

U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service
Bleached Sandhill Skipper Proposed Listing
Virtual Public Hearing Transcript
April 16, 2025, 5:00 – 7:00 pm Pacific Time

00:00:05.880 --> 00:00:16.559

Megan Stone - AECOM: Hello, everyone. I'd like to welcome you all to the US Fish and Wildlife Service's virtual public meeting for the bleach sandhill skipper proposed listing.

00:00:16.670 --> 00:00:35.510

Megan Stone - AECOM: We're going to give folks a few minutes here to join the meeting, and then we'll begin the PowerPoint presentation shortly, so please stay tuned. I do want to note that closed captioning is available by clicking the live transcript button on your Zoom toolbar and then selecting show subtitles.

00:00:35.770 --> 00:00:40.480

Megan Stone - AECOM: Thank you everyone for your patience as we give folks a few moments to join.

00:01:15.410 --> 00:01:42.969

Megan Stone - AECOM: Again, welcome everyone to this evening's meeting. We're going to give folks a few more minutes here to join the meeting, so please stay tuned, and we'll start the presentation shortly. Again, I do want to note that closed captioning is available by clicking the live transcript button icon on your zoom toolbar, and then selecting show subtitles. Thanks for your patience as we give folks just another moment here to join.

00:02:18.370 --> 00:02:22.429

Megan Stone - AECOM: We'll go ahead and get started next slide, please.

00:02:24.580 --> 00:02:29.640

Megan Stone - AECOM: Hello, everyone! As I said, we'll go ahead and get started with our meeting tonight

00:02:29.740 --> 00:02:53.819

Megan Stone - AECOM: On behalf of the US Fish and Wildlife Service. I would like to thank you all for joining us. We appreciate your time and participation. My name is Megan Stone, with AECOM, a contractor for the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service and I'm going to be your meeting facilitator tonight. Additionally, I have several members of the Service with me on the meeting tonight who will be introduced in a moment.

00:02:54.260 --> 00:03:04.829

Megan Stone - AECOM: On the screen is our expected agenda for the evening. I'll first go over a brief orientation to Zoom, and some meeting ground rules for the meeting this evening.

00:03:04.960 --> 00:03:24.829

Megan Stone - AECOM: The Service will welcome you all and provide introductions, and then we'll move into a presentation on the proposed listing, which will last between 20 to 30 minutes. For the remainder of the meeting, we'll accept verbal public comments, and after the comment session we'll provide brief closing remarks

00:03:24.940 --> 00:03:26.430

Megan Stone - AECOM: Next slide, please.

00:00:03:30.380 --> 00:03:35.849

Megan Stone - AECOM: before we get started with our meeting we wanted to go over some ground rules

00:03:36.010 --> 00:03:42.990

Megan Stone - AECOM: First, closed captioning is available by selecting the Closed Caption icon at the bottom of your Zoom screen.

00:03:43.150 --> 00:03:51.519

Megan Stone - AECOM: Second, this meeting is being recorded as part of the project record, and will be posted to the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service website.

00:03:52.340 --> 00:03:57.649

Megan Stone - AECOM: Third, your microphones and videos will be turned off for the duration of the meeting tonight.

00:03:57.820 --> 00:04:05.210

Megan Stone - AECOM: You will only be unmuted if and when I unmute you during our verbal public comment session if you are commenting.

00:04:05.740 --> 00:04:11.580

Megan Stone - AECOM: Third, we'll move into that verbal public comment portion after the presentation.

00:04:11.910 --> 00:04:27.940

Megan Stone - AECOM: If you registered before the start time of tonight's meeting and indicated that you wanted to offer verbal public comment tonight you are on our list of preregistered commenters. We will call on preregistered commenters in the order of registration.

00:04:28.060 --> 00:04:38.119

Megan Stone - AECOM: If you registered after the meeting started, we'll do our best to reserve some time for you to have an opportunity to offer your verbal public comment this evening.

00:04:38.430 --> 00:04:52.850

Megan Stone - AECOM: If you do not get the opportunity to offer your verbal public comment tonight, written public comments can be submitted at [regulations.gov](https://www.regulations.gov). We'll provide further information on how to submit your comments at the end of the presentation

00:04:52.990 --> 00:04:58.039

Megan Stone - AECOM: the Service will review all public comments, both written and verbal.

00:04:58.970 --> 00:05:12.359

Megan Stone - AECOM: We did want to note that this meeting is a public hearing, which is part of a formal process, to allow the public to comment, and it will be included in the Service's administrative records and made publicly available as well.

00:05:12.560 --> 00:05:18.520

Megan Stone - AECOM: If attendees do want to talk with field office representatives in more detail about the process

00:05:18.670 --> 00:05:33.549

Megan Stone - AECOM: or if they have specific questions about the species or information in the proposed rule or the species status assessment, we encourage you to contact the field office, and we'll provide that information later on as well.

00:05:33.910 --> 00:05:39.359

Megan Stone - AECOM: With that I'll now turn it over to Kristen Jule with the Service to welcome you all.

00:05:50.040 --> 00:06:04.060

Lara Enders - USFWS: My name is Kristen Jule and I am the Field Supervisor here at the Reno Fish and Wildlife office, and I want to thank everybody for your participation tonight and for your interest in the species, and how

00:06:04.560 --> 00:06:17.150

Lara Enders - USFWS: the proposed classification might impact you. The public comment period is a really important part of the process, and we really value your insights, perspectives, and look forward to hearing more of your comments

00:06:17.250 --> 00:06:20.630

Lara Enders - USFWS: I'm going to pass off next introductions.

00:06:22.160 --> 00:06:29.030

Lara Enders - USFWS: Hi, everyone. My name is Rachel Youmans. I'm an Assistant Field Supervisor here at the Reno Fish and Wildlife office.

00:06:30.150 --> 00:06:58.539

Lara Enders - USFWS: Good evening, everyone. My name is Lara Enders. I'm a wildlife biologist here in the Reno office as well, and I'm the lead biologist for the bleached sandhill skipper, *Polites sabuleti sinemaculata*. So I'll be giving the short presentation tonight, providing an overview of Endangered Species Act information for the species, where it's found, its life history, the threats that we evaluated for listing determination, before we move on to the public hearing portion of this evening's session.

00:06:58.740 --> 00:07:05.139

Lara Enders - USFWS: So on this slide, we have a picture of a male bleached sandhill skipper nectaring on yellow rabbitbrush.

00:07:07.770 --> 00:07:24.260

Lara Enders - USFWS: So a little bit about bleached sandhill skipper listing history. So in 2010 to 2012, we evaluated the bleached sandhill skipper for listing and in 2012, at the end of that process, we found that listing was not warranted based on the information available and the review of the threats at that time.

00:07:24.380 --> 00:07:41.350

Lara Enders - USFWS: In 2022, we were petitioned again to evaluate the need to list, and so this started the process over again. We spent 2023 gathering best available science and information to assess our understanding of the bleached sandhill skipper building on that which we had done for the 2012 effort.

00:07:41.680 --> 00:07:59.039

Lara Enders - USFWS: All of this information in 2023 was wrapped into a science-based document called the Species Status Assessment that provides what is known about the bleached sandhill skipper, what it needs to survive, and then the analyses of factors that may affect it. What's the evidence and magnitude of these potential threats now and into the future?

00:07:59.790 --> 00:08:14.809

Lara Enders - USFWS: So, using the information that we gathered in the SSA, we then evaluated the species for the need to list against the definitions of threatened and endangered which resulted in the proposed rule. On January 8th that found that bleached sandhill skipper is warranted for listing as endangered.

00:08:16.840 --> 00:08:44.989

Lara Enders - USFWS: So endangered means that it is in danger of extinction throughout all or a portion of its range. And once a species is listed, it's then afforded the full range of protections available under the Endangered Species Act, including prohibitions on killing, harming, or otherwise taking

the species. For efforts that have a federal nexus, such as funding or permitting, it may require consultation under Section 7 of the ESA.

00:08:46.030 --> 00:08:57.339

Lara Enders - USFWS: So, as part of the listing process, now that we've issued a proposed rule, we have our public comment period to solicit additional information to help inform our final decision.

00:08:57.420 --> 00:09:16.389

Lara Enders - USFWS: During our original public comment period from January to March of this year, we did receive a request for a public hearing, and also a request to extend the public comment period. So to meet these requests, we've reopened the public comment period and we'll reiterate the opportunities to comment on the last slide.

00:09:16.580 --> 00:09:29.090

Lara Enders - USFWS: So when this public, when this public comment period closes, we'll review all of those comments and work to issue a final decision within 12 months of the proposed rule, we're looking at January 8th.

00:09:32.730 --> 00:09:54.720

Lara Enders - USFWS: Alright. So who and what is the bleached sandhill skipper and where is it found? To start with where it's found, there's three populations, all in Humboldt County, Nevada, west of Denio. So Pueblo Slough, the first population, is about 5 miles west of Denio. Rincon Creek is then another 5 miles west. And the Gridley Lake population is about 15 miles south from there.

00:09:54.820 --> 00:10:21.289

Lara Enders - USFWS: So when we evaluated bleached sandhill skipper back in 2012, only one population, the Pueblo Slough population, was known. And so during this current evaluation, we were able to determine two additional populations based on data that was not previously public--wasn't publicly known in 2012. Also from genetic analyses that were completed in 2023, and then additional survey work that's occurred over the last several years.

00:10:22.000 --> 00:10:29.329

Lara Enders - USFWS: At this time, we don't have additional information that there are other populations or may be other populations outside this geographic area.

00:10:29.340 --> 00:10:52.089

Lara Enders - USFWS: So if there's additional information, we appreciate that. We've also called these separate populations as they're separated by about 5 to 15 miles, as I mentioned, and skippers don't consistently fly particularly far. So that, and then supported with the genetic analyses information, indicate that movement's pretty limited between these three areas, so that's why we're calling them populations.

00:10:52.240 --> 00:11:02.790

Lara Enders - USFWS: On this slide here, we have an aerial image of the range of bleached sandhill skipper showing the approximate population locations relative to Highway 140 and within Humboldt County.

00:11:05.240 --> 00:11:09.889

Lara Enders - USFWS: So this slide provides an overview of the lifecycle of the bleached sandhill skipper.

00:11:10.080 --> 00:11:33.499

Lara Enders - USFWS: Adult bleached sandhill skippers feed on nectar, which can come from any flowering plants. They've been mostly observed on yellow rabbitbrush and white rabbitbrush as those are the main nectar sources available in late summer in their habitat. The adults are found in August through early October, with individuals probably living about one to two weeks. Here we have a picture of an adult female on yellow rabbitbrush.

00:11:34.930 --> 00:11:50.680

Lara Enders - USFWS: So the second stage, then, is the females lay their eggs on saltgrass and eggs are likely present mid-August through October as females lay eggs over the course of the season. Each egg hatches after about one week. And here we have a picture of saltgrass.

00:11:52.440 --> 00:12:06.949

Lara Enders - USFWS: When the eggs hatch, or the caterpillars hatch, they remain on the saltgrass and eat the saltgrass as their food source. And then caterpillars are likely present September through November, with each individual caterpillar living for about four to six weeks.

00:12:08.710 --> 00:12:33.609

Lara Enders - USFWS: When it's time to pupate or turn into a chrysalis, which likely occurs when the saltgrass begins to dry out for the season, they do so at the base of the saltgrass plant. So we have chrysalises present November to the following August, and they remain in this stage until that late summer when the adults emerge and they reproduce, starting the cycle over again. The picture here provides a landscape view of habitat.

00:12:35.140 --> 00:12:58.619

Lara Enders - USFWS: So a few things to note is that much of the activity for the butterfly, focusing on the adult, happens in late summer and fall. And so when we're thinking about the threats in a few slides here and talking about warming and drying conditions, consider that we're already kind of towards the tail end of the productive period from a habitat perspective, things are already drying out, and if you have warming and drying, that may accelerate to that.

00:12:59.440a --> 00:13:09.940

Lara Enders - USFWS: Adding to that, bleached sandhill skippers have just one generation per year. And so anything that happens during that adult flight period that affects adult survival or reproduction

00:13:10.000 --> 00:13:34.910

Lara Enders - USFWS: really impacts next year's population, and so they must complete those life save functions of eating and breeding within just a couple weeks. Individuals only live one to 2 weeks, so if conditions are not appropriate, then they die or don't reproduce. So an example of this is when it gets really hot, butterflies tend to stop flying, and then they won't get food or have the ability to mate.

00:13:35.750 --> 00:13:58.389

Lara Enders - USFWS: In addition with these guys, and again, supported by the genetic information we have, they have low dispersal rates. They don't fly very far. They don't intermix. And they aren't--so therefore they're not really able to move to respond to poor conditions. So any factors that are affecting this region are going to be affecting all the butterflies. All the bleached sandhill skippers.

00:14:01.710 --> 00:14:13.590

Lara Enders - USFWS: So on this slide, we have a picture of the alkali meadow habitat that's found in each of the three populations. And it's showing saltgrass as the understory and then mostly yellow rabbitbrush as the overstory in these pictures.

00:14:13.890 --> 00:14:23.299

Lara Enders - USFWS: So the plant community that bleached sandhill skipper lives within is a groundwater-dependent ecosystem, which means that a shallow water table is needed to support those plants.

00:14:23.480 --> 00:14:29.879

Lara Enders - USFWS: Changes to the water table on the order of just a few feet can really affect the cover and composition of the plants.

00:14:30.220 --> 00:14:45.569

Lara Enders - USFWS: and also precipitation and temperature needs to be appropriate for the timing of the nectar availability and the saltgrass to green up to be able to align with the bleached sandhill skipper life stages so that they have the food appropriate for that life stage.

00:14:49.420 --> 00:14:58.549

Lara Enders - USFWS: So how many bleached sandhill skippers do we have? In the 2012 listing evaluation, we really didn't have any objective survey data.

00:14:58.550 --> 00:15:26.949

Lara Enders - USFWS: Starting in 2014, survey guidelines were developed that provided a consistent approach for surveys that we could compare between years. So as we developed the 2023 SSA and the current listing evaluation we

had butterfly count data conducted over 6 out of 10 years for the Pueblo Slough population. And again, this stems from the fact that originally we just had knowledge of the Pueblo Slough population and not the other ones.

00:15:27.090 --> 00:15:55.949

Lara Enders - USFWS: So these counts show that there's been a drop by 97% in that timeframe. So this slide shows a graph with years across the bottom from 2014 to 2023 and the number of bleached sandhill skippers counted is on the up-and-down axis, with zero at the bottom and greater than 6,000 at the top. So the results show that in 2014, there were 7,400 or so individuals counted.

00:15:55.950 --> 00:16:13.139

Lara Enders - USFWS: And each survey year after, using that same survey method, in 2015 and 2019, there were several thousand— several thousand, then a few thousand. And in 2021 to 2023, there's just been a few hundred counted each year.

00:16:13.870 --> 00:16:23.299

Lara Enders - USFWS: So insect populations often have variable numbers between years, depending on conditions, so thinking about trend for insects requires looking across multiple years.

00:16:23.360 --> 00:16:45.280

Lara Enders - USFWS: Well, we may see increases in abundance in years with favorable weather conditions, such as, anecdotally observed, 2023 was supposed to be a pretty good year for Western butterflies generally and we expect to see those good years. But these data that we have here suggest that even if we are seeing favorable years, they're not really able to rebound from those poor years.

00:16:48.810 --> 00:17:02.420

Lara Enders - USFWS: So on this next slide, then, we have the same graph as before, but we've added the data that we had for Gridley Lake and Rincon Creek. So we have some information on presence/absence, which is just sort of: yes, they were there. No, they weren't there.

00:17:02.872 --> 00:17:08.990

Lara Enders - USFWS: But we do have one year of data for each of these populations that follow those standardized guidelines.

00:17:09.579 --> 00:17:29.630

Lara Enders - USFWS: So while we don't have trend, they do give us a possible relative population size compared to Pueblo Slough. And so for Rincon Creek, in the lower left hand, we presume a much smaller relative size to Pueblo Slough as we counted 78 individuals were counted at the Rincon Creek population in 2015.

00:17:29.710 --> 00:17:55.370

Lara Enders - USFWS: And for Gridley Lake, in 2023, just over 300 individuals were counted relative to about 250 at Pueblo Slough and so we assume this one probably has a similar population size. As we move forward with our final listing decision we'll look to include any additional survey that's available for 2024 and 2025, depending on the timing of when those data become available.

00:17:58.620 --> 00:18:21.010

Lara Enders - USFWS: So that's background on the bleached sandhill skipper switching to evaluating the species for listing under the ESA, under the Endangered Species Act there's five categories we look at when evaluating species. Those are listed here as A through E and these are the categories as they're laid out in the ESA itself. So the first one is really thinking about threats to the habitat itself.

00:18:21.150 --> 00:18:27.689

Lara Enders - USFWS: and then B and C, and potentially D, think about more direct impacts to the individuals.

00:18:28.080 --> 00:18:37.029

Lara Enders - USFWS: And then E is natural or other man-made factors affecting, which helps capture additional concepts beyond those in A and D.

00:18:37.950 --> 00:18:43.619

Lara Enders - USFWS: And so what are these threats—consider how these threats or protections provide—maybe

00:18:43.740 --> 00:18:50.260

Lara Enders - USFWS: how these threats are either protective or negative, and how they may be affecting the species.

00:18:56.180 --> 00:19:25.600

Lara Enders - USFWS: So to determine the factors that may affect the species and then evaluate them, we reviewed information that was provided in the petition, the 2022 petition. Information that was submitted in response to information requests. And we reviewed the scientific literature and met with relevant experts. All of this built upon the information in the 2012 evaluation. So our data standard is the use of best available science and information, including traditional knowledge.

00:19:25.850 --> 00:19:36.599

Lara Enders - USFWS: So the potential factors that were brought to light and we analyzed in depth in the SSA were changing climatic conditions, groundwater pumping, grazing, and geothermal development.

00:19:36.770 --> 00:19:57.880

Lara Enders - USFWS: So changing climatic conditions was looking at if there's evidence for recent change and into the future in regards to temperature, precipitation, and drought. And then, if so, would that affect

the bleached sandhill skipper, thinking about effects to its habitat and then also impacts to the butterflies themselves that might affect their ability to survive and reproduce.

00:19:57.880 --> 00:20:14.100

Lara Enders - USFWS: And this was one area since the 2012 listing that there was a lot more information available, both in terms of data availability, modeling, and then also research on impacts to butterflies from those particular potential threats.

00:20:14.470 --> 00:20:25.659

Lara Enders - USFWS: For groundwater pumping, we are looking at the potential for concern to bleached sandhill skipper relative to their habitat. The plants whose roots need the shallow groundwater table and provide a moderating microclimate.

00:20:25.770 --> 00:20:34.120

Lara Enders - USFWS: So we looked at groundwater pumping and well data, perennial yield, how it's determined and modeling of the vegetation community over time.

00:20:35.130 --> 00:20:50.020

Lara Enders - USFWS: Livestock grazing occurs at Pueblo Slough and Gridley Lake, and we also considered the potential presence of wild horses and burros in the area. And so for this, we're thinking about potential concerns of trampling of eggs, caterpillars, the chrysalises, the things that can't move

00:20:50.020 --> 00:21:07.209

Lara Enders - USFWS: that are in the saltgrass, and we also evaluated information available to see how nectar sources or saltgrass abundance may be detrimentally affected by the grazing management. And so for this, we reviewed grazing permits and monitoring data collected by the BLM.

00:21:08.230 --> 00:21:32.510

Lara Enders - USFWS: There's also geothermal development that's been authorized in this area. And so we evaluated if there's potential for changes in surface and shallow groundwater that support the habitat or direct impacts from increased noise or activities associated with the future facility. So we reviewed the local hydrologic and geologic information, project planning, including monitoring and consulting with experts and scientific literature.

00:21:32.890 --> 00:21:42.740

Lara Enders - USFWS: So for all of these factors, we're asking: are they really present? And if so, is there a mechanism and evidence for detrimental impacts to the bleached sandhill skipper's persistence?

00:21:45.860 --> 00:21:59.620

Lara Enders - USFWS: So in our review of those factors using the best available science and information, we did find that the impacts from the

warming and drying, from climatic conditions and drying of habitat from groundwater pumping are currently key concerns for the bleached sandhill skipper.

00:21:59.860 --> 00:22:06.590

Lara Enders - USFWS: Grazing and geothermal development were not found as key threats on their own, though they may add to stressful conditions into the future.

00:22:06.890 --> 00:22:17.000

Lara Enders - USFWS: We also did not find information on any ongoing conservation actions for the benefit of the bleached sandhill skipper, which we will also consider if it's ongoing.

00:22:18.380 --> 00:22:33.930

Lara Enders - USFWS: So from this, in summary, we find that the bleached sandhill skipper met the definition of endangered. It's in danger of becoming extinct across all or a significant portion of its range, and therefore, we are proposing to list the bleached sandhill skipper as endangered under the ESA.

00:22:34.070 --> 00:22:57.830

Lara Enders - USFWS: So at this stage in the listing process, for this public comment period, we'd appreciate additional information on the topics that we've introduced here or other information that you find would be relevant for that. So various topics, habitat conditions over time, additional information on the populations or other populations to look into, past or ongoing conservation measures, and any additional information.

00:22:59.960 --> 00:23:21.660

Lara Enders - USFWS: So this slide here will provide--reiterates the opportunity to provide comments. So in addition to the opportunity to provide public comment at this evening's hearing, you may also do so online or in writing. And so we'll accept comments received or postmarked on or before May 19th of this year.

00:23:22.439 --> 00:23:40.969

Lara Enders - USFWS: and the presentation. This evening we covered a lot of the information, the proposed rule, and we have started reviewing the comments that were submitted were submitted during the first public comment period and we're already starting to evaluate that. So we really appreciate the time, for those who have submitted, and look forward to the remaining comments.

00:23:41.330 --> 00:23:45.099

Lara Enders - USFWS: And this concludes the informational presentation. Thank you for your time.

00:23:46.770 --> 00:23:49.570

Megan Stone - AECOM: Thank you, Lara, for that presentation.

00:23:49.830 --> 00:23:53.580

Megan Stone - AECOM: We'll go ahead and move into the public hearing portion

00:23:53.730 --> 00:23:59.870

Megan Stone - AECOM: Again, my name is Megan Stone, and I'll be the facilitator for the public comment session this evening.

00:24:00.220 --> 00:24:10.910

Megan Stone - AECOM: Before I go over instructions on how to provide verbal comments we wanted to thank folks for submitting questions when they registered for this evening's meeting.

00:24:11.050 --> 00:24:19.220

Megan Stone - AECOM: As everyone signed up to attend this virtual public meeting, they were given the option to submit their questions about the proposed rule.

00:24:19.350 --> 00:24:25.410

Megan Stone - AECOM: The Service reviewed all pre-submitted questions, and used them to inform the presentation.

00:24:25.810 --> 00:24:40.080

Megan Stone - AECOM: We do want to note this evening's meeting is a public hearing which is part of that formal process to allow public comment, and again will be included in the Service's administrative records and made publicly available as well.

00:24:40.400 --> 00:24:56.849

Megan Stone - AECOM: If attendees do want to talk with field office representatives in more detail about the process, or if they have specific questions about the species or information in the proposed rule or the SSA, we encourage you to contact the field office.

00:24:57.000 --> 00:25:01.680

Megan Stone - AECOM: and we'll provide that information later on before we close out.

00:25:02.240 --> 00:25:06.430

Megan Stone - AECOM: Next slide. Oh, actually, this is the right slide, perfect.

00:25:06.880 --> 00:25:23.330

Megan Stone - AECOM: We're going to officially start the verbal public comment portion of the meeting. This public comment session, along with your comments, is being recorded as part of the official record and as a reminder, your camera and mic control settings are restricted during this time.

00:25:23.600 --> 00:25:31.720

Megan Stone - AECOM: You will only be able to unmute if and when you are prompted to unmute. So please remember to speak when prompted.

00:25:32.050 --> 00:25:38.159

Megan Stone - AECOM: The Service wants to hear from all members of the public, so we'll be using the following guidelines today.

00:25:38.380 --> 00:25:46.399

Megan Stone - AECOM: First, please be mindful of the length of your comment, so that everyone who wants to speak has an opportunity to do so this evening.

00:25:46.600 --> 00:25:58.990

Megan Stone - AECOM: We ask that you keep your comment limited to three minutes. We're going to do our best to get through our list of preregistered commenters, and save time for others to offer their comments as well.

00:25:59.400 --> 00:26:14.629

Megan Stone - AECOM: But if you do not get the opportunity to offer your full comment this evening again, you can submit your written comments via [regulations.gov](https://www.regulations.gov) or hard copy. And that information Lara just went over.

00:26:15.270 --> 00:26:20.079

Megan Stone - AECOM: Second, we ask that you please be respectful of others and their viewpoints.

00:26:20.330 --> 00:26:47.099

Megan Stone - AECOM: Third, please refrain from using profanity. While passion is welcome in your comment, policy requires that we mute anyone who uses inappropriate language because we are recording this meeting and others may be livestreaming. So please avoid inappropriate language. If that does happen, we'll provide a reminder before unmuting the person to try again using words acceptable to all ages.

00:26:47.840 --> 00:26:57.829

Megan Stone - AECOM: Comments will be accepted in the order that people registered. Again, if you registered before the start time of tonight's meeting you're on our pre-registered commenter list.

00:26:58.170 --> 00:27:07.099

Megan Stone - AECOM: If you are on the commenter list, when it's your turn to provide your comment, we'll read your name aloud from the list and display your name on the screen.

00:27:07.350 --> 00:27:11.700

Megan Stone - AECOM: We will also display the name of the commenter who is next in line.

00:27:11.970 --> 00:27:19.749

Megan Stone - AECOM: When you hear your name called out, please use the "raise hand" feature so that we know you are available and ready to offer your comment.

00:27:20.450 --> 00:27:30.640

Megan Stone - AECOM: You can access the "raise hand" feature by clicking on either the reactions icon or the participants list icon, which are both located at the bottom of your zoom screen.

00:27:30.910 --> 00:27:36.980

Megan Stone - AECOM: If you wave your mouse back and forth across the bottom of your Zoom screen, those icons should appear.

00:27:37.240 --> 00:27:42.249

Megan Stone - AECOM: You may need to exit out of your full screen zoom view to see the icons.

00:27:42.580 --> 00:27:51.420

Megan Stone - AECOM: You can then select the "raise hand" feature. Again, that's located in the reactions icon area or at the bottom of your participants list.

00:27:51.980 --> 00:27:58.430

Megan Stone - AECOM: Or if you're calling in through the phone, please press *9 to access the "raise hand" feature.

00:27:58.920 --> 00:28:02.959

Megan Stone - AECOM: Again, that's *9 for any phone callers to raise your hand.

00:28:03.410 --> 00:28:08.910

Megan Stone - AECOM: Once you've raised your hand, you'll then be unmuted so that you can provide your verbal public comment.

00:28:09.420 --> 00:28:16.589

Megan Stone - AECOM: You may be double muted. If that's the case, we'll prompt you to unmute yourself on your end so that we can hear you.

00:28:17.050 --> 00:28:29.440

Megan Stone - AECOM: We ask that you please spell out your first and last name for the record before providing your verbal public comment. And if you are representing an organization or group, please say so during your comment.

00:28:29.590 --> 00:28:33.559

Megan Stone - AECOM: We will display a comment timer on the screen as well.

00:28:33.920 --> 00:28:41.279

Megan Stone - AECOM: and I wanted to know if we have any attendees joining us this evening who have multiple people in the same room,

00:28:41.410 --> 00:28:45.649

Megan Stone - AECOM: if you could send a message to us, that would be great.

00:28:45.890 --> 00:28:58.400

Megan Stone - AECOM: and we ask you to follow the same instructions. Just keep an ear out for your name when it's called. Raise your hand and, we'll get you unmuted.

00:28:59.080 --> 00:29:21.340

Megan Stone - AECOM: After you provide your comment, we'll mute you and move on to our next commenter. Again, once we've worked our way through the current pre-registered commenter list we'll move on to those who registered after the start time of tonight's meeting who selected they wanted to offer a comment. And then if we have time remaining after that, which I think we will, we will go ahead and open up the meeting

00:29:21.460 --> 00:29:28.930

Megan Stone - AECOM: to anyone who would like to comment, regardless of whether you signed up when registering. Please

00:29:31.620 --> 00:29:38.429

Megan Stone - AECOM: All right. For anyone who might be new to Zoom, or need a refresher, we just have the

00:29:39.135 --> 00:29:47.090

Megan Stone - AECOM: information here on the screen about how you can raise your hand in Zoom. So I'll leave that up for a second and then we'll get started.

00:29:48.110 --> 00:29:57.809

Megan Stone - AECOM: And if anybody has any technical issues at any point, please do feel free to send a message to host and panelists, and we'll get you some support.

00:29:58.280 --> 00:29:59.690

Megan Stone - AECOM: Next slide, please.

00:30:01.910 --> 00:30:03.000

Megan Stone - AECOM: All right.

00:30:03.250 --> 00:30:13.290

Megan Stone - AECOM: we are going to go ahead and get started with our list of pre-registered- commenters. Our first pre-registered commenter is Andy Rieber.

00:30:13.690 --> 00:30:16.999

Megan Stone - AECOM: I see Andy in our participants list.

00:30:17.130 --> 00:30:21.239

Megan Stone - AECOM: So if you would still like to provide a comment, please do raise your hand.

00:30:21.960 --> 00:30:22.820

Megan Stone - AECOM: Perfect.

00:30:23.150 --> 00:30:27.019

Megan Stone - AECOM: Hi, Andy, I prompted you to unmute. Can you hear us.

00:30:27.450 --> 00:30:28.780

Andy Rieber: Yes. Can you hear me?

00:30:29.100 --> 00:30:33.539

Megan Stone - AECOM: I can hear you. Can you state your first and last name for the record, please?

00:30:33.540 --> 00:30:38.190

Andy Rieber: Yes, this is Andy Rieber, and I am Humboldt County's public lands consultant.

00:30:39.070 --> 00:30:40.719

Megan Stone - AECOM: Thank you. You can begin.

00:30:41.050 --> 00:30:53.459

Andy Rieber: Right. Well, thank you very much for holding this. A couple of comments that were gone over in Humboldt County's general comment, but I think it would be useful to bring to the fore here.

00:30:53.740 --> 00:30:56.839

Andy Rieber: Concerns about the proposed listing.

00:30:57.000 --> 00:31:06.290

Andy Rieber: The first thing I'd like to walk forward is a concern about the almost complete lack of field data

00:31:06.400 --> 00:31:19.560

Andy Rieber: that supports this listing. We did see the little population chart. One thing I would point out, is by the Fish and Wildlife Service's own standards that they mention

00:31:19.890 --> 00:31:38.660

Andy Rieber: the Fish and Wildlife Service hasn't provided enough data points even for the Pueblo Slough population to determine population and trend. And

I would also point out that those high population counts have also been brought into question by legitimate experts.

00:31:39.084 --> 00:31:50.119

Andy Rieber: It seems that the Fish and Wildlife Service doesn't have any field data on the vegetative habitat that is the saltgrass and the rabbitbrush

00:31:50.615 --> 00:31:54.799

Andy Rieber: What you have is some spotty remote sensing data.

00:31:54.950 --> 00:32:20.689

Andy Rieber: but given that the habitat range is only 14 square miles, it doesn't seem too much to ask, to actually go and do some habitat assessment on the ground and by the Fish and Wildlife Service's own admission, you don't have any groundwater level data at the site of habitat, so the fact that there isn't—there is very little or in some cases no confirmational field data

00:32:21.140 --> 00:32:23.250

Andy Rieber: conformational field data

00:32:23.830 --> 00:32:48.699

Andy Rieber: makes this proposed listing very, very concerning to Humboldt County. It also brings into question the before and after picture relative to the 2012 final decision not to list, and this decision—proposed decision to list. One thing that is not clarified in this proposed listing is what is new.

00:32:48.700 --> 00:33:00.079

Andy Rieber: what is new that you now know about climate change that you didn't know in 2012, for example? What is new that you now know about grazing that you didn't know in 2012?

00:33:01.150 --> 00:33:06.569

Andy Rieber: and that—those—the change, the shift in your view.

00:33:07.056 --> 00:33:12.949

Andy Rieber: from where you were in 2012, and where you are now is by no means clarified.

00:33:13.100 --> 00:33:28.799

Andy Rieber: And what that suggests is that the Fish and Wildlife Service in this proposed listing is actually operating under a new and different standard from the standard that you were using in 2012 in terms of determining

00:33:28.800 --> 00:33:44.000

Andy Rieber: what constitutes best available scientific data and what does not. And there really seems to be a relaxation of your standards, and allowing for much, much more speculative

00:33:44.848 --> 00:33:47.519

Andy Rieber: viewpoints, thanks very much.

00:33:48.690 --> 00:33:53.260

Megan Stone - AECOM: Thank you for your comment, Andy. We'll go ahead and place you back on mute

00:33:53.610 --> 00:33:59.480

Megan Stone - AECOM: and we will move on to our next pre-registered commenter, Wallace Slough.

00:34:00.250 --> 00:34:02.780

Megan Stone - AECOM: I do see Wallace in our list.

00:34:03.520 --> 00:34:06.999

Megan Stone - AECOM: All right, I've prompted you to unmute, Wallace.

00:34:07.110 --> 00:34:08.420

Megan Stone - AECOM: Can you hear us?

00:34:09.510 --> 00:34:10.820

Wallace Slough: Can you hear me now?

00:34:11.330 --> 00:34:12.399

Megan Stone - AECOM: We can hear you.

00:34:12.409 --> 00:34:16.659

Wallace Slough: Okay. My name is Wallace Slough. I'm the owner of Quinn River Crossing Ranch

00:34:17.214 --> 00:34:24.309

Wallace Slough: Much of Rincon Creek is deeded land. We'll be submitting written comments and we'll leave it at that.

00:34:25.370 --> 00:34:30.839

Megan Stone - AECOM: Okay, thank you for confirming. We appreciate it. We'll go ahead and place you back on mute

00:34:31.020 --> 00:34:35.910

Megan Stone - AECOM: and we will move on to our next pre-registered commenter

00:34:37.060 --> 00:34:44.180

Megan Stone - AECOM: We do have two names here, so if we have two different commenters, just let me know, and we'll go through

00:34:44.834 --> 00:34:53.240

Megan Stone - AECOM: through your comments one at a time. So our next pre-registered commenter is Tim and Carolyn Dufurrena.

00:34:53.929 --> 00:34:56.379

Megan Stone - AECOM: and I saw your hand raised there.

00:34:56.699 --> 00:34:59.789

Megan Stone - AECOM: I prompted you to unmute. Can you hear us?

00:35:06.420 --> 00:35:08.580

Megan Stone - AECOM: Hi there. Are you able to hear us?

00:35:13.440 --> 00:35:17.480

Megan Stone - AECOM: It looks like you're unmuted on my end.

00:35:21.320 --> 00:35:26.260

Tim/Carolyn Dufurrena: Unmuted on this end as well.

00:35:26.260 --> 00:35:28.399

Megan Stone - AECOM: Yay, yes, we can hear you now.

00:35:28.400 --> 00:35:30.560

Tim/Carolyn Dufurrena: Microphone in use by Firefox.

00:35:31.830 --> 00:35:33.539

Megan Stone - AECOM: Yep, we can hear you now.

00:35:33.650 --> 00:35:37.010

Tim/Carolyn Dufurrena: Okay so my name is Carolyn Dufurrena.

00:35:37.470 --> 00:35:39.789

Tim/Carolyn Dufurrena: Okay, yes, I can.

00:35:40.100 --> 00:35:57.849

Tim/Carolyn Dufurrena: I am a rancher and married to Tim Dufurrena, who is the manager of Quinn River Crossing Ranch. We have lived here since, well, Tim has lived here his entire life, and

00:35:58.555 --> 00:36:05.380

Tim/Carolyn Dufurrena: and we have lived here in this area since 1984 and have

00:36:05.910 --> 00:36:11.379

Tim/Carolyn Dufurrena: paid a lot of attention to how the landscape and the habitat have

00:36:11.740 --> 00:36:27.780

Tim/Carolyn Dufurrena: maintained given, you know, the grazing, our grazing practices and our sustained interest in keeping the habitat viable for all species. We will be

00:36:27.950 --> 00:36:35.599

Tim/Carolyn Dufurrena: submitting written comments after this meeting, so I will keep my keep my comments short. Thank you.

00:36:37.700 --> 00:36:43.979

Megan Stone - AECOM: Thank you for your comment. We'll go ahead and place you back on mute, and lower your hand.

00:36:44.830 --> 00:37:04.109

Megan Stone - AECOM: With that we have gotten through all of our folks who signed up to comment when they registered for this evening's meeting. So at this time we're gonna go ahead and open it up to anyone who would like to comment, regardless of whether you signed up when you registered.

00:37:04.230 --> 00:37:11.359

Megan Stone - AECOM: So if you'd like to provide a verbal comment this evening you can go ahead and access that "raise hand" feature

00:37:11.500 --> 00:37:16.770

Megan Stone - AECOM: that's on the bottom of your Zoom toolbar or in the participants list.

00:37:17.350 --> 00:37:25.689

Megan Stone - AECOM: And then, if we have any phone callers joining us. I do. I think we have one. ,you'll press * 9 on your keypad to raise your hand.

00:37:26.210 --> 00:37:33.410

Megan Stone - AECOM: So I'll go ahead and continue to keep an eye out for anyone who has their hand raised.

00:37:33.740 --> 00:37:45.169

Megan Stone - AECOM: If anyone's experiencing any issues at any point raising their hand or with audio or anything like that, please do just send us a chat and we'll get you support.

00:37:45.830 --> 00:37:50.210

Megan Stone - AECOM: Alright, I see our next commenter is Rick Roseta.

00:37:51.300 --> 00:37:55.019

Megan Stone - AECOM: I prompted you to unmute, Rick. Are you able to hear us.

00:38:01.710 --> 00:38:04.199

Rick Roseta: I can hear you. Can you hear me?

00:38:04.460 --> 00:38:08.960

Megan Stone - AECOM: We can hear you. Could you please spell your first and last name for the record?

00:38:08.960 --> 00:38:14.120

Rick Roseta: R-I-C-K, Rick, R-O-S-E-T-A, one T, Roseta.

00:38:14.920 --> 00:38:19.960

Megan Stone - AECOM: Oh, thank you. We'll get that corrected on the screen. You can begin your comment now.

00:38:19.960 --> 00:38:24.120

Rick Roseta: I'm from Eugene Oregon. I'm just listening as matter of

00:38:24.780 --> 00:38:36.729

Rick Roseta: public interest. I'm wondering if there's a way that we can obtain copies of the slides that have been used tonight. Is that a possibility, or is that part all part of the public record that we can request.

00:38:39.940 --> 00:38:58.300

Megan Stone - AECOM: Thank you for that, Rick. We are in a comment session this evening, our virtual public hearing, so we're unable to address question during this comment session that we've moved into. But if you have any further comments, please let us know.

00:38:59.780 --> 00:39:08.799

Rick Roseta: My only comment is, I'm wondering what effort was made to identify other populations of the butterflies elsewhere besides Humboldt County.

00:39:10.460 --> 00:39:11.649

Megan Stone - AECOM: Thank you, Rick.

00:39:13.640 --> 00:39:16.720

Megan Stone - AECOM: Alright. We'll go ahead and place you back on mute.

00:39:17.770 --> 00:39:38.999

Megan Stone - AECOM: And I did just want to note for anyone who may have joined us later on, and just in general the US Fish and Wildlife Service is recording this meeting and that recording will be posted later on. It does take some time to get that posted to make sure it's accessible for everyone.

00:39:39.568 --> 00:39:45.089

Megan Stone - AECOM: And there's also plans to post the slides. So I just wanted to make that announcement.

00:39:46.410 --> 00:39:58.210

Megan Stone - AECOM: With that we'll go ahead and continue to keep an eye out for anyone who would like to provide their verbal public comments during this public hearing portion of the meeting.

00:39:59.260 --> 00:40:04.910

Megan Stone - AECOM: and if you'd like to provide any comments, please do raise your hand, and we'll get you unmuted.

00:40:12.420 --> 00:40:17.180

Megan Stone - AECOM: Alright, I see, Pam, and then Don have their hands raised.

00:40:17.770 --> 00:40:20.910

Megan Stone - AECOM: I've prompted you to unmute, Pam.

00:40:21.030 --> 00:40:22.990

Megan Stone - AECOM: Are you able to hear us?

00:40:24.860 --> 00:40:26.390

Pam Harrington: Can you hear me okay?

00:40:26.850 --> 00:40:30.820

Megan Stone - AECOM: We can. Can you please spell your first and last name for the record?

00:40:31.700 --> 00:40:38.280

Pam Harrington: Sure. I'm Pam Harrington, P-A-M H-A-R-R-I-N-G-T-O-N. And I'm the

00:40:38.740 --> 00:40:42.779

Pam Harrington: Natural Resource Officer for Lander County.

00:40:42.960 --> 00:40:52.742

Pam Harrington: and we did submit written comments, so I'll keep it brief too, but I just wanted to make sure I highlighted the concern that we had was the

00:40:53.200 --> 00:41:01.630

Pam Harrington: lack of data from the decision that the Service made in 2012 versus now to reverse

00:41:01.980 --> 00:41:03.959

Pam Harrington: what the findings were.

00:41:04.626 --> 00:41:07.749

Pam Harrington: In our opinion, I did not see

00:41:08.000 --> 00:41:17.230

Pam Harrington: evidence to support this change in decision. So I'd like to see a lot more robust datasets

00:41:17.520 --> 00:41:34.170

Pam Harrington: because you are setting a precedence for many other species as well. I mean, maybe this butterfly is only found in Humboldt County, but what the Service does, and will make a difference in any other

00:41:34.410 --> 00:41:43.029

Pam Harrington: space as we move forward. So I just want to emphasize that, that I think that you really need to be able to make the case here

00:41:43.350 --> 00:41:46.869

Pam Harrington: to provide a listing, and I'm not seeing it.

00:41:48.030 --> 00:41:49.319

Pam Harrington: That's about it.

00:41:50.490 --> 00:41:59.019

Megan Stone - AECOM: Thank you for your comment, Pam. We'll go ahead and place you back on mute and we'll move on to our next hand raised, who is

00:41:59.150 --> 00:42:04.150

Megan Stone - AECOM: Don Kalkoske. Apologies, if I mispronounced that

00:42:04.580 --> 00:42:06.859

Megan Stone - AECOM: Hi, Don, are you able to hear us?

00:42:07.400 --> 00:42:09.120

Don Kalkoske: Yes, I am. Can you hear me?

00:42:09.550 --> 00:42:10.720

Megan Stone - AECOM: We can.

00:42:10.940 --> 00:42:14.610

Megan Stone - AECOM: Can you spell your first and last name for the record, please?

00:42:14.610 --> 00:42:20.119

Don Kalkoske: Absolutely. Don, D-O-N, Kalkoske, K-A-L-K-O-S-K-E.

00:42:20.670 --> 00:42:40.689

Don Kalkoske: Humboldt County Manager, and I would first like to thank you guys for having this meeting. I know it was a little bit of a struggle to get this done but I do appreciate your efforts in getting this through. So the first thing I'd like to point out is, when you're going through the graphs

00:42:40.970 --> 00:42:52.819

Don Kalkoske: on the presentation, there were a lot of assumptions made on the populations for the butterfly,

00:42:53.280 --> 00:42:57.690

Don Kalkoske: and it's just kind of concerning that

00:42:58.230 --> 00:43:05.439

Don Kalkoske: there was no data statistical analysis utilized to-

00:43:06.450 --> 00:43:10.040

Don Kalkoske: that was provided in the report itself

00:43:10.700 --> 00:43:15.633

Don Kalkoske: to substantiate these populations. Everything was just assumptions.

00:43:16.560 --> 00:43:23.889

Don Kalkoske: The next thing I'd like to mention is, you know, there

00:43:24.970 --> 00:43:33.739

Don Kalkoske: was very little effort to establishing populations, much like one of the previous commenters mentioned.

00:43:35.320 --> 00:43:42.679

Don Kalkoske: There was no looking elsewhere. It was just this little area

00:43:43.500 --> 00:43:46.690

Don Kalkoske: you were looking at for this, and

00:43:47.000 --> 00:43:51.329

Don Kalkoske: it's kind of hard to say, even in the report, whether there were any

00:43:52.440 --> 00:43:59.140

Don Kalkoske: on the Service itself to establish these populations.

00:44:00.280 --> 00:44:03.379

Don Kalkoske: and that's all I have for you.

00:44:04.850 --> 00:44:11.709

Megan Stone - AECOM: Thank you for your comment, Don. We'll go ahead and place you back on mute and lower your hand.

00:44:13.000 --> 00:44:20.179

Megan Stone - AECOM: And we've gone through the hands raised that I saw so far, but I'll continue to keep an eye out

00:44:20.470 --> 00:44:31.139

Megan Stone - AECOM: for anyone who would like to raise their hand and provide a comment. Again, for phone callers if you'd like to raise your hand, you'll press *9 on your phone keypad

00:44:31.250 --> 00:44:35.670

Megan Stone - AECOM: and then for anyone joining on your smartphone or computer

00:44:35.900 --> 00:44:41.209

Megan Stone - AECOM: you can find that "raise hand" button in the Zoom toolbar or the participants list.

00:45:08.580 --> 00:45:16.759

Megan Stone - AECOM: We also do want to note that if there are folks who would like to comment again, we will allow you to comment twice

00:45:17.214 --> 00:45:20.889

Megan Stone - AECOM: if you'd like to this evening. So if there's anything that

00:45:21.100 --> 00:45:26.849

Megan Stone - AECOM: you didn't get to in your first comment, feel free to raise your hand again, and we'll get you unmuted.

00:45:28.100 --> 00:45:31.030

Megan Stone - AECOM: But with that we'll continue to leave this slide up

00:45:31.170 --> 00:45:37.930

Megan Stone - AECOM: and monitor for anyone who might join later on or decide they have a comment to provide.

00:45:38.290 --> 00:45:39.619

Megan Stone - AECOM: Thank you, everyone.

00:45:48.450 --> 00:45:54.170

Megan Stone - AECOM: Alright. I see we have. Or we did have a hand raised briefly from Andy Rieber.

00:45:54.660 --> 00:45:55.620

Megan Stone - AECOM: Perfect.

00:45:56.700 --> 00:46:06.140

Megan Stone - AECOM: I've allowed you to unmute Andy. Could you spell your first and last name for the record again? Just for the transcripts, so we get that down.

00:46:06.330 --> 00:46:16.500

Andy Rieber: Sure thing. This is Andy Rieber, A-N-D-Y, Rieber, R-I-E-B-E-R. Thanks for letting me take one more swing at this. I appreciate that.

00:46:17.100 --> 00:46:24.570

Andy Rieber: One more thing I'd like to point out that's very concerning about this proposed rule

00:46:24.750 --> 00:46:29.299

Andy Rieber: is the leap it makes from speculation to certainty.

00:46:29.640 --> 00:46:39.009

Andy Rieber: So what you find in this is a chain of assumptions and speculations, starting from

00:46:39.270 --> 00:46:52.490

Andy Rieber: speculations about population drop, speculation about the quality of vegetative habitat, speculation about groundwater levels at the site of the habitat.

00:46:54.010 --> 00:46:57.440

Andy Rieber: What you get, however, in the proposed rule,

00:46:57.940 --> 00:47:05.473

Andy Rieber: area these definitive statements that groundwater pumping is causing

00:47:06.650 --> 00:47:15.839

Andy Rieber: vegetative senescence or climate change is causing a population drop in the

00:47:16.340 --> 00:47:27.979

Andy Rieber: species, and it is very disconcerting to see, given the amount of times that the word "likely" is used in this document, an extraordinarily

00:47:28.090 --> 00:47:32.280

Andy Rieber: abundant occurrence of that word that

00:47:32.640 --> 00:47:52.070

Andy Rieber: the Fish and Wildlife Service feels entitled, on the basis of highly speculative evidence, to come up with these absolutely ironclad and unwavering assertions about the state of the species and its habitat.

00:47:52.230 --> 00:48:05.589

Andy Rieber: I noted that your primary source of data is the Desert Research Institute, the DRI, paper that looms large in your background science

00:48:06.210 --> 00:48:12.549

Andy Rieber: and is your primary source. Interestingly, however, the authors of the DRI study

00:48:12.980 --> 00:48:24.579

Andy Rieber: are much more modest about their conclusions than is the Fish and Wildlife Service. The DRI authors in many places say "We lack

00:48:24.980 --> 00:48:33.850

Andy Rieber: critical data to draw certain conclusions" and that their study serves merely as a starting point

00:48:34.000 --> 00:48:40.930

Andy Rieber: for other subsequent studies, to be able to determine more

00:48:41.330 --> 00:48:51.840

Andy Rieber: fully the causal effects or causal connections, if any, between, say groundwater pumping and down-gradient vegetation

00:48:51.960 --> 00:49:00.249

Andy Rieber: and that is a kind of scientific conservativeness and modesty that is not

00:49:00.380 --> 00:49:25.609

Andy Rieber: in any way reflected in the Fish and Wildlife Service's findings. And what I would suggest and recommend is that the Fish and Wildlife Service step back and take that more modest approach and go and do the science and fill the data gaps with regard to field studies. Because right now

00:49:25.760 --> 00:49:31.060

Andy Rieber: I would say you are not--the very thin data that you have

00:49:31.490 --> 00:49:43.240

Andy Rieber: does not entitle you to the conclusions you're drawing. And indeed the authors of the DRI study were fully aware of that. And I think that's an attitude that you should echo.

00:49:43.690 --> 00:49:44.560

Andy Rieber: Thanks.

00:49:45.770 --> 00:49:50.419

Megan Stone - AECOM: Thank you, Andy, for your comment. We'll go ahead and place you back on mute

00:49:50.910 --> 00:49:54.329

Megan Stone - AECOM: and we will move on to our next

00:49:54.520 --> 00:50:00.590

Megan Stone - AECOM: pre-registered commenter. Sorry, our next hand raised who's Ron Cerri.

00:50:02.410 --> 00:50:05.919

Megan Stone - AECOM: And I'll go ahead and get you unmuted now.

00:50:06.370 --> 00:50:08.739

Megan Stone - AECOM: Hi, Ron, are you able to hear us?

00:50:09.090 --> 00:50:10.250

Ron Cerri: Yes. Can you hear me?

00:50:10.700 --> 00:50:11.900

Megan Stone - AECOM: Yes, we can.

00:50:12.120 --> 00:50:15.690

Megan Stone - AECOM: Can you spell your first and last name for the record, please?

00:50:15.900 --> 00:50:20.099

Ron Cerri: My name is Ron Cerri, Humboldt County Commissioner and rancher in Humboldt County.

00:50:20.760 --> 00:50:24.760

Ron Cerri: My name is spelled R-O-N

00:50:24.900 --> 00:50:26.769

Ron Cerri: C-E-R-R-I.

00:50:27.150 --> 00:50:29.289

Ron Cerri: Last name is C-E-R-R-I.

00:50:31.090 --> 00:50:37.680

Ron Cerri: I would like to recommend-suggest that

00:50:37.820 --> 00:50:49.860

Ron Cerri: rather than a sudden listing of this sandhill butterfly, that an opportunity be given to do some

00:50:51.110 --> 00:50:56.970

Ron Cerri:--to the landowners, grazers, and other users to do some voluntary
00:50:58.250 --> 00:51:02.249

Ron Cerri: efforts, maybe identified by the Service,
00:51:02.610 --> 00:51:06.130

Ron Cerri: before they list it as an endangered species.
00:51:06.310 --> 00:51:14.440

Ron Cerri: To give that at least a chance to let the landowners, the private
landowners and the permittees,

00:51:16.250 --> 00:51:24.939

Ron Cerri: do some things before a listing comes down and makes their
operation that much more difficult.

00:51:25.690 --> 00:51:29.230

Ron Cerri: That's the extent of my comments. Thank you.

00:51:30.310 --> 00:51:36.450

Megan Stone - AECOM: Thank you for your comment, Ron. We'll go ahead and
place you back on mute and lower your hand.

00:51:37.430 --> 00:51:41.439

Megan Stone - AECOM: I don't see that we have any more hands raised right
now,

00:51:42.039 --> 00:51:46.980

Megan Stone - AECOM: but just a reminder for any folks we have joining us

00:51:47.400 --> 00:51:56.209

Megan Stone - AECOM: we are in the verbal public hearing portion of the
meeting, and we'll be on and ready to listen to your comments for the next
hour or so.

00:51:56.330 --> 00:52:07.009

Megan Stone - AECOM: So, if you do have any comments to provide verbally,
please press *9 on your phone keypad if you're a phone caller or raise your
hand and we'll get you unmuted.

00:52:07.520 --> 00:52:24.590

Megan Stone - AECOM: or if you prefer to offer your comments in writing the
Service does encourage you to submit your comments via regulations.gov by
searching the docket number, FWS-R8-ES-2024,

00:52:24.830 --> 00:52:33.290

Megan Stone - AECOM:41-0029.

00:52:33.400 --> 00:52:38.239

Megan Stone - AECOM: And we've also put that information in the chat for folks to copy down.

00:53:08.170 --> 00:53:17.539

Megan Stone - AECOM: I see we have a hand raised from Pam. I'll go ahead and unmute you now, Pam. And if you could spell your first and last name for the record again, that would be great.

00:53:19.070 --> 00:53:33.129

Pam Harrington: Sure. Hi, this is Pam Harrington, P-A-M H-A-R-R-I-N-G-T-O-N. And maybe I couldn't find it on this Zoom call. I had submitted a question at the beginning, that was an

00:53:33.620 --> 00:53:59.460

Pam Harrington: an opportunity we had is to submit a question, I guess to be answered, I thought, in this public hearing, but I'm not sure. And my question generally asked what was the protocol for acceptable data for the Fish and Wildlife Service to go forward with an endangered species listing. So I apologize if I missed it and I was supposed to find it on

00:53:59.910 --> 00:54:01.889

Pam Harrington: the chat or something.

00:54:04.280 --> 00:54:09.100

Megan Stone - AECOM: Thank you for your comment, Pam. We'll go ahead and place you back on mute

00:54:10.500 --> 00:54:18.600

Megan Stone - AECOM: and just a reminder for folks. We did have the option to submit questions when you registered

00:54:18.780 --> 00:54:30.810

Megan Stone - AECOM: the Service, did review all of those questions submitted through the registration page, and used them to inform the presentation that Lara provided earlier.

00:54:30.950 --> 00:54:48.659

Megan Stone - AECOM: But if there are any topics or anything you're more curious about, we can provide the field office information for how to get in touch with them. But again, we really do encourage you to submit comments

00:54:50.480 --> 00:54:54.330

Megan Stone - AECOM: and that can be either verbally this evening or in writing.

00:54:59.350 --> 00:55:03.719

Megan Stone - AECOM: All right. We'll continue to keep an eye out for

00:55:04.020 --> 00:55:08.589

Megan Stone - AECOM: any hands raised or any folks joining us

00:55:08.830 --> 00:55:09.740

Megan Stone - AECOM: late.

00:55:10.500 --> 00:55:26.819

Megan Stone - AECOM: And please do let us know if anybody's having any technical issues at any point via the chat, and we'll get you some support. We do have the information on how to submit comments in the chat here, and we can go ahead and provide that

00:55:27.737 --> 00:55:30.940

Megan Stone - AECOM: mailing address in the chat as well.

00:55:31.160 --> 00:55:32.500

Megan Stone - AECOM: Thank you, everyone.

00:56:28.470 --> 00:56:40.819

Megan Stone - AECOM: All right, I see Don has their hand raised again. We'll go ahead and get you unmuted, Don. And if you could spell your first and last name for the record in the transcript, that would be great.

00:56:41.380 --> 00:57:03.989

Don Kalkoske: Absolutely. Don Kalkoske, D-O-N K-A-L-K-O-S-K-E. Humboldt County Manager, again. So I'm just kind of curious on the procedures of this. With this you keep calling it a public hearing, and there's a lot of questions being raised, but there's no interaction from the group.

00:57:04.250 --> 00:57:09.300

Don Kalkoske: Is it just, you're taking these questions and you're going to

00:57:09.450 --> 00:57:19.599

Don Kalkoske: file them away or...? How is this going to work? I don't understand and it may be that I'm new to this

00:57:19.810 --> 00:57:25.559

Don Kalkoske: but it just seems kind of odd to me. So that's all I have for you.

00:57:28.030 --> 00:57:29.979

Megan Stone - AECOM: Thank you for your comment, Don.

00:57:30.300 --> 00:57:36.100

Megan Stone - AECOM: We'll go ahead and place you back on mute and lower your hand.

00:57:38.270 --> 00:57:48.930

Megan Stone - AECOM: Just a reminder for everyone. We are in a verbal public hearing this evening, so we're here to listen to comments that you have on the proposed rule.

00:57:49.090 --> 00:57:56.470

Megan Stone - AECOM: If you would like to provide a comment at any time. You're welcome to do so by raising your hand, and we'll get you unmuted.

00:57:56.700 --> 00:57:57.546

Megan Stone - AECOM: Thank you.

00:59:06.460 --> 00:59:07.820

Megan Stone - AECOM: Alrighty.

00:59:09.010 --> 00:59:15.998

Megan Stone - AECOM: We're gonna go ahead and put some information in the chat. So we do have the information

00:59:16.650 --> 00:59:44.820

Megan Stone - AECOM: for where you can get in contact with the field office. if you have any questions or topics that you want to know about further, since we are dedicated to listening to comments this evening, we'll be focusing on accepting those verbal comments, but folks are welcome to call the field office with questions or discussion since we are doing the formal public hearing this evening.

00:59:44.960 --> 00:59:53.409

Megan Stone - AECOM: so we'll get that information posted in the chat on where you can call the field office in just a moment here.

01:00:28.890 --> 01:00:36.029

Megan Stone - AECOM: alright, we do have that information in the chat for where you can contact the field office at.

01:00:36.250 --> 01:00:44.130

Megan Stone - AECOM: and I'll just say that number out loud for anyone who's calling in on the phone who might want to copy that down.

01:00:44.260 --> 01:00:52.709

Megan Stone - AECOM: The information for the field office is (775)-861-6300.

01:00:54.470 --> 01:01:04.720

Megan Stone - AECOM: With that we'll go ahead and continue to see if we have anyone else who would like to provide verbal public comments this evening.

01:01:04.830 --> 01:01:24.640

Megan Stone - AECOM: Again, if you are ready to offer your comment, please raise your hand and we'll get you unmuted, or if you would prefer to provide your verbal public comments in writing, we have the information on where you can mail those or where you can provide them electronically on regulations.gov.

01:01:25.210 --> 01:01:32.469

Megan Stone - AECOM: So thank you, everyone for your patience as we go ahead and continue to see if we have any more commenters.

01:05:49.390 --> 01:06:02.790

Megan Stone - AECOM: Hello again, everyone. Just wanted to remind folks that we are still in the verbal public hearing portion of the meeting this evening and we'll be on and listening to your comments for the next

01:06:03.060 --> 01:06:11.809

Megan Stone - AECOM: 50 minutes or so. So if you do have any comments that you would like to provide verbally, you're welcome to do so by raising your hand.

01:06:11.930 --> 01:06:20.010

Megan Stone - AECOM: For phone callers, you'll press *9 and for those joining by computer or smartphone you can use that "raise hand" feature.

01:06:22.200 --> 01:06:27.309

Megan Stone - AECOM: Thank you everyone for your patience as we wait for other commenters.

01:12:18.570 --> 01:12:20.450

Megan Stone - AECOM: Hello again, everyone

01:12:20.760 --> 01:12:32.420

Megan Stone - AECOM: just wanted to remind folks that we have another 45 minutes or so here, where the Service is on, and ready to listen to any verbal public comments you might have.

01:12:32.550 --> 01:12:34.800

Megan Stone - AECOM: If you would like to provide a comment

01:12:35.060 --> 01:12:57.929

Megan Stone - AECOM: you're welcome to raise your hand by pressing *9 on your phone keypad, or by raising your hand in the Zoom toolbar or participants list. And again, since we do have time this evening, if folks have already commented and would like to comment again, you're welcome to do so, just raise your hand and we'll get you unmuted.

01:12:58.340 --> 01:13:02.710

Megan Stone - AECOM: Thanks for your patience, everyone, as we wait for additional commenters.

01:24:29.780 --> 01:24:38.369

Megan Stone - AECOM: Hello again, everyone, just wanted to remind folks that we're still on and ready to listen to any comments that you might have.

01:24:38.470 --> 01:24:46.869

Megan Stone - AECOM: We'll be accepting verbal comments for the next 30 minutes or so before moving into closing remarks.

01:24:47.030 --> 01:25:06.479

Megan Stone - AECOM: and we do welcome any input you might have. So if you have a comment to provide, please press *9 on your phone keypad if you're joining on the phone and that will let you raise your hand. You can find that button at the bottom of your zoom screen if you're joining on the computer or smartphone.

01:25:06.670 --> 01:25:12.819

Megan Stone - AECOM: We'll continue to see if we have any additional attendees joining us or any hands raised.

01:25:12.970 --> 01:25:16.759

Megan Stone - AECOM: And please reach out if you're having any technical issues at any point.

01:25:16.930 --> 01:25:17.950

Megan Stone - AECOM: Thank you.

01:36:41.750 --> 01:36:50.459

Megan Stone - AECOM: Hello, everyone. Just wanted to remind folks that we are on and ready to listen to any comments you might have.

01:36:50.690 --> 01:36:55.389

Megan Stone - AECOM: We'll be accepting verbal public comments during this hearing for the next

01:36:55.650 --> 01:37:05.389

Megan Stone - AECOM: 20 minutes or so, and then we'll move into some closing remarks. So if you'd like to provide a comment, please let us know by raising your hand. Thank you.

01:50:04.560 --> 01:50:26.849

Megan Stone - AECOM: Hello, everyone. We do have 10 more minutes left in our virtual public hearing this evening so if you would like to provide any comments, please raise your hand by pressing *9 on your phone keypad, or, if you're joining by computer or smartphone, you can raise your hand with your Zoom toolbar or participants list.

01:50:27.010 --> 01:50:32.450

Megan Stone - AECOM: We'll continue to keep an eye out to see if anyone has any comments they'd like to provide.

01:50:32.760 --> 01:50:40.770

Megan Stone - AECOM: and we also have the information up on the screen of where you can provide your comments in writing if you would prefer to do that.

01:50:40.950 --> 01:51:02.829

Megan Stone - AECOM: We also have some great information in the chat for you to copy down, including information on where questions can go by contacting the field office, where you can find the proposed rule, and then again, that regulations.gov. link and the mailing address for hard copy comments as well.

01:51:03.340 --> 01:51:09.130

Megan Stone - AECOM: So thank you, everyone for your patience, and let us know if you have any further comments.

01:56:21.800 --> 01:56:39.399

Megan Stone - AECOM: Hello again, everyone. Just wanted to provide one final reminder that if we have anyone who would like to provide any last comments, we have time for another comment here. So please do raise your hand to let us know if you'd like to provide a comment, and we'll go ahead and get you unmuted.

01:56:39.780 --> 01:56:44.660

Megan Stone - AECOM: We'll keep an eye out for any hands raised, and then we'll move into closing remarks.

01:58:56.600 --> 01:59:02.189

Megan Stone - AECOM: Alright, we'll go ahead and move into closing remarks and go to the next slide.

01:59:10.060 --> 01:59:17.979

Megan Stone - AECOM: Just wanted to provide a reminder that the comment period closes on May 19th, 2025,

01:59:18.080 --> 01:59:24.809

Megan Stone - AECOM: you can submit comments, either in writing electronically through regulations.gov,

01:59:25.010 --> 01:59:30.029

Megan Stone - AECOM: in writing hard copy through the mailing address that we posted in the chat,

01:59:30.350 --> 01:59:39.170

Megan Stone - AECOM: or this evening, there was the opportunity to provide those verbal comments which will be reviewed and incorporated into the record.

01:59:39.780 --> 01:59:56.020

Megan Stone - AECOM: We want to thank everyone so much for attending, listening in and providing comments. We appreciate you taking the time out of your evening to participate in this process and look forward to receiving your input. Thank you, everyone, and have a great evening.