

Final Minutes
TRINITY RIVER ADAPTIVE MANAGEMENT WORKING GROUP

February 17, 2016
 Trinity River Restoration Office, Weaverville, CA

Tuesday February 16, 2016 9:00 AM

Attending Members

Member	Representative Seat:
Tom Stokely	Vice-chair, Commercial Fishing Organizations
Gil Saliba	Environmental Organizations
Paul Catanese	Local Landowners/Business owners
Ed Duggan	Small business Owners
Joe McCarthy	Local Landowners
Julie Catanese ¹	Public Utilities
Michael McHugh ²	Trinity County Residents
David Steinhauser ³	Whitewater Outfitters /Guides

¹Alternate for Paul Hauser; ² Alternate for Kelli Gant; ³ Arrived during item 5.

Members that did not attend

Member:	Representative Seat:
Emelia Berol	Environmental Organizations
Elizabeth Hadley	Chair, Utility Companies
Sandy Denn	Glenn-Colusa Irrigation District
Richard Lorenz	Trinity County Residents
Liam Gogan	Trinity River Fishing Guides
Darren Mierau	Environmental Organizations

Designated Federal Officer: Joe Polos, Fish and Wildlife Service, Arcata, CA.

Other attendees: Dave Wellock, Kristi Bevard, (residents); Vina Frye (USFWS); Robert Stewart, Brandt Gutermuth, Todd Buxton (TRRP); George Kautsky, Robert Franklin (Hoopa Valley Tribe); Wade Sinnen (Ca Dept. Fish and Wildlife); Federico Barajas (Bureau of Reclamation); Shiloh Braxton (Trinity RCD); Leslie Bryant (Redding Electric Utility).

Notes: Kim Mattson (ENW).

List of Motions Made during the Meeting

Ed Duggan made a motion to accept the December meeting minutes.

Joe McCarthy seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously with Michael McHugh abstaining.

Gil Saliba made a motion that the TAMWG select Elizabeth Hadley as Chair and Tom Stokely as Vice-Chair.

Julie Catanese seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously.

Ed Duggan made a motion that the TAMWG recommend that the TMC recommend to the Bureau of Reclamation that a cold-water-carryover storage of 600,000 acre-foot be maintained in Trinity Reservoir on 9/30/16 per the 2000 National Marine Fisheries Service Biological Opinion in order to avoid a temperature emergency.

Gil Saliba seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously.

Action Items Designated during the Meeting

Wade Sinnen will seek information on numbers of brown trout electroshocked and rates of mortality.

Meeting Minutes by Agenda Item

1. Welcome, Introductions, Approve Agenda and Minutes

Tom Stokely, Vice Chair, opened the meeting for the Trinity River Adaptive Management Working Group (TAMWG). He noted they had not yet reached a quorum of members but would start the meeting and they could not take votes until one more member arrived. He asked the attendees to introduce themselves.

Formal approval of the agenda and the minutes were delayed until after Item 5. Tom Stokely asked the TAMWG to take up two items for approval.

Ed Duggan made a motion to accept the December meeting minutes.

Joe McCarthy seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously with Michael McHugh abstaining.

The TAMWG took up the election of officers. Ed Duggan nominated Tom Stokely as Chair. Julie Catanese nominated Elizabeth Hadley as Chair. Tom Stokely said he thought Hadley and he made a good team and that he said he would rather serve as Vice-Chair. Paul Catanese nominated Stokely as Vice-Chair. Since there were no other nominations for Chair and Vice-Chair, the TAMWG handled this as a motion instead of a secret ballot.

Gil Saliba made a motion that the TAMWG select Elizabeth Hadley as Chair and Tom Stokely as Vice-Chair.

Julie Catanese seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously.

2. Public comment

Kristi Bevard asked if the TAMWG for the future would consider a call-in option for members of the TAMWG so they could achieve a quorum.

Dave Wellock related his attendance of a meeting at the Moose Lodge and noted that the members of the public are not getting information from the Program. He asked about the Bucktail Bridge and the abutments. Brandt Gutermuth noted the bridge does not meet the needs of the 100-year flood flows, but the abutments are sound. Wellock asked about dredging near the abutments to allow more flow. Gutermuth said that area was mostly bedrock. Wellock noted that there has been filling of fine sediment. He thought they needed to install rip-rap or gabions. He questioned the need for the bridge replacement. Gutermuth said they are not proposing to replace the bridge but instead the County is seeking funding for it.

3. Designated Federal Officer Items

Joe Polos noted this was an election meeting, but elections would be delayed until they had their quorum of members. He noted the Action Tracker items. He noted there have two proposed changes in alternate memberships and two proposed changes in primary memberships and these people are being vetted. Polos reminded the TAMWG of the Decision Support Workshop planned for March 29-31 and that this will be an official TAMWG meeting. A Trinity Management Council is also scheduled to follow.

Gil Saliba asked if they could look into getting a better system for video conferencing. Paul Catanese said that his business has very good system but it has to be hard-wired and the meeting location would have to be permanent.

4. TMC Chair Report

Federico Barajas went through the agenda for the Trinity Management Council (TMC) meeting scheduled for tomorrow. He noted he would be talking about the Fixer Document which is a proposal as a result of discussions with the Tribes about a review of the Program and an efficiency assessment. The concept is to have someone possibly within the federal agencies with policy experience and to integrate this review with the past reviews.

Paul Catanese asked about the rationale for another review. Barajas said there were concerns about the time-windows and there are new findings of the Efficiencies Subcommittee. Tom Stokely said he supports the Fixer approach as recommendations of past reviews have not been implemented. The Fixer approach would bring in higher level decision makers from within the agencies to help implement changes. Barajas said the Fixer Document would likely be a longer-term process but if Stokely had specific changes, Stokely could bring these to Barajas for consideration sooner. Barajas noted the TMC would be also discussing the Efficiencies Subcommittee report during their meeting.

Other items to be covered at the TMC meeting would be the 2017 budget. Barajas noted the total budget is \$15.1 million with \$500 K for watersheds. On Friday, the TMC will get updates on Science, Implementation, and a water update from the Central Valley Project (CVP). Other topics include current conditions, fish, riparian, and TMC letters. One letter will address Sacramento

diversions and the other will address a request of the Trinity fishing guides to help with tributaries assessment (Attachment 1).

Ed Duggan noted the concerns over the Sacramento winter-run Chinook whereas there seems to be no concerns expressed over the Trinity River fish. Brandt Gutermuth noted the Sacramento winter-run Chinook are listed as endangered whereas the Trinity coho are listed as threatened and the Trinity steelhead or Chinook are not listed.

Tom Stokely asked about the date of release of the Draft EIS for Draft Long-Term Plan for Protecting Late Summer Adult Salmon in the Lower Klamath River. Barajas said a Record of Decision (ROD), originally planned for this year would not be available until late winter. Barajas said they are honoring Humboldt County's 50,000 acre-feet releases, and this is also under litigation.

5. Executive Director Updates – FY17 budget, Implementation Planning

Brandt Gutermuth, interim director for the Trinity River Restoration Program (TRRP) went through his report (Attachment 2). Two items on the 2016 budget were that the Trinity County Resource Conservation District (RCD) has been contracted to continue outreach and that they have set up a scope of work with Dr. Jim Peterson's group to continue work on the Decision Support System (DSS).

Tom Stokely asked about the River Corridor Plan. Gutermuth said Dave Gaeuman, Robert Steward, and Todd Buxton drafted a plan that is currently under in-house review. It would be a tool to help support ongoing restoration work. Polos said it would integrate actions such as gravel with habitat in a more quantitative way.

Tom Stokely asked about staffing. Federico Barajas said Brandt Gutermuth is interim director, and Barajas said they have a pool of candidates to be announced with a selection made by end of March to be the acting director until a permanent decision is made.

Gutermuth continued his updates and moved to Implementation. They are ready to implement the Bucktail site—they are finalizing the EIR with the BLM and they have reviewed the designs. There is a private landowner that is not interested in working with the Program and Gutermuth is recommended they do not implement the IC-7 side channel. But, based on public comments to the EA, there are no plans to move the current location of the boat ramp.

Deep Gulch is the next project and is located more downstream (downstream of Dutch Creek). Design is being conducted by the Federal Team and they are increasing their use of woody debris. They are considering consolidating the Deep Gulch project with the Sheridan project. One reason is that some are considering the tailings along the river that resulted from gold mining as historic sites and consolidation with Sheridan would avoid impacts to historic tailings at Deep Gulch.

Chapman Ranch has a final design but will be kept on the shelf until the other projects are completed. The cost of Chapman is expected to be \$12 million. Lower Dutch Creek is in the early stages with the Forest Service and they plan to have an environmental document in the fall or winter with implementation in 2017.

Gutermuth touched on new items in compliance. The TRRP has a Section 10 permit that covers coho science work on the Trinity and it has just been renewed. Brown trout are being electroshocked to see what they are feeding on but this specific element is not being funded by the program. Paul Catanese noted a marked decrease in brown trout in the upper river and asked if

they are tracking the numbers of fish shocked and killed. Wade Sinnen would seek information on this.

Action item: Wade Sinnen will seek information on numbers of brown trout electroshocked and rates of mortality.

Gutermuth completed his presentation and at this point, the TAMWG returned to Item 1 approval of agenda and minutes and to Item 3 election of officers as a quorum had been reached. After that, the TAMWG, being ahead of schedule took up discussion of Item 7 before breaking for lunch.

Lunch

6. Science Workgroup Updates

Damion Ciotti introduced himself as the acting Science Coordinator. He gave updates on the activities of the workgroups. He noted that Andreas Krause is the new Flow Workgroup leader. The Flow Workgroup forwarded two recommendations to the TMC: that they maximize Trinity Reservoir storage and to complete a Feasibility Study to reduce the temperature of Lewiston Dam discharges. The Fish Workgroup hosted Steve Cannata and his analysis of fish returns relative to other rivers. The Riparian Workgroup is advising the TMC that the foothill yellow-legged frog and the western pond turtle are being considered for listing under ESA. The Watershed Workgroup is monitoring the application of proposals. Ciotti described the planned workshop on the DSS in late March. They are planning to hear about model output and from others that have used DSS in other rivers. They hope to have a discussion of how DSS will be used in the Trinity River. Ciotti said they are not yet certain about a third day and would welcome input by the TAMWG about this.

7. Flow Update

This item was addressed following Item 5 as the TAMWG was ahead of their schedule. Robert Stewart gave a Powerpoint presentation on Trinity River WY 2016 current conditions. Temperature compliance as measured at the North Fork of the Trinity River showed that river temperatures had exceeded the compliance temperature of 56 F for 15 days in October but dropped below 56 F once air temperatures dropped. The daily CVP water supply report showed low storage (49% of average) in Trinity Reservoir, whereas inflow was 99% of average, and precipitation was 104% of average. The 50% exceedance of predicted inflow forecast to Trinity Reservoir is trending between a normal and wet year. The snowpack is above 100% of normal at many of the sites in the Trinity watershed; but snowpack levels appear to be decreasing. NOAA forecasts are predicting higher than normal air temperatures for this month; precipitation is also predicted to be slightly above normal. Streamflow at Coffee Creek is running higher than average since mid-January due to rains and now snowmelt. Given the predictions of a warmer spring, the Flow Workgroup is considering moving the hydrograph earlier in the year and one that is more jagged to more closely mimic the natural variability.

The TAMWG asked if the Flow Workgroup has considered changing the ROD directions for releases of water so to give consideration to reservoir levels. Stewart acknowledged that the ROD flows do not take into account reservoir carryover storage. Tom Stokely said there is no guarantee that any reserved water wouldn't be shipped "over the hill" to those water users. Ed Duggan noted that a ruling has been made for the Shasta Reservoir, why can't they do the same thing for the Trinity. Stokely said the State is looking for ways to conserve cold water for the winter run Chinook as they had a disaster in that they lost 95% of their young fish two years in a row, despite

claims to be conserving cold water. He reviewed some of the complexities and difficulty of enforcing water storage and water temperature objectives as these are not in the language in the Bureau of Reclamation water use permits, making the Trinity more vulnerable. Dave Steinhauser asked if the Workgroup has considered taking spring flow and putting it into summer flow. Stewart said no. Julie Catanese noted that the water “going over the hill” provides the funding for this program.

The TAMWG discussed a motion to maintain cold water storage in the Trinity Reservoir. Thoughts were to enforce 600,000 acre feet and to eventually increase this to 900,000 acre feet but to also allow for emergency use as described in the National Marine Fisheries Service’s 2000 Biological Opinion.

Ed Duggan made a motion that the TAMWG recommend that the TMC recommend to the Bureau of Reclamation that a cold-water-carryover-storage of 600,000 acre-foot be maintained in Trinity Reservoir on 9/30/16 per the 2000 National Marine Fisheries Service Biological Opinion in order to avoid a temperature emergency.

Gil Saliba seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously.

8. 2015 Run Size

Steve Cannata, of the California Department of Fish and Wildlife, gave a Powerpoint presentation on Trinity River Fall Chinook Run-size and Escapement Comparisons. He showed data from the pre-season forecast for the 2015 run. The pre-season forecast was 120,000 and the post-season estimate was 78,000 which was more than a 50% overestimate. The tribal and recreational harvests were reduced. The natural area spawners were reduced from the floor value of 40,500 to 28,100. This was the first time it was missed during the last five years. If it is missed 3 years in a row, fishing restrictions will be imposed. In 2015, Trinity River run size above Weitchpec was 10,236 adults and 3022 jacks; above Willow Creek was 7,624 adults and 2,754 jacks; at the Trinity River Hatchery was 3,229 adults and 224 jacks. Looking at fish returns by brood year (year of birth), 2009 was a very productive year and the reasons are not known. 2001 was a poor brood year for fingerlings from Trinity Hatchery whereas the yearlings did well that same brood year.

Looking at the comparisons to Klamath, Rogue, and Sacramento, Cannata pointed out that all rivers have shown declines in recent years. Cannata showed returns of hatchery fish from Iron Gate which releases 6 million fall Chinook juveniles to Trinity River hatchery which releases 3 million juveniles. Returns of spawners to Trinity hatchery have averaged 39% of Iron Gate returns. The returns to Trinity in some years have often equaled Iron Gate until the last four years when Iron Gate has produces at least twice the returns. Spawner returns to the Trinity River have averaged 46% of the Klamath above Weitchpec and this percentage has dropped off in recent years. Returns of fall Chinook to the Trinity versus Rogue show similar ups and downs. The Rogue returns in recent years have dropped too. Another trend Cannata showed was that the percent of naturally produced fall Chinook to the total escapement was less than 10% in 2004 and bounced back to about 50% since 2007 and dropped to 30% in 2015. A similar trend was observed for spring Chinook. Steelhead natural produced fish has shown a statistically significant increase over time. The amount of naturally produced steelhead has remained more or less 6000 fish with lows of less than 4000 to highs of 8000.

Wade Sinnen reported run sizes for 2015: spring Chinook 4,345 (64% hatchery), coho 4,636 (816 wild), steelhead 12,000 (78% hatchery).

Cannata closed his presentation by noting that in the last 17 years, they have over-predicted 7 years, under-predicted 4 years and have been pretty close other years.

Gil Saliba asked about ocean predictions. Sinnen said this has been looked at but it has not been very successful. Asked about next year, Sinnen said to expect a small quota for 2016 based on the small number of two year olds in 2015.

9. Public Comment

No comments.

Adjourn 2:40 PM

LIST OF ATTACHMENTS AND OTHER DOCUMENTS

Attachment 1: Draft letter from Federico Barajas to the Trinity fishing guides regarding status of the tributaries for fish passage; passed out by Federico Barajas.

Attachment 2: Interim Executive Director's Report, February 2016; passed out by Brandt Gutermuth.

Other Documents:

TAMWG Action Tracker; passed out by Joe Polos.

TMC meeting agenda; passed out by Federico Barajas.

TMC notes from December meeting; passed out by Tom Stokely.

Letter to TMC from TAMWG December 14, 2015; prepared by Elizabeth Hadley.

Trinity River Adaptive Management Working Group

DRAFT AGENDA

Meeting of February 17, 2016

NOTE: Times Subject to Change

Location: Trinity River Restoration Program office (1313 South Main St, Weaverville, CA 96093)

Wednesday, February 17, 2016		
Time	Agenda Item	Presenter
9:00 AM	Welcome, Introductions, Approve Agenda & Minutes	TAMWG
9:15 AM	Public Comment <i>Note: In accordance with traditional meeting practices, TAMWG will not act on any public comment item during its current business meeting</i>	
9:30 AM	Designated Federal Officer Items	Joe Polos
10:00 AM	TMC Chair Report	Frederico Barajas
10:30 AM	Executive Director Updates – FY17 budget, Implementation Planning, etc.	Brandt Gutermuth
12:00 PM	Lunch	
1:00 PM	Science Workgroup Updates – DSS workshop, WG updates	Damion Ciotti/ Brandt Gutermuth
1:45 PM	Flow Update – water year update, flow schedule planning, reservoir mgt.	BOR/TRRP
2:45 PM	2015 Run Size	Steve Cannata
3:45 PM	Public Comment	
4:00 PM	Adjourn	