



Memorandum

To: Edward Maillott

From: CRA International

Date: December 7, 2006

Subject: **ECONOMIC IMPACT OF CONSERVATION EFFORTS IN DESIGNATED CRITICAL HABITAT FOR THE LYON'S PENTACHAETA AND BRAUNTON'S MILK VETCH**

On Tuesday, November 14, 2006, the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (the Service) designated critical habitat for Braunton's milk-vetch (*Astragalus brauntonii*) and Lyon's Pentachaeta (*Pentachaeta lyonii*). A total of approximately 339 acres of proposed critical habitat for Braunton's milk-vetch were excluded in the Final Rule. A total of approximately 816 acres of proposed critical habitat for Lyon's pentachaeta were excluded in the Final Rule. This memorandum summarizes the economic impact of conservation activities in the geographic areas that were identified in the Final Rule.¹

In the Final Rule, the Service reduced the outer boundaries of each unit. In the Proposed Rule, the unit boundaries extended 984 ft. on all sides for both species. In the final rule, the unit boundaries extend 935 ft. for milk-vetch and 902 ft. for pentachaeta. In addition, the Service excluded unit 6 for the pentachaeta due to economic impacts to the landowner. The Service also corrected the ownership of lands within several units. The differences in acreage ownership between the Proposed Rule and the Final Rule are summarized in Table 1 below. The Final Rule describes the details of the geographic scope of final critical habitat and reasons for excluding certain units of proposed critical habitat.²

Tables 2a and 2b below display the economic impacts in areas that were designated critical habitat for Braunton's milk-vetch and Lyon's pentachaeta.

¹ The Service, Endangered and Threatened Wildlife and Plants; Designation of Critical Habitat for *Astragalus brauntonii* and *Pentachaeta lyonii*; Final Rule, Federal Register, Vol. 71, No. 219, November 14, 2006, 66388 and 66391.

² The Service, Endangered and Threatened Wildlife and Plants; Designation of Critical Habitat for *Astragalus brauntonii* and *Pentachaeta lyonii*; Final Rule, Federal Register, Vol. 71, No. 219, November 14, 2006, 66382.

Table 1: Summary of Ownership Modifications

	Pentachaeta				Milk-Vetch						
	Unit 1C		Unit 2b		Unit 1D			Unit 2a			
	Private	CMWD	Private	COSCA	Rocketdyne	Boeing	SMMC	Private	COSCA	State	
Proposed Rule	49	2	16	31	77			217	235		
Final Rule	33		18	22	68			2	71	221	118

Notes:

- 1) Area shown in acres.
- 2) CMWD stands for Calleguas Municipal Water District; COSCA stands for Conejo Open Space Conservation Agency; SMMC stands for Santa Monica Mountain Conservancy.

Source:

- 1) The Service, Endangered and Threatened Wildlife and Plants; Designation of Critical Habitat for *Astragalus brauntonii* and *Pentachaeta lyonii*; Final Rule, Federal Register, Vol. 71, No. 219, November 14, 2006, 66382.

Table 2a: Summary of Economic Impacts on Lands Designated Critical Habitat for *Astragalus brauntonii*

Name	Unit	Area Included in Final Critical Habitat	Lost Housing Development		
			Surplus Lost	Annualized Impact (3% Discount Rate)	Annualized Impact (7% Discount Rate)
Northern Simi Hills	1A	183	\$11,605,527	\$757,353	\$1,023,813
	1B	73	\$3,787,269	\$247,149	\$334,104
	1C	108	\$0	\$0	\$0
	1D	70	\$0	\$0	\$0
Southern Simi Hills	2A	410	\$0	\$0	\$0
	2B	1	\$0	\$0	\$0
	2C	144	\$0	\$0	\$0
	2D	111	\$0	\$0	\$0
	2E	146	\$0	\$0	\$0
	2F	207	\$59,353,085	\$3,873,262	\$5,235,992
Santa Monica Mountains	3	228	\$0	\$0	\$0
Pacific Palisades	4	505	\$0	\$0	\$0
Monrovia	5	282	\$9,447,993	\$616,557	\$833,480
Coal Canyon	6	832	\$0	\$0	\$0
Total		3,300	\$84,193,874	\$5,494,321	\$7,427,389

Note:

1) Area shown in acres.

Sources:

- 1) CRA, Economic Effects of Critical Habitat Designation for Braunton's Milk Vetch in Three California Counties, April 28, 2006.
- 2) The Service, Endangered and Threatened Wildlife and Plants: Designation of Critical Habitat for *Astragalus brauntonii* and *Pentachaeta lyonii*: Final Rule, Federal Register, Vol. 71, No. 219, November 14, 2006.

Table 2b: Summary of Economic Impacts on Lands Designated Critical Habitat for *Pentachaeta lyonii*

Name	Unit	Area Included in Final Critical Habitat	Lost Housing Development		
			Surplus Lost	Annualized Impact (3% Discount Rate)	Annualized Impact (7% Discount Rate)
Simi Valley	1A	245	\$3,464,529	\$226,088	\$305,633
	1B	18	\$5,242,586	\$342,121	\$462,489
	1C	33	\$12,354,309	\$806,217	\$1,089,869
	1D	94	\$25,080,859	\$1,636,726	\$2,212,575
Montclef Ridge	2A	1,051	\$33,092,823	\$2,159,570	\$2,919,372
	2B	40	\$1,668,085	\$108,856	\$147,155
	2C	66	\$6,539,985	\$426,786	\$576,942
Thousand Oaks	3A	212	\$11,164,466	\$728,570	\$984,903
	3B	64	\$6,590,074	\$430,055	\$581,361
	3C	983	\$4,297,553	\$280,450	\$379,120
Triunfo Canyon	4	206	\$0	\$0	\$0
Mulholland Dr.	5A	68	\$0	\$0	\$0
	5B	107	\$0	\$0	\$0
	5C	62	\$0	\$0	\$0
	5D	55	\$0	\$0	\$0
Cornell Road	6	0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Malibu Lake	7	92	\$0	\$0	\$0
Total		3,396	\$109,495,271	\$7,145,439	\$9,659,420

Note:

1) Area shown in acres.

Sources:

- 1) CRA, Economic Effects of Critical Habitat Designation for Lyon's Pentachaeta in Two California Counties, June 2, 2006.
- 2) The Service, Endangered and Threatened Wildlife and Plants: Designation of Critical Habitat for *Astragalus brauntonii* and *Pentachaeta lyonii*: Final Rule, Federal Register, Vol. 71, No. 219, November 14, 2006.