

Ciudad de México, 28 de febrero de 2017

Comments of the “Draft Species Status Assessment for the Mohave Shoulderband Snail (*Helminthoglypta greggi*).”

Page 15, second paragraph, line 7, says: *Sonarella*, should say *Sonorella*

Page 19, first paragraph, line 3: 2, 850 foot?

Page 39, last paragraph, line one, it says “climate chnage”, should say: “climate change”.

Page 44, penultimate paragraph, eight line, is this correct?

“shoulderband snail is representative of relict snail populations that are have become restricted to”

A quien corresponda:

Al revisar el manuscrito: Draft Species Status Assessment for the Mohave Shoulderband Snail (*Helminthoglypta greggi*). Me parece que los autores han hecho una amplia revisión y análisis de la información en relación con el “Mohave Shoulderband Snail (*Helminthoglypta greggi*)”. Los aspectos tratados se han realizado con detalle.

Sin embargo, existe cierta información, de la cual carecemos, como el número de individuos que constituyen una población de “Mohave Shoulderband Snail (*Helminthoglypta greggi*)”. Si sabemos que las poblaciones se encuentran aisladas, unas de las otras; los valles, arroyos o florecimientos se hayan separados varios metros o kilómetros.

La reproducción o el entrecruzamiento entre las poblaciones no está garantizado, debido a las distancias que representan el ambiente hostil: el desierto. Sospecho, y lo sospechábamos el Dr. Walter B. Miller, mi profesor y mis compañeros de clase, que las poblaciones de caracoles del desierto han estado aisladas por muchos años. Por otro lado, los caracoles “Mohave Shoulderband” hasta donde sabemos no son gregarios: son solitarios. Según nuestra experiencia, si tenemos mucha suerte, podemos encontrar a lo mucho cinco ejemplares vivos en un afloramiento. ¿Pero cuántos caracoles viven en un macizo montañoso?

Por lo que, desde mi perspectiva, debemos apelar al “principio precautorio” y tratar de afectar lo menos posible el hábitat. ¿Cuántos años necesitará el medio ambiente, “el desierto” para recobrase de una pérdida del 19%? ¿Se podrá mejorar esa cifra y afectar lo menos posible el hábitat? Ahora somos testigos de los cambios en el ambiente, ello nos invita a reconsiderar nuestras apreciaciones. Les invito a tratar de conservar lo más posible “Soledad Mountain”.

Atentamente:


Edna Naranjo-García Ph.D.

Mexico City, February 28, 2017

Comments of the “Draft Species Status Assessment for the Mohave Shoulderband Snail (*Helminthoglypta greggi*).”

Page 15, second paragraph, line 7, says: *Sonarella*, should say *Sonorella*

Page 19, first paragraph, line 3: 2, 850 foot?

Page 39, last paragraph, line one, it says “climate chnage”, should say: “climate change”.

Page 44, penultimate paragraph, eight line, is this correct?

“shoulderband snail is representative of relict snail populations that are have become restricted to”

Dear Sir/Madam:

Upon review of the manuscript “Draft Species Status Assessment for the Mohave Shoulderband Snail (*Helminthoglypta greggi*),” it seems to me that the authors carried out an extensive review and analysis of the information concerning the Mohave Shoulderband Snail (*Helminthoglypta greggi*). The aspects addressed have been discussed in detail.

Nevertheless, there is certain information that we are lacking, such as the number of individuals that make up a Mohave Shoulderband Snail (*Helminthoglypta greggi*) population. We know that the populations are isolated from one another; valleys, streams, or blooms have separated them by several meters or kilometers.

Reproduction or crossover between populations is not guaranteed due to the distances of a hostile environment—the desert. I suspect, and we (my professor Dr. Walter B. Miller, my classmates, and I) suspected that desert snail populations have been isolated for many years. On the other hand, as far as we know, Mohave Shoulderband Snails are not gregarious, they are solitary. In our experience, if we are very lucky, we might find as many as five live specimens in an outcrop. But how many snails live in a massif?

Comments of the “Draft Species Status Assessment for the Mohave Shoulderband Snail (*Helminthoglypta greggi*).”

Page 15, second paragraph, line 7, says: *Sonarella*, should say *Sonorella*

Page 19, first paragraph, line 3: 2, 850 foot?

Page 39, last paragraph, line one, it says “climate chnage”, should say: “climate change”.

Page 44, penultimate paragraph, eight line, is this correct?

“shoulderband snail is representative of relict snail populations that are have become restricted to”

To whom this may concern,

On reading the document: Draft Species Status Assessment for the Mohave Shoulderband Snail (*Helminthoglypta greggi*). I had found a comprehensive approach and analysis of the information related with the Mohave Shoulderband Snail (*Helminthoglypta greggi*). Detailed information of very aspect treated.

In light of certain information, we are lacking, such as number of individuals that conform a population; we know that populations are isolated, since various meters or kilometers separate each valley, ravine or outcrop from each other. Reproduction or crossing among those populations is not warranted due to those distances that represent a harsh environment: the desert. Snail populations we suspect, have been isolated for many years. On the other hand, individuals of the Mohave Shoulderband Snail as far as we know are not gregarious. From our experience, if you are lucky you could find at the most five live organisms in one outcrop, how many could live in one mountain range?

So, from my perspective we should appeal to the caution concept and try to affect the less possible the habitat, how many years could the desert environment need to recover a 19% loss?

With best regards,

Edna Naranjo-García Ph.D.

A review of the Draft SSA for the Mohave Shoulderband Snail -- February 12, 2017

Lance Gilbertson

The assessment was done thoroughly and professionally. It very adequately explains the present situation and future concerns of the Mohave shoulderband snail. Of necessity, it often uses research based on other (usually desert) snails to help fill in what is not known specifically about the Mohave shoulderband. I concur with the information and concerns that are expressed in the document.

A few minor specific corrections, suggestions, etc., are as follows:

There should be a sentence somewhere explaining the erroneous spelling of “Mohave” (i.e. with an “h”) in the snail name compared with “Mojave” Desert.

- p. 1 -- Title. Change to “...FOR THE MOHAVE...” (i.e. add “THE”)
The snail is shown reversed in the photo. It is incorrect and weird looking!
- p. 2 -- Item (2). Change to “...mosses, lichens...” (i.e. plural) Also on other pages incl. 15 and 44.
- p. 3 -- 2nd paragraph -- “...likely potential stressors (i.e. hard rock mining...) ...are low... “. Really? I thought hard rock mining would be a high stressor (i.e. the reason for this petition.)
- p. 7 -- 1st paragraph. Change to: “The Mohave shoulderband snail, *Helminthoglypta (Coyote) greggi* Willett, 1931 is a small.... . The type description was based on.... .”
- p. 13 --Possibly add a sentence re. egg-laying behavior of *Sonorella odorata* per Gilbertson 1969.
- p. 15 --3rd paragraph. Gilbertson 1969. *Sonorella odorata* is an unusual high elevation (8,000 ft.), mountain species. Not desert.
- p. 16 --Snail predators also include invertebrates such as certain beetles and their larvae.
- p. 21 --Table 1. Re. the number of observations at Soledad Mt. How many were live snails vs. shells? Will there be another line added for the January 2017 observations? And, did the 2017 observation polygons partially or totally overlap with previously surveyed areas shown on Table 1 and Figure 5? Are there any stats on the total number of live snails? Immatures vs adults? How much rain was recorded on the days prior to the 2017 search?
- p. 43 --Abundance. Change to: “...does not indicate that the species’ abundance is significantly impacted by factors that are human-caused.”
- p. 45 --paragraph 2. (change to) “...future, alleviate the effects of impacts related to wildland fire,”

p. 51 – Gilbertson 1969. Change to “snail” (singular)
Gilbertson....2006. Change to “Malacological”
Gilbertson 2013. Change to “Mojave”, and “Malacological”