as
5 outlined in our written comments. The council
6 violates the requirements of the Federal Advisory
7 Committee Act because it is not essential, not
8 conceived in the public's interest, and offers a
9 special interest group the opportunity to promote
10 their private concerns.

11 Importantly, international trophy
12 hunting has very little public support in the
13 United States. A December 2017 survey showed that
14 78 percent of U.S. voters oppose the import of
15 elephant and lion trophies, and 69 percent oppose
16 all forms of trophy hunting. The same taxpayer
17 dollars are now asked to foot the bill for \$250,000
18 in annual costs for the operations of this
19 pro-trophy hunting council.

20 Finally, notably missing from this
21 council are qualified representatives of the
22 broader conservation community, with scientific
23 credentials and direct experience with the

1 management of successful conservation programs,
2 along with wildlife law enforcement experts, who
3 have no financial or commercial stake to cloud or
4 shape their judgments. We appreciate your
5 consideration of our comments. Thank you.

6 MR. WINCHELL: Is Bill Kitchen here in
7 attendance at the meeting? Bill Kitchen.

8 MR. KITCHEN: My name is Bill Kitchen.
9 I've never been here. This is a beautiful
10 building. When I came in, I'm struck by everything
11 on the walls, all the Native Americans, the
12 wildlife, the buffalo. I'm wondering what
13 happened to all the buffalo in this country?

14 I don't suppose we're going to blame
15 that on China. I noticed that there's no -- I
16 wonder what the African-American community, which
17 has zero representation here, probably, thinks of
18 how Trump and Zinke are doing their jobs, in terms
19 of protecting the environment and wildlife. What
20 kind of twisted logic says let's kill elephants to
21 save elephants?

22 What kind of message do we send to the
23 world when we lift the import ban on elephant tusks

1 and body parts, so that rich Americans can get a
2 so-called trophy? I hope there's a campaign to get
3 every American airline to refuse to transport tusks
4 and other body parts from Africa back into this
5 country. What kind of message do we send with a
6 picture of the president's namesake standing next
7 to an elephant he just shot, holding a knife in one
8 hand and the elephant's tail in the other? This
9 country stands for wildlife and protecting the
10 elephants.

11 If you want to find anti-poaching, that
12 doesn't mean you have to go spend a lot of money
13 to kill an elephant, so the money will go into
14 conservation. Just send them the money.

15 I've seen pictures of people here
16 supposedly walked up within five paces of an
17 elephant and shot it -- that sounds real
18 sporting -- and then have it propped up, legs tucked
19 under it, like a little puppy dog. If we want
20 to -- we just send them the money, instead of the
21 quarter million dollars that's being budgeted for
22 this bogus council.

23 That would pay for several rangers to

1 protect them, or would pay for two non-disclosure
2 agreements. Trump, Sr. has said that elephant
3 hunting is a horror show. Then the NRA and others
4 weighed in, and he crumbled. My mother taught me
5 well and taught me some manners. I usually don't
6 speak like this. But to put this in a language that
7 the president understands and uses, Don, Jr. is a
8 sick son of a bitch, and if Trump, Sr. caves, he's
9 a spineless son of a bitch. He is -- now I'm going
10 to get called on that kind of language.

11 CHAIR SHEEHAN: We'll ask you to watch
12 your language, please.

13 MR. KITCHEN: Our president does that
14 in front of the whole world on TV. You ought to
15 go -- hope Mueller does his job soon. Maybe he'll
16 go become Putin's official lapdog. He's lucky he
17 doesn't end up in jail. Maybe he will.

18 It's pathetic what's happening in this
19 country, and this is just a sign of what's pathetic
20 is pulling back on this import ban on elephants and
21 pretending like we're going to lead the world in
22 saving elephants. You folks, I assume you've got
23 half a brain. Nobody will stand up to him.

1 MR. WINCHELL: Peter LaFontaine. Is
2 Peter here? Hi, Peter.

3 MR. LAFONTAINE: Thank you, and good
4 afternoon. My name is Peter LaFontaine. I'm
5 delivering these comments on behalf of the
6 International Fund for Animal Welfare, Animal
7 Welfare Institute, Born Free USA, and Defenders of
8 Wildlife, which represent millions of Americans
9 and others around the globe. We have one initial
10 request, and would also like to express several
11 concerns about this council.

12 To the first point, we urge the council
13 to use its platform to push for prioritization of
14 international conservation programs, particularly
15 the multinational species conservation funds, the
16 U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service's International
17 Affairs Program, USA Biodiversity Program, U.S.
18 State Department and USAID programs combatting
19 wildlife trafficking, and the Global Environment
20 Facility.

21 As to our concerns, we object to the
22 assumption that promotion of trophy hunting should
23 be the primary focus of this council and believe

1 that it is inconsistent with the mission of the U.S.
2 Fish and Wildlife Service, as well as the letter
3 and spirit of the Federal Advisory Council Act.

4 Noticeably absent from this process is
5 a commitment to science-based decision making or
6 consideration of the public's broad opposition.
7 We're deeply troubled that wildlife scientists and
8 other legitimate conservation experts have already
9 been marginalized. FACA requires advisory
10 councils to fairly balance points of view, so as
11 not to be driven by special interests. IFAW and
12 several other established conservation
13 organizations put forward a qualified nominee who
14 was excluded from this council, and I see only one
15 member from a similar organization with
16 broad-based conservation experience.

17 Particularly egregious is the
18 inclusion of the firearms and ammunition
19 manufacturing industry, which has no demonstrated
20 expertise in conservation science, and which has
21 a clear interest in maximizing sales of products
22 used to kill wildlife, regardless of ecological
23 implications. This council also undermines the

1 FACA requirement to avoid duplicative mandates.

2 The existing Wildlife and Hunting
3 Heritage Conservation Council, and the recently
4 disbanded Advisory Council on Wildlife
5 Trafficking, would have more than served the
6 purposes of this new body. We're also troubled by
7 the directives to explore ways to streamline range
8 state consultations and expedite processing of
9 import permits. Such language parrots talking
10 points from the trophy hunting industry which
11 underpin legislation such as the SAVES Act,
12 H.R.2603, and other efforts to strip protections
13 from foreign listed species. This administration
14 has made it abundantly clear that it does not rely
15 on foreign nations' scientific or policy
16 judgments.

17 Yet, this council's stated aim rests on
18 an assumption that range states provide adequate
19 data on wildlife management, running counter to the
20 administration's broader foreign policy stance, at
21 the same time as the White House's budget proposals
22 make permit reviews and ESA consultations even more
23 difficult. It is clear that this council is an

1 unwanted use of public resources and should,
2 therefore, be re-evaluated.

3 A legitimate council would be dedicated
4 to promoting best practices for conservation and
5 animal welfare around the globe, and its membership
6 would reflect a true cross-section of expertise in
7 this area. Thank you for your time.

8 MR. WINCHELL: Keisha Sedlacek
9 (phonetic)?

10 PARTICIPANT: I'll pass.

11 MR. WINCHELL: Rick Parsons?

12 MR. PARSON: I will pass. Thank you.

13 MR. WINCHELL: Thank you. Anna
14 Seidman.

15 MS. SEIDMAN: Good afternoon,
16 everyone. I'm Anna Seidman. I'm director of
17 government affairs and director of litigation for
18 Safari Club International. I speak on behalf of
19 Safari Club International. Historically, Safari
20 Club has been supportive of hearing from the range
21 countries who manage the wildlife that this council
22 is here to address.

23 We also have been extremely supportive

1 of community-based management, involving the
2 communities in the decision making and in the
3 conservation of international wildlife,
4 particularly in Africa.

5 Recently, Safari Club participated,
6 together with other -- with some European
7 organizations, advocacy organizations, FACE, CIC,
8 and the European Landowners Organization, to put
9 together a meeting or an event in Brussels for the
10 EU Parliament. It was called Keep Calm and Let
11 Africa Take the Lead. Representatives from three
12 African range nations, Namibia, South Africa, and
13 Zimbabwe, came to speak to members of the European
14 Union Parliament and their commission about the
15 successes that they have been having in managing
16 and conserving their wildlife, using hunting as one
17 of the management tools. They spoke eloquently.

18 They provided excellent examples of how
19 communities are involved in conserving wildlife,
20 and how that has been successful in numerous
21 African countries in bringing wildlife back and in
22 continuing to conserve wildlife, to maintain
23 habitat, and to give wildlife value, so that

1 communities are interested in managing the
2 wildlife.

3 Our recommendation is that for a future
4 meeting, an agenda item for this council is to bring
5 the voice of Africa to speak about their methods
6 for managing wildlife, about community based
7 resource management and sustainable use
8 management, and to bring them here either in person
9 or by some electronic means, so that they can share
10 with you the successful stories that they shared
11 in Europe. We have some product from the event
12 that we will share with this council, but we think
13 it would be an excellent way to advise the council
14 to have the voices of Africa speak directly to you.
15 Thank you.

16 MR. WINCHELL: A quick note. I have a
17 sign-in sheet here that I'll be passing around to
18 members of the council. It had gone out to the
19 members of the public. If you haven't signed it,
20 just let me know.

21 CHAIR SHEEHAN: Was that all of our
22 public comments, then, Joshua?

23 MR. WINCHELL: Yes, that was all

1 individuals who requested public comment.

2 CHAIR SHEEHAN: I thank those of you
3 who came today to speak to us, and others who came
4 to observe the proceedings. At this point, I think
5 we'll move into some of the business of the council,
6 themselves. We've tried to share with you some
7 background information, today, about some of the
8 programs that we operate in the Fish and Wildlife
9 Service and in the U.S. government. We've had some
10 opportunities, now, to hear from some of our
11 public. Hopefully, you've had a chance to
12 interact a little bit and get a sense of how you
13 may want to move forward and start shaping the body
14 of this council. I think it probably would be,
15 first and foremost, appropriate that we move
16 towards establishing, perhaps, a chair or vice
17 chair, at your will, to help lead this up.

18 They could take the helm even today, and
19 then talk about other business and maybe try to,
20 at some point, wrap this up with some level of
21 information about what you would like us, at the
22 Fish and Wildlife Service, and others, State
23 Department, to bring to you. We heard from Ms.

1 Seidman a moment ago, talking about perhaps some
2 African range country feedback.

3 But whatever feedback you'd like from
4 us would be most helpful, so that we can make these
5 important meetings for all of you. With that, I
6 think I will hold on to this chair position long
7 enough for you to deliberate on a new chair. I will
8 ask that when you've perhaps nominated someone and
9 had that discussion and take a vote, we would ask
10 for an oral vote, a verbal vote, and show of hands.
11 We'll do show of hands, if that would work. If you
12 keep those up, as well, so we have an opportunity
13 to document who was voting in the affirmative.
14 With that, I think I'm going to just toss it out
15 to this fine group of folks here today to work on
16 that a little bit. We'll go from there, unless
17 there's any questions of me as we move into this.

18 PARTICIPANT: I'd like to nominate
19 Bill Brewster. Bill's provided a service to this
20 country his whole life. He's bipartisan, actually
21 one of the few guys in this city that truly is
22 bipartisan and respected on both sides, has a great
23 depth of knowledge on this subject, and a wonderful

1 human being.

2 PARTICIPANT: I second.

3 MR. WINCHELL: Just a quick reminder,
4 if you could state your name before making your
5 comments, so we can have clarity about who is
6 nominating and requesting. Thank you.

7 CHAIR SHEEHAN: That's been seconded.
8 At this point, I think we can move to conversation
9 of the body, or comment.

10 MEMBER JACKSON: I would third, John
11 Jackson.

12 CHAIR SHEEHAN: Okay. I don't know if
13 we need a third, but thank you for that. That must
14 be the upcoming version of Robert's Rules of Order,
15 but thank you, Mr. Jackson. Is there a desire for
16 any other discussion on that before we potentially
17 call for a vote, or any other nominees? Mr.
18 Brewster, or Congressman Brewster, perhaps I
19 should say, would you like to provide any feedback
20 before we call for a vote?

21 MEMBER BREWSTER: I haven't really had
22 a chance to put a lot of thoughts together, Greg.
23 I think that we can do a lot of positive things for

1 conservation. I think we can do a lot of positive
2 things, especially, in Africa and around the world.
3 As I mentioned earlier to some of you, I know CITES
4 is considered the gold standard in many things, as
5 far as wildlife conversation and threatened
6 species, endangered species.

7 I'd like to see the CITES quotas that
8 are given to countries and have a better feel for
9 everything CITES. Another thing, when I was in
10 Congress, I had the opportunity to work with
11 Congressman Jack Fields in passing the Rhino and
12 Tiger Conservation Act. That was one thing I was
13 always quite proud of.

14 CHAIR SHEEHAN: Were you a co-sponsor
15 of that or sponsor of that, one of the funds we had
16 heard about earlier this morning.

17 MEMBER BREWSTER: Yes, 1994, I
18 believe. There's a lot of things that certainly
19 have to be legislated, but there's a lot of things,
20 policy wise, that can be done from your department,
21 etc. And wildlife conservation is something that
22 I love. Yes, I've been a hunter most of my life.

23 That is part of the deal of wildlife

1 conservation to me. Have been fortunate enough to
2 see species in our country proliferate. When I was
3 a kid, if you saw a white-tailed deer, you called
4 the newspapers. Today, they're in all 77 counties
5 in my state. Same thing; I never heard of anyone
6 that had seen a wild turkey when I was a kid. Now
7 they're everywhere.

8 Our North American model has worked
9 quite well. Hopefully, we can expand a lot of the
10 principles for wildlife conservation around the
11 world. This is a learning experience for me, as
12 much as anything. I hope to gain a lot more
13 knowledge out of this and look forward to trying
14 to help this be as good as it can be for wildlife
15 species around the world.

16 CHAIR SHEEHAN: Okay, thank you. I'll
17 call out one last opportunity for other
18 nominations. Otherwise, we'll call for a vote on
19 the motion that's been made. Hearing none, all in
20 favor, if you could please raise your hands, so we
21 can identify who those --

22 (Show of hands.)

23 CHAIR SHEEHAN: Is this unanimous,

1 before we try to get -- okay, let me say -- all
2 right, thank you. Any opposed? That might be
3 easier to count.

4 (Show of hands.)

5 MEMBER SHEEHAN: Congratulations now
6 Chairman Brewster. A new title for you, so we
7 can -- at least in this room, maybe we'll -- you've
8 moved on from Congressman to Chairman. With that,
9 I think I will defer to you to take the next action,
10 certainly help you through other elements of this
11 meeting, as you would wish. You could take over
12 as chairperson, decide what you want to do, and I'd
13 be glad to help you out. CHAIR

14 BREWSTER: Okay, so we need a vice chair, at this
15 point, correct?

16 MEMBER INGRAM: I'd like to make a
17 nomination, Mr. Chairman. I'd like to nominate
18 the name of Dr. Jenifer Chatfield as the vice
19 chairman.

20 CHAIR BREWSTER: Mr. Ingram nominates
21 Jenifer Chatfield.

22 MEMBER BABAZ: Second.

23 CHAIR BREWSTER: Other nominations?

1 PARTICIPANT: Paul Babaz seconds.

2 CHAIR BREWSTER: Paul Babaz seconds.

3 Other nominations? Seeing none, we will call for
4 the vote. Those in favor of Jenifer Chatfield
5 being vice chair?

6 (Show of hands.)

7 CHAIR BREWSTER: Those opposed?

8 (Show of hands.)

9 CHAIR BREWSTER: Unanimous. Okay,
10 now we need to organize some subcommittees. Am I
11 correct on that?

12 MEMBER SHEEHAN: Mr. Chairman, that's
13 the business of this body. If you would like to
14 do that, that's certainly something that you're
15 entitled to do.

16 CHAIR BREWSTER: I believe that would
17 be a good use of our time, to determine some
18 subcommittees, and then possibly let everybody
19 have some time for thought on what subcommittees
20 they would like to be on.

21 They might want to talk about it today,
22 or they might want to wait and get that information
23 back. Obviously, a policy subcommittee is going

1 to be something that would be important, I believe,
2 so we need to get a chairman of a policy committee.
3 Do I hear a nomination for policy committee.

4 MEMBER CHANCELLOR: I'd like to
5 nominate Chris Hudson.

6 MEMBER WELKER: I'll second that.

7 CHAIR BREWSTER: Chris Hudson
8 nominated by Steve Chancellor, seconded by Denise
9 Welker. Other nominations? Other nominations?
10 Seeing none, those in favor of Chris Hudson as
11 chairman of policy?

12 (Show of hands.)

13 CHAIR BREWSTER: It's unanimous. Do
14 we need a vice chairman of our subcommittees, as
15 well?

16 MR. WINCHELL: I don't think that's
17 necessary. If it's something you would like, it's
18 certainly not a requirement. Having an individual
19 named as chair, certainly important. A vice chair
20 obviously is helpful, in the case that the chair
21 can't make a meeting. A point of clarification.

22 If decisions are made for the council
23 to move forward with establishing subcommittees,

1 the decision to do so needs to occur during a public
2 session, as well as which members of the council
3 will be working on that particular subcommittee.
4 Thank you.

5 CHAIR BREWSTER: In that regard, we've
6 got to establish what subcommittees there are, and
7 then people determine which ones they would like
8 to work on. In that case, let's just go with a
9 chairman, at the moment. Then we may establish a
10 vice chairman at a later time.

11 I think there needs to be a subcommittee
12 of enforcement, wildlife law, wildlife
13 trafficking, kind of a catchall subcommittee that
14 looks at all the problems that are creating
15 poaching in Africa, especially, and all over the
16 world, but Africa's the one that's most noticed.
17 Let's determine a subcommittee chair for that
18 subcommittee. Do I hear a nomination?

19 MEMBER WELKER: I'd like to nominate
20 Ivan Carter.

21 CHAIR BREWSTER: Denise Welker
22 nominates Ivan Carter.

23 MEMBER BABAZ: I second that.

1 CHAIR BREWSTER: We got a second from
2 Paul Babaz.

3 PARTICIPANT: I just have a question,
4 Mr. Chairman. Ivan's really well respected
5 worldwide as a conservation leader. Ivan, I'd
6 like your comments on it. I know when it comes to
7 wildlife habitat protection, corridor
8 protection -- which, as we know, in the world, the
9 No. 1 threat is loss of habitat -- where would you
10 see yourself serving better, on the conservation
11 committee or in enforcement committee?

12 MEMBER CARTER: If there is a
13 subcommittee that is going to represent the
14 communities and the third world beneficiaries of
15 the trade of wildlife, I would serve best on that.
16 That's an area of my greatest knowledge is engaging
17 communities and positively reinforcing the
18 sustainable use, healthy ecosystems, and prolific
19 wildlife in third-world communities,
20 particularly.

21 CHAIR BREWSTER: Keep in mind, I've had
22 about three minutes to think of all this. My first
23 thoughts on committees were going to be a policy

1 committee, a conservation committee, and an
2 enforcement, anti-drug trafficking type
3 committee. We've done the policy committee. I
4 brought up the enforcement and trafficking next,
5 but you know your strengths. I don't know anyone
6 that would have more strengths with the communities
7 than you do.

8 MEMBER CARTER: Yes, sir. Actually,
9 to be honest, the community's where the traffic
10 starts. Without the community, there is no
11 traffic. I would agree with that.

12 PARTICIPANT: He has a unique
13 perspective, not, obviously, for all of the world,
14 but for the African continent, because that's where
15 he's from. He's lived with that since the day he
16 was born. If anyone's going to know how to help
17 preserve the habitat, which is, I think, our
18 primary goal, that's how we try to save the species.
19 I think Ivan's uniquely qualified.

20 CHAIR BREWSTER: We can further define
21 the subcommittees as we go along, but working with
22 the communities, I would think, would certainly be
23 in the same realm as anti-trafficking side.

1 MEMBER CARTER: Absolutely. I think
2 that one of the most important things is to solve
3 third-world issues with third-world solutions. I
4 think that's one of the things I bring to this
5 committee is a lot of third-world knowledge, having
6 spent my life there.

7 CHAIR BREWSTER: Further discussion on
8 the trafficking enforcement community
9 subcommittee? Ivan Carter's been nominated by
10 Denise Welker, and I believe seconded by Paul
11 Babaz. Those in favor, say aye.

12 (Chorus of ayes.)

13 CHAIR BREWSTER: Those opposed?

14 (No audible response.)

15 CHAIR BREWSTER: You're unanimous,
16 Ivan. Now, a general conservation committee, I
17 think, would be useful, one that looks at
18 everything connected with conservation, maybe not
19 as much specifics as general, and what can be done
20 to enhance wildlife conservation. As you know,
21 we're having to work with other countries. It's
22 not like the U.S. can make them do anything.
23 General conservation ideas that would benefit

1 wildlife in the other countries that, hopefully,
2 we could get them to do to enhance habitat, etc.
3 Is there a nomination for a chairman?

4 MEMBER BABAZ: I nominate Denise
5 Welker.

6 CHAIR BREWSTER: Denise Welker. Paul
7 Babaz nominates Denise Welker. Hear a second?

8 MEMBER HUDSON: Second.

9 CHAIR BREWSTER: Chris Hudson seconds.
10 Other nominations? Seeing no other nominations,
11 you want to say anything, Denise, before you get
12 voted on here?

13 MEMBER WELKER: I do feel strongly that
14 we need to understand conservation around the
15 world. Our North American model is a great one,
16 but like Ivan said, each country, each community
17 presents its own problems. I think what I've
18 learned the most, traveling the world, is how the
19 different countries and the different people see
20 their problems. I'm open to listening to other
21 people in the communities and finding out what
22 their needs are to preserve their wildlife, their
23 habitat, and make a nice life for the people as we

1 expand and take over more of the animals' habitat.

2 For me, that's been a big thing. I
3 think our third-world countries don't understand
4 how it works here in America. We can take our model
5 to them and let them work off our North American
6 model and fine tune it to their particular area.

7 CHAIR BREWSTER: You make some very
8 good points there, Denise. I've been fortunate
9 enough to be in some pretty remote areas in Africa
10 and other places. It's not like dealing with the
11 States, the U.S. If you're hungry, there's not
12 much in thoughts of conservation sometimes. It's
13 going to be quite important that we try to develop
14 some conservation ideas that are palatable to those
15 countries and to those people. Those in favor of
16 Denise Welker?

17 (Show of hands.)

18 CHAIR BREWSTER: Those opposed?

19 (Show of hands.)

20 CHAIR BREWSTER: Gosh, it's unanimous.
21 We've developed our three subcommittees, Greg. We
22 haven't really had a chance to go much beyond that.
23 Do you have some thoughts you would like to provide,

1 at this point, as to when we should meet again, what
2 we need to work on between now and the time we meet
3 again? We can certainly -- I can sit down with the
4 committee chairs and develop some thoughts on that,
5 and we can be in touch with everybody
6 electronically.

7 MEMBER SHEEHAN: Thank you, Mr.
8 Chairman. I think one thing that we probably need
9 to do today, if I understood Mr. Winchell, to my
10 right here, appropriately, is determine who might
11 serve on each of those subcommittees. That may
12 be difficult to go through a long nomination, but
13 perhaps you could consider maybe asking for
14 volunteers or something.

15 I think in the spirit of the rules, we
16 operate under FACA, those should be of a contained
17 size, so it truly serves as a subgroup or a working
18 group. I'll let you decide how many folks you may
19 want to have serve. I don't know that anybody's
20 precluded on serving on more than one of these, but
21 probably should limit the number of individuals
22 that's on each, I would think, to maybe not more
23 than -- this is just my thoughts or ideas; it's not

1 a rule anywhere, but maybe six or seven people,
2 maybe, maximum.

3 PARTICIPANT: Joshua, you're the guy
4 that knows the rules. Do we need to do a vice chair
5 for a subcommittee in this meeting? It seems to
6 me the most constructive thing is to give the chairs
7 and the chairman and vice chairman a chance to get
8 their thoughts together on, even, members of the
9 committee and talk to them and see who's willing
10 to serve. Once they get that groove, I think they
11 can better identify a vice chair.

12 CHAIR BREWSTER: Each of us knows our
13 strengths better than someone else would know, as
14 far as appointing them on particular committees.
15 Why don't we let each of the members choose two of
16 the three committees that they could serve on?
17 They would know their strengths better than someone
18 else, and we can get a balanced number that way.
19 Thoughts?

20 PARTICIPANT: If that's --
21 (Simultaneous speaking.)

22 CHAIR BREWSTER: Then Steve, as far
23 as --

1 PARTICIPANT: -- write them down as
2 quick as we can.

3 CHAIR BREWSTER: Then as far as the
4 vice chairman, let the chairman and his committee
5 determine the vice chairman.

6 PARTICIPANT: That's my view.

7 PARTICIPANT: Mr. Chairman, one of the
8 other subcommittee chairs, that doesn't prevent
9 them from serving on the committee, does it?

10 CHAIR BREWSTER: No.

11 PARTICIPANT: So Ivan could serve, as
12 far as conservation --

13 CHAIR BREWSTER: Certainly.

14 PARTICIPANT: (Inaudible) he could
15 also be on.

16 CHAIR BREWSTER: Absolutely. That's
17 why I was suggesting --

18 PARTICIPANT: Mr. Chancellor certainly
19 was (inaudible) Ivan has so much to add to
20 conservation that (inaudible) serving on your
21 committee.

22 CHAIR BREWSTER: I would hope that he
23 would choose conservation and the other one as his

1 two committees. What do we need to do, just go
2 around, ask each?

3 MEMBER SHEEHAN: If that's your
4 desire, we could start wherever you'd like in the
5 room and around. We'll kind of write them down and
6 see what it looks like at the end. We might ask
7 you to rebalance a bit, depending on what that look
8 like.

9 CHAIR BREWSTER: Okay, let's start on
10 the far side. Erica.

11 MEMBER RHOAD: I'd like policy and
12 enforcement.

13 CHAIR BREWSTER: I take it we've got
14 someone that's going to write them all down, so I
15 don't need to, right? Jenifer.

16 MEMBER CHATFIELD: Policy and
17 conservation.

18 CHAIR BREWSTER: Steve.

19 MEMBER CHANCELLOR: Conservation, No.
20 1. I'd like to think I've spent much of my life
21 on that subject. Enforcement, that's one of the
22 primary keys to the conservation.

23 CHAIR BREWSTER: Okay, Chris.

1 MEMBER CHANCELLOR: Conservation and
2 enforcement.

3 MEMBER HUDSON: I'd like to
4 participate in the conservation committee, as
5 well.

6 CHAIR BREWSTER: Okay. Olivia.

7 MEMBER OPRE: Participate in the
8 conservation and (inaudible).

9 MEMBER MAPLE: Conservation and
10 enforcement.

11 CHAIR BREWSTER: Terry, okay.

12 MEMBER CARTER: Traffic and
13 conservation.

14 MEMBER JACKSON: John Jackson,
15 conservation and enforcement, in that order.

16 MEMBER HORN: Peter Horn, enforcement
17 and conservation.

18 CHAIR BREWSTER: I would take policy
19 and enforcement. Paul?

20 MEMBER BABAZ: Conservation and
21 enforcement.

22 PARTICIPANT: Conservation and
23 enforcement. I think I'm going to work well with

1 either.

2 CHAIR BREWSTER: We do need a few more
3 on Chris's policy committee here.

4 PARTICIPANT: That means you.

5 PARTICIPANT: I would take policy and
6 enforcement.

7 CHAIR BREWSTER: Very good.

8 PARTICIPANT: You talked about
9 community. Is that conservation, right, Ivan?

10 MEMBER CARTER: I think that
11 community's under traffic, based on the fact that's
12 where the traffic starts, with the community.

13 PARTICIPANT: Okay. I like the sounds
14 of that. I haven't done the hunting. A lot of you
15 have. But I've been in Tanzania, and I've seen
16 that they're willing to die just to get protein.
17 They're just back there not killing elephants and
18 counting ivory off tusks. That happens, but
19 there's people back there that are just struggling
20 to get meat. I think that community aspect and the
21 trafficking, however that ties in, that's a big
22 part of it. I want to understand that more. The
23 people there are as good of people as you'll find,

1 hard workers. I just want to try to learn more
2 about it.

3 MEMBER KANIA: I could be on policy, and
4 if you need anybody else, I could go on
5 conservation, but if it's just policy, that's fine.

6 CHAIR BREWSTER: Okay, Gary picked
7 policy.

8 MR. WINCHELL: If I could just ask for
9 a couple of individuals to repeat their choices,
10 we can make sure we got them down correctly.

11 PARTICIPANT: Policy and enforcement.

12 MR. WINCHELL: Cameron?

13 MEMBER HANES: Just trafficking,
14 right? I think that's what -- if I'm understanding
15 it right, I think trafficking, anti-trafficking.

16 CHAIR BREWSTER: Okay. Everybody
17 satisfied with the committees? I know we're not
18 exactly balanced, but we at least have people on
19 the committees that they believe are their
20 strengths.

21 MEMBER SHEEHAN: We maybe could use one
22 or two more on policy, and I think we might need
23 to contract these other two by two-three people

1 because it seems to be a large part of the body.

2 CHAIR BREWSTER: John.

3 MEMBER JACKSON: If you can be on
4 three, I'll be on policy, as well.

5 CHAIR BREWSTER: John, you always have
6 to be the exception. There's no rule that says you
7 can't be on three.

8 MEMBER JACKSON: I want to do the grunt
9 work. I'm in the field all the time. I know the
10 (inaudible).

11 MEMBER SHEEHAN: Knowing the other two
12 committees might need to contract a bit, would you
13 be willing to defer off of one of the other two?

14 MEMBER JACKSON: Yes.

15 MEMBER SHEEHAN: Which one,
16 enforcement or --

17 (Simultaneous speaking.)

18 PARTICIPANT: What are the totals,
19 Greg?

20 MEMBER SHEEHAN: If I got these
21 right -- I'm going to these folks -- In policy,
22 now, we have six. In enforcement, I have 11. I
23 have 11 in each of these other two.

1 CHAIR BREWSTER: How many do we have on
2 each one, at this point?

3 MEMBER SHEEHAN: Six, eleven, and
4 eleven, if I got that properly as we went around
5 the room.

6 CHAIR BREWSTER: Six on policy, and
7 eleven on the other two.

8 MEMBER SHEEHAN: Maybe we could --

9 CHAIR BREWSTER: Is there anyone who
10 would like to adjust their thoughts a little bit
11 and be on policy instead of one of the others?
12 Chris is not that bad a guy.

13 PARTICIPANT: I'll go on policy, and
14 I'll drop -- damn. I've got to drop something.
15 I'll have to drop enforcement because I have more
16 experience in conservation.

17 CHAIR BREWSTER: Why don't we start
18 with that, Greg? We may have to rebalance at a
19 later time. Let's start with seven on the one that
20 has the least, and ten and eleven on the other two.
21 Are we overlooking any obvious committee that we
22 should be doing something different? These three
23 should encompass about every issue that's out

1 there, but if we're overlooking
2 something -- Jenifer, your thoughts?

3 MEMBER CHATFIELD: Mr. Chairman, I
4 just wonder about the communication aspect. I
5 think one of the things in our charter was to
6 discuss the enhanced public communication. I
7 don't know if we need to have a subcommittee for
8 that. It's just another piece. Each of these
9 certainly could address that individually as
10 subcommittees within their topic, but we might want
11 to add that.

12 CHAIR BREWSTER: There's nothing to
13 keep us from establishing another committee as we
14 go along. If it's okay, why don't we start with
15 those three? Then after we actually do something
16 and have some more concrete plans, the
17 communication aspect would certainly be in order.
18 Ivan.

19 MEMBER CARTER: Mr. Chairman, if I
20 could just add that I think that, to one of the
21 public speaker's points earlier, it's super
22 important, particularly when you're looking at a
23 global group like this, to take into consideration

1 a lot of local movers.

2 For example, tribal idiosyncrasies,
3 country restrictions, country cultures, tracking
4 down the expert of that field is going to be crucial
5 to making good decisions, and tracking down those
6 experts can be a full time job.

7 I'm wondering if we shouldn't have a
8 subcommittee that serves all of the other
9 committees to track down the best in field for each
10 of these areas. If we're going to be talking about
11 Zimbabwe elephants, we need to have the best in
12 field, not necessarily from the hunting or the
13 anti-hunting, but just from the Zimbabwe elephant
14 field.

15 That person needs to be tracked down and
16 engaged to bring their expertise to the table if
17 we're going to do a really good job here. That
18 really is a big job tracking those people down,
19 whether it's somebody from Pakistan, Tajikistan,
20 Zimbabwe. I wonder if there shouldn't be a
21 subcommittee that serves the others to bring these
22 experts in the field --

23 CHAIR BREWSTER: Determining the

1 experts in particular fields?

2 MEMBER CARTER: Yes, and bringing them
3 to table, or at least their knowledge base,
4 electronically or physically, to the table. I
5 think that's crucial to making the right decision.

6 CHAIR BREWSTER: I would hope that each
7 of the subcommittee chairmen could determine one
8 of their people that would be responsible for
9 identifying that, give the subcommittee chairmen
10 a little more latitude. In your case, it would be
11 someone on your committee that would like to take
12 the responsibility of helping determine, in
13 Tajikistan, who the proper person is to talk about
14 Marco Polos or otherwise.

15 Why don't we start with that approach
16 to it, so each subcommittee chairman could
17 determine who, on their committee, would be
18 responsible for identifying the leading side to
19 start -- leading person in that regard, if that's
20 okay?

21 MEMBER CARTER: Yes, absolutely
22 perfect.

23 CHAIR BREWSTER: Okay, anything

1 further that we need to -- any further issues
2 that -- Jenifer, you have anything else?

3 MEMBER CHATFIELD: No, sir.

4 CHAIR BREWSTER: I would think that we
5 need to think in terms of a future meeting. For
6 a lot of people, July and August is a good time.
7 For some people, that's not a particularly good
8 time.

9 Second and third week of August is a
10 time frame that -- keep in mind, I've now had about
11 seven or eight minutes to think about this, but just
12 trying to determine what would be a workable time,
13 and yet have sufficient time to try to develop some
14 thoughts and develop some ideas on where we're
15 going and what we hope to accomplish, outcomes we
16 hope to have.

17 PARTICIPANT: Mr. Chairman, one of the
18 ladies talked about trying to get host countries
19 here. To me, the goal still in front of us, and
20 the big job still in front of us, is education. We
21 know what our own experiences have been throughout
22 our lives, but we need to absorb a lot of
23 information before we can intelligently try to do

1 something to fix this gigantic problem. As she
2 said on -- part of the charter is communicating.
3 We're in no position to do a lot of communicating
4 until we know more than we know today.

5 CHAIR BREWSTER: Absolutely.

6 MEMBER CHANCELLOR: I would say for
7 those of you who have not spent a lot of time
8 particularly in third-world countries, time is
9 short. The minute you have an area go vacant,
10 which there are a lot of areas going vacant right
11 now, and at a frightening pace, the wildlife in that
12 area is decimated, and it's decimated overnight.
13 It starts the next morning.

14 When you lose the anti-poaching teams
15 that have been funded, when you put an entire
16 industry out of work in an area that's rural, and
17 there's nothing else for them to do, the very next
18 morning, they have to feed their families.

19 Those anti-poaching teams, those
20 people who were drivers and worked in camps,
21 whether they were (inaudible), they've still got
22 to feed their families. We're having a lot of that
23 occur right now, particularly concerned about

1 Tanzania, but others, as well. You can
2 lose -- Tanzania has a population of 55,000
3 elephants. You could lose 90 percent of those
4 elephants in a short window. The anti-poaching
5 organized crime we're talking about, these guys
6 know what they're doing. They're aggressive.
7 They're evil.

8 As they said earlier, in addition to
9 trafficking in wildlife, which is repulsive
10 enough, they also even traffic in human beings and
11 anything else they can make illicit money on. I
12 don't know that setting a date today is necessary.

13 I would like you to maybe give us some
14 dates. My thoughts are -- I'd like to see the next
15 meeting be sooner than that and, again, be an
16 educational meeting for us. If we could do it, I
17 would love that meeting to center around bringing
18 in some folks from the host countries. We're
19 talking a lot about Africa because it's easy to talk
20 about, but as you said, Tajikistan, Mongolia,
21 Kyrgyzstan.

22 There's a host of them that have the
23 same issue. If we could have one good, solid day

1 of getting further education from the Service and
2 further education from those host countries, then
3 I think we're going to be better prepared to
4 actually sit down and do something constructive.

5 CHAIR BREWSTER: Steve, I think that's
6 a good idea. The more I sat here and listened to
7 you, the more I was convinced it's a good idea. I
8 would say the Department could get us some stuff
9 together in probably six weeks, some thoughts. Is
10 that possible, Greg?

11 MEMBER SHEEHAN: I think we could get
12 some ideas. I'm not sure we'd be ready to meet
13 again by then, particularly if we need to
14 investigate having some individual source matter
15 experts who may not be local, but maybe from far
16 away. We might need to see what avenue they could
17 come here and participate, how that might be paid
18 for and those sorts of things.

19 CHAIR BREWSTER: What if we looked at
20 something that -- I guess it's the third week of
21 May, the 14th, the week of the 14th, 15th, 16th,
22 something like that, in May? That's two months.
23 Is that sufficient time to get some information

1 together? Maybe not everything we need, but
2 certainly --

3 MEMBER CHANCELLOR: But as much as we
4 can.

5 CHAIR BREWSTER: Yes.

6 MEMBER CHANCELLOR: At this point,
7 anything they can add to what they shared with us
8 today is going to be helpful. It'll also give us
9 time -- and Ivan, possibly you can be helpful, at
10 least on the African continent, of telling us who
11 those people should be, could be, and who really
12 know what they're talking about, and then be able
13 to reach out to those people and see if we can make
14 them drive in to one single date. I know that won't
15 be easy.

16 CHAIR BREWSTER: Paul.

17 MEMBER BABAZ: Mr. Chairman, I was
18 going to say can we have some time to look at the
19 calendar? I'm pretty sure I have a few conflicts
20 in May.

21 CHAIR BREWSTER: There's going to be
22 conflicts with this group, I'm confident. What we
23 have to do is find a time with the least amount of

1 conflicts. Why don't we look at that week as a
2 possibility, nothing more, and get communication
3 out to everybody when they have a chance to -- I'm
4 not sure of my calendar, so we have a chance to get
5 home and look it over and see what might be there.

6 PARTICIPANT: We can get feedback back
7 to the chairman and the vice chairman and hopefully
8 come up with a date that works for most, but right
9 now, I feel like we're hungry and thirsty for more
10 education.

11 CHAIR BREWSTER: You made some very
12 good points on what's going on in Tanzania, having
13 been there on six different occasions, and in some
14 very remote areas. I know that if those
15 concessions are turned back, it is going to be a
16 killing spree, I'm afraid.

17 MEMBER CHANCELLOR: As you know, I
18 believe it was three years ago -- two years ago or
19 three years ago -- 71,000 square kilometers, in
20 Tanzania, of wildlife habitat got turned back.
21 Virtually everything in that area is gone today.
22 You've

23 (Simultaneous speaking.)

1 CHAIR BREWSTER: Do you want to define
2 turn back?

3 PARTICIPANT: Turn back.

4 PARTICIPANT: Pardon?

5 PARTICIPANT: Turn back.

6 PARTICIPANT: Turn back.

7 PARTICIPANT: Some people are not.

8 CHAIR BREWSTER: The person who had the
9 concession --

10 MEMBER CHANCELLOR: When I say turn
11 back, it's no longer considered a wildlife habitat.
12 It's turned back to the local populations. All the
13 elephants, all the lions, all the plains game is
14 either killed or driven out. It's almost
15 instantaneous. That's why I say this committee
16 needs to have some sense of urgency of what things
17 we can do. We need to get more information, in
18 order to know how to do that.

19 CHAIR BREWSTER: Steve, I think you
20 make some very good points as to the timeliness of
21 this and the importance of trying to get together
22 something a little quicker than I'd initially
23 thought. Greg, why don't we start going that

1 direction, see what we can get together,
2 understanding that it's not going to be as complete
3 as it would have been at a later time.

4 If we could get everybody to look at
5 their calendar, we'll get back with you as to what
6 might be a good possible date during that week.
7 Then we'll look at a later time, probably in August,
8 as well, but we've got to start somewhere, so let's
9 look at this one as a starting place.

10 MEMBER CHANCELLOR: If the poachers
11 are killing 30,000 elephants and 1,000 rhinos a
12 year, we need to be in a hurry.

13 CHAIR BREWSTER: Yes, it's really a
14 tough situation. Anything else that we need to
15 accomplish today? John, you had your hand up.

16 MEMBER JACKSON: I'm just going to talk
17 about in Tanzania, four fifths of the habitat that
18 contains wildlife is in hunting areas. The
19 Serengeti and all the national parks and whatnot
20 are just one fifth the size of the hunting areas.

21 If we lose half the hunting areas, which
22 I think we've done the last 30 days, you're talking
23 about an enormous number of lions and elephants and

1 cape buffalo in a country that has the third largest
2 population of elephants at risk, the largest number
3 lions in the world; they're at risk; the most cape
4 buffalo, more than all the rest of Africa combined,
5 which is the prey base for the lion. I could go
6 on and on and on with this. We're talking about
7 a magnificent country that's about to lose most of
8 its wildlife, and we hold the solution to that, if
9 we can address it fast enough. Thank you.

10 CHAIR BREWSTER: That's another place,
11 John, as long as an animal has value, it will exist.
12 When an animal has no value, the local people have
13 no reason to let it exist.

14 MEMBER JACKSON: The hunting
15 concessions are being surrendered because they're
16 no longer -- they operate at a loss without key
17 species. The worst part of it is that there's no
18 substitute for that. We don't need another safari
19 lodge. There's not that many tourist safari
20 companies needed, and there's no wildlife to
21 support that. It's not the type of habitat that's
22 even there. This is really a loss of wildlife, and
23 it's a direct loss of wildlife, not indirect.

1 CHAIR BREWSTER: I understand.

2 PARTICIPANT: Bill, the other fact we
3 have to remember to be in a hurry here is --

4 CHAIR BREWSTER: I'm sorry?

5 MEMBER CHANCELLOR: I said another
6 thing that we need to focus on why we need to be
7 in a hurry, only about 25 to 30 percent of wildlife
8 habitat on the African continent are in national
9 parks. Seventy to seventy-five percent of that
10 wildlife is 100 percent dependent, and has been for
11 a century, on the safari companies. As those
12 safari companies go out of business -- and they're
13 going out of business at a rapid rate -- 100 percent
14 of law enforcement ends overnight, the next
15 morning, and 100 percent of the employment in those
16 rural areas ends overnight.

17 We've got to be in a hurry. If we're
18 going to find some way to defend them, to do
19 anti-poaching, to try to preserve corridors and
20 habitat.

21 CHAIR BREWSTER: Steve --

22 MEMBER CHANCELLOR: They will kill
23 these animals at a rate that's mind-boggling. If

1 we think 30,000 here on elephants is a lot, get
2 ready.

3 CHAIR BREWSTER: Steve, as you know, in
4 addition to those being dependent on that respect,
5 those communities are also quite dependent on those
6 outfitters for schools, for medical clinics, so
7 it's a quality of life issue for them, as well.

8 MEMBER CHANCELLOR: But the point
9 being urgency is important, but we need to get more
10 educated, or we don't know what to do to help.

11 CHAIR BREWSTER: Okay, we will gather
12 information and try to have that third week of May.
13 Ivan, you had your light on.

14 MEMBER CARTER: I was just going to
15 add -- sorry -- the Tanzania government, last week,
16 announced that they're going to be looking at
17 repurposing a lot of the game reserves back to being
18 for people to use for agriculture. The largest
19 game reserve in Africa is Selous Game Reserve.
20 They're looking at cutting a big chunk of that back
21 out and giving that back to the people.

22 MEMBER CHANCELLOR: They don't have
23 any choice. This is just a fact. If they don't

1 have revenue from the wildlife, why have it? It's
2 not going to stand in the way of progress if it's
3 not producing revenue.

4 CHAIR BREWSTER: Okay.

5 PARTICIPANT: Can I add one thing? I
6 just wanted to clarify. Ivan, when they turn that
7 back to the people, what's your experience in what
8 happens? They turn it back into farmland or
9 cattle, but when the lions come in and kill their
10 cattle or kill their goats or whatever, how do they
11 deal with that?

12 MEMBER CARTER: The first step is they
13 eat the edible wildlife, poison out the lions who
14 are killing their cattle, and it basically becomes
15 a community area. It's a change of land
16 designation, so there's no formal wildlife
17 protection on there anymore.

18 The wildlife becomes fair game to
19 whoever's living there. It's quite a serious deal
20 because if that happens in one country of Africa,
21 it sets a very dangerous precedent for any other
22 part of Africa that has got game reserves that they
23 consider are under-utilized.

1 They can follow suit, and we can end up
2 losing millions and millions of acres of Africa in
3 a landslide because in Africa, as we know from the
4 Zimbabwe scenario and the land acquisition that
5 went on there, they put enormous value on tribal
6 use of land.

7 PARTICIPANT: Right. Because you
8 said that originally, for us, in America, that
9 doesn't sound that bad. Give it back to the
10 people. That sounds great. Whole different deal
11 over there for the animals.

12 MEMBER CARTER: It's a different
13 conversation if you're considering ecosystems and
14 healthy wildlife populations.

15 CHAIR BREWSTER: Paul.

16 MEMBER BABAZ: I was going to say,
17 Ivan, I was in Tanzania in July and we went to an
18 area that hadn't been hunted in two years. The
19 outfitter had vacated the camp for two years. Ten
20 days, no buffalo, none, in ten days. Didn't see
21 any buffalo. The poachers just wiped them out.

22 CHAIR BREWSTER: As you know, a lot of
23 those people are cattlemen. If they can wipe the

1 buffalo out, there's more for their cattle to eat.
2 As long as that buffalo has value -- and some of
3 them are going to get some jobs working for an
4 outfitter, and they're going to get the meat of the
5 buffalo anyway, that buffalo has a chance to live.

6 I think everything's been said, just
7 not everybody's said it, at this point. Unless
8 somebody else has something for the good of the
9 order to bring up, we're going to declare this
10 meeting adjourned.

11 MEMBER SHEEHAN: Mr. Chairman, could
12 I, after Chris, maybe, just go over these
13 subcommittees again, and the chairs, just in case
14 people are trying to write down notes quickly and
15 make sure we have that properly?

16 CHAIR BREWSTER: When we get through
17 here, if I could sit down with the ones that are
18 chairs and just talk for a minute, we can do that
19 in private. We're not doing anything, as far as
20 business is concerned, just kind of talk about
21 organization?

22 MEMBER SHEEHAN: Yes.

23 MEMBER HUDSON: My question is for any

1 of the Fish and Wildlife representatives. Last
2 month, the secretary issued Order 3362, which
3 prioritized wildlife corridors and migration
4 corridors here domestically. I was wondering if
5 either of you could speak to what, if anything, the
6 fish and wildlife service is doing in the
7 international arena, with respect to transferring
8 to your corridors?

9 MEMBER SHEEHAN: I could tell you that
10 Secretary Zinke is personally very passionate
11 about these important habitats and these connected
12 important habitats on landscapes, whether it's in
13 America or around the world. I've heard that from
14 him a number of times. The U.S. certainly offers
15 grant funding in Africa and many other countries
16 to help conserve wildlife issues. We saw much of
17 that this morning, but there was a fair amount more
18 than what was in these presentations.

19 If that is able to rise as a focus, I
20 think that opportunities to provide funding to keep
21 important places for these species viable on the
22 landscape will be fundamental to the long-term
23 survival. I hope that might be a way that we

1 continue to shape our wildlife internationally.

2 We're working on a strategic plan. Mr.
3 Hoover gave part of presentation, how do we engage
4 with the world so we're doing the most important
5 work in the right places? I think that's how we
6 would address that corridor issues. Hopefully,
7 that answered your question.

8 PARTICIPANT: Thank you.

9 MEMBER INGRAM: Mr. Chairman, can I ask
10 a question?

11 CHAIR BREWSTER: Yes, Mike.

12 MEMBER INGRAM: One quick question.
13 For our gentleman at the end, on enforcement -- I
14 can't remember his name -- what's the name?

15 PARTICIPANT: David.

16 MEMBER INGRAM: David, excuse me. On
17 the presentation this morning, I was just
18 wondering, when I was on a photo safari last year
19 in Tanzania, one of the rangers had mentioned that
20 at that time, he was very concerned about the
21 poaching going on in their country.

22 He said they were not allowed to inspect
23 ships with a Chinese flag on them. Do you have any

1 idea if that's changed, if that's still the case
2 or not? He brought that up to us in our group. He
3 said we do not have that within our ability to -- he
4 was talking about the importation of illegal horns
5 and ivory going out. I don't know if that's
6 changed, if that's right or not, but that was his
7 comment to the group.

8 MR. HUBBARD: I'm unaware of that, and
9 it does not sound accurate that --

10 (Simultaneous speaking.)

11 CHAIR BREWSTER: That would be a good
12 point to research before our next meeting.

13 MEMBER INGRAM: I'd sure like to know
14 some of that, yes.

15 (Simultaneous speaking.)

16 MEMBER INGRAM: I'll keep quiet, Madam
17 Chair. The other thing, I want to second what
18 Steve Chancellor mentioned and what John had said
19 there. If you do something in May, I'm sure I won't
20 be able to make it, but I'd hope this committee and
21 this council would go forward.

22 With the (inaudible), if he gives up all
23 that land, 200 anti-poaching people will go out of

1 work immediately. Those 200, they patrol that
2 area greatly, so you're going to see a real
3 (inaudible). It'll be unbelievable what's going
4 to happen there.

5 MEMBER INGRAM: Unbelievable.

6 PARTICIPANT: How many families now
7 don't have food on the table?

8 MEMBER INGRAM: He employs so many
9 people in those areas, in that money. It's going
10 to be --

11 PARTICIPANT: 40 years they were
12 there.

13 MEMBER INGRAM: Yes, 40 years there.
14 I'll tell you, I hope you do get together in May.
15 I won't be here, Mr. Chairman, but carry on with
16 your work.

17 CHAIR BREWSTER: Pasanisi (phonetic)
18 had roughly one half of the Selous in his
19 concessions. It's an incredible area that is
20 going to be, I'm afraid, devastated. Certainly
21 hope that's not the case, but without any
22 anti-poaching in there, it's not going to be good.

23 MEMBER CHANCELLOR: He was spending

1 about a million and a half dollars a year on the
2 anti-poaching. That's gone. It's already gone.
3 There's nothing we can do to change that. We've
4 got to get educated to see what can we do to fill
5 some holes. There's nobody to hire to put any law
6 enforcement on the ground in many of those areas
7 today.

8 As deputy director said, there are
9 programs. There's opportunities for grants. The
10 young lady earlier was talking about -- I don't
11 remember which one you said, but one of the budget
12 cuts was 50 or 60 percent on a particular item.
13 We've got to make sure that we generate the money
14 we need, whether that's private or public or a
15 combination, but we've got to get more educated,
16 so we know what do we need, where do we need to put
17 it, but we need to do that in a hurry.

18 CHAIR BREWSTER: It'll probably be a
19 combination of private and public, would be my
20 guess. Most of us in this room enjoy hunting, but
21 first off is wildlife conservation and habitat.
22 Without that, there is no hunting. Without proper
23 wildlife conversation and habitat, there's no

1 wildlife, there's no hunting, there's no nothing.
2 That has to be our first and main goal.

3 MEMBER JACKSON: Mr. Chairman, I would
4 say we've quantified the loss of habitat in the
5 Selous in the last 90 days. It's two-thirds
6 sitting unoccupied right now, without poaching
7 protection. Over 100 game scouts have been
8 relieved from duty. There's no operators there.
9 Even the vehicles are being sold off.

10 A survey was done year before last,
11 actual audit of operators and their books, hard
12 copies of the documents that showed the average
13 operator contributed \$75,000 a year to
14 anti-poaching, directly to anti-poaching, up to \$2
15 million a year. There's nothing like it. That's
16 why it's one of the greatest wildlife countries
17 left in the world. But it won't be there in a short
18 period of time. The government advised the Fish
19 and Wildlife Service of this, but there was no panel
20 to address it or call attention to it.

21 It's been treated as a low priority by
22 the prior administration turning their back on the
23 Africans. This was all -- it was almost like it

1 was planned. Everybody knew it was going to
2 happen, and it now has happened. It's not coming
3 back. It's too late. We've got to save the rest
4 of Africa.

5 CHAIR BREWSTER: John, most of us know
6 the problems that exist in this discussion. The
7 question's going to be how to come up with solutions
8 to help solve them. Hopefully, we can get a lot
9 of education in a hurry here about some ideas that
10 might go a long ways toward helping with it. Greg,
11 anything else that we need to accomplish?

12 MEMBER SHEEHAN: If I could go over
13 these committees to make sure I got it right, that
14 would be great, Mr. Chairman. I'll go through
15 them. If I got you wrong on this somehow, let me
16 know. For the Policy Committee, chaired by Chris
17 Hudson, it would have Erica, Jenifer, Bill, Keith,
18 Gary, John, and Paul. Sorry I'm not reading last
19 names, but thank you. Enforcement Committee would
20 be chaired by Ivan Carter, and would include Erica,
21 Steve Chancellor, Olivia, Terry, Peter, Bill,
22 Mike, Keith, Cameron, and Denise.

23 The Conservation Committee will be

1 chaired by Denise Welker, with members being
2 Jennifer, Steve, Chris, Olivia, John, Ivan, Peter,
3 Paul, Mike and Terry. Does that sound correct?

4 CHAIR BREWSTER: Anybody got a
5 question?

6 MEMBER HANES: I want to add one thing.
7 I just want to say how important I think the
8 messaging is on this. I think communication, like
9 Jenifer mentioned, was important, but everybody
10 here cares about the animals.

11 I think just dialing in that messaging,
12 to where we can explain how hunting is how these
13 companies, like Pasanisi, stays in business, and
14 the animals are protected. I think Mr. Kitchen,
15 here, mentioned how does killing an animal help it?
16 I think we just need to get that message out on how
17 hunting is the -- it's the crux of all this.
18 Without hunting, there is no other industry there.
19 That's it. With every day that goes by, I just
20 think that we're losing animals. I could care less
21 about hunting myself, but the animals are
22 disappearing. Hunting is the biggest key to that.
23 The messaging is what's -- we, as hunters, haven't

1 done a very good job, I don't think.

2 CHAIR BREWSTER: Certainly messaging
3 is extremely important, Cameron.

4 MEMBER CHANCELLOR: One more thing.
5 On getting us educated, we talked about bringing
6 host countries in, what you guys can do for us. Not
7 everyone in this room has the same opinion, but
8 there are people in this room that have opinions
9 that matter, that we need to hear from.

10 We should try to get all the education
11 we can get from various points of view, but
12 particularly from people who are truly educated and
13 experienced on the subject. We need to get
14 feedback from people who have spent time on the
15 ground, in the bush, with the animals, with the
16 poachers, with the anti-poachers, so they really
17 understand all the issues. Those don't have to be
18 hunters, don't have to be photographic folks.
19 They can people that have worked over there on water
20 projects, working schools, clinics, whatever, but
21 people who see the perspective firsthand. We need
22 to solicit that.

23 CHAIR BREWSTER: Very good point,

1 Steve. It's awful easy to have a solution if
2 you've never been there. When you see the
3 problems, it's quite involved, and you make some
4 very good points there. We hope to get some very
5 good input from everybody. I'm open to discussion
6 because our main thing to accomplish is the
7 conservation of the wildlife. Okay, Greg, or Mr.
8 Director. I'm sorry; I've been calling you Greg.

9 MEMBER SHEEHAN: No, that's great.
10 Thank you all, first of all, for your service. And
11 I'll again thank everyone who attended today and
12 wish you all safe travels as you head home after
13 this meeting today. Mr. Chairman, thank you for
14 stepping up to help lead this group. I know
15 Secretary Zinke, again, thanks you for your time
16 and service here.

17 CHAIR BREWSTER: If we could get the
18 ones that are chairman and your vice chairmen,
19 Jenifer, and we can sit down with Greg and go
20 through some ideas on our next meeting and what we
21 would like to -- hope we can get information on.
22 If there's nothing else, this meeting stands
23 adjourned.